

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING**
Held on Monday, 3 October 2022 via Microsoft Teams, at 8:30



1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Ms Waseefa Dhansay officially opened the meeting at 8:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Members of Committee

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD) (Chairperson)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM) (Senior Heritage Officer)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Chane Herman (CH) (Heritage Officer)
Mr Robin George (RG) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport (SB) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Natalie Kendrick (NK) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SnJ) (Heritage Officer)
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ) (Heritage Officer)

Members of Staff

Ms Aneeqah Brown-Adams (AB) (Secretary)
Ms Zikhona Signoya (ZS) (Admin Assistant)

Legal Advisor

Ms Penelope Meyer

Visitors

Mr. Philip Smith
Mr. Graham Jacobs
Ms. Karen Dugmore-Strom
Mr Jose Conde
Mr Reinier Visser

Observers

Ms Laura Milandri

3 Apologies

None

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

- 4.1 3 October 2022. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits and Additions. CM moves to adopt the agenda and CN seconds.

5. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

- 5.1.1 12 September 2022. The Committee resolved to approve the minutes approve with minor edits. CM moves to adopt the approval of the minutes and MS seconds.
- 5.1.2 26 September 2022. The Committee resolved to approve the minutes approve with minor edits. RG moves to adopt the approval of the minutes and CM seconds.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest

- 6.1 None

7. Confidential matters

- 7.1 None

8. Standing Items

8.1 Site inspections undertaken

8.2 Proposed Site Inspection

- 8.2.1 Item 11.8 Erf 170615, 52 Main Road, Kalk Bay - MS

8.3 Site Inspection Reports

- 8.3.1 None

8.4 Preparation for the upcoming Committee meetings

- 8.4.1 APM_5 October 2022 – Documentation and agenda has been issued

8.5 Interim and Close out Reports

None

8.6 Incomplete Applications

See individual cases

9. Administrative Matters

9.1 Signing off and stamping of RODs

- Given concerns raised, the matter of signing and stamping will be reviewed

9.2 Stop works orders and unauthorized work database

- Officers are to update admin as to the status of unathoized works and associated site inspection reports to be drafted – these to be finalized as a matter of urgency

9.3 Archaeological site inspection, Erf 4716 Great Brak River, Western Cape Province (CM)

- The report by Dr Nilssen is noted- the Committee is of the view that Section 35 and 38 is not applicable in terms of the NHRA.

9.4 Advice / queries

- Advice matters for consideration to other committees must be placed on the HOMS agenda for consideration prior to escalating to other committees.
- In addition queries to be acknowledged and reviewed internally if unclear.

10. Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

11. MATTERS ARISING

**11.1 Proposed New Confined Animal Feeding Operations on Portions of The Farms Boontjieskraal 417 and Klipheuvel 416 Located West of Caledon in The Overberg District Municipality and Theewaterskloof, S38(8)-HIA Phase 2
Case No: 20083107SB0930E**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Phase 2 of the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA).
- The identification of heritage resources has been adequately mapped and documented.

INTERIM COMMENT

The HIA as submitted prepared by APelser Archaeological Consulting (APAC) dated September 2022 is not compliant with Section 38 (3) of the NHRA for the following reasons;

1. Although consultation has been noted within the HIA, it is unclear as to which I&As have been consulted (Refer to table provided within the HIA).
2. The recommendations as proposed need to be refined and clearly articulated in a numbered format.
3. The Committee notes the workplan included, however this can only be reviewed once the HIA requirements have been met.

SB

**11.2 Phase 1 Archaeological Survey of Approved Mining Areas at The Namakwa Sands Mine, Brand-se-Baai, Vredendal, S38(8)- HIA
Case No: 131024TS47**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Referred to APM for their expertise.

HELD OVER:

Referred to APM on 5 October 2022.

SB

11.3 Proposed development on Ptn 274 of Erf 959, Fairlands, Somerset West. S38(4)-NID
Case No: 22040106SB0912E

Under investigation – Case officer to engage with the applicant as well as the CoCT to ascertain the requirements of the proposal in relation to the NHRA.

SB

11.4 Proposed residential development on Portion 2 of the Farm De Leeuw No.527, Paarl, S38(8)-NID
Case No: 22082502SB0830E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 23 September 2022.
- There is reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.
- The site is in the blue (low) palaeo-sensitive area on the SAHRIS map.
- No previous studies have been done in the area according to SAHRIS.
- Previous precedent has been given that the route does have scenic qualities of heritage significance.
- Previously HOMs and Appeals committee resolved for HIA on Portion 2 of the farm Calais No 600, Paarl.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following specialist studies;

1. Visual Impact Assessment of the proposal on the cultural landscape

SB

11.5 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 7519, 13 Tygerberg Street, Goodwood, S34-A&A
Case No: 22072906CH0909E

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 27 September 2022
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

11.6 Proposed total demolition on Erf 1177, 30 Avenue, Fresnaye, S34-Total Demolition (TD)
Case No: 22081712CM0818E

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 6 September 2022.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO

- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Seapoint For All supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

CM

**11.7 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 6868, 28 Grove Street, Parow, S34-A&A
Case No: 22081902CM0822E**

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 6 September 2022.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CM

**11.8 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 170615, 52 Main Road, Kalk Bay, S34-A&A
Case No: 22081901MS0824E**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

Mr Philip Smith (CoCT) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO
- CoCT have not been consulted as submitted as a minor works application
- Given the inconsistencies with the documentation provided, the Committee is unclear as to what is being proposed and what has taken place on site.

HELD OVER:

Site inspection to be conducted.

MS

**11.9 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 28697, 1 Princess Street, Mowbray, S34-A&A
Case No: 22091907MS0919E**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 26 September 2022.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Rosebank and Mowbray Planning Aesthetics Committee had no objections.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

11.10 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 24306, Corner McFarlane & Main Street, Paarl, S34-A&A Case No: 22062917SJ0711E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Application was previously from BELCom.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as meeting the requirements of BELCom as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

11.11 Proposed Ceremonial Werf on Rem of PTN 12 of Farm 653, Somerset West, S38(8)-HIA – EA Amendment Report Case no: 22060310SJ0624E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 27 September 2022.

FINAL COMMENT

1. The Committee resolved to endorse the Amendment of The Environmental Authorisation Report dated September 2022, prepared by Kozette Myburg, as meeting the requirements of Section 38(3) of the National Heritage Resources Act.

The recommendations found in Annexure 13: Heritage Impact Assessment, page 9, dated August 2022, prepared by Stuart Hermansen, are supported, as follows:

- a. That this Heritage Impact Assessment satisfies the requirements of Sect 38 [3] of the NHRA;
- b. That the two non-conservation worthy [ungraded] labourer's cottages in the proposed Ceremonial Werf precinct may be demolished;
- c. The proposed design of the 'Ceremonial Werf' on the attached drawings conform to the Integrated Design Indicators, and therefore will have minimal impact on heritage resources;
- d. The visual impact of the proposed Ceremonial 'Werf' from the historic werf and broader context will be 'Low to Very Low' provided the mitigating measures described under Sect 1:28: Visual Impact Mitigating Measures [pp 30-32] are followed;
- e. Construction may commence once all other regulatory requirements have been met.

SJ

11.12 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1677, 222B High Level Road, Unit 5, S34-A&A Case No: 22091503TZ0915E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- Graded IIIB
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

TZ

11.13 Erf 2412, Corner Upper Buitenkant , Myrtle Street and Maynard Street, Gardens, S34-A&A minor works

Case No: 22091308TZ0915E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Proposal is for the boundary wall

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

TZ

11.14 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 752, Swartland Primary School, S34-A&A

Case No: 22091203TZ0915E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

Mr Graham Jacobs (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Inside historic core
- Minor works application

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

TZ

11.15 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 768, 15 Clydebank Road, Sea Point, S34-A&A

Case No: 22091208TZ0915E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

Mr Graham Jacobs (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- Graded IIIC

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

11.16 Proposed additions and alterations on Erven 3080 and 3081, 220, 222 Upper Buitengracht Street, S34-A&A
Case No: 22090906TZ0915E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- Citybowl Residents and Ratepayers Association did not support the proposal.
- Referred to BELCom for their expertise.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 13 October 2022.

11.17 Proposed additions and alterations on Farm 1311, Lievland Farm Klappmuts, S34-A&A
Case No: 22091406RG0915E

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

Mr Graham Jacobs (heritage consultant), Mr Jose Conde (insert) and Mr Reinier Visser (insert) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Stellenbosch Municipality did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- Ward Councillor did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- Simon van De Stel Heritage Foundation did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- Stellenbosch Interest Group supports the proposal.
- Vernacular Architecture Society of South Africa had no objections.
- South African Institute of Architects supports the proposal.

DECISION

1. The Committee does not recommend that charges be laid for the previously unauthorised work as these have not negatively impacted on heritage resources
2. The proposed work as indicated on drawings L2201/Q/101; L2201/Q/301 is approved as not negatively impacting on heritage resources.

11.18 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 62030, 10 Mellheim Road, Lansdowne, S34-A&A
Case No: 22062223RG

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 28 September 2022
- Graded Not Conservation Worthy
- Outside Heritage Protection Overlay Zone

- City of Cape Town supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

11.19 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 505, 303 High Level Road, Fresnaye, S34-A&A

Case No: 22021004CM0919E

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 29 September 2022.
- Graded IIIC
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Seapoint, Fresnaye and Bantry Bay Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.
- Seapoint For All did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CM

11.20 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 39058, 23 Honeyside West Road, Crawford, S34-A&A

Case No.: 22072517CN0801E

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 21 and 29 September 2022.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The Committee notes that work has started.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CN

11.21 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 979,114 St George Street, Simons Town S34-A&A

Case No.: 22072517KB0801E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 28 September 2022
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Simons Town Historical Society supports the proposal.
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

**11.22 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 14028, 87 Salisbury Street, Woodstock S34-A&A
Case No.: 22071417KB0714E**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 28 September 2022
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Woodstock Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

**11.23 Proposed Development of Erf 152098,10-17 Pine Close, Hanover Park, Cape Town
S38(4)-NID
Case No: 22081909KB0822E**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 27 September 2022
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

KB

12. NEW MATTERS

**12.1 Proposed clearance of vegetation on portion 56 of Farm 100, Robertson, S38(8)-NID
Case No: 22082515SB0920E**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Images of the site and its context to be provided.

SB

**12.2 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 293, 23 North Way, Pinelands, S34-A&A
Case No: 22092703SB0927E**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape images required.

SB

**12.3 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 37, 6 Gardenia Street, Thornton, S34-A&A
Case No: 22092608SB0927E**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- HOMs graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SB

**12.4 Proposed Development of The Witberg Wef Access Road in Central Karoo, S38(8)-HIA
Case No: 22081211SB0817E**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The Committee endorses the mapping and the assessment of the significance.

INTERIM COMMENT

The HIA as submitted prepared by CTS Heritage dated August 2022 is not compliant with Section 38 (3) of the NHRA; However, notes that the proposal is within the basic assessment phase and this Committee will have an opportunity to comment further.

The Committee endorses the identification, mapping and the assessment of heritage resources and will await further detailed development proposals.

SB

**12.5 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 377, 77 School Street, Paarl, S34-A&A
Case No: 22091309CM0921E**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Elevation, internal images and comments from DHF and Paarl300 required.

CM

**12.6 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 7624, 2 Hillside Road, Fish Hoek, S34-A&A
Case No: 22091404CM0921E**

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CM

**12.7 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 165,33 Le Roux Street, De Rust, S34-A&A
Case No: 22092311CM0926E**

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Work has already been completed.
- The Oudtshoorn Heritage and Municipality supports the application.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. A statement to be provided as to the impacts on the heritage resources based on the unauthorized work.
2. Plans are to be colored up showing the completed interventions.

CM

**12.8 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 212, 13 Disa Place, Bergvliet, S34-A&A
Case No: 22092607CM0926E**

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CM

**12.9 Proposed rezoning and development of the subdivided portion on Paapekuilsfontein
Farm 281, S38(8)-NID
Case No: 22092705CM097E**

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed are 27 single residential erven.
- The critical biodiversity area and ridgeline was highlighted as important features on the cultural landscape.
- There is reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following specialist studies;

1. Visual Impact Assessment (VIA) on the cultural landscape
2. Palaeontological Impact Assessment (PIA)

CM

**12.10 Proposed Diazville Clinic on Portion 24 of Farm 282, Kliprug, Saldhana Bay, S38(4)-NID
Case No: 22092602CM0926E**

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The new Diazville Clinic and ambulance station will be constructed on the southern Boundary of the site.
- Due to Palaeontological sensitivity, the consultant recommended monitoring during the construction phase.
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

CM

**12.11 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 94937, 73 Orange Street, Gardens, S34-A&A
Case No: 22091407KB0920E**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

Ms Laura Milandri was present as an observer.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

**12.12 Proposed additions, alterations and demolitions on Erven 1993, 1994 and 1998, 157 Kloof Nek, Table Mountain Nature Reserve, S34-A&A
Case No: 22092001KB0920E**

Under investigation – Documentation to be requested.

KB

**12.13 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 13488, 133 Kommetjie Road, Fish Hoek, S34-A&A
Case No: 22092609KB0926E**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

12.14 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 15255, 73 Plein Street, Paarl, S34-A&A
Case No: 20220913KB0926E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- HOMs graded IIIC
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the proposal.
- Paarl300 supports the proposal.
- The Committee does not deem the work to be minor in nature.

FURTHER REQUIRMENTS

1. Full Section 34 application form be submitted.
2. Applicant to confirm if the work has started
3. Revised Plan showing the work completed and the work that is still proposed.

KB

12.15 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 3421, 42 Main Road, Paarl, S27-A&A
Case No: 22072607KB0926E

Under investigation.

1. Applicant to supply detailed set of plans appropriately scaled and coloured up.
2. Applicant to provided 3D renderings of the proposed interventions.

KB

12.16 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 94992, 101 Kloof Street, Gardens, S34-A&A
Case No: 22092201KB0926E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

Ms Karen Dugmore-Strom was present and took part in the discussion as an I&AP.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO
- The Committee notes that previous proposals have been submitted, these are unclear as this stage if implemented
- The structure has landmark qualities and the interventions as actioned does set a negative precedent for the site and surrounding heritage resources
- Concerns were raised as to the interventions adaptation into a permanent structure as well as the material used

FURTHER REQUIRMENTS

1. The Committee notes the unauthorized work that has taken place on site and has concerns regarding the precedent and the graded IIIA resources. The Committee therefore requires a heritage statement clarifying all previous approvals in place as well as the impacts of the unauthorized work currently before the Committee.
2. This report is to be submitted to HWC within 60 days of receipt of this letter.

KB

**12.17 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 170668, 93 Newlands Avenue, Newlands, S34-A&A
Case No: 22092102MS0922E**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

Ms Karen Dugmore-Strom (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- The Committee recommends that CoCT to consider grading and its surrounds.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

**12.18 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 60, 57 Waterkant Street, Stillbaai Wes, S34-A&A
Case No: 22092211MS0922E**

FURTHER REQUIRMENTS

Coloured up set of plans required.

MS

**12.19 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 687, 7 Alice's Ride, Pinelands, S34-A&A
Case No: 22091305MS0922E**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Pinelands Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

**12.20 Proposed total demolition on Remainder Farm Kreefte Bay 368, Malmesbury, S34-Total
Demolition
Case No: 22070423MS0922E**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Saldanha Bay Municipality deferred the decision to HWC.
- West Coast National Parks did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- Site has been stripped and does not have heritage value

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

MS

- 12.21 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 325, Riebeeck Valley Special School Girls Hostel, S34-A&A-Minor Works**
Case No: 22092307MS0926E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Plans to be coloured up and application form to be completed where applicable.

MS

- 12.22 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2035, 9 Ark Street, Riebeeck West, S34-A&A- Minor Works** Case No: 22092308MS0926E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Plans to be coloured up and application form to be completed where applicable.

MS

- 12.23 Proposed roof repairs on Erf 1424, Former Tafelberg School, Sea Point, S27-Roof Repairs**
Case No: 220300812MS0927E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Application form to be completed where applicable.

MS

- 12.24 Various Erven, Lourens River Diversion Canal, Somerset West, S38(8)-NID**
Case No: 22092203NK0923E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- There is no reason to believe that the impact to heritage resources is significant.
- The area has been built up and is along existing structures.
- The requirements of a section 34 application for structures older than 60 years is required before permitting.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

NK

- 12.25 Proposed Struisbaai Stormwater Infrastructure upgrade, RE 856 and 5178, Cape Agulhas, S38(8)-NID**
Case No: 22092302NK0923E

Under investigation - Case officer to clarify archaeological and palaeontology concerns with the applicant and refer application back to HOMs.

NK

12.26 Proposed clearance of vegetation on Erf 1882, De Doorns, S38(8)-NID

Case No: 22092202NK0923E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The clearance of vegetation does not change the character of the landscape
- It is unlikely that there is preservation of fossil at this site due to water runoff from the higher terrain
- A survey has already identified stone tools, however there were only 3 and of low/no significance
- There is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

NK

12.27 Proposed mixed use development on Portion 23, Farm Nooitgedacht, Stellenbosch S38(8)-NID

Case No: 22092304NK0923E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The site is bordered to the North by Kromme Rhee Road and the Holy Spirit Roman Catholic Church, to the east by the railway line and to the west by the R304. The Catholic Church has been identified as a place of social significance by a member of the Aboriginal Customary Council Stellenbosch Cochoqua Tribe
- The site is located close to 3 significant historic erfs, two are proposed grade IIIC, and one is proposed grading of IIIA
- The proposed development is quite an intrusion into the landscape and the practitioner recommends an HIA with reference to a Visual Impact assessment on the socio historic landscape

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following specialist studies;

1. Visual Impact Assessment on the cultural landscape

NK

12.28 Proposed mixed use development on Erf 2111, Riebeek Kasteel, S38(8)-HIA

Case No: 21100104NK1105E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The finding is that "In principle, development of the property concerned as proposed is supported. Future development in accordance with the SDF will reduce the sensitivity of the study area and the topography around the site limits visibility to the site from surrounding areas."
- The proposal does not have an impact on the cultural landscape or the historic core of Riebeek Kasteel
- There were no objections based on heritage grounds from I&AP

FINAL COMMENT

The Committee endorses the HIA as meeting the requirements of the S38(3) of the NHRA and the following recommendations on page 49 of "Pre-app HIA Erf 2111 Riebeek Kasteel September 2022" (Cindy Postlethwayt)

1. In terms of Section 38(8) of the NHRA supports the proposed development of Erf 2111 Riebeek Kasteel provided it is executed generally in accordance with (and in all heritage related aspects) the Development Framework, Design Ethos Statement, Landscape Master Plan and design motivation included in Annexure E to this report. Subject to the mitigations listed on pages 44 to 47 of this report

NK

12.29 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 177698, 65 Main Road, Mowbray, S34-A&A Case No: 22092212RG0923E

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Inside Heritage Protection Overlay Zone
- The City of Cape Town did not provide commentary within the 30-day period
- The Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee did not provide commentary within the 30-day period

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

12.30 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 34348, 33 Thornton Road, Athlone, S34-A&A Case No: 22092105RG0923E

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded Not Conservation Worthy
- Outside Heritage Protection Overlay Zone
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

12.31 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 4006, 35 Plein Street, Fairfield Estate, Parow, S34-A&A Case No: 22092101RG0923E

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

12.32 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 722, 86 Avenue St Charles, Fresnaye, S34-A&A Case No: 22081112RG0923E

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal
- Sea Point, Fresnaye, Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association supports

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

12.33 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 7477, 13 Schilpadvlei Road, Constantia, S34-A&A Case No: 22092303RG0923E

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

Ms Sandy Surnam and representation was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Outside Heritage Protection Overlay Zone
- City of Cape Town notes that work has been completed
- Constantia Residents and Ratepayers had no objections
- Friends of Constantia Valley Greenbelt had no objections
- The Committee notes the work that has been completed

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. The Committee requires further consultation to be conducted for 30 days with the BRGC, upon receipt of the comment or evidence of consultation, the Committee will review the application further.

RG

12.34 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1417, 179 Seventh Avenue, Grassy Park, S34-A&A Case No: 22092216RG0926E

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside Heritage Protection Overlay Zone
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

12.35 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 7144, 42 Oldham Street, Parow, S34-A&A Case No: 2001806RG0926E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Proof of payment required.

RG

12.36 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 80454, 33 Fourth Road, Healthfield, S34-A&A Case No: 22092605RG0926E

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

12.37 Proposed mixed use development on Farm 819-RE Paarl, S38(8)-HIA Case No: 21082702AM0901E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Landmark brick kiln chimney and workers' cottages on the property are older than 60 years.
- Brick kiln chimney was suggested for retention as a reminder of historical use.
- All buildings are noted as being not conservation worthy.
- The site forms part of numerous properties which are not considered to comprise a landscape of heritage significance and situated between three proposed heritage protection overlays (Agter Paarl, Wemmershoek Slopes and Simonsberg Slopes). In general, these are not considered to be visually sensitive.
- Low palaeosensitivity.
- Archaeological significance is low as the site was previously used a quarry and has a history of agricultural activities.

FINAL COMMENT

The Committee resolved to endorse the HIA by Cindy Postlethwayt dated September 2022 as meeting the requirements of Section 38 (3) with the recommendations on page 69;

It is recommended that Heritage Western Cape:

- In terms of Section 38(4) of the NHRA approves the proposed development of Farm 819-RE, Paarl provided it is executed generally in accordance with (as pertains to the heritage and visual related aspects) the Development Framework, Urban Design Report, Landscape Concept Plan, and proposals for signage and boundary treatment along the R45as included in Annexure E to this report.

- In terms of Section 38(3) of the NHRA approves the demolition of all structures on site older than 60 years with the exception of the historic kiln chimney.

Subject to:

- The satisfactory conclusion of the ESTA process in respect of the housing of existing tenants who meet the criteria contained in said legislation, prior to the re-development of the Northern Infill Housing Precinct.
- The mitigations included on pages 66 to 69 of this report.
- Should the proposal undergo significant change during further design processes, a visual impact statement must be issued by a suitably qualified specialist to re-assess the potential visual impact and determine if the findings of this study remain unchanged.

AM

**12.38 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1347, 3 Second Street, Wellington, S34-A&A
Case No: 22042813TZ0928E**

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Within historic core of Wellington area
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the proposal.
- Drakenstein Heritage Foundation supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. Streetscape and internal images are submitted.

TZ

**12.39 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 24135, 6 Khan Street, Paarl, S34-A&A
Case No: 22051803TZ0928E**

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- The site falls outside a Special Character Protected Area Overlay Zone of Paarl.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. Streetscape and internal images are submitted.

TZ

**12.40 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 55722, 7 Kinkleway Avenue, Newlands, S34-A&A
Case No: 22092610TZ0927E**

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

TZ

- 12.41 **Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 331 and 334, 15A and 15B Hof Street, Hopefield, S34-A&A**
Case No: 22092306TZ0926E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:
Coloured up plans required.

TZ

- 12.42 **Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 383, 13 Market Street, Hopefield High School Girls Hostel, S34-A&A**
Case No: 22092305TZ0926E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:
Coloured up plans required.

TZ

13. OTHER MATTERS

14. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions CM moves to adopt the decisions and resolutions and CN seconds.

15. CLOSURE: 12:50

16. DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 10 October 2022

Chairperson.....

Secretariat: