



**Western Cape
Government**

Community Safety

**POLICING NEEDS AND PRIORITIES 2018/19
COMMUTER SAFETY WORKSHOP REPORT**

28 NOVEMBER 2018

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND.....	4
2. PROJECT OBJECTIVES.....	5
3. METHODOLOGY.....	5
3.1 Target group.....	6
3.2 Structure of the workshop.....	6
4. LIMITATIONS OF THE CONSULTATIONS.....	6
5. SUMMARY OF KEY PRESENTATIONS.....	7
5.1 Opening remarks by Ms Amanda Dissel, Director: Policy and Research, Department of Community Safety.....	7
5.2 Presentation by Mr Neil Arendse, Manager: Transport and Urban Development Authority, ...8 City of Cape Town.....	8
5.3 Presentation by Mr Yasir Ahmed, Chief Director: Transport Regulation, Department of Transport and Public Works.....	10
5.4 Presentation by Mr Richard Walker, Regional Manager: Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa (PRASA).....	13
5.5 Presentation by Colonel PP Ndzimela, Operations Commander: Rapid Rail Police Unit.....	15
6. FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS.....	17
The participants were split into focus groups to look at what is currently working well, what are the key challenges, and what measures need to be taken to improve the situation.	17
6.1 What is working well?.....	17
6.2 What are the key challenges?.....	18
6.3 What measures need to be taken?.....	19
6.4 What must be prioritised and by whom?.....	22
7. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	25
8. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	28

ACRONYMS

ANPR	Automatic Number Plate Recognition Camera System
CCTV	Close Circuit Television
CMOCC	Cape Metrorail Operational Control Centre
CoCT	City of Cape Town
CPF	Community Police Forum
CPI	Combined Private Investigation
CSIP	Community Safety Improvement Partnership
DoCS	Department of Community Safety
DOJ & CD	Department of Justice and Constitutional Development
DTPW	Department of Transport and Public Works
EPWP	Expanded Public Works Programme
GABS	Golden Arrow Bus Service
GBV	Gender Based Violence
KPI	Key Performance Indicators
MOA	Memorandum of Agreement
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MPS	Metrorail Protection Service
MTEF	Medium Term Expenditure Framework
NHW	Neighbourhood Watch
NPA	National Prosecuting Authority
NRCCF	National Rail Crime Combating Forum
PNP	Policing Needs and Priorities
PRASA	Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa
PRCCF	Provincial Rail Crime Combating Forum
PTI	Public Transport Interchange
PTRS	Public Transport Regulation System
RRPU	Rapid Rail Police Unit
RSR	Rail Safety Regulator
SANTACO	South African National Taxi Council
SAPS	South African Police Service
SARS	South African Revenue Services
SSA	State Security Agency
TFR	Transnet Freight Rail
TPC	Transport Priority Committee
VisPol	Visible Policing
WCG	Western Cape Government

1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

As part of its annual Policing Needs and Priorities (PNP) consultations, the Department of Community Safety (DoCS) decided to focus its attention on three themes for 2018/19 namely Gender-Based Violence (GBV), Commuter Safety and Policing of Drugs. The Commuter Safety workshop, which was hosted at the Townhouse Hotel in Cape Town on the 28th November 2018, was the last one of the three workshops. The workshop was hosted in partnership with the Western Cape Department of Transport and Public Works to provide content expertise into the structure and process for the workshop. The workshop aimed to feed into the determination of the policing needs and priorities mandated by Section 206 of the Constitution and Section 23 of the Western Cape Community Safety Act,¹ in terms of which the Minister of Police is obliged to seek input from provincial governments about their policing needs and priorities.

The key aims of the Commuter Safety workshop were to:

- Determine policing needs and priorities on commuter safety in order to formulate policy or other recommendations for stakeholder implementation.
- Submit the determined needs to the national Minister of Police to take into consideration when resource allocation is done.

These workshops are part of the departmental 'whole of society' approach that seeks to build safety, not for the community but with it. The aim is to ensure that provincial government departments are responsive to the safety needs of communities, to enhance efficiency through the integration of services, to establish partnerships and to include communities in local structures created around safety.² The PNP thematic workshops feed into the DoCS Community Safety Improvement Partnership (CSIP) which has the following objectives:

- Promotion of professional policing through effective oversight;
- Making public buildings and spaces safe; and
- Establishing viable safety partnerships within communities.

Commuter Safety has consistently been raised and recorded as a concern at PNP workshops conducted by the Department since 2015 and therefore called for focused attention. The workshop brought together key players and experts in the various fields to intensely engage and discuss the challenges, to identify the policing needs and priorities, and to develop recommendations to adequately address commuter safety. It provided a platform to share best practices, look at policy options, and identify creative and evidence-based solutions. It also examined the roles of different stakeholders and addressed the systemic shortcomings in policy implementation. This enables the Department to make policy or other recommendations and to articulate the key policing needs and priorities for the Western Cape.

¹ Act 3 of 2013.

² CSIP Blueprint, 2016.

2. PROJECT OBJECTIVES

- To identify the policing needs and priorities for the Western Cape Province pertaining to commuter safety;
- To focus on key themes and stimulate debate to consider key policy positions, policy gaps and decisions;
- To improve stakeholder relations around key themes where these are lacking;
- To influence the allocation, distribution and utilisation of policing and safety resources in line with the identified policing needs and priorities and safety concerns;
- To facilitate communication between the Department and local community representatives and other key stakeholders;
- To encourage stakeholders that are active in the field of safety and security to partner with the Department in the context of the “whole of society” approach to address crime and safety levels;
- To improve inter-governmental and multi-sectorial relations in the public transport industry with the aim of improving commuter safety across different modes of transport in the Western Cape;
- To make policy or other recommendations on commuter safety.

3. METHODOLOGY

The Commuter Safety workshop was a one-day consultative workshop where various key stakeholders and representatives from civil society were invited.

Fifty one (51) participants took part in the workshop on 28 November 2018. The workshop started off with presentations setting the scene, introducing the purpose of the workshop and the process of compiling a report, followed by focus group discussions. After the presentations, the floor was opened for questions and answers which were directed to the presenters. The plenary was divided into four randomly assigned focus groups with 10 to 15 participants per group to discuss four predefined questions namely:

- What is working well?
- What are the key challenges?
- What measures need to be taken to address the challenges?
- What must be prioritised and by whom?

The four hour-long focus group discussions were moderated by facilitators from DoCS. The facilitators were responsible for collating and capturing the group's inputs onto a worksheet. Each group also had a scribe that was responsible for writing up the discussions of the group and recording the discussions with a digital voice recorder. The focus groups then reported back to the plenary and further questions and discussion ensued.

3.1 Target group

Invitations were extended to key stakeholders and experts from various fields including:

- Local and Provincial Government Departments
- The South African Police Service (SAPS) as well as Rapid Rail Unit
- Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa (PRASA) and Metrorail
- Rail Safety Regulator (RSR)
- Golden Arrow Bus Service (GABS)
- South African National Taxi Council (SANTACO)
- Civil Society Organisations
- Academic Institutions
- Community Police Forums (CPF)
- Accredited Neighbourhood Watches (NHW)

3.2 Structure of the workshop

The workshop was opened by Ms Amanda Dissel, Director: Policy and Research from DoCS. Thereafter, Mr Neil Arendse, Manager: Transport and Urban Development Authority from the City of Cape Town made a presentation on the challenges facing commuters in the City of Cape Town and the City's response to them. Mr Yasir Ahmed, Chief Director: Transport Regulation from the Department of Transport and Public Works presented on tackling the root causes of crime and violence in the public transport sector. Thereafter Mr Richard Walker, Regional Manager from PRASA made a presentation on the challenges facing commuters on trains and PRASA's response to them. The final presentation was made by Colonel PP Ndzimela, Operations Commander from SAPS Rapid Rail Unit focusing on what the Rapid Rail Unit is doing to improve safety on trains.

The presentations were followed by focus group discussions. After the focus group discussions, each of the four group facilitators gave feedback to the plenary on the discussions that took place within their respective groups. This was followed by a short summary on the key recommendations to improve commuter safety on trains and public transport hubs.

4. LIMITATIONS OF THE CONSULTATIONS

- The target group for the workshop represented specific interest groups and while at least one person attended from each group, they were not necessarily there in a 'representative' capacity or representing the views of the larger stakeholder group.
- The time frame allocated for discussions was limited. However, since most participants were well versed in the topic, it was more likely that they represented the issues relevant to Commuter Safety.

5. SUMMARY OF KEY PRESENTATIONS

5.1 Opening remarks by Ms Amanda Dissel, Director: Policy and Research, Department of Community Safety

Ms Dissel thanked everyone for attending the workshop and explained that this was part of the annual policing needs and priorities process. The Constitution requires the Minister of Police to determine the national policing needs and priorities annually based on the determination of the provincial policing needs and priorities. He must take this into consideration when allocating policing resources and he may make provision for different policies based on the needs determined by each province. Each Province must, through the Minister of Community Safety, determine the provincial policing needs and priorities and submit this to the national Minister of Police. The Western Cape Community Safety Act obliges the Department to submit the PNPs to the Standing Committee for Community Safety which may allow an opportunity for public debate and comment and then that gets submitted to the Provincial cabinet for adoption before it goes to the Minister. Ms Dissel said that this is a very important opportunity to raise issues that affect safety and policing in the Province and to make recommendations around the allocation of resources, the development of appropriate responses, plans of action and strategic direction affecting safety and policing in the Province.

This year the Department wanted to identify safety and policing needs around particular thematic issues. Three themes were selected that are key issues affecting safety in the Western Cape.³ With this workshop the Department invited stakeholders from the public transport environment as well as some CPF members and some of the key affected areas.

While there have been some developments around new transport nodes, there are still many concerns around safety on public transport. The Department and the province more generally, is concerned about the safety of commuters on trains, buses, taxis, on the platforms and various transport hubs. There is a clear need for the different departments and entities concerned with public transport to work together to enhance safety. This workshop is intended to start that process of formulating recommendations to improve safety.

³ Gender-based violence; substance abuse; and commuter safety.



5.2 Presentation by Mr Neil Arendse, Manager: Transport and Urban Development Authority, City of Cape Town



Mr Arendse pointed out that public transport is the way of the future. He said that the COCT wanted to achieve collaborative safer transport teams. In 2017 The United Nations predicted that 70% of the

population will live in cities by 2030. That is a serious concern as there are cities whose population is close to the population of South Africa, such as Tokyo with 37.2 million residents. Urbanisation is going to create a situation where cities are forced to ensure that they rely on public transport. The railway is the backbone of public transport in the City. The City tries to support Metrorail whenever they can.

Cape Town is one of the most congested cities in South Africa and this creates unanticipated challenges. He quoted Brent Toderian, as referenced by Nolu Mthimkulu (July 2017), saying “The best way to address mobility challenges, is to fund smart public transit investment, while also making decisions, both land use and transportation-related, that support more inviting movement choices through transit, walking and cycling.”

Given this, what is the mobility then for the future? The City advocates that the future lies in cycling. Transport studies reveal that cities should promote cycling and walking which are healthier lifestyle choices and reduce traffic congestion. Cities therefore need to invest in the necessary infrastructure to ensure that children can cycle to school. In the South African scenario, the majority of people make use of taxis. Many people are forced to walk since they can't even afford public transport.

More than 70% of South Africans or Cape Town residents make use of public transport. Most of them are school children. But there are often problems with public transport, and at times the authorities are faced with situations where 39 children are crammed into one taxi placing all children at huge risk.

The City of Cape Town surveyed commuters to understand the public transport environment and challenges facing commuters at public transport interchanges. A personal sense of insecurity, especially amongst women and children, are some of the biggest issues that commuters have, fear moving to and from ranks and interchanges – both in the mornings and evenings. Parents are concerned for the safety of their children because they go separate routes. There is also drug peddling at interchanges and taxi ranks. Better visible policing is needed to act as deterrent to criminals. Commuters feel safer when they see uniformed officers on the street.

Hence the City identified a need for dedicated transport enforcement teams as one of the solutions. The City learned during an exchange visit of the London Model which had two teams. One that deals with traffic policing and regulations, and the other called: “Safer Transport Teams” (STT) to deal with reassurance policing, problem-solving, community liaison and crime prevention. This is what is needed in Cape Town. Upon return from London, the City of Cape Town launched the City's Transport Enforcement Unit. The focus areas of this unit include public transport safety and security, public transport traffic policing, public transport regulation and revenue protection.

The City signed a memorandum of agreement with the Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa (PRASA) in April 2018. The City is also trying to address the future focus on motorised and non-motorised public transport. The Rail Enforcement Unit that was established in collaboration between the City, PRASA and the Western Cape Government has had some successes. They have made some cable theft arrests and removed dangerous weapons from people travelling on trains. He quoted Matt Skade, UCT (October 2015) saying “Safe and reliable public transport systems and resources are fundamental components of functioning, integrated and resilient cities.” Dedicated transport enforcement is the way to go.

In addition, the CoCT have Law Enforcement Officers responsible for safety at public transport interchanges, high visibility patrols on public transport routes (road and rail) and crime prevention through environmental design. There is always that need for collaboration. Safer Transport Teams are tasked to ensure collaboration with the necessary agency that can support them such as SAPS Sector Policing, Metro Police, Neighbourhood Safety Teams and neighbourhood watches.

5.3 Presentation by Mr Yasir Ahmed, Chief Director: Transport Regulation, Department of Transport and Public Works



Mr Yasir Ahmed focused on taxi violence which impacts commuter safety directly and indirectly. He gave an overview of what the Western Cape Government, together with the City of Cape Town, South African Police Service and other stakeholders are doing to address the issue of taxi violence. He highlighted that the public is daily faced with railway infrastructure being targeted, violence at taxi ranks and gang conflict zones where commuters are caught in crossfire with sometimes tragic results. Recently a 16-year old girl lost her leg after she was shot at the Delft taxi rank. Mr Ahmed argued that to ensure that commuters are safe, there is a need to look at the root causes of taxi violence and in so doing make the lives of commuters safer while ensuring their dignity. The dignity of commuters is impacted by the violence as well as the poor infrastructure that government provides. He gave an example of a public toilet at a taxi rank that had no door. The taxi routes and infrastructure are owned by government, not by taxi associations.

There is poor integration on the management of interchanges on PRASA properties and the Western Cape Government and City of Cape Town are addressing it. Many facilities are in a shocking state which impact on the dignity of commuters. Safety and dignity go hand in hand. Commuters must be given a voice to express their frustrations directly to government.

In 2018, Mr Ahmed reported that there were 90 taxi-related murders and 60 attempted murders. The numbers were confirmed by the police and National Prosecuting Authority and were confirmed as taxi-related. The root causes of taxi violence are weak planning and regulation (archaic systems, weak data, corruption, lack of capacity, subsidy, overtrading, reactive regulation and interference), flawed enforcement (complicity, abdication, fear, favouritism, capacity, siloed data and corruption), organised crime (extortion, smuggling, assassinations, intimidation, racketeering, gangs, fragmented response and fraud), greed (gatekeeping, 'taxation', route/turf invasions, 'reckless' recruitment and leadership battles), and culture of lawlessness (entitlement, captive market, abdication, vehicle standards, lack of training and fear).

To improve planning and regulation the Western Cape Government drafted Provincial legislation to strengthen or fill gaps in national legislation, for example the Western Cape Transport Framework Bill. It also introduced the Public Transport Regulation System (PTRS) that will allow better monitoring of operating licenses, integration of planning, survey and operating license data, a Transport Intelligence Centre (Hub) funded for fast-tracked implementation over the MTEF period, training of municipal officials in transport regulation, and processes to prevent backlogs in Operating License applications.

The Department intends to empower law enforcement officers with tools and systems that will allow them to work smarter. Currently the regulation system is integrated with the Automatic Number Plate Recognition (ANPR) camera systems. The Transport Intelligence Centre (Hub) links regulation systems with enforcement technology to allow officers to verify operating licenses, vehicle registration and driving license details. Stolen vehicles or vehicles involved in crimes can be tracked via ANPR networks – it sends alerts when listed registration numbers are spotted. The next phase is to integrate municipal and provincial contravention systems.

Organised crime is a major issue that the Department is addressing, firstly through a functioning Transport Priority Committee for integrated government response and planning. A Joint Task Team on taxi-related crimes was established between SAPS, NPA, Transport and Public Works, SSA, SARS and DoCS where taxi-related crimes are defined and adopted by the Provincial Joints. There is a dedicated team of detectives assigned to investigate taxi-related murders and 'hits'. The number of arrests in 2018 surpasses the number of arrests in the last six years. There is a single repository of taxi-related crimes established and jointly updated by SAPS, NPA and Transport. Lastly, there is a dedicated reporting line for taxi related violence and incidents.

The Department monitors the Annual General Meetings of taxi associations – including audited financial statements. There are independent electoral monitors to supervise regional and provincial taxi council elections. The Department also trains enforcement officers on the codes of conduct for Minibus Taxi Associations and Operators and partnered with the Department of Labour to monitor working conditions of drivers and other employees. In addition, the Department is also tracking the

hiring of operating licenses by 'gatekeeping' executives through changes in vehicle ownership. Mr Ahmed highlighted that there is a direct correlation between Provincial taxi council elections and taxi-related murders. During 2018 there was a spike in taxi-related murders because of the Provincial taxi council elections and there is a potential for another spike in five years' time which the police need to prepare for.

Commuter forums are being established to address the culture of lawlessness, to hold operators and government accountable and to give commuters a voice. The Department is in the process of establishing a task team on Rank Management in the City of Cape Town to take back control of ranks from taxi associations and introduce technology.

The Department is reviewing a vehicle marking system and introducing tracking and other technology to curtail route invasions, stop patrol vehicles that 'enforce' associations' laws and register taxi drivers so that they can be put through customer care training.

Mr Ahmed acknowledged that there is excellent work being done within the City of Cape Town and other municipalities. The Wallacedene taxi rank is a shining example. Cape Town is a design capital and has the expertise to design world class infrastructure and facilities. Technology already exists to monitor operations and for enforcement of regulations (e.g. access control to allow only operating license holders entry to taxi ranks).

Mr Ahmed proposed establishing an inter-governmental coordinating structure for the management of ranks and interchanges, and assigning a clear line of responsibility and accountability within the City of Cape Town for overall rank management. Where public transport interchanges (PTI's) are located on PRASA premises, closer collaboration should be established, and boundaries of responsibility be clarified (this type of discussion has started with the Station Deck project). Other initiatives include: introducing a roving City team that can randomly inspect other PTI's; categorise and set minimum standards and key performance indicators (KPI's) for infrastructure and operational management of ranks and interchanges; establish permanent visibility of Law Enforcement at high risk sites (with agreed definition of 'High Risk'); track incidents at PTI's to establish criminal trends in consultation with SAPS; install CCTV at all PTI's and ensure that it is linked to the Transport Monitoring Centre; upskill security monitoring staff and establish lines of communication between the CCTV monitors and Law Enforcement; enforce by-laws in terms of illegal trading and remove 'gatekeepers'; clamp down on illegal taxi operators at ranks through the use of technology and integrated systems (with DTPW); and fast track the establishment of a commuter forum to represent and articulate the needs and challenges faced by commuters.

Mr Ahmed announced that police officers in uniform can travel for free in Golden Arrow and My Citi buses and there is already an agreement with PRASA national for police officers to travel for free on trains.

He concluded that safe public transport is key to growth and the Western Cape Government has got all the building blocks for an excellent public transport system in the City of Cape Town and the Province.

5.4 Presentation by Mr Richard Walker, Regional Manager: Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa (PRASA)



Mr Walker introduced the corporate structure of PRASA which includes the different divisions and subsidiaries. In terms of the legislation PRASA is a national competency and is funded through the national Department of Transport and they have been brought into being by the Legal Succession Act, No. 89 of 1989. PRASA conforms to the National Land Transport Act and is required to provide Metrorail services in the Western Cape. They operate not only within the Metro but also across six other municipalities covering 75% of residential areas and are the backbone of public transport in the Western Cape, because rail is the most convenient and affordable means of travelling.

PRASA is supposed to have 88 train sets to operate but currently has 42 train sets. Their asset base is 123 stations covering 489 kilometers track and 70 rail level crossings within the province. They are also offering a service to Worcester – one service in and out in the morning and from the end of November 2018 they will open a brand-new station in Gouda. Everything runs into and out of Cape Town in the morning. PRASA is currently working on a future project to connect Khayelitsha through to Blue Downs.

The reason for the poor performance of Metrorail is vandalism of infrastructure, arson and coach vandalism caused mainly by the demand for copper. He said commuters did not set the trains alight because the trains were late. That is not the case in the Western Cape. There are criminal

elements that are taking advantage of the situation. The reasons for delay are faulty or damaged or stolen signals, mostly due to vandalism and copper theft. The reason for cancellations in the main is lack of rolling stock.

Based on ticket sales information, patronage in the Western Cape has dwindled from 15 430 060 passenger trips in October 2015 to 4 033 578 passenger trips in October 2018. Crime incidents occur all over the network and it's no longer concentrated in a few areas. Scrap dealers are allegedly colluding with criminals. 118 coaches were damaged between 2015 and 2017 and 56 in October 2018 through arson. These incidents happened at night while trains were stationary. There is no signal operation between Langa and Philippi due to vandalism and theft of signals. Trains operate there on a manual authorisation process which means that only one train can operate at a time. Crime has a negative impact in Area Central as a train driver was fatally shot at Netreg station in July 2016. The culprits were caught and sentenced. Two Metrorail Protection Services (MPS) members were ambushed. In Area Central PRASA cannot operate a service without armed escorts for the train crew. He pleaded that "We must rid our communities of guns and drugs. We need to look at how one approach this collectively."

To keep the system operating, PRASA appointed 88 guards to accompany train drivers and implemented other interventions such as fencing of the rail reserve, infrastructure recovery, rolling stock recovery, drones and Combined Private Investigations (CPI) and entered into a Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) with the City of Cape Town. The plan is to recover signaling in Area Central by December 2019. The Khayelitsha and Mitchell's Plain services share only two lines, and if anything goes wrong everything comes to a standstill.

PRASA plans to launch another 22 train sets by the end of March 2019 and are aiming to increase the service to about 60 train sets by March 2019.

PRASA contracted a company that does drone surveillance to protect what is left of the network and have seen great successes with the drone surveillance in terms of arresting criminals. The company appointed its own investigation team. There are 52 cases that were pending by 31 October 2018 and the accused in custody stood on 198. It is encouraging that offenders are now given imprisonment sentences when convicted, and one person was sentenced to 30 years imprisonment. PRASA have deployed Law Enforcement officers in the system.

There is a MOA which formalizes how PRASA works with the City in terms of the National Land Transport Act from a planning perspective.

Railway crime is on the increase nationally, but the Western Cape is no longer the highest due to the interventions that have been implemented.

PRASA is expecting new trains at the beginning of 2020 as part of their modernization process. PRASA is building a new depot in Paarden Island. Everybody needs to play their part. Mr Walker said, "We need to use interchange management as a real concept of making those hubs safer and take control away from the criminals and we need visible policing. The new trains will be coming on screen in the next 12 or 18 months and we must prepare for them holistically, infrastructure, law

enforcement, discipline and mind-set of our people to say this asset belong to us. We must entrench that sense of ownership and we are not going to destroy it because it's here to serve us."

5.5 Presentation by Colonel PP Ndzimela, Operations Commander: Rapid Rail Police Unit



Col Ndzimela said that the Rapid Rail Police Unit (RRPU) is a national unit located under SAPS Visible Policing. There are six units nationally. Gauteng North is also responsible for Limpopo, Gauteng South serves North West and then there is Port Elizabeth and East London in the Eastern Cape, KwaZulu Natal and Western Cape. She said some people may not even know that RRPU is a national unit because of the support that they get from the Provincial Commissioner, Lieutenant General Jula. The mandate of the RRPU is to provide optimal police visibility to ensure prevention and deterrence of crime in the rail environment, to provide a swift response service to emergencies such as train derailments, train accidents, commuter disorderly situations and crime scene management, to provide a rail corridor policing service that is accessible to commuters, stakeholders and citizens and to adopt a problem solving approach and support all crime prevention actions at police stations.

In terms of resources in the Western Cape the unit is led by a Brigadier. Then there are two colonels. One of them is mainly responsible for long distances while the other is responsible for the Metro. The unit is becoming understaffed due to transfers. It has a total of 575 members of which 102 are support staff and 473 operational members. These 473 members are deployed in four corridors namely Cape Town, Bellville, Philippi and Retreat. The unit has 52 vehicles; however most are aging and have surpassed 200 000 kilometres. The unit enjoys a lot of support from the Western Cape

Provincial Commissioner who appointed a senior member as Chairperson of the Transport Priority Committee which convenes weekly meetings to look at crime, taskings, ensures that the plans are compiled, presented, implemented and feedback provided. All clusters are assisting the unit. The unit works in an integrated way with the Province. Its main partner is PRASA. The unit has got a CMOCC (Cape Metrorail Operational Control Centre) that acts like a coordinating body and keeps information as well as assists in deployment. They have a CMOCC at PRASA and have the unit's operational room that is also doing the same functions. The unit consists of Provincial Detectives and Crime Intelligence officers.

PRASA is also responsible for deploying and protecting their own assets. RRPU have Transnet Freight Rail and Provincial FLASH that is responsible for implementing the Second-Hand Goods Act. Some government departments and Non-Profit Organisations have been co-opted to assist whenever the need arises and are partners during the 16 Days of Activism and Women's Month.

Col Ndzimela said there is a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between RRPU and Transnet Freight Rail (TFR), but there is no MOU between RRPU and PRASA/Metrorail. There are no Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) and no guidelines that exist between RRPU and PRASA.

Operationally there is a Provincial Rail Crime Combatting Forum (PRCCF) where all three partners meet on a weekly basis. The National Rail Crime Combatting Forum (NRCCF) meetings are convened bi-monthly by the national office. There is a need for a more comprehensive attendance of PRCCF meetings in order to address the problem of overcrowding on trains among other things.

The Unit has established working relations with PRASA and TFR Communication officers which resulted in the implementation of integrated projects. It appointed eight (8) Social Crime Prevention Coordinators – two per corridor focusing on conducting awareness campaigns, determined the number of awareness campaigns per corridor informed by crime patterns and crime threat analysis. Awareness campaigns were more effective during peak hours, especially in the early morning.

Col Ndzimela acknowledged that RRPU has very limited resources and need adequate human and material resources. Col Ndzimela recommended the following: intensify monitoring of joint deployments between RRPU and PRASA; intensify joint commuter and community engagement; improve communication with commuters to prevent anger and destruction of property; avoid overcrowding; use of volunteers to look after scholars to prevent crime by them and against them; and also look at how to source funding to pay stipends to volunteers; develop binding Standard Operating Procedures; finalise the MOU between RRPU and PRASA and establish a steering committee to monitor its implementation.

There is a clear need for a comprehensive annual plan that includes all the stakeholders especially relevant government departments, civil society, and CPFs who can mobilise the community. All these stakeholders need to sit together and develop an annual action plan. A steering committee should oversee the implementation of the plan. There must be joint training of PRASA and RRPU members to avoid partners working against each other.

6. FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS



The participants were split into smaller focus groups to look at what is currently working well, what are the key challenges, and what measures need to be taken to improve the situation.

6.1 What is working well?

Participants felt there are functional policies and legislative frameworks. The legislative framework is currently being strengthened.

There are stakeholder relations between government and civil society organisations. Civil society organisations have been and continue to be involved in commuter safety. Inter-governmental engagements from all spheres of government are working well, namely PRASA, City of Cape Town, Provincial government and SAPS and the Rail Enforcement Unit is a good example of this, although its sustainability is questioned in terms of continuous funding. At an operational level there is collaboration and synergy between the rail enforcement units, road transport units and SAPS. There is a newly elected leadership in the taxi industry and amongst other things it focuses on commuter safety.

There is a Provincial Joints platform where discussions about the integrated transport system are underway. The use of technology (drones) to monitor areas where cable theft is a problem has yielded good results in terms of arrests. In addition, the use of CCTV's and digital applications are

said to be working well. The Criminal Matters Amendment Act of 2015 is working for PRASA. The walking bus initiative is working well in some areas and should be implemented in other areas as well.⁴ In terms of safety on public transport, the use of social media by commuters to report incidents is said to be working well.

Even though there are serious challenges, it is acknowledged that efforts are being made by the Western Cape Government (WCG) and the City of Cape Town (CoCT) to put measures in place to make commuting safer. In addition, the CoCT offers rewards of R5 000 when information leading to arrests are made. The implementation of the special detectives by the Transport Priorities Committee (TPC) has led to an increase in the number of arrested suspects. The passenger forums hosted by the Golden Arrow Bus Services are working well in terms of representing the needs of the passengers. However, it needs to be expanded into other forums.

6.2 What are the key challenges?

Public transport across the board is under attack and is targeted by organised networks of criminals. There is a general feeling of lack of safety on public transport. Community members don't know who to speak to in government with regards to commuter safety issues. In addition, community members often don't report offences as there is a general feeling that the government seldom acts when the community speaks out. Communication between SAPS and PRASA is not satisfactory. This needs to be changed to improve response times.

There is a lack of resources – human resources and budgets are an issue. There is a perception of a lack of political or government will to accept the technological developments that are already available.

The taxi industry is often not included in discussions relating to commuter safety. Expectations of benefits from the community members when they are asked to engage with transport authorities is said to be a real challenge. The cost of transport was said to be one of the main challenges. In addition, an intermodal transport strategy is non-existent which would allow for a commuter to buy one ticket and use it for a taxi, bus and train.

Participants also expressed their concern about the nature of the relationship between PRASA and the Rail Safety Regulator (RSR). PRASA is required to comply with the safety requirements as prescribed by the RSR. PRASA's obligation is to ensure safe railway operations for both its workers and the commuters who rely on trains as their main mode of transport. It is the duty of the RSR to ensure that railways are safe, secure and reliable. There are common challenges when assessing the three most used modes of transport in the Western Cape. Robberies, assault and sexual harassment are prevalent. Generally, it was felt that there is a lack of intelligence by SAPS. At Nolungile station in Khayelitsha, for instance, commuters are robbed daily but because those incidents are not reported to the police, SAPS do not deploy more officers at the station. Like on

⁴The walking bus initiative organises groups of parents and responsible adults to walk with children from a certain point in their residential areas to schools to ensure their safety.

buses, vandalism is a frequent occurrence on trains (fleet), on the trackside and at the stations. In recent years, there has been an increase in both cable theft and arson attacks.

There is this perception that docketts relating to train incidents are placed at the bottom of the pile. In addition, substances (alcohol and drugs) are used openly by minors on carriages as there is no visible policing. The challenges faced with minibus taxis are the illegal operators and the bad behaviour of the drivers.

A range of other challenges were raised by participants and these include:

- i. Formalisation and transformation of the informal economy, specifically the taxi industry;
- ii. Lack of implementation of the existing legislation and policies;
- iii. Lack of commuter safety plans and commuter charters;
- iv. Lack of safety and unreliability of the rail system – trains are frequently delayed;
- v. Lack of broader stakeholder integration;
- vi. Prevalence of crime on public transport and fear of crime when commuters leave their homes to transport interchanges, train stations and taxi ranks;
- vii. Inadequate fencing in and around the train stations;
- viii. PRASA's non-compliance with the Court orders regarding compliance with the safety requirements prescribed by the RSR on the safety permit.

6.3 What measures need to be taken?

- 6.3.1 Strengthen civil society's voice to keep government and other stakeholders accountable.
- 6.3.2 Balance public transport as a social and economic good.
- 6.3.3 Develop a Strategic Annual Commuter Safety Plan to formalise relations between different stakeholders and develop an Integrated Policing approach for Public Transport with key indicators for success and implementation.
- 6.3.4 Consider safety as a system design issue so that it is seen as an integral part of the process.
- 6.3.5 Develop a multi-dimensional and comprehensive approach to commuter safety.
- 6.3.6 Conduct commuter safety audits at given intervals to gauge the safety levels of commuters using different modes of transport.
- 6.3.7 Professionalise law enforcement agencies by means of training, capacitation, resourcing and support.
- 6.3.8 Professionalise the taxi industry through training in customer services, business and financial management among other things.
- 6.3.9 Invest in public transport infrastructure upgrade and management. These include the bus terminus, taxi ranks, train stations and cycling stations.
- 6.3.10 Encourage business chambers to accommodate the current situation about challenges relating to public transport in general. For instance, the delays in the train services making employees to be late.
- 6.3.11 Strengthen the use of technology to improve commuter safety and communication on and off the train, bus and taxis.
- 6.3.12 Introduce an inter-modal transport strategy (single ticket for all modes of transport).

- 6.3.13 Increase visibility of SAPS and other law enforcement officers at public transport interchanges, taxi ranks and train stations.
- 6.3.14 PRASA officers to become Peace Officers which requires changes to the existing legislation.
- 6.3.15 Create favourable conditions for non-motorised transport.
- 6.3.16 More funding needs to be ring-fenced for the railway as it is the back bone of public transport.
- 6.3.17 Youth paid through EPWP can be deployed as a force multiplier at train stations.
- 6.3.18 SAPS must prioritise the investigation of reported cases. They need to increase investigative capacity.
- 6.3.19 SAPS need better communication and accountability from the top structure downwards so that they could be proactive. Thus, a dedicated transport police and a designated prosecutor from the National Prosecuting Authority (NPA) is needed.
- 6.3.20 In South Africa, it is not necessary to show any form of identification before using public transport. Legislation should be considered around this. A single fare collection system like the one used by Golden Arrow Bus Service should also be considered. These cards must be registered before commuting. Approximately 50% of individuals are registered voluntarily, though there is still some historical resistance to this idea. Metrorail should consider a fare card system (smart card). This could help with the overcrowding of carriages. It could also be an effective way of motivating people to travel if they feel safer.
- 6.3.21 Regular monitoring, better regulation and the closing of scrap yards in communities should be done.
- 6.3.22 Participants were of the opinion that there is no need for any new policies but those responsible should rather focus on the enforcement and the follow-up thereof. In addition, communities should also be educated about these policies.
- 6.3.23 There needs to be more coordination between the different transport authorities and different transport bodies. There is some coordination at a strategic level from the Prov Joints but there is not always sufficient coordination at an operational or intermediate level.
- 6.3.24 There is a need to include the private companies like Golden Arrow and those in the taxi industry in the collaborative initiatives as they are often left out.
- 6.3.25 There needs to be more targeted crime intelligence investigations into the crimes that are happening around the transport systems.
- 6.3.26 There needs to be joint planning in terms of the resource allocation and budgeting across different government departments.
- 6.3.27 There needs to be a strengthening of the existing operational plans and existing MOU's.
- 6.3.28 There needs to be an emphasis on the use of technological solutions like CCTVs and drones. In addition, the use of WhatsApp and other types of digital communications between the communities and public authorities as a form of passive security is important. This will allow the communities to communicate threats amongst themselves using WhatsApp and also report to the police or law enforcement.
- 6.3.29 The taxi industry needs to be included in the discussions around commuter safety. There needs to be some way of including them into the discussion and involve them in coming up with solutions, plans and taking responsibility for commuter safety.
- 6.3.30 There is a need for much more stakeholder engagement within communities. It is in the communities that people are affected by crime and criminality, so law enforcement needs to tap into community structures and allow their voices to be heard.

- 6.3.31 It is important to set up passenger forums or community forums where community structures can also take some responsibility for doing something in terms of commuter safety so that the responsibility is not only placed on government or transport authorities.
- 6.3.32 Lastly, there is a need for the development of commuter safety plans that are developed in collaboration with the communities.

6.4 What must be prioritized and by whom?

WHAT MUST BE PRIORITIZED?	BY WHOM?
COMMUTER SAFETY CENTERED SERVICES	
1. Strengthen civil society's voice	Department of Community Safety (DoCS), Department of Transport and Public Works (DTPW) and City of Cape Town (CoCT)
2. Commuter safety audits must be prioritised	Department of Transport and Public Works (DTPW) and City of Cape Town (CoCT)
3. A holistic commuter centered Safety Plan must be developed and be commuter safety focused.	DoCS, all Government Depts, Civil Society, SAPS, PRASA, CPF, NHW and street committees.
4. Conduct research on the public transport needs of vulnerable groups and people with disabilities and integrate into the Commuter Safety Plan.	DoCS, Local government, PRASA and DTPW
5. Joint commuter safety awareness campaigns to be designed, funded and implemented.	Stakeholders representing all modes of public transport, NGOs, SAPS, CoCT, and Western Cape Government.
6. The fears of commuters must be addressed by better policing and service delivery.	PRASA, SAPS, DoCS, DTPW and CoCT
7. Public transport should be considered as an essential service which limit interruptions to service through strike action.	National Department of Transport and National Parliament.
8. Engage with the taxi industry and passenger forums across the board.	Prov-Joints and DTPW

USE OF TECHNOLOGY	
9. Strengthen the use of technology	CoCT and other municipalities
10. Link CCTV cameras to the Transport Management Centre in Goodwood so that police or security officers can be dispatched whenever crime occurs.	Goodwood Transport Management Centre, PRASA, SAPS and Metro Police
11. Use of smart phones to share information about crime incidents.	SAPS and other Law Enforcement Agencies and PRASA
STRENGTHEN PARTNERSHIPS	
12. Finalise MOUs between PRASA and SAPS	PRASA and SAPS
13. Clear role definition amongst role players	DoCS
14. More regular engagements with key stakeholders and the community	SAPS, DTPW, and DoCS.
15. A joint budget or human resources plan across different government departments	Ministerial level (Minister of Transport) and Treasury
16. Strengthen existing operational plans and agreements	DTPW, CoCT, SAPS and PRASA
REPORTING OF CRIME AND PRIORITISATION OF CASES	
17. A central reporting mechanism for commuters when encountering crime must be established.	SAPS, DoCS, CoCT and PRASA
18. Establishment of specialised courts to prioritise cases related to cable theft (copper).	NPA
19. Prioritisation of cases/investigations in the public transport environment and crime intelligence.	SAPS, PRASA Protection Services

20. More amendments needed in terms of the classification of cases. For instance, arson attacks are not legally considered as arson but rather malicious damage to property because it is not an erected building.	SAPS, Department of Police, Department of Justice and Constitutional Development and National Parliament.
21. Increase police and security officers at public transport interchanges, bus terminuses, train stations and taxi ranks.	SAPS, PRASA and all security stakeholders.
OTHER	
SERVICE DELIVERY	
22. Inter-modal transport strategy (Implement a single ticket system for all modes of transport)	CoCT and other municipalities
23. RSR and PRASA should report to two different Ministers. Ideally RSR should report to Minister of Finance (Treasury).	National Cabinet, National Department of Transport, RSR and PRASA
24. Corruption needs to be addressed decisively. When alleged corruption is being reported on in the media, the public need to see decisive action and investigation and finalisation of such matters. Long delays in finalising cases makes commuters perceive there is no justice.	All stakeholders
25. Scrapyards in communities must be better regulated and monitored.	Department of Human Settlements and CoCT.
26. Better regulation of scholar transport.	DTPW, WCED
27. Better transport coordination between different transport authorities and bodies	SAPS and Prov-Joints, PRASA, RSR, DOCS, CoCT, Commuter Safety forums
28. Targeted crime intelligence operations	SAPS, Law Enforcement units and NPA
29. Infrastructure upgrade and management	CoCT and other municipalities

7. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- 7.1 Mr Werner Bezuidenhout from the Department of Community Safety concluded the session with a summary of the key concerns and policy implications impacting on commuter safety in the public transport environment. Commuters need a cost effective, safe and effective public transport system.
- 7.2 He highlighted the fragmentation of public transport. Taxis have operating licenses and the enforcement is done by local government. Buses have permits and the Department of Transport on provincial level is dealing with those permits. In terms of the commuter rail service PRASA as an arm of the national Department of Transport has an important overarching management responsibility in enabling Metrorail to operate such a service.
- 7.3 A critical challenge is that of mandates: which institution is mandated to deliver what type of function in terms of firstly the safety of commuters on trains and stations, and secondly, the safeguarding of assets [fixed assets and rolling stock] in that environment? In the historic context important developments took place, such as the legal process followed during 1986 to integrate the South African Railway and Harbor Police into the old South African Police [SAP]. This legislation, combined with relevant legislation in the transport environment, clearly determine mandates. A serious challenge is that key stakeholders such as SAPS, PRASA and Metrorail do not share a similar understanding of the actual implications of their respective mandates.
- 7.4 One of the challenges for SAPS is that there is no approved structure for their Rapid Rail Police Unit at national level, and therefore there can be no assessment of their actual versus approved personnel strength. The allocation and quality of vehicles provided to the unit is another concern. As was discussed in the workshop, although CCTV cameras was identified as a priority, many of them are not functioning. Much of the rail reserve is unfenced.
- 7.5 A combination of public unrest and criminal activity in the recent past reduced the train sets available for deployment in Cape Town. In these conditions commuter rail could no longer form the backbone of the public transport system in Cape Town, and feeder systems such as buses and minibus taxis filled the gap. Although the minibus taxi industry as transport mode is consistently growing in the number of passengers it transports, this industry is characterised by several realities that increase the danger for passengers they transport. In general, buses as transport mode is the safest of the three (3) modes.
- 7.6 As was noted several times, a poorly functioning commuter safety system has a severe impact on safety, commuter confidence and on the economy. The Cape Town Chamber of Commerce indicated during 2018 that as many as

85% of their members are negatively affected by the ineffectiveness of Metrorail to perform as expected.

He summed up with some of the key recommendations of the workshop:

7.7 Key stakeholders such as SAPS, PRASA and Metrorail should all agree and understand the actual implications of their respective mandates.

7.8 The commuter as the recipient of the service needs to be better consulted on their safety needs and should be engaged through social media and SMS short code platform options to give them a voice to express their frustrations directly to government.

7.9 SAPS must prioritise an approved structure for their Rapid Rail Police Unit at national and Provincial level, and oversight bodies such as DoCS need to monitor their resource allocation. New vehicles need to be procured for the Rapid Rail Police Unit. Furthermore, SAPS should consider a dedicated capacity for investigation of cases in the rail commuter environment.

7.10 The lack of management and maintenance of safety tools (non-functioning of CCTV cameras) to protect assets should be addressed as a matter of urgency by PRASA and Metrorail.

7.11 Stakeholders need to take urgent action in implementing initiatives that will enhance the safety of their passengers.

7.12 There is a need for a comprehensive plan of action involving all the relevant stakeholders including commuter representatives and a steering committee that will ensure implementation of that plan.

7.13 Establishing an inter-governmental coordinating structure for the management of ranks and interchanges and assigning a clear line of responsibility and accountability within the City of Cape Town for overall rank management is recommended.

7.14 Where public transport interchanges (PTI's) are located on PRASA premises, closer collaboration should be established, and boundaries of responsibility be clarified (this type of discussion has started with the Cape Town Station Deck project).

7.15 Introducing a roving City team that can randomly inspect other PTI's; categorise and set minimum standards and key performance indicators (KPI's) for infrastructure and operational management of ranks and interchanges; establish permanent visibility of Law Enforcement at high risk sites (with agreed definition of 'High Risk'); track incidents at PTI's to establish criminal trends in consultation with SAPS; install CCTV at all PTI's and ensure that it is linked to the Transport Monitoring Centre; upskill security monitoring staff and establish lines of communication between the CCTV monitors and Law Enforcement;

enforce by-laws in terms of illegal trading and remove 'gatekeepers'; clamp down on illegal taxi operators at ranks through the use of technology and integrated systems (with DTPW); and fast track the establishment of a commuter forum to represent and articulate the needs and challenges faced by commuters are other key recommendations.

7.16 The City advocates that the future lies in cycling and therefore need to invest in the necessary infrastructure to create an enabling environment.

7.17 Police officers in uniform can travel for free in Golden Arrow and My Citi buses and there is already an agreement with PRASA national for police officers to travel for free on trains. A circular need to be distributed to all policemen to inform them of these arrangements.

7.18 PRASA need to use interchange management as a real concept of making those hubs safer and take control away from the criminals and need to insist on visible policing. The new trains must be prepared for holistically, infrastructure, law enforcement, discipline and mind-set of people. PRASA must entrench that sense of ownership and cultivate a culture that people are not going to destroy it because they understand it's there to serve them."

7.19 There is a need for a more comprehensive attendance of PRCCF meetings in order to address the problem of overcrowding on trains among other things.

7.20 Whilst there is a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between RRP and Transnet Freight Rail (TFR), there is no MOU between RRP and PRASA/Metrorail. There are no Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) and no guidelines that exist between RRP and PRASA. This needs to be addressed as a matter of urgency.

7.21 SAPS recommended the following: intensify monitoring of joint deployments between RRP and PRASA; intensify joint commuter and community engagement; improve communication with commuters to prevent anger and destruction of property; avoid overcrowding; use of volunteers to look after scholars to prevent crime by them and against them; and also look at how to source funding to pay stipends to volunteers; develop binding Standard Operating Procedures; finalise the MOU between RRP and PRASA and establish a steering committee to monitor its implementation.

7.22 There is a clear need for a comprehensive annual plan that includes all the stakeholders especially relevant government departments, civil society, and CPFs who can mobilise the community. All these stakeholders need to sit together and develop an annual action plan. A steering committee should oversee the implementation of the plan. There must be joint training of PRASA and RRP members to avoid partners working against each other.

7.23 The walking bus initiative is working well in some areas and should be implemented in other areas as well.⁵

7.24 The passenger forums hosted by the Golden Arrow Bus Services are working well in terms of representing the needs of the passengers. However, it needs to be expanded into other forums.

⁵The walking bus initiative organises groups of parents and responsible adults to walk with children from a certain point in their residential areas to schools to ensure their safety.

8. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Department of Community Safety thanks all of the participants in the workshop for their valuable contribution towards a successful workshop.

DoCS officials:

Ms. Amanda Dissel
Mr. Bhekithemba Simelane
Mr. Patrick Njozela

Ms. Theresha Hanekom
Mr. Khumbulani Mfanta
Mr. Werner Bezuidenhout

Ms. Mamello Lekhanya
Mr. Yonwaba Mbarane
Ms. Shakirah Ariefdien

Ms. Charmaine Marman
Mr. Sibulele Sonka
Ms. Alicia Beerwinkel

Partners:

Mr. Yasir Ahmed
(Chief Director: Department of Transport and Public Works)
E-mail: Yasir.Ahmed@westerncape.gov.za

Mr. Neil Arendse
(Manager: City of Cape Town)
E-mail: Neil.Arendse@capetown.gov.za

Mr. Richard Walker
(Regional Manager: Passenger Rail Agency of South Africa (PRASA))
E-mail: richard.walker@prasa.com

Colonel PP Ndzimela
(Operations Commander: South African Police Service (SAPS))
E-mail: NdzimelaP@saps.gov.za