

# APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE, HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING Held on Thursday, 3 February 2022, HOMS MEETING VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS, scheduled for 08:30

# 1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Ms Colette Scheermeyer officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

# 2. ATTENDANCE

Members None

# **Members of Staff**

Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB) (secretary) Mr Reagon Fortune (RF) (Intern Admin support) Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CS) (Deputy Director) Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM) (Heritage Officer) Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS) (Heritage Officer) Mr Robin George (RG) (Heritage Officer) Ms Corne Nortje (CN) (Heritage Officer) Ms Corne Nortje (CN) (Heritage Officer) Ms Chane Herman (CH) (Heritage Officer) Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD) (Assistant Director) Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SnJ) (Heritage Officer) Ms Natalie Kendrick (NK) (Heritage Officer) Ms Xola Mwandle (XM) (Heritage Officer) Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB) (Heritage Officer) Mr Thando Zingange (TZ) (Heritage Officer)

(CS left at 9:50 and returned at 12:00) (WD chaired from item 11.14 – 12.75)

# Legal Advisor

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)

# Visitors

Dane Leo Fareez Dollie

#### **Observers** None

3 Apologies Ms Stephanie Barnardt (On Leave)

> Absent None

# 4. Approval of Agenda

**4.1** 3 February 2022. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits. AM moves to adopt the agenda and MS seconds that.

# 5. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

**5.1** 24 January 2022. The Committee resolved to approve the minutes. MS moves to adopt the agenda and SJ seconds that.

# 6. Disclosure of conflict of interest

7. Confidential matters

None

# 8. Standing Items

# 8.1 Site inspections undertaken.

- 1. Erf 6726, 20 Oxford Street, Durbanville- Stop work order WD & CH 1 Feb 2022
- 2. Rhodes Memorial Table Mountain Nature Reserve and University of Cape Town, WD- 1 Feb 2022

# 8.2 Proposed Site Inspection

-Item 12.32: Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 2083, 71 Buitengracht Street, Cape Town S34-A&A Case no: 21120219SJ1215E

#### 8.3 Site Inspection Reports

- 8.3.1 Table Mountain
- 8.4 Preparation for the upcoming committee meetings.

IGIC\_4 February 2022

# 8.5 Interim and Close out Reports

- 8.6 Incomplete Applications
- 9. Administrative Matters
- 9.1 Discussion of the agenda - Item 11.13
  - Item 11.18
- 10. Appointments

#### MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

- 11. MATTERS ARISING
- **11.1** Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 4172, 23 Victoria Street, Paarl S34-A&A Case no: 21121302AM1214E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 27 January 2022
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the proposal.
- Drakenstein Heritage Foundation supports the proposal.
- Paarl300 supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

AM

# 11.2 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 1286, Fairy Knowe Hotel Wilderness George S34-A&A Case no: 21102705AM1215E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 26 January 2022
- Graded IIIC
- George municipality support.
- George Heritage support.
- Simon van de Stel supports the proposal.
- The report by Stefan de Kock dated October 2021 was provided at the request of HOMs to substantiate the reasons for illegal work undertaken.

# DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

AM

# **11.3** Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 1601, 2 End way, Pinelands S34-A&A Case no: 21111009MS1117E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 25 January 2022.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

# DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

# 11.4 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 4863, 226 Mills Street, Strand S34-A&A Case no: 21120907TZ1213E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 26 January 2022
- Graded NCW
- Heldeberg Renaissance Foundation supports the proposal
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

#### DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

ΤZ

# 11.5 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 76843, 20 Dragoon Road, Plumstead S34-A&A Case no: 21112310TZ1129E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 25 January 2022.
- HOMs graded NCW
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

ΤZ

# 11.6 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 441 RE, 128 Kloof Road, Bantry Bay S34-A&A Case no: 21111714TZ1119E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 29 January 2022.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Sea point, Fresnaye and Bantry Bay Resident and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal
- Sea Point For All did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

# **11.7** Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 8639, 36 Langenhoven Street, Boston Bellville S34-A&A Case no: 21091705XM1118E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 20 January 2022
- Graded NCW
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

**11.8** Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 70984, 31 Ophir Road, Plumstead, S34-A&A Case No: 21120203XM1202E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 26 January 2022
- Not graded
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

# 11.9 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 3929, 1 Zoetendal Street, Ruyterwacht S34-A&A Case no: 2110211RG1123E

Mr Robin George introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 21 January 2022
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

ХМ

# 11.10 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 294, 21 North Way, Pinelands S34-A&A Case no: 21120903RG1202E

Ms Robin George introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 25 January 2022
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Pinelands Residents and Residents Association supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

# **11.11** Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 860, Unit 201 Rapallo, 292 Beach Road, Sea point, S34-A&A Case No: 21120232RG1202E

Mr Robin George introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 31 January 2022
- Outside HPO
- Graded IIIB
- Seapoint, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.
- Simon van de Stel supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

# **11.12** Proposed maintenance on ERF 875, Stone Cottages, Kirstenbosch Drive, S34-Minor Works Case no: 21111901SJ1209E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item

Mr. Amjad Hendricks (SANBI) was present and took part in the discussion.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 01 February 2022.
- Minor works application
- Graded PHS

#### DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application on condition;

- 1. Work to be monitored by a suitably qualified architect with heritage experience
- 2. A close-out report to be submitted within 30-days of practical completion.

#### SJ

# 11.13 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 12530, 58 Chester Road, Walmer Estate, S34–A&A Case no.: 21101201CH1109E

Ms Chane introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HOMs previously graded the structure IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Given the controversial nature raised by I&APs, HOMs deemed the matter to be controversial and requires the expertise of BELCom.
- Given that the matter is controversial, HOMs does not have delegations to deal with the matter.

#### **HELD OVER:**

Referred to BELCom on 10 February 2022.

СН

# 11.14 Proposed maintenance on ERF 5546, Rus Street, Oudtshoorn, S34-A&A Case no 21072004KB0704E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

WD took over as chairperson.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 26 January 2022.
- Graded IIIC
- Oudtshoorn Heritage supports the proposal.
- Oudtshoorn Municipality supports the proposal.
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

#### DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

# 11.15 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 17747, 11 Buitenkant Street, Cape Town S27-A&A Case no: 21042008KB0702E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

Mr. Craig was present and took part in the discussion

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 26 January 2022.
- Graded PHS

- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

# 11.16 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 1164, Baauw Street, Fisherman's Village, Velddriff, S34-A&A

Case no: 21120903KB1202E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 27 January 2022.
- Graded NCW
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

#### DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

КΒ

11.17 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 56421, 1 Torquay Road, Claremont S34-A&A Case no: 21120225KB1201E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 27 January 2022.
- Graded IIIA
- Outside HPO
- Upper Claremont Residents and Ratepayers Assocation supports the proposal
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

# 11.18 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 959, Ave Fountain Bleau Avenue, Fresnaye S34-A&A

**Case no:** 21092821KB1021E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on
- Graded NCW
- Seapoint For All did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

- Seapoint, Fresnaye and Bantry Bay Resident's and Ratepayers Association did not support the proposal.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The Committee notes that the work has been completed.

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

#### 12. NEW MATTERS

# 12.1 Proposed excavation on ERF 49557, Blombos Cave, Still Bay S35-Excavation Case no: 21112320AM0123E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Within the permit issued in 2018, the applicant was only able to excavate for a full season in 2019 but only managed to excavate for 3 days in the 2020 season due to the Covid-19 pandemic.
- This application is for the continuation of the works projected within the 2018 application.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application with the standard S35 regulations and post completion requirements.

AM

KB

12.2 Prospecting mining rights application on Farm Widouw 309, Vanrhynsdorp S38(8)-NID Case no: 21092903AM0103E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• To meet the standards of the AIA and HIA need to include the recorded survey tracks, as well as a marked map showing both the archaeology and the proposed prospecting in relation to each other.

# DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38(3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following;

1. AIA

AM

12.3 Proposed development of a filling station on Ptn 8 farm 657 Leliefontein Paarl S38(8)-NID Case no: 22011016AM1010E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• The site is within the green/blue zones which indicate insignificant and low palaeosensitivity.

- Subject site was previously a farm for orange and lemon trees and therefore the likelihood of significant archaeological material being present is thought to be low.
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

AM

12.4 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 2707, 61 Surrey Street, Townsend Estate S34-A&A Case no: 22011002AM0111E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

# DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

AM

12.5 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 7011, 13 Church Street, Goodwood S34-A&A Case no: 21030812AM0111E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

# DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

AM

AM

# 12.6 Proposed rezoning and subdivision for private dwellings and tourist accommodation on Remainder ERF 1262, Wilderness, George District, S38(8)-HIA Case no: 19111209KB1118E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Referred to APM/IACom for their expertise.

#### HELD OVER:

Referred to APM/IACom on 16 February 2022.

# 12.7 Proposed construction of one single residential dwelling on ERF 13166, Wellington S38(1)-NID Case no: 21091009AM

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Small area of moderate palaeosensitivity that is surrounded by vast areas of zero/insignificant palaeosensitivity.
- The subject site is in a modern residential area with an existing structure therefore the existence of archaeological material is low.
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

# 12.8 Proposed mining on Farm 312, Pearly Beach S38(8)-NID Case no: 21102501NK0104E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

NK

AM

# 12.9 Proposed upgrade of Erven 101671 & 101670 221 Heideveld Road, Heideveld S38(8)-NID Case no: 21121512NK0105E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

NK

# 12.10 Proposed development of an apartment complex on Erf 59, 18 Boundary Road, Cape town Phillipi S38(8)-NID

**Case no:** 21121406NK0112E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item

Mr. Dane Leo (town planner) was present and took part in the discussion,

# DISCUSSION

Approved HOMS Minutes \_ 3 February 2022

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

12.11 Proposed telecommunications mast on ERF 794, Van der Stel Street, Tulbagh S38(8)-NID Case no: 22011103NK0112E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

NK

12.12 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 2922, 37 Goodwood Street, Goodwood S34-A&A Case no: 22011015NK0110E

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION**

Power of attorney, proof of ownership, internal photos and stamped plans required.

NK

12.13 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 6851, 7 Park Street De la Haye, Bellville S34-A&A Case no: 21121315NK0110E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Not graded
- Outside HPO
- CoCT does not support the proposal due building regulations, but supplied no comment with regards to heritage

# DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

NK

# 12.14 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 20506, 38 Da Gama Street, Brooklyn S34-A&A Case no: 21111205NK0112E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HOMs graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

#### 12.15 Proposed Upgrade of Services, ERF 519, Walter Street, Riebeek Kasteel, S38(8) Case no: 22011404NK0117E

Ms Natalie Kendrick introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

NK

# 12.16 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 1386, 60 Lyell Street, Ceres S34-A&A Case no: 21110904KB1216E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor works application
- HOMs graded NCW
- Outside HPO

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

# 12.17 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 796, 101103 Dorp Street, Stellenbosch S34-A&A Case no: 21121401KB1216E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• The Committee noted that all comments are outdated as it is relevant to the previous permit dated 2011.

# FURTHER REQUIRMENTS

1.Updated comments from conservation bodies required (Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation, Stellenbosch Interest Group and Stellenbosch Municipality).

KB

# 12.18 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 258, 31 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Melkbosstrand S34-A&A Case no: 21110303KB1216E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT objected to the proposal.
- Friends of Blauwwberg objected the proposal.
- Referred to BELCom for their expertise.

#### **HELD OVER:**

Referred to BELCom on 10 February 2022.

12.19 Proposed additions and alterations on erf 43605, 17 Sergeant Street, Rondebosch S34-A&A Case no: KB0111E

# **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

CoCT comment and motivation required.

KB

KB

12.20 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 9728, 43 Seventh Avenue, Boston, Bellville S34-A&A Case no: 211101101KB0111E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

12.21 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 3792, 1 Risedale, Paarl S34-A&A Case no: 21111509KB0111E

Item removed from agenda

KB

12.22 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 101, 30 Le Roux Street, De Rust S34-A&A Case no: 21120212KB0112E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed: Approved HOMS Minutes \_ 3 February 2022

- Heritage Oudtshoorn does not support the proposal.
- Referred to BELCom for their expertise

#### HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 10 February 2022.

12.23 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 7118, Caledon Road, Elgin Grabouw, S34-A&A Case no: 21112313KB0114E

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Local authority comment required and company resolution.

12.24 Proposed additions and alterations ERF 1456, 34 Rhine Road, Sea point S34-A&A Case no: 21112602MS1223E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Referred to BELCom for their expertise.

# HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 10 February 2022.

12.25 Proposed Partial demolition on ERF 877, 29 Del Hermite Avenue, Fresnaye S34-A&A, Partial Demolition Case no: 21120217MS1223E

# INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Local authority (municipality) and Sea Point for All comments, plans stamped as reviewed by relevant authorities.

MS

MS

12.26 Proposed additions and alterations ERF 147, Van Riebeek Street, Heidelberg S34-A&A (Minor Works) Case no: 2111112MS1223E

# **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Committee does not consider the work being proposed as minor. Full S34 Application to be submitted along with plans and relevant authority comments.

MS

12.27 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 12026, 59 Kitchner Road, Woodstock S34-A&A Case no: 21112323MS0124E

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Woodstock Ratepayers and Residents' Association comments required.

MS

KB

KB

# 12.28 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 335, 13 Sunny Way Pinelands S34-A&A Case no: 21120904MS0110E

- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- Pinelands Ratepayers and Residents' Association has no objection.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

MS

12.29 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 90925, 26 Taunton Road, Wynberg S34-A&A Case no: 21112601MS0111E

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

SG Diagram ,CoCT and Wynberg East Civic Association Comments And stamp.

12.30 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 142164, 68 Upper Melbourne Road, Walmer Estate S34-A&A

Case no: 20211119MS0111E

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents' Association; Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group comments required.

MS

12.31 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 50433, 54 Malcolm Road, Rondebosch, S34-A&A Case no: 21081010MS0117E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- Greater Lynfrae Civic Association supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

12.32 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 2083, 71 Buitengracht Street, Cape Town S34-A&A Case no: 21120219SJ1215E

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Proof of consultation required and clarity of work that has commenced.

# 12.33 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 174322, 66 Byrant Street, Bo-Kaap S34-A&A Case no: 21081706SJ1220E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Bo-Kaap Civic Association supports the proposal.
- Bo-Kaap Youth movement supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

# 12.34 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 190, 25 Hoop Street, De Rust S34-A&A Case no: 21120702SJ0103E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HOMs graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Oudtshoorn municipality supports the proposal.
- Heritage Oudtshoorn supports the proposal.
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

# DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

# 12.35 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 8331, Chapel Street Primary School, District Six S34-A&A

Case no: 2112809SJ0104E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO

#### DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

# 12.36 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 1279, 13 Fontein Street, Riebeek Kasteel S34-A&A Case no: 21120901SJ0110E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

Graded IIIB

#### FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

- 1. The committee requires detailed photo montages contextualising the proposal within the surrounding context.
- 2. More information required around the addition of the four townhouses and their impact on the heritage resource.

# 12.37 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 859, 58 Main Road, Greyton S34-A&A Case no: 21101502SJ011E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIB
- Inside Greyton special character area overlay zone.
- Greyton Conservation Society supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

SJ

# 12.38 Proposed Total Demolition on ERF 56563 + 56564, 4 Maclear Road, Bishops Court S34-Total Demolition

Case no: 2201104SJ0111E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO

#### DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

# 12.39 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 842, 2 Huguenot Ave, Oranjezicht, S34-A&A Case no: 21082609SJ0117E

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Citybowl Residents and Ratepayers Assocation comments, motivation, and annotated images required.

SJ

# 12.40 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 1040, 20 Camp Road, Pinelands S34-A&A Case no: 21121514CN1221E

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Pinelands Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

# 12.41 Proposed subdivision, rezoning and development on ERF 5515, Loedolf Street, Malmesbury S38(4)-NID

**Case no:** 21111109CN1221E

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee is of the view that the Section 38 process needs to run its course and the is not reviewing the Section 34 process at this stage.
- HWC has been informed that work has proceeded on site, should this be the case further investigation to be conducted by the case officer and the necessary stop works order to be issued.
- Given the impacts to the heritage core of the area and the cultural landscape, the Committee is concerned about the development.

# DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38(3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following;

1. Townscape assessment including a built environment study.

CN

# 12.42 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 50785, 22 Marne Avenue, Claremont S34-A&A Case no: CN0104E

# **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Updated application form, Proof of Payment, Title Deed, Power of Attorney, Locality Plan, Internal Photographs, External Photographs, Streetscape Photographs, Greater Lynfrae Civic Association Comments, S.G. Diagrams

# 12.43 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 115, 5 Karreeboom Road, Thornton S34-A&A Case no: 21121513CN0104E

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

# 12.44 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 6847, 26 Molteno Street Richmond Estate S34-A&A Case no: 21122007CN0105E

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HOMs graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

# 12.45 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 61246, 20 Chukker Road, Lansdowne S34-A&A Case no: 21122008CN0105E

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

# DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

# 12.46 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 94904, 5 Wilkinson Street, Gardens S34-A&A Case no: 21120902CN0112E

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Citybowl Resident and Rateoayers Association supports the proposal.
- CoCT raised concerns and some additions are not supported
- Referred to BELCom for their expertise.

#### **HELD OVER:**

Referred to BELCom on 10 February 2022.

CN

12.47 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 16527, 222 Lower Main Road, Observatory, S34-A&A Case no: 21120709CN0113E

# **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Updated application form, proof of payment, stamped plan, streetscape photographs, local authority comments and salt river heritage society comments required.

CN

# 12.48 Proposed subdivision to develop additional dwellings on Portions 3 and 4 of Farm 637, Hermanus, S38(8)-HIA

Case no: 21101218CN0121E

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Referred to APM/IACOM for their expertise.

#### DECISION

Referred to APM/IACom on 16 February 2022.

CN

ΤZ

12.49 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 1077, 7 Rugley Road, Vredehoek S34-A&A Case no: 21122101TZ1224E

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Citybowl Residents and Ratepayers comments required.

12.50 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 68410, 33 Broad Road, Wynberg, S34-A&A Case no: TZ1224E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Approved HOMS Minutes \_ 3 February 2022

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HOMs graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Minor works application for maintenance and repairs.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

ΤZ

# 12.51 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 749, 94 High Level Road Green Point, S34-A&A Case no: 21121510TZ1227E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item

Mr. Stuart Burnett was present and took part in the discussion.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Greenpoint Resident and Ratepayers Assocation supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

ΤZ

# 12.52 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 616, 12 Mountain Road, Chapmans Peak, Noordhoek, S34-A&A

Case no: 2112302TZ1206E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- NRPA supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

ΤZ

# 12.53 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 2281, 65 Castle Street, Cape Town, S34-A&A Case no: TZ0107E

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Proof of payment is required and Citybowl Resident and Ratepayers Association comments.

12.54	Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 813, 2 George Road, Green Point, S34-A&A Case no: 21120204TZ0107E	
	<b>INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:</b> Greenpoint Residents and Ratepayers Association comments required.	ΤZ
12.55	Proposed total demolition on ERF 23517, 17 Spencer Street Maitland, S34-Total Demolition Case no: 21121511TZ0111E	
	INCOMPLETE APPLICATION: CoCT comments required.	TZ
12.56	Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 996, 8 Camp Road, Pinelands, S34-A&A Case no: 21111716TZ0113E	
	<b>INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:</b> Pinelands Residents and Ratepayers Association comments required.	TZ
12.57	Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 56150, 2 Sylvia Road, Claremont, S34-A&A Case no: 21121506XM1215E	
	Duplicate application.	ХМ
12.58	Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 110422, 9 Dorset Close Harfield Village, S34-A&A Case no: 21121410XM1215E	
	Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the item	
	<ul> <li>DISCUSSION</li> <li>Amongst other things, the following was discussed: <ul> <li>Graded IIIB</li> <li>Outside HPO</li> <li>CoCT supports the proposal</li> <li>Harfield Village Association supports the proposal.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	
	<b>DECISION</b> The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact	on
	heritage resources.	хм

# 12.59 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 2325, 66 Ringwood drive Pinelands, S34-A&A Case no: 21112504XM1215E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

XM

# 12.60 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 59456, 36 Dale Street, Lansdowne, S34-A&A Case no: 21120906XM1215E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

XM

# 12.61 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 161503, 10 Church Street Brooklyn, S34-A&A Case no: 21122102XM1228E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

# DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

XM

# 12.62 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 59829, Buckingham Road, Lansdowne, S34-A&A Case no: 21120601XM1228E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

XM

# 12.63 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 20788, 20 Gleniffer Street, Brooklyn, S34-A&A Case no: 21121701XM1229E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT has noted that they cannot condone illegal work.
- The Committee notes the as-built plans.

# DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

ΧМ

# 12.64 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 367, 17 Firgrove, Milnerton, S34-A&A Case no: 21121311RG1220E

Mr Robin George introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

# DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

# 12.65 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 142407, 23 Springbok Street, Athlone, S34-A&A Case no: 21121503RG1220E

Mr Robin George introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

# 12.66 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 722, 23 Molteno Road, Oranjezicht, S34-A&A Case no: 21100601RG1220E

Mr Robin George introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Not graded
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- Citybowl Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

# 12.67 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 61253, Maybury Road, Kenwyn, S34-A&A Case no: 21122006RG0124E

Mr Robin George introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Not graded
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

12.68 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 4039, 3 Vredenburg Lane Cape Town, S34-A&A Case no: 21121312RG0114E

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Locality plan, internal photos and SG diagram

12.69 Proposed widening along the N7, Wingfield, S38(1)-NID Case no: 21071901RG0118E

Mr Robin George introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

RG

# 12.70 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 56150, 2 Sylvia Road Claremont, S34-A&A Case no: 21121506RG1216E

Mr Robin George introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor works application
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

# 12.71 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 23517, 17 Spencer Street, Maitland, S34-Total Demolition

Case no: 21121312RG0114E

Mr Robin George introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

12.72 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 179202, 3, 5 and 7 Upper Union Street, Gardens, S34-A&A

Case no: 21120710CH1215E

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Various II, IIIB and IIIC respectively
- Inside of HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Citybowl Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition;

- 1. Work to be monitored by a suitably qualified architect with heritage experience
- 2. A close-out report to be submitted within 30-days of practical completion.

СН

# 12.73 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 1718, 9 Oranje Ave, Pinelands, S34-A&A Case no: 21121409CH1215E

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- Pinelands Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

СН

# 12.74 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 90872, 9 Visser Ave, Wynberg, S34-A&A Case no: 21111006CH0103E

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

СН

12.75 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 53667, 19 Esher Street, Claremont, S34-A&A Case no: 21112604CH0106E Ms Chane Herman introduced the item

CS returned and resumed as chairperson.

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

# DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

# 12.76 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 746, 21 Poplar Avenue, Thornton, S34-A&A Case no: 21120602CH1010E

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

СН

СН

# 12.77 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 103007, 8 Devon Road, Lansdowne, S34-A&A Case no: 22011007CH1010E

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

# DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

СН

СН

# 12.78 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 1255, 20A Woodside Road, Tamboerskloof, S34-A& Case no: 22011018CH0112E

# **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

Citybowl Residents and Ratepayers comment required.

**Chairperson:** 

# 12.79 Proposed additional structure on ERF 13166, Wellington, S38(4)-NID

Case no: 21091009CH0117E- This is a duplicate of item 12.7.

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item

Mr. Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) supports the proposal.

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Site is within the green area of the SAHRIS paleo-sensitivity map.
- The subject site is located within a predominately residential area therefore the existence of archaeological material is significantly low.
- Since there is no reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

# DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Fossil finds procedure to be included.

#### СН

# 12.80 Proposed additions and alterations on ERF 2226, 69 Nelson Mandela Boulevard George Case no: 21112407CH

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item

# DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Main building graded IIIC
- Outbuilding graded NCW
- Simon van der Stel Foundation recommends a S51 Letter.
- The George Heritage Trust recommends a Section 51 letter.
- George Municipality did not provide comment with the 30 days.

# DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

13. OTHER MATTERS

# 14. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions. KB moves to adopt the decisions and resolutions and AM seconds.

- 15 CLOSURE: 13:15
- 16 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Secretariat: A.Brown

Date: 18 February 2022 Date: 14 February 2022 СН

7 February 2022

Page 30 of 30