APPROVED DECISIONS OF THE MEETING
OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
BUILT ENVIRONMENT AND LANDSCAPE PERMIT COMMITTEE (BELCom)
Held on Wednesday, 23 April 2014, 1st Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town at 09H00

---

1. Opening and Welcome

The meeting was officially opened at 09:05 by the chairperson, Ms Sarah Winter, and she welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Members		**Members of Staff**	
Ms Sarah Winter	SW	Mr Andrew Hall	AH
Ms Belinda Mutti	BM	Ms Ntombi Nkoane	NN
Mr Graham Jacobs	GJ	Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka	ZS
Mr Stuart Hermansen	SH	Ms Lithalethu Mshoti (Sec)	LM
Mr Rowen Ruiters	RR	Mr Ronny Nyuka	RN
Mr Peter Buttgens	PB	Mr Olwethu-Oz-Dlova (Sec)	OD
Mr Michael Scurr	MS	Mr Guy Thomas	GT

Visitors			
Mr Chris Snelling	CS	Mr Johan Malherbe	JH
Mr Henry Aikman	HA	Mr Henk Lourens	HL
Ms Christa Van Staden	CVS	Ms Patty Price	PP
Mr John Rennie	JR		

Observers
None

3. Apologies
None

4. Approval of agenda

4.1 The Committee approved the agenda dated 23rd April 2014 with some amendments.

5. Approval of minutes of previous meeting

5.1 Dated 26 March 2014

The Committee resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

6. Disclosure of Interest

- GJ: E.12.4
- PB: W.18.1and E.12.2
- MS: E.10.1
- SW: W.11.2; E.12.4

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

APPROVED

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

The CEO gave a report back on the following appeal matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition on Erven 869 and 870, 20 & 16 Exner Avenue, Vredehoek (Section 34);
- Proposed Expansion of an Aquaculture Operation on Erf 3819 and Lot 32A of Erf 538, Gansbaai (Section 35); and
- Romney Road, Green Point (Section 34).

AH/ZS

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges

8.2.1 Long Street, Montagu

DECISION

The Committee resolved that the previous decision be followed up on.

NN

8.2.2 Other Stop Works Orders

GT reported back on stop works orders in:

- Durban Road, Wynberg (add street no)
- Main Road, Muizenberg (add street no)
- shell midden, Melkbosstrand (add erf or street no)
- Panorama Building and Jackson Bakery, Stellenbosch (add street no)

8.3 Recommendations of the Appeals Committee

Procedural issues arising from the above appeals were discussed by the Committee.

ZS/AH

8.4 Declaration forms

It was noted that a declaration of interest form must be submitted by committee members who had not yet submitted their forms.

8.5 Elim Electrification Upgrade

TS reported back that a letter had been issued and that there had been no response from the Church.

It was agreed that a permit be issued.

TS

8.6 Formal Protection of Buildings Refused for Demolition

The Committee noted that the next meeting of IGIC is to be held in June 2014 and that the Queens Street, Sea Point and 24 Davenport Road, Vredehoek matters will be tabled.

APPROVED

8.7 Elim Unauthorised Building Work

A site inspection was conducted. The structure in question is a planter authorised by HWC.

ZS

9. Appointments

9.1 None

FIRST SESSION: TEAM WEST PRESENTATION

W.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

W.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 237, 1 Buite Street, Elim: MA HM/ELIM/ERF 237/BUITE STREET

Case No: 131108JW23

Revised drawing prepared by T Engel, dated December 2013 (drawing no: 01_01_17, Rev: 01) was tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The revised proposals were an improvement on the previous proposals but that further improvements were needed to respond more sympathetically to the architectural character of Elim.
- Elim is a grade II site and is declared as a PHS.

DECISION
The Committee resolved to support the proposals in principle subject to the revision of the roof form as annotated on the drawings submitted. Revised proposals must be resubmitted to the Committee.

JW

W.11 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

W.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 590, Corner Wantenaar Street and Main Road, Gouda: MA
HM/GOUDA/ERF 590

Case No: 14021407RN0228E

An application for a permit, a heritage statement prepared by Aikman Associates Heritage Management, dated February 2014 and the Drakenstein Inventory were tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

Mr Henry Aikman was present and took part in discussion.

APPROVED

In discussion it was noted that:

- The building is graded IIIC and does not form part of a proposed heritage overlay zone or heritage area.
- The building is currently in a derelict and dangerous state with no remaining significant period features.
- The owner is currently being prosecuted in term of the NBR and S Act.
- It is not possible to ascertain who has responsible for the state of the building and the issue of wilful neglect is only applicable in the case of a declared heritage site.
- The DHF has recommended that HWC lay charges under the NHRA. It was felt by the Committee that if the DHF is confident concerning who is responsible for the damage to the building and under which provision of the NHRA charges might be brought then the organisation should lay charges..

DECISION
The Committee resolved to approve the demolition of the remaining structure. A letter must be written to DHF informing of the Committee's decision and its opinion concerning charges.

RN

W.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

W.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Restorations, Farm 429, Hoogstede Road, Paarl: NM HM/PAARL/FARM 429

Case No: 1432504RN0325E

An application for a permit prepared by A.D. Muller, dated 18 March 2014 was tabled.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The werf is graded IIIA and forms part of a highly significant historic landscape.
- Parts of the building are known be at least 200 years old and the fabric is richly layered.

DECISION
The Committee resolved that the documentation be circulated and that a decision be taken by e-mail.

The architect should be asked to confirm their experience and/or that of their proposed contractor concerning work on sites of this nature.

RN

APPROVED

W.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 47443, House van Heerden, 29 Lochiel Road, Rondebosch: NM
HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 47443/HOUSE VAN HEERDEN

Case No: 14031705JW0331E

An application for a permit prepared by Patty Price dated 4 March 2014 and plans prepared by Patty Price Architects, dated 5 February 2014 (drawing no: L1.02) was tabled.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka made a power-point presentation.

Ms Patty Price was present and participated in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The City of Cape Town HRS does not support the proposals as they will entirely change the character of the building. However the impact of the proposals on heritage significance was not motivated.
- The City of Cape Town has suggested a grading of IIIC.

DECISION
The Committee decided the grading of the building to be un-gradable and therefore without heritage significance.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

The Committee recommended that the street facing roof form be amended to a hipped roof on both ends to respond to the surrounding roof scape.

JW

W.12.3 Proposed Restoration and Alterations, L'Huguenot Winery, Erf 341, Val de Vie Estate, Main Entrance Road, R 301, Paarl: MA
HM/PAARL/L'HUGUENOT WINERY/ERF 341

Case No: 14031105RN0312E

SW recused herself and SH took the chair.

Mr Ronny Nyuka made a power-point presentation.

SH reported back on their site inspection.

Mr Johan Malherbe was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The presentation by the case officer is substandard and misleading as most of the work shown had already been approved. Some of the photographs shown dated from 2009 and had no relationship to the current proposals.
- The present application was essentially to realign openings on the facade of the building.

DECISION
The Committee decided the grading of the building to be IIIB.

APPROVED

The Committee resolved to approve the application as submitted related to the realignment of the French doors of the stoep and the demolition of the lean-to structure at the rear of the building.

RN

W.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

W.13.1 None

W. 14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

W.14.1 None

W.15. PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

W.15.1 None

W.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

W.16.1 None

W.17. PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

W.17.1 None

W.18. REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

W.18.1 Erf 55297, 6 Cavendish Street, Claremont
HM/CLAREMONT/ERF 55297

PB recused himself.

OPINION
The majority of the Committee members supported the retention of the building. The Committee was unanimous that the building contributes to the streetscape and the pattern of the built form and alignments within the surrounding context.

The building has largely contextual value as part of a row which mediates between the high scale of Cavendish Square and adjacent Claremont Village.

Options for the retention of the building and its alteration and extension would be supported.

DECISION
The Committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC.

ZS

W.19. Other Matters

W.19.1 None

APPROVED

SECOND SESSION: TEAM EAST PRESENTATION

E.10 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITE: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

E.10.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 90780, 27 Durban Road, Wynberg: MA HM/WYNBERG/ERF 90780

A revised drawing prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects, dated 8 April 2014 (darwing no: C-1001) was tabled.

MS recused himself.

Mr Zwelibanzi Shiceka introduced the application.

Mr John Rennie was present and took part in discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The revised drawings comply with the recommendations of the heritage report prepared by RSA Architects and previously endorsed by the Committee.
- The applicant has given a written undertaking that RSA Architects will supervise the ongoing work.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals, Drawing C-1001, dated 2014/04/08. Mr Rennie must provide a report on completion of the work.

ZS

E.10.2 Proposed Alterations and Restoration, Erf 127, Four Oaks Guesthouse, 46 Long Street, Montagu: MA HM/MONTAGU/ERF 127/ FOUR OAKS

Case No: 140127NN03

Structural Engineers Report prepared by Thatchsure Natural Homes and ES Professional Engineers undated was tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals subject to the submission of a completion report prepared by the consultant.

RECOMMENDATION

It was recommended that the air conditioning units on the side elevation be relocated to a less visible location.

NN

APPROVED

E.10.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations to existing dwellings of Glen Budd on Erf 101, No.6 Long Street, Montagu: MA
HM/MONTAGU/ERF 101/GLEN BUDD

Case No: 140121NN17E

Structural Engineers Report was tabled

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

DECISION
The Committee resolved to approve the roof repair and maintenance proposals subject to a completion report being submitted by the consultant.

NN

E.10.4 Proposed Restorations on Erf 2594, Druids Lodge, 50A Paul Kruger Street, Robertson: NM
HM/ROBERTSON/ERF 2594/DRUIDS LODGE

Case No: 131128NN04E

An application for a permit prepared by F.C Koch, dated 4 September 2013. Photographs and plans were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation

In discussion it was noted that:
- The CEO as director of Museums Services should advise the museum as how best to approach the rising damp problem and to provide the Committee with a proper scope of work and specification.

DECISION
The Committee resolved to defer the matter for the CEO to report back.

NN

E.10.5 Trafalgar Park, PHS, Woodstock

In the discussion it was noted that:
- The Committee remained concerned by the piece meal approach of the landscaping interventions as well as potential impact on archaeological remains.
- In order to resolve this issue interaction between HWC and the City of Cape Town is necessary.
- The master plan submitted does not address the basic requirements for such a plan including detailed site analysis and which is necessary to inform aspects such as surfacing, edge treatments and ensure a consistent approach across the site.
- The Committee remained concerned that the City of Cape Town had not attended this or previous meetings when the matter was discussed despite having been invited.

APPROVED

DECISION
The Committee resolved that a formal meeting between HWC and City of Cape Town and its consultants be set up to discuss the concerns raised above. The matter will not again be tabled at a BELCom meeting until this meeting has taken place.

GT/JW

E.11. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

E.11.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 63992, Corner Main and Robinson Roads, Kenilworth, Cape Town: NM
HM/KENILWORTH/ERF 63992

Case No: 14021102GT0303E

Application, Maps and Photographs and supporting documents prepared by Warren Petterson, dated 3 February 2014 were tabled.

Mr Guy Thomas made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:
- The building is situated within an area containing a large number of similar buildings of medium to high local significance.
- It is an area the Committee considers worthy of protection as a heritage area.
- The option of provisional protection might be useful to control possible new development within the area.
- Heritage Western Cape needs to review its policy regarding IIIC sites where contextual issues could be addressed by appropriate new development.

DECISION
The Committee unanimously decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC.

The Committee resolved by a vote of four to three not to approve the application for demolition.

The Committee unanimously recommended that a Kenilworth heritage area be investigated for formal protection by the City of Cape Town.

GT

E.11.2 Proposed total Demolition, Ptn 2 of the Farm Kleinvlei No 196, Kleinvlei Farm Homestead, Clanwilliam: NM
HM/CLANWILLIAM/FARM KLEINVLEI NO 196

Case No: 14033101NN0402E

An application for a permit prepared by Anton O.D Bergh, dated 3 March 2014, report regarding fire damage, locality map and plans were tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:
- The application was incomplete.

APPROVED

- The building is published in Hans Fransen's 'The Old Buildings of the Cape" and is potentially of high significance.

DECISION
The Committee resolved to request a proper site plan showing the location of the building within the werf and its immediate and its broader landscape context, together with GPS coordinates and the required contextual photographs.

NN

E.12 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

E.12.1 Proposed Alterations and Addition, D'Olyfboom, 14 Napier Street, Paarl: MA HM/PAARL/D'OLYFBOOM

Members of the Committee (SH and SW) reported back on their site inspection.

Mr Malherbe was present and participated in the discussion.

In discussion it was noted that:
- SH reported back on the site visit and undertook to tabulate his concerns and to email these to the Committee and architect for further discussion.
- The architect indicated that he regarded the comments in a positive light and agreed to take the concerns into account in the design development process.
- The buildings and site are highly significant and reveal a highly complex layering. The site should be investigated for provincial heritage site status and the case officer should conduct a site inspection.

DECISION
The Committee resolved that the proposals required further consideration to address a number of concerns.

GT

E.12.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 15201, Transnet Engineering Building, 19 Voortrekker Road, Salt River: MA HM/SALT RIVER/ERF 15201/TRANSNET ENGINEERING BUILDING

Case No: 131203NN31M

Revised drawings were tabled.

PB recused himself.

Mr Henk Lourens was present and participated in the discussion.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

DECISION
The Committee resolved to approve the plans subject to the work proceeding substantially in accordance therewith. Final details for the treatment of the staircases are to be submitted for approval.

NN

APPROVED

E.12.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 27412, Corner Browning & Victoria Roads, Salt River: MA
HM/SALT RIVER/ERF 27412

Case No: 14013006NN0207E

A Heritage Statement prepared by Chris Snelling, dated April 2014 to be tabled.

MS recused himself.

Mr Chris Snelling was present and participated in the discussion.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The Committee supported the findings and recommendations of the heritage statement and complemented Mr Snelling on his report.

DECISION
The Committee decided the grading of the building to be un-gradable.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals.

NN

E.12.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Klein Melkboschplaas, Homestead, Erf 94 Melkbosstrand: MA
HM/MELKBOSSTRAND/ERF 94
Case No: 110930NN23M

An application to undertake maintenance work was tabled.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

GJ and SW recused themselves and MS took the chair.

In discussion it was noted that:

- The detailed specification provides a general guide to the work to stabilise the building, however given the nature of the site and fabric many on site decision will have to be taken.

DECISION
The Committee resolved to approve the maintenance specifications subject to the following conditions:

- The heritage architect is required to undertake site inspections and investigations on a regular basis and as deemed necessary by him in order to achieve compliance.
- The 'Chromadek' roof sheeting colour to be confirmed by the heritage consultant and to be grey toned to accord with the original roof.
- The overall redecoration and colour scheme of the entire building (not limited only to the maintenance items outlined) is to be confirmed by the heritage architect based on historic precedent.
- A completion report must be tabled by the heritage architect before the committee.

NN

APPROVED

E.12.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 13355, 230 Victoria Road,Woodstock: NM
HM/WOODSTOCK/ERF 13355

Case No: 140127NN06E

An application for permit prepared by Dennis Christian Robertson, dated 24 January 2014, photographs and plans prepared by Zuckerman Sachs Architects, dated 22 January 2014 (drawing no: 1.01) were tabled.

Ms Christa Van Staden was present and participated in the discussion.

Ms Ntombi Nkoane made a power-point presentation.

In discussion it was noted that:
- The City of Cape Town HRS supports the proposals.
- The proposals do not impact the significance of the building.

DECISION
The committee decided the grading of the building to be grade IIIC.

The committee resolved to approve the proposals.

NN

E.13 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

E.13.1 None

E.14 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

E.14.1 None

E.15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

E.15.1 None

E.16 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

E.16.1 None

E.17 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

E.17.1 None

E.18 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

E.18.1 None

E.19 Other Matters

E.19.1 None

20. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS
The Committee adopted the resolution and decisions.

APPROVED

21. CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at **16H20**

22 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 28 May 2014

CHAIRPERSON_____ **DATE**_____

SECRETARY_____ **DATE**_____

APPROVED