

**MEETING OF THE HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
SUPPLEMENTARY HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING (HOMS)**

Approved Minutes of the Supplementary HOM's Committee Meeting of Heritage Western Cape held on Monday 15 April 2019, at 9H00 in the 8th Floor Boardroom at the Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town

1. Opening and Welcoming

The Chairperson, Ms Colette Scheermeyer, officially opened the meeting at 09:05 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members

Mr Chris Snelling (CSn)	IACom Committee
Mr Peter Buttgens(PB)	BELCom Committee
Ms Janine de Waal(JdW)	BELCom Committee
Ms Colette Scheermeyer(CSc)	Deputy Director
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)	Assistant Director
Mr Andrew September(AS)	Heritage Officer
Mr Lwazi Bhengu(LB)	Heritage Officer
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)	Graduate Intern
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)	Graduate Intern

HWC Staff

Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni(NT)	Admin Clerk
-------------------------	-------------

Visitors

Mr H. Pereira

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Ms Heidi Boise (HB)	Heritage Officer
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)	Legal Advisor
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)	Heritage Officer

4. Approval of agenda

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 15 April 2019 with the following amendments:

- Addition of 8.1 as an item under Administrative Matters: Erf 971, Voortrekker Street, Riebeeck West
- Items 12.1 to 12.6 referred to BELCom meeting of 24 April 2019
- Addition of item 12.12, Erf 971, Voortrekker Street, Riebeeck West

5. Approval of minutes of the previous meeting

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes dated 18 February 2019 and 18 March 2019 with minor amendments. The approval of the minutes of the meeting of 14 March 2019 was deferred to the next meeting.

6. Disclosure of interest

6.1 None

7 Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8 Administrative Matters

8.1 12.12 Erf: 971, Voortrekker Street, Riebeeck West

Case No: 1903080HB0405E

9. Other Committee Referrals

Ms Dhansay raised the matter in respect to endorsements required for the Werdmuller Centre. This is specifically in respect of the appointment of the heritage practitioner and architects. This matter has been referred for endorsement at the following HOMS meeting.

10. Appointments

10.1 10h00 item 12.12, Erf 971, Voortrekker Street, Riebeeck West

11. Matters Arising

11.1 None

12. New Matters

12.1 Proposed Restoration at Erf 4274, Onze Molen, Onze Molen Street, Durbanville:

Section 27.

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/DURBANVILLE/ERF 4274

Case No: 19022005HB0403E

RESOLUTION:

- The committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on 24th April 2019

HB

12.2 Proposed Addition and Alteration at Re-Erf 1600, 122B Kloof Street, Gardens:

Section 34

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RE-ERF 1600

Case No: 18111943HB0307E

RESOLUTION:

The committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on 24th April 2019

HB

12.3 Proposed Addition and Alteration at Erf 13753, Schoenstatt, Constantia Main Road, Constantia:

Section 34.

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CONSTANTIA/ERF 13753

Case No: 18050801HB0522E

RESOLUTION:

- The committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on 24th April 2019

HB

12.4 Proposed Addition and Alteration at Erf 11, Farm Eureka, Noord Agter Paarl:

Section 34.

HM/CAPE WINELANDS/PAARL/ DRAKENSTIN/ERF 11

Case No: 19021902HB0219E

RESOLUTION:

The committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on 24th April 2019

HB

- 12.5** Proposed Alterations and Additions at Erf 340, 51 Main Street, Wellington:
Section 34

HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ERF 340

Case No: 19021903HB0219E

RESOLUTION:

The committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on 24th April 2019

HB

- 12.6** Proposed Addition and Alteration at Erf 283, 48 Oak Street, Greyton:
Section 34

HM/OVERBERG/ THEEWATERSKLOOF/ GREYTON/ ERF 283

Case No: 19021408HB0305E

RESOLUTION:

The committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on 24th April 2019

HB

- 12.7** Proposed Alteration and Additions on Erf 242, 7 Jagerfontein Lane,
Oranjezicht:

Section 34

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITN/ ORANJEZICHT/ Erf 242

Case No: 19012411KB0325E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- CoCT support the proposal
- CIBRA does not support the proposal.
- The site is graded IIIB and falls within an HPO.
- The committee was of the opinion that the proposal will negatively impact on the architectural significance of this building and the terrace row in general.

FUTHER REQUIREMENTS

- The Committee noted various concerns, which include, but are not limited to the following:
 1. The inappropriate internal changes (including ceiling heights) and the resultant loss of spatial legibility
 2. The inappropriate front façade enclosure and changes to openings
 3. The over scaled bathroom addition to the north side.
 4. The over scaled rear first floor dormer windows/doors and the undesirable rear staircase.

As the proposal as submitted will, in the opinion of the committee, impact negatively on the identified heritage resource it is recommended that a heritage practitioner with architectural expertise is consulted in order to address the above concerns, and assist in preparing appropriate heritage design indicators to guide the revised proposal.

KB

12.8 Proposed Alteration and Additions on Erf 31461, 7 Sydney Road, Mowbray:

Section 34

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ MOBRAY/Erf 31461

Case No: 18112220KB1205E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item and provided report back on the site inspection undertaken.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- CoCT and RAMPAC do not support the proposal.
- The site is graded IIIC.
- The site is within the HPO.
- A site inspection was conducted by the case officer on 19 March 2019 (see attached SI report 1), where it was established that work has commenced on site.

- The completed work, with specific reference to the enclosed stoep and repositioning of the front door, has negatively impacted on heritage resources.
- The proposed garage has a negative impact on the streetscape.
- The committee has strong reservations in respect of the unauthorised work, the negative impact that it has on the significance of not just the structure itself, but also the row of similar graded houses in its context. As such it is strongly recommended that the CoCT investigate further, given the site falls within a City HPO.

DECISION

The committee resolved not to approve the application as the proposal, as well as unauthorised work negatively impacts on the heritage significance.

KB

12.9 Proposed Alteration and Additions on Erf 25606, 93 Rochester Road, Observatory:

Section 34

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ OBSERVATORY/ Erf 25606

Case No: 19031925KB0319E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The site is graded III C
- The site is within an HPO
- CoCT supports the application
- OCA objects to the application
- The committee notes the addition of the en-suite bathroom due to the special needs of the occupant.
- The committee notes the work has been completed.
- The Committee did not believe that the completed work has impacted negatively on identified heritage resources.

DECISION

The committee resolved to issue a S.51 letter as it cannot condone illegal work.

KB

12.10 Proposed Alteration and Additions on Erf 50512,10 Stanford Road, Rondebosch:

Section 34

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ RONDEBOSCH/Erf 50512

Case No: 19020409KB0320E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The committee is of the strong opinion that neither the structure nor its context is of heritage significance.
- The CoCT provided an NCW grading.
- The Greater Lynfrae Civic Association Objects to the proposal.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the proposal as it does not impact on heritage resources.

KB

12.11 Proposed new fence and raising of current boundary wall including minor Alterations on Erf 9768, Riebeek Square, 93 Bree Street, Cape Town:

Section 27(2, 3)

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN CBD/ERF 9768

Case No: 18120603AS0129E

Mr Andrew September introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The site is a PHS, outside on HPO.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CIBRA objects to the proposal.
- The committee had concern regarding excessive proposed height of the fence.
- The committee was made aware that there is reason to believe that the issue of fencing around the square has been tabled with the CoCT (and HWC or even the National Monuments Council) previously, and that there may well be previous approvals with conditions that needs to be taken in to account.

RECOMMENDATION:

The committee recommends the matter be referred to BELCom on the 24th April 2019 for considered discussion and decision.

AS

12.12 Erf: 971, Voortrekker Street, Riebeeek West

Case No: 1903080HB0405E

HM/ WEST COAST/ SWARTLAND/ RIEBEECK WEST/ ERF 971

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item.

Mr Pereira was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:
The committee supports the owner implementing the necessary interventions required to secure the site.

RECOMMENDATION:

The committee recommends the matter be referred to BELCom on the 24th April 2019 with the following recommendation:

1. The committee undertakes a site inspection
2. A further detailed fabric analyses of both the structures is required including a comprehensive chronological historical mapping of the property in its context, in order to better understand the significance of the building.
3. Assistance is sought from an architect with heritage experience to help form an appropriate method statement. It was noted that specifications provided for on the plans, do not relate to these specific structures.

HB

14. Adoption of decisions and additions

The Committee resolved to adopt the decisions.

15. Closure of the meeting

The Chairperson closed the meeting at 11:25

16. Date of next meeting: 20 May 2019

Chairperson's Signature.....

Date

APPROVED