

**MEETING OF THE HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
SUPPLEMENTARY HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING (HOMS)**

Approved Minutes of the Supplementary HOM's Committee Meeting of
Heritage Western Cape held on Tuesday 18 February 2019, at 10H00 in the 8th
Floor Boardroom at the Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape
Town

1. Opening and Welcoming

The Chairperson, Ms Waseefa Dhansay, officially opened the meeting at 10:05 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)	Acting Assistant Director
Mr Andrew September(AS)	Heritage Officer
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)	Heritage Officers
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)	Heritage Officer
Mr Lwazi Bhengu(LB)	Heritage Officer
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)	Graduate Intern
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)	Graduate Intern
Mr Chris Snelling (CSn)	IACom Committee
Mr Mike Scurr (MS)	BELCom Committee
Ms Janine de Waal (JdW)	BELCom Committee
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)	Legal Advisor

HWC Staff

Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)	Administrative Clerk
--------------------------	----------------------

Visitors

Mr Nicolas Omar (NM)	Mr A.A. Omar (AM)
Mr AE Shalk(AeS)	Mr Johan Cornelius (JC)
Ms Clarice Arendse(CA)	Mr Richard Summers(RS)
Mr Gavin Dingle(GD)	Ms Nelia Wolfaardt(NW)
Mr Ashley Lillie (AL)	

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)	Deputy Director
------------------------------	-----------------

4. Approval of agenda

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 18 February 2019 with additional items and minor changes.

5. Approval of minutes of the previous meeting

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes dated 20 November 2018 with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of interest

- 6.1 Item 12.2 JdW
Item 12.1 CS
Item 13.3 CS and MS

7 Confidential Matters

- 7.1 None

8 Administrative Matters

8.1 Proposed Total Demolition at Re-Erf 24311, 10 and 12 Highgate Street, Maitland. S34.

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MAITLAND/RE-ERF 23733

See item 12.3

HB

8.2 Proposed additions and Alterations to existing structure of Erf 911, 79 Forest Drive, Pinelands. S34: HM/PINELANDS/ERF 911

See item 13.3

TZ

8.3 Wickboom Lane, Simons Town

The Committee noted that City of Cape Town (CoCT) has requested HWC to provide comment of the lifting of the weight limit on Wickboom Lane.

HWC recommends that the CoCT implements the following conditions:

1. Appropriate protective barriers (to protect the adjacent buildings from any physical damage caused by vehicles) to be installed on Wickboom Lane, without touching existing structures ("floor"/road mounted),
2. Measurement gauges to be located on the structures, as per engineer's recommendation,
3. Weekly report backs to be provided to CoCT and HWC recording any structural movement or other damage. Report back to be provided irrespective of any movement or not.

SB

8.4 Bay View Terrace, Simons Town

The case officer indicated that no further report has been provided and that this was requested in 2017.

As such a letter is to be written to the owners requesting reasons as to why criminal charges should not be laid.

HB

9. Other Committee Referrals

10. Appointments

10.1 Item 13.1 at 10h00

11. Section 27 - Provincial Heritage Sites

12 Section 34 - Total Demolitions

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition of 6 Nursery Road, Rondebosch, Erf 45531 HM/CAPE TOWN METROPLITAN/ RONDEBOSCH / ERF 45531

Case Number: 18071701SB0802E

Ms Stephanie Bernard gave a PowerPoint Presentation.

CSn recused himself and left the room.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- BELCom supported the total demolition however felt that the street scape had heritage significance and requested heritage indicators to inform the replacement structure with specific reference relating to the overall height and setback.

FURTHER REQUIRMENTS

The committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on the 27 February 2019 as the committee was unable to reach a consensus.

SB

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 64355, 297 Main Road, Kenilworth HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ KENILWORTH /ERF 64355

Case Number: 19011604SB0129E

JdW recused herself and left the room.

Stephanie Barnardt gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Mr Gavin Dingle was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The structure is graded III C within a proposed HPO

- The CoCT has supported the total demolition, however there have been objections regarding the implications and the wider effect the incremental demolitions has on the Heritage context
- The committee advised Mr Dingle that each application is assessed on its own merits, any potential demolitions and/ or alterations which affects structures older than 60 years in this area would undergo their own assessment
- Although the structure is in a proposed HPO, the immediate context possesses minimal heritage significance, and cannot be considered worthy of formal protection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed total demolition as the structure has insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

SB

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition at Re-Erf 24311, 10 and 12 Highgate Street, Maitland. S34.

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MAITLAND/RE-ERF 23733

Case Number: 18100101HB1018E

Ms Heidi Boise gave a PowerPoint Presentation.

Johan Cornelius was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

HWC has been made aware of I&APs who have not had sufficient notice of the meeting who would have liked to make representation.

DECISION

The Committee agreed that the I&APs should have the opportunity to be represented and resolved to refer the matter to BELCom 27 February 2019.

HB

13. Section 34 – Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolitions

13.1 Proposed Alteration & Additions of 8 Protea Street, Paarl, Erf 3914

HM / CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL / ERF 3914

Case Number: 18101001SB1024E

Stephanie Barnardt gave a PowerPoint Presentation.

Ms. Nelia Wolfaardt was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is graded III C
- Drakenstein Municipality and Paarl 300 supports the proposal
- Drakenstein Heritage Foundation does not support the two windows on the west elevation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal as not impacting on heritage significance. The applicant is to amend the roof plan/west elevation to illustrate the design correctly in terms of the junction of the existing dormer and the new roof.

SB

13.2 Proposed alteration and addition at Erf 285, 5 Dirkie Uys Street, Franschhoek, Stellenbosch

HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ FRANSCHHOEK/ ERF 285

Case Number: 19010803HB0115E

Ms. Heidi Boise gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- Stellenbosch municipality does not support the proposal.
- It was noted that the application contained very little information as to the exact nature of the impact of the proposed addition on the existing building, or wider streetscape.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

- A Heritage statement is required to identify the site in its heritage context within the wider area. The applicant is to utilise the approved Stellenbosch Heritage management guidelines.
- A full set of plans, including plans, sections and elevations, depicting the existing building and new interventions are to be provided.

HB

13.3 Proposed additions and Alterations to existing structure of Erf 911, 79 Forest Drive, Pinelands

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ PINELANDS/ERF 911

Case Number: 18121402TZ1219E

MS and CSn recused themselves and left the room.

Mr Nicolas Omar, Mr A.A. Omar and Mr AE Schalk were present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

HWC has been made aware of I&APs who have not had sufficient notice of the meeting who would have liked to make representation.

DECISION

The Committee agreed that the I&APs should have the opportunity to be represented and resolved to refer the matter to BELCom 27 February 2019.

TZ

**12.6 Proposed Alteration and Additions on Erf 3540 Bosman, Paarl
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 3540**

Case Number: 19012303KB0123E

M.s Khanyisile Bonile gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building has been graded not conservation worthy.
- The deviated work completed has not negatively impacted on heritage significance.

DECISION

The NHRA does not make provision for the condoning of illegal work. Undertaking work without a permit constitutes a criminal offence in terms of section 51(1)c of the same Act. As no heritage resources have been impacted upon, no further action in terms of the NHRA is required.

KB

**12.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 781, 11 Hastings Road,
Tamboerskloof, S34.
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ TAMBOERSKLOOF/ ERF 781**

Case Number: 19011605LB0131E

Mr Lwazi Bhengu gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building has been graded IIIIC within an HPO
- CoCT approved the proposal
- CIBRA has objected to the proposal
- There was concern regarding the impact that the proposed large double garage will have on the streetscape and interface with the street (massing, extents of a single double door vs, two single doors, architectural resolution, et al).
- There was concern regarding the added top floor resolution, with its repeated balcony and window elements and the resultant overall height, and how this impacts on the context.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Heritage design indicators are to be prepared by an architect with heritage experience. These must assess the urban morphology and heritage context and character of the streetscape and surrounding area. These indicators must in turn inform the design of the revised proposal.

13 Other Matters

13.1 Tribunal Ruling Total Demolition - Erf 97471, 4 Lemon Lane, Newlands
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ ERF 97471

Case Number: 17050901KR0510E

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item.

Mr Richard Summers and Ms Clarice Arendse were present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The Tribunal approved the total demolition.
- The proposed development may proceed, subject to HWC approving the developer's heritage preservation plan for the proposed development within 60 days of its submission. The HPP submission is in line with the Tribunal decision.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the Heritage Preservation Plan with the following condition:

1. The Environmental Control Officer (ECO) is to provide monthly reports to HWC upon commencement of construction.

WD

14. Adoption of decisions and additions

The Committee resolved to adopt the decisions.

15. Closure of the meeting

The Chairperson closed the meeting at 12:15

16. Date of next meeting: 25 February 2019

Chairperson's Signature.....

Date