

**MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
INVENTORIES, GRADING AND INTERPRETATION COMMITTEE**

**Final Draft Minutes of a meeting of the Inventories, Grading and Interpretation
Committee of Heritage Western Cape held on 31 May 2017, at 09H30 in the 1st Floor
Boardroom at the Offices of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport, Protea
Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town**

1. Opening and Welcoming

The Chairperson, Mr Siphiso Mavumengwana, opened the meeting at 09h40 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Inventories, Grading and Interpretation Committee:

Mr Siphiso Mavumengwana (SM)

Dr Ignatius De Swardt (IdS)

Ms Quahnita Samie (QS)

Ms Katherine Dumbrell (KD)

Dr Rolf Annas (RA)

Ms Jenna Lavin (JL)

Ms Fowzia Achmat (FA)

HWC Staff

Colette M Scheermeyer (CS)

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka (ZS)

Mr Jonathan Windvogel (JW)

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)

Ms Heidi Boise (HB)

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)

Mr Andrew September (AS)

Mr Zethembe Khuluse (ZK)

Ms Busisiwe Menzela (LM)

Visitors

Mr C.A Augustides

Mr C Snelling

Ms S Titlestad

Mr W van Scmallyr

Mr C Alexander

Ms H Bowen
Mrs L Munro
Ms W Wilson
Mr J Aufrichty
Mr N Smith
Mr D Geageades
Ms J Poking
Ms J McQueen
Mr S Burnett

3. Apologies

Mr Stefan De Kock
Ms Terry-Jo Thorne

4. Disclosure of Interest

- 4.1 Chairperson will recuse himself 16.1
- 4.2 QS will recuse herself - 17.1, 17.2, and 17.4
- 4.3 KD will recuse herself - 17.4
- 4.4 FA will recuse herself - 17.1

5. Approval of the agenda

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 31 May 2017 with two minor additions.

6. Approval of the previous minutes dated 16 February 2017

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes dated 16 February 2017 with a few amendments.

7. Confidential matters

7.1 None

8. Appointments

9. Administration Matters

9.1 Recording the proceedings of the meetings of HWC Council and its Committees

The Committee has noted that future meetings will be recorded.

9.2 Resignation of Dr D Le Roux

The committee has noted the resignation of Dr D Le Roux from both council and committee.

9.3 Delegation of powers to the committee

The committee has acknowledged the delegated powers as contained in the legal opinion provided by the legal advisor. It was noted that the committee's powers relating to protection in terms of S27 of the NHRA are to recommend to Council who makes the final decision.

10. Outcomes of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The following appeal matters were heard.

- Piketberg
- Clarens Road, Sea point
- Calay Road, Sea Point
- Franshoek

The following tribunal matter was heard

- 22 Plein Street, Paarl

11. Standing Items

None

11.1 Site Inspections

The following site inspection reports were received.

- Rex Trueform site inspection report (for noting)
- Kaba Aye Peace Pagoda site inspection report (for noting)
- Melck warehouse (Committee to report back)

12. Report back from ExCo, Council and/or other committees

12.1 No. 25 Long Street, Joubert House, Montagu.

(Council Decisions_15 March 2017)

The council supports the IGICom assessment that the property does not meet the requirements of provincial heritage resource status. The building has high local significance. HWC is to proceed with investigating the process of re-grading.

13. Policy Matters

13.1 None

14. Surveys

14.1. None

15. PROPOSED GRADING OF PREVIOUS NATIONAL MONUMENTS

15.1 No. 25 Long Street, Joubert House, Montagu: MA

JW gave some background information on this matter.

It the discussion it was noted that:

- A letter has been sent to the applicant informing him of the council's decision that HWC considers the former national monument not to meet the requirements of a provincial heritage site but that it is of high local significance.

DECISION

- The legal advisor will report to council on the need for a definitive legal opinion on the grading of previous national monuments.

16. PROPOSED PROVINCIAL PROTECTION

16.1 Two rivers Urban Park Baseline Study application: NM

Chairperson recused himself for this item: KD took over the chairpersonship.

JW gave some background information on this matter.

It the discussion, amongst other things, the following was noted:

- The committee acknowledges that the site is large and comprises a complex interplay of significances- social, natural, industrial, scientific, architectural, agricultural and historical- that spans from pre-colonial contact to present.
- Appropriate management of the site is necessary in order for this multi-layered significance to offer an opportunity for marginalised and intangible histories and heritage to be celebrated.
- The committee further acknowledges that integrated consultation will be complex for this site, but is essential as part of the S38 process.

- The committee notes IACom's comment that the Baseline Study does not meet the requirements of the NID response dated 25 August 2016 and is in agreement with IACom's identification of gaps in the study.

RECOMMENDATION

- The committee recommended that the further work required by IACom be completed before IGICom considers provisional protection of the site.

17. PROPOSED NOMINATIONS OF PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES

17.1 Erf 163450 The Auwal Masjied, 39 Dorp Street: Matter Arising

FA and QS recused themselves

JW gave some background information on this matter.

It the discussion, amongst other things, the following was noted:

- That the nomination is submitted by the Muslim Judicial Council.
- SAHRA has no objection to the proposed grading of the site as a PHS.
- The Auwal Masjiet Council supports the nomination of the site as a PHS.
- That the site is located in a grade 1 HPOZ. (*Jonathan pls confirm*)
- The committee supports the HOMS recommendations for the declaration of this site as a provincial heritage site.
- Due to the significant nature of the site (cultural, sacred, historical, associational and the establishment of Islam in the Cape), it is recommended that a conservation management plan (CMP) be drafted. This after the Gazette notice is promulgated.

RECOMMENDATION

- The committee recommends that council declares the Auwal Masjid Mosque a PHS in terms of S27 of the NHRA.

JW

17.2 Erf 1056, Green Point Common, Green Point: MA

QS recused herself

JW gave some background information on this matter.

It the discussion, amongst other things, the following was noted:

- The City of Cape Town has made a submission for the review of the PHS boundaries as previously approved by this committee.
- The committee noted that the city's submission is not based on heritage considerations nor does it present any new information or motivation.
- The decision by the committee on the boundaries was based on a thorough report (nomination document) which included the identification, analysis and mapping of heritage resources applicable to the Green Point common as an urban cultural landscape.
- The city will have an opportunity to substantiate its submission during the 60-day commenting period.
- The Green Point Ratepayers Association supports the boundaries in option C, as previously approved.

RECOMMENDATION

- The committee has resolved to re-affirm option C as previously approved (excluding the Helen Bowden nurses' home precinct in the east square area opposite Green Point Lighthouse at the north-west corner connecting the Common to the beachfront) and the site be recommended as a Grade II heritage resource.

JW

17.3 Erf 11553, The Rocklands Community Hall, Mitchells Plain: MA

JW gave some background information on this matter.

It the discussion, amongst other things, the following was noted:

- A PHS nomination for this site was previously submitted by HWC in February 2013. This is a resubmission.
- The site has strong political, architectural and social significance.
- The site has a UDF Memorial erected by the City in front of the hall.
- The 'heritage site' consists of a Rocklands community hall, the library, and a memorial square (in front of the community hall).
- The proposed boundary as presented excludes the library and the memorial square.

- The City supports this nomination

RECOMMENDATION

- The committee has resolved to continue with the process of nomination in terms of S27(8) of the NHRA and notify all interested parties and give them 60 days to make submissions regarding the proposed nomination.
- The committee further recommends including the library, the memorial square and the community health care centre in the proposed boundaries of the declared area.

JW

17.4 Erf 174009, Melck Warehouse, Cape Town

KD and QS recused themselves

JW gave some background information on this matter.

A site inspection report was tabled.

In the discussion, amongst other things, the following was noted:

- The committee has noted the findings of the site inspection.
- The motivation for the proposed nomination does not match the findings from the site visit.
- It was further noted that the site/building comprises of different sections with varying degrees of authenticity and original fabric.
- The warehouse has been transformed over the years through developments to accommodate various commercial trading activities.
- The site has high historical cultural significance. However, this relates to its historic origins as a warehouse rather than the remaining built fabric remains (mostly to the interior).
- The committee is of the opinion that proper conservation of the original built fabric will be adequately dealt with as part of possible future redevelopment of the site (also considering the Gees judgement case law)
- There is an authentic space in the middle of the building.

RECOMMENDATION

- The committee resolved not to support the PHS nomination.

JW

18. DE-PROCLAMATION OF EXISTING PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES.

18.1 No. 25 Long Street, Joubert House, Montagu: MA

Refer to item 15.1

19. OTHER MATTERS

20. DATE OF NEXT IGIC MEETING: 04 Aug 2017

21. CLOSURE: 01H56

Approved