

**APPROVED DECISIONS OF THE MEETING  
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,  
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)  
Held on Wednesday, 26 March 2014, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the  
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,  
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00**

---

**1. Opening and Welcome**

The meeting was officially opened at 09:10 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Members**

Ms Sarah Winter		SW
Ms Belinda Mutti	BM	
Mr Graham Jacobs		GJ
Mr Stuart Hermansen		SH
Mr Rowen Ruiters		RR
Mr Peter Buttgens		PB

**Members of Staff**

Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Ms Ntombi Nkoane	NN
Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Mr Olwethu-Oz-Dlova (Sec)	OD
Mr Jonathan Windvogel	JW
Mr Guy Thomas	GT
Mr Troy Smuts	TS

**Visitors**

Mr Chris Snelling	CS	Mr Ashely Lillie	AL
Mr David Erickson	DE	Mr David Halkett	DH
Mr Bradley Knight	BK	Mr Russel Baker	RB
Mr Johan Malherbe	JM	Ms Sarah-Jane Jackson	SJJ
Henk Lourens	HL		

**Observers**

None

**3. Apologies**

Mr Michael Scurr MS

**4. Approval of agenda**

**4.1** The Committee approved the agenda dated 26<sup>th</sup> March 2014 with some amendments.

**5. Approval of minutes of previous meeting**

**5.1 Dated 26 February 2014**

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

**5.2 Dated 14 March 2014**

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

## **6. Disclosure of Interest**

- BM: E.12.8
- PB: E.12.2; PB: E.12.6
- SH: W.12.3
- SW: W.11.2

## **7. Confidential Matters**

7.1 None

## **8. Administrative Matters**

### **8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

The CEO gave a report back on the following appeal matters:

- Proposed total demolition on Erven 869 and 870, 20 & 16 Exner Avenue, Vredehoek (Section 34); and
- Proposed expansion of an aquaculture operation on Erf 3819 and lot 32A of Erf 538, Gansbaai (Section 35).

**AH/ZS**

### **8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges**

GT reported back on stop works orders involving two buildings in Durban Road, Wynberg and a shell midden in Melkbosstrand.

**ZS**

#### **8.2.1 Long Street, Montagu**

ZS reported back on his discussion with Mr Brand of the Langeberg Municipality and undertook to write to the owner informing him that the repair work is a contravention in term of Section 34.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to request the owner to provide reasons for this illegal work to a grade IIIB building within a highly significant heritage context. A response is required within 14 days, failing which further steps will be taken.

**NN**

#### **8.2.2 Resolution of Stop Works Order, Purple Turtle (Old Imperial Hotel, 29 Shortmarket Street, Cape Town, Erf 2355, Cape Town**

The CEO reported that progress has been made with the owner.

**ZS/AH**

### **8.3 Recommendations of the Appeals Committee**

The Committee noted that it has been resolved that a standard condition be developed and submitted for consideration at the next meeting.

**ZS/AH**

#### **8.4 Declaration forms**

It was noted that a declaration of interest form must be submitted by committee members before 31 March 2014.

#### **8.5 Elim Electrification Upgrade**

It was noted that the electrification upgrade has enormous heritage and social benefits and the delay in sign off by the Church is affecting service delivery to the community. The Committee resolved that a letter be written to the Church requesting a response within 7 days. Failing a response or reasonable grounds for objections, it should be indicated that a permit will be issued.

**GJ**

#### **8.7 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition**

The Committee requested that the Queens Street, Sea Point and 24 Davenport Road, Vredehoek matters be referred to IGICom for consideration for formal protection.

#### **8.8 Elim Unauthorised Building Work**

Following a report back on a site visit taken by BM there appears to be significant building work being undertaken within the historical mission complex.

An urgent site inspection by a heritage officer must be undertaken.

**ZS**

### **9. Appointments**

**9.1** The Committee noted the appointments of item W.12.1 set for 12H00 and item E12.6

#### **FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION**

#### **W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

**W.10.1** None

#### **W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**W.11.1** Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 590, Corner Wantenaar Street and Main Road, Gouda: NM  
HM/GOUDA/ERF 590

**Case No:** 14021407RN0228E

An application for a permit, a heritage statement prepared by Aikman Associates Heritage Management, dated February 2014 was tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

The matter was deferred for further investigation by the case office of the Drakenstein inventory. A map of the grading of buildings in Gouda must be presented at the next meeting.

**RN**

**W.11.2 Proposed Restoration and Alterations, L'Huguenot Winery, Erf 341, Val de Vie Estate, Main Entrance Road, R 301, Paarl: NM  
HM/PAARL/L'HUGUENOT WINERY/ERF 341**

**Case No:** 14031105RN0312E

A Heritage Screening Report (Draft I Report) prepared Nicolas Baumann & Sarah Winter, dated December 2003 and plans were tabled.

SW recused herself and SH took the chair.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- Invasive exploratory work appears to have been undertaken without a permit.
- The work reflects an incomplete understanding of HWC's guide to grading and the grading approved by the HWC Council and rising from the Drakenstein Inventory.
- It is noted that the building is formally graded as IIIA.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved that a site inspection be conducted with the architect, archaeologist and Ms C. de Kock of the Drakenstein Municipality present.

**RN**

**W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**W.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 15802 & 2043, Eikestad Urban Renewal, Stellenbosch: MA  
HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 15802 & 2043**

Revised plans prepared by DHK, dated 11 June 2012 to be tabled.

The matter was withdrawn from the agenda as this is a Section 38 matter.

**RN**

**W.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 13122, Coronation Flats & Adjacent Buildings, 19 Walmer Road, Woodstock: NM  
HM/WOODSTOCK/ERF 13122**

**Case No:** 14030512JW0312M

An application for a permit prepared by Russen Baker, dated 21 October 2013, Statement of Significance and Assessment prepared by Chris Snelling, dated March 2014 were tabled.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

Mr Chris Snelling and Mr Russel Baker were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Upper Woodstock Residents Association Aesthetics Committee had been informed that the matter was to be tabled.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the Coronation Flats building to be Grade IIIC and it is noted that it is situated within a HPOZ.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals. The Committee supports the recommendations of the heritage assessor and requests that the final drawings be submitted to HWC for stamping by the case officer.

**JW**

#### **W.12.3 Proposed restoration, Erf 1893 and 1894, Paarl Regional Branch, Magistrates Court, Corner of Makert Street and Main Road, Paarl: NM HM/PAARL/ERF 1893 & 1894**

**Case No:** 14021207JW0312M

An application for a permit prepared by Stuart Hermansen, dated 10 March 2014, A Heritage Statement prepared by Stuart Hermansen, undated and plans were tabled.

SH recused himself.

Mr Jonathan Windvogel made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building is graded IIIA in terms of the approved Drakenstein Inventory.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that the sill height of the bathroom windows on the North elevation be aligned to match the existing windows.

Revised plans must be submitted to HWC for stamping.

**JW**

#### **W.12.4 Proposed Partial Demolition, Excavation and Landscaping, Erf 4053, Off Juter Square/ Wickboom Lane, Simonstown: NM HM/SIMONSTOWN/ERF 4053**

**Case No:** 14031111TS0313M

An application for a permit, A Phase II Assessment of Archaeological Resources Distributed during Development Activities, prepared Dave Halkett, dated November

2013, Document Pack prepared by Dave Halkett, dated November 2013 (updated March 2014) were tabled.

Mr Troy Smuts made a power-point presentation.

Mr David Halkett and Dr David Erickson of the Simonstown Historical Society were present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The historic walling and terraces formed part of the historical pattern of settlement making within Simonstown particularly with respect to its positive response to the topography. Concerns were raised regarding the extent of historic walling being removed and lack of response to the topography and existing levels of the terraces.
- The Committee was of the opinion that the reconfiguration of the units impacting the walling would resolve these concerns.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the historic walling and terraces to be Grade IIIB.

The Committee resolved to refer the proposal back to the applicant for consideration of the concerns raised. It also requested further information on the topography; including site sections and level changes.

TS

#### **W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

W.13.1 None

#### **W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

W.14.1 None

#### **W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

W.15.1 None

#### **W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

W.16.1 None

#### **W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

W.17.1 None

#### **W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

W.18.1 None

#### **W.19. Other Matters**

W.19.1 None

## **SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION**

### **E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

#### **E.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 237, Elim Clinic, Church Street: MA HM/ELIM/ERF 237**

**Case No:** 131022NN33E

BM reported back on her site visit.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The proposals will have a negative impact on the pattern of buildings along Church Street particularly in terms of roof configuration and orientation.
- There is no in principle objection to the construction of a building of this nature and size on this site but this will need to respond sympathetically to the historical typologies and orientation of buildings on Church Street.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved not to support the proposals in their current form, and to request the submission of revised proposals and that these proposals involve the input of a heritage architect to resolve the issues raised above.

**NN**

### **E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

#### **E.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 63992, C/O Main and Robinson Road, Kenilworth, Cape Town: NM HM/KENILWORTH/ERF 63992**

**Case No:** 14021102GT0303E

Application, Maps and Photographs and supporting documents prepared by Warren Petterson, dated 3 February 2014 were tabled.

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be Grade IIIC.

The Committee resolved to request further contextual information to establish whether the building forms part of a significant grouping that could be part of a future heritage area.

The matter will be postponed until the next meeting following further investigation by the case officer.

**GT**

**E.11.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 94664, 62A Kloof Street, Gardens, Cape Town:  
NM  
HM/GARDENS/ERF 94664**

**Case No:** 140120NN13E

Application and plans prepared by MLB architects, dated 28 October 2008 were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- CIBRA had raised numerous concerns that were not heritage related and are within the mandate of the committee.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided the building to be un-gradable.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

**NN**

**E.11.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 620, 37 Dixon Street, de Waterkant, Cape Town:  
NM  
HM/DE WATERKANT/ERF 620**

**Case No:** 14031203NN0313E

Application, location details, Photographs and Heritage Comments prepared by Ashley Lillie, dated 12 March 2014 were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

**DECISION**

The Committee decided the building to be un-gradable due to its lack of authenticity and typical characteristics relative to the de Waterkant typology and heritage area.

The Committee resolved to approve the application for total demolition.

**NN**

**E.11.4 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 591, 17 Avenue Disandt, Fresnaye: NM  
HM/FRESNAYE/ERF 591**

**Case No:** 14031815NN

Application, Photographs and Plans prepared by Black Currant Architects, dated February 2014 was tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

**DECISION**



The Committee decided the building to be un-gradable.  
The Committee resolved to approve the application for total demolition.

**NN**

**E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**E.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2899, 16 Bryant Street, Bo-Kaap: MA HM/BO-KAAP/ERF 2899**

**Case No:** 14021305NN0213E

An application for a permit and revised plans were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

**DECISION**

The Committee was satisfied that the revised proposals had addressed its previous concerns. The Committee resolved to approve the application.

**NN**

**E.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 5397, 19 Buitenkant Street, Cape Town: NM HM/BUITENKANT/ERF 5397**

**Case No:** 14031216NN0312E

Application and a Heritage Statement prepared by PBA Architects, dated March 2014 were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

PB recused himself.

**DECISION**

The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIIA and an excellent and rare example of a small industrial building of its period located in the City Centre.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

**NN**

**E.12.3 Proposed remodelling of Outbuildings on Erf 4907, Farm Uitkyk Noorder Paarl: MA HM/PAARL/FARM/YUITKYK/ERF 4907**

**Case No:** 131125NN49M

Heritage Statement prepared by Aikman Associates, dated November 2013 was tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

**DECISION**

The Committee was satisfied that the revised proposals had addressed its previous concerns. The Committee resolved to approve the application.

NN

**E.12.5 Erf 27412, Corner of Browning Street and Main Road, Observatory: MA HM/OBSERVATORY/ERF 27412**

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:

- Comments had been obtained from docomomo and the City of Cape Town.
- The requirement for further information had not been fulfilled.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to request a heritage statement to be prepared by a suitably qualified and experienced heritage practitioner with expertise in mid-20<sup>th</sup> century industrial architecture. The focus of the heritage statement must be on the heritage significance of the building in terms of architecture, type and grading.

NN

**E.12.6 Transnet Building, Salt River**

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

PB recused himself and left the room.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to support the proposed staircases as indicated by option 1B, i.e. with the removal of the steel cladding to ground level.

The Committee resolved to support the revised proposals for the roof addition.

Final detailed proposals must be submitted to the Committee for approval.

NN

**E.12.7 Proposed Alterations and Addition, D'Olyfboom, 14 Napier Street, Paarl**

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site visit.

NN

**E.12.8 Proposed Alterations at Diamant Estate, Farm 1279, Suider Agter Paarl Road, Southern Paarl: NM HM/ Paarl/FARM 1279**

**Case No:** 14031102GT0312E

Application, Photographs and Plans prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects, dated 24 January 2014 was tabled.

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation

BM recused herself.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The local conservation bodies supported the proposals.

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

**GT**

**E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**E.13.1** None

**E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**E.14.1** None

**E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**E.15.1** None

**E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**E.16.1** None

**E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

**E.17.1** None

**E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

**E.18.1** None

**E.19 Other Matters**

**E.19.1** None

**20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

**21. CLOSURE**

The meeting adjourned at **16H00**

**22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 23 April 2014**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_ **DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_ **DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

APPROVED