

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)**
**Held on Wednesday, 28 April at the 1st Floor Boardroom, at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09:00**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Chairperson Ms Sarah Winter officially opened the meeting at 09:05 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members

Ms Sarah Winter	SW
Mr Mike Scurr	MS
Ms Belinda Mutti	BM
Mr Peter Buttgens	PB
Mr Stuart Hermansen	SH
Mr Graham Jacobs	GJ

Members of Staff

Mr Mxolisi Dlamuka	MD
Ms Jenna Lavin	JL
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Andrew September	AS
Ms Waseefa Dhansay	WD
Mr Olwethu Oz Dlova (Sec)	OD
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM

Visitors

Dr Stephen Townsend	ST	Mr Henry Aikman	HA
Mr Andrew Pentz	AP	Mr Andrew Berman	AB
Mr Stuart Burnett	SB	Ms Bridget O'Donoghue	BO'D
Mr Ashley Lillie	AL	Mr Andreas Lehmacher	AL
Mr A Botes	AB	Mr David Talbot	DT
Mr T Hughes	TH		

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Mr Rowen Ruiters	RR
Ms Colette Scheermeyer	CS
Ms Penny Meyer	PM
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Ms Katherine Robinson	KR

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 28 April 2016

The Committee approved the agenda dated 28 April 2016 with minor amendments.

5 Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 Dated 30 March 2016

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest

- MS: 11.1
- GJ: 13.1

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

JL reported back on the following appeals matters:

- Proposed rezoning from Agricultural Use Zone to Subdivision Area Overlay Zone, Erven 558, 609, 610, 612, 615, 616, 617, 626, 628, 632, 634, 662 and 664, Philippi: Section 38(3).

PM

8.2 Report Back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

- 165 Main Road Paarl

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (GJ, PB, SW, MS and SH)

PM

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition

JL reported that an audit of buildings refused for demolition since 2003 is underway.

ZS

8.4 Purple Turtle Erf 2355, Cape Town

It was reported that Committee members (GJ, SW) had undertaken a site inspection and that the decision was taken via email to recommend that the stop works order be lifted as heritage significance of the building had not been damaged by unauthorized work.

WD

8.5 Het Gesticht and Slave Church, Main Road Paarl

GJ and SH reported back on their site inspection/discussion with Mr Raymond and a representative from the Church.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The stone flags of the stair case had deteriorated to a point where they are dangerous.
- The proposal is to repair the middle section (approximately 1200mm wide) of the stair case to make it safe.
- The input of the suitable qualified stone mason should be obtained to provide a method statement to accompany an application to HWC.

8.6 Drostdy Museum, Swellendam

The CEO joined the Committee for this matter.

DECISION

The Committee endorsed the findings and recommendations of the opinion submitted by Prof Townsend and agreed that the Museum Board needs to develop a statement of significance, statement of policy and a conservation management plan for the Museum as an entity and for the Old Gaol complex. The CMP should include a vision for the Museum and address the future sustainable use and protection of the heritage significance of the site. The CMP is expected by the end of the next financial year.

The Committee approves the emergency remedial actions on page 8 of the opinion as follows:

- The removal of the tent structure and the plugging of holes where the structure has been attached to the building.
- The removal of the northern section of the slabs and all of the interlocking brick paving.
- The removal of the pizza oven and its slab integrated visually with the rest of the surface of the yard.

Approval is subject to the following conditions:

- The work must be carried out by a suitably experienced constructor to be approved by HWC.
- The remedial work must be documented and photographed in a report prepared by the Museum and included within a completion report to be submitted to HWC within 30 days of practical completion.
- This approval does not apply to any additional interventions to the court yard space e.g. soft and hard landscaping.

The remaining remedial actions identified on page 8 of the opinion must be submitted to HWC for approval as part of a separate application within the next 6 months and must be prepared with the input of an architect with heritage expertise.

WD

8.7 Integration of BELCOM and APM decisions

It was noted that administrative processes for addressing archaeological issues in terms of section 27 applications need to co-ordinate and integrate the decisions of BELCOM and APM.

9. Standing items

9.1 Site Inspections

The following site inspections undertaken by Committee members and staff were noted:

- Purple Turtle Erf 2355, Cape Town
- Proposed Total Demolition Erf 802, 181 Main Road, Green Point
- Proposed Total Demolition, Erven 3223 & 2988, 106 & 108 Kloof Street, Oranjezicht

The following site inspections undertaken by staff were noted:

- Proposed Partial Demolition, Alterations, Restoration and Landscape, Erf 1109, 10 Voortrek Street, Swellendam

PM

10. Appointments

10.1 None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 4942, City Hall, Darling, Corporation, Parade and Long Market Streets Cape Town: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD/ Erf 4942

Case No: 16041202WD0413M

A Heritage Statement, an application for a permit, photographs, roof plans and additional information were tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation.

Mr Andrew Berman and Mr Andrew Pentz were present and took part in discussion.

The chair indicated that Mr Scurr had an interest in the application as ArchRSA had prepared detailed specifications for a previous contract/ appointment. Mr Berman and Mr Pentz confirmed that there was no conflict of interest.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed roof replacement and painting of the stair case subject to the following conditions:

- An architect with appropriate heritage experience should be directly involved in the supervision of the work.
- The work is to be fully documented.
- Completion reports are to be submitted to HWC for each proposal within 30 days of practical completion.
- The specifications described on page 10 of the Heritage Statement. Detailed specifications of the paint colour and type and must be submitted to HWC for approval.
- The Rennie Scurr Adendorff specifications and reports dated 2012, 2013 and 2014 should be considered and integrated into the detailed documentation

WD

**11.2 Proposed Development, ERF 161, 20 BATH STREET, MONTAGU: MA
HM/MONTAGU/ERF 161**

Case No: 14061706JW0611E

A completion report prepared by Mr Henry Aikman was tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Henry Aikman was present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

The Committee endorsed the completion report prepared by Mr Aikman.

The Committee does not condone unauthorised work. However, it has no objection to the deviations to the approved plans as they have not impacted heritage significance.

JW

**12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL
DEMOLITION**

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, ERVEN 3223 & 2988, 106 & 108 KLOOF STREET,
ORANJEZICHT: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ORANJEZICHT/ERVEN 3223 & 2988**

Case No: 16011108KR0210E

GJ, SW and PB reported back on their site inspection.

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee noted that the building has been graded IIIC and is in agreement with this grading. The interiors of the buildings have been significantly altered. However, they contribute to the historical character of a significant streetscape in terms of building form and scale, style roof form, timber detailing on the gable ends and other upper floor detailing. The buildings are a prominent presence in the street's context and have a positive relationship with the historic terrace houses opposite.

The committee resolved not to approve the demolition. The Committee is of the opinion that there is room for alternatives to be explored rather than totally redeveloping the site.

GT

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition, ERF 1090, 44 AVENUE DISANDT, FRESNAYE: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/FRESNAYE/ERF 1090

Case No: 16040605KR0411E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Stephen S. Townsend, dated 8 April 2016, an application for a permit, and comments from the SFB Residents and Ratepayers Association and the City were tabled.

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation

Dr Stephen Townsend was present and took part in discussion.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection (GJ, SW, MS and PB).

KR

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition Erf 802, 181 Main Road, Green Point: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/GREEN POINT/ERF 802

Case No: 16020914JW0212E

SW and GJ reported back on their site inspection.

Mr Stuart Burnett and Mr Ashley Lillie were present and took part in the discussion.

DECISION

It was noted the City has graded the building IIIB in terms of its intactness and contribution to the context. However, the Committee is of the opinion that the building is not conservation worthy.

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition given that it has been highly altered, retains very few distinctive and significant period features and does not contribute to the heritage context.

JW

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Development, ERF 19506 SOMERSET WEST, PAARDEVLEI: MA HM/SOMERSET WEST/PAARDEVLEI/ERF 9506

Case No: 16031411JW0413M

A Heritage Statement and plans were tabled

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation

The chair indicated that Mr Jacobs had an interest in the application as he had been party to preparing previous heritage indicators for the site. Mr Aikman for the applicant confirmed that there was no conflict of interest.

DECISION

- The Committee resolved to approve the proposed alterations and additions and landscaping proposals 01-01-001 rev C, 01-01-002 rev C, 02-01-001 rev C, 03-01-001 rev C, 03-01-002 rev C and Type B; 01-01-001 rev C, 01-01-002 rev C, 02-01-001 rev C, 03-01-001 rev C, 03-01-002 rev C and the Proposed Landscape Plan. 123-02-01.

Approval is subject to the following conditions:

- The original colour scheme must be retained including the roof tiles.
- A completion report prepared by the heritage consultant must be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

The Committee has no objection to the removal of senescent Gum trees.

JW

13.2 PROPOSED PARTIAL DEMOLITION AND ALTERATIONS ON ERF 117778 AND 117779, 1 HARRINGTON STREET, CAPE TOWN: NM HMCAPETOWN METROPOLITAN CITY CENTRE CBD I ERVEN 117778 117779 1 HARRINGTON STREET

Case No: 16040618GT0413E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Bridget O'Donoghue and plans No: 2016/NICRO/201 - 215 dated 12 April 2016 were tabled.

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to conduct a site visit (SW, GJ, PB and MS).

GT

13.3 Proposed ALTERATION OF GROUND FLOOR AND ADDITION OF TWO MORE FLOORS, ERF 25450-RE, CORNER LOWER MAIN AND COLE ROAD, OBSERVATORY: NM

Case No: 15070910KR0331E

An application for a permit, comments from the City and the Observatory Civic Association, photographs and drawings prepared by Twofivefive Architects - 15002/4.1-A-1 to 15002/4.1-A-12 dated 2016-01-22 were tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposed interventions will not impact negatively on heritage significance.

WD

**13.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 14519 - 10 Upper Lady Grey Street,
Paarl: NM
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ ERF 14519**

Case No: 16040611WD0406E

An application for a permit, photos, locality plan, plans, and conservation body comment were tabled

Ms Waseefa Dhansay made a power-point presentation

DECISION

The Committee resolved to conduct a site visit (SW, SH, GJ, PB and MS).

WD

**13.5 Proposed Partial Demolition, Alterations, Restoration and Landscape, Erf 1109,
10 Voortrek Street, Swellendam: MA
HM/OVERBERG/SWELLENDAM/ ERF 1109**

Case No: 16020909KR0303M

JL reported back on her site visit.

The Committee noted the report back and that a Section 51 notification has been issued.

JL

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: **13H00**

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 25 May 2016

CHAIRPERSON _____ **DATE** _____

SECRETARY _____ **DATE** _____