

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)
Commenced at 08:30 and held on Thursday, 13 October 2022 via
Microsoft Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 08:32 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)
Prof Walter Peters (WP)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM)
Mr Reagon Fortune (RF)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Ms Natalie Kendrick (NK)
Mr Robin George (RG)
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)

Visitors:

Ms Sarah Winter
Mr Theo Cromhout
Mr William George
Ms Tamar Shem-Tov

Mr Mike Scurr
Mr Jacques Mouton
Ms Kirsten Burgers

Apologies

Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 13 October 2022.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 13 October 2022.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 28 September 2022

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 28 September 2022 and resolved to approve them with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

6.1 Recusals

- GJ: item 13.3
- DB: item 13.4

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The Committee noted the following Appeals matters:

- Erven 2455 & 2456, C/O Joubert Street & Merriman Avenue, Stellenbosch.
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 17200, 212A Buitengracht Street, Bo-Kaap: S.34.
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 20746, 166-170 Main Street, Paarl: S.34.
- Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 138 & 3110, 19 Mead Way, Pinelands: S.27.
- Athlone Power Station Erf RE 32564, Athlone (held over).

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

8.2.1 Union Castle Building

The legal advisor to pursue this matter further with the CEO in the absence of having received further response from the applicant.

The Committee notes that the meeting between BELCom representatives, the independent monitoring consultants and the applicant regarding the implementation of emergency site protection is anticipated to occur very shortly.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

Nothing to report.

8.4 Compulsory Repair Orders

8.4.1 Palace Barracks, Simon's Town

DB reported back that no remedial action has been taken as of 8 October 2022 despite the compulsory repair order having been issued on 26 September 2022.

8.4.2 Meeting with the Moravian Church; general maintenance issues

Members of the Committee together with HWC CEO and staff met with management of the Moravian Church via video conference on Tuesday, 11 October 2022 to discuss the way forward regarding the compulsory repair order for Wupperthal and general maintenance issues in its other Mission stations. The Moravian Church is to provide HWC with a written response to the compulsory repair order within 14 days of the aforementioned video conference i.e. by 26 October 2022. Upon receipt of the response, the CEO will obtain a legal opinion from senior counsel regarding the issue of land ownership in the mission stations.

8.4.3 Wupperthal, 6 Klip Street

The Committee notes that a compulsory repair order was issued in error on this house. The Committee has no objection to this order being rescinded.

8.5 Erf 740, 25 Caledon Street, George

The Committee is still waiting for feedback on the transgressions that have occurred on this property.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3035, 51 Bryant Street, Bo-Kaap.
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 3080 and 3081, 220-222 Upper Buitengracht Street, Cape Town.
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 63656, 42 Oak Avenue, Kenilworth.

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

None

10. Appointments

The Committee noted the appointment for item 20.1 set for 09:00.

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 None

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 None

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Minor Works on Erf 735-RE, 36 Hastings Street, Tamboerskloof: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ TAMBOERSKLOOF/ ERF 735-RE

Case No: 22091408RG0915E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Robin George introduced the case.

Ms Kirsten Burgess (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is a grade IIIB resource and situated inside an HPOZ.
- CoCT supports the proposals.
- CIBRA supports the proposals.
- BELCom requested revision of the balustrade detail on the Hastings Street elevation at the meeting of 12 July. A revised detail was presented and accepted at the meeting of 31 August.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings CS-ERF 735-RE-21.01, Revision 05, dated 4 August 2022 and prepared by Kirsten Burgess Architects as having met previous requirements.

RG

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3035, 51 Bryant Street, Bo-Kaap: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ BO-KAAP/ ERF 3035

Case No: 22091502RG0915E

Application documents were tabled.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 18 October 2022 at 14:00 (DB, GJ, WP and HvdM).

RG

**13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 3080 and 3081, 220-222 Upper Buitengracht Street, Cape Town: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ERVEN 3080 & 3081**

Case No: 22091208TZ0915E

Application documents were tabled.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 18 October 2022 at 13:30 (DB, WP and HvdM).

TZ

**13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 63656, 42 Oak Avenue, Kenilworth: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KENILWORTH/ERF 63656**

Case No: 22090604TZ0915E

Application documents were tabled.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 18 October 2022 at 15:00 (GJ, WP and HvdM).

TZ

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 Boschendal Historic Core Precinct Draft Conservation Management Plan: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH / BOSCHENDAL FARM

Case No: None

The Conservation Management Plan prepared Sarah Winter was tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Sarah Winter (heritage consultant), Mr Mike Scurr (heritage consultant), Mr Theo Cromhout (Boschendal CEO) and Mr Jacques Mouton (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Boschendal and Rhone are both PHS resources and situated inside the Grade I Cape Winelands Cultural Landscape.
- The Committee noted that the draft CMP is a very comprehensive document and contributed a few suggestions, for example adding a statement of intent as introduction to the section on heritage design indicators, explaining their underlying purpose (item 7.1). The Committee also suggested that it would be more helpful if terms such as 'positive' (e.g. as in 'positive interface') and 'appropriate' (e.g. as in 'appropriate re-use' or 'appropriate interventions') were explained/ better articulated.
- The importance, amongst others, of the historic axial approaches to the Boschendal and Rhone werfs was raised and it was agreed that an important aspect of significance would be recovered if the old axial approach to Rhone was to be reinstated for public vehicular access if at all possible.
- It was noted that the Boschendal & Rhone historic core is embedded within a wider cultural landscape consisting of a working farm under single ownership, allowing for a consistency of approach towards conservation management and sustainable economic activity.

ADVICE:

Minor issues were raised, which the consultants agreed to attend to, and the public participation process could go ahead.

SB

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 12:15

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

10 November 2022

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

APPROVED