



**APPROVED MINUTES OF A MEETING OF
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE (HWC)
INVENTORIES, GRADING AND INTERPRETATION COMMITTEE (IGIC) HELD ON 17TH
OF FEBRUARY 2023, AT 09H00 VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS**

1. Opening and Welcoming

The Chairperson, Mr. Ron Martin, opened the meeting at 09:21 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

IGIC Committee

Mr. Ron Martin (RM)
Ms. Jenna Lavin
Ms. Laura Milandri
Dr Wandile Kasibe
Mr. Glynn Alard

HWC Staff

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel (JW)
Ms. Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms. Nuraan Vallie (NV)
Ms. Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Mr. Yaseen Simondium (YS)
Ms. Cecilene Muller (CM)
Mr. Robin George (RG)
Ms. Muneerah Solomon (MS)
Ms. Chane Herman (CH)
Ms. Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Mr. Michael Janse van Rensburg (MJvR)

Visitors

Ms. Petra Broddle
Mr. Danie Kotze
Mr. Kevin Maart
Ms. Leesha ...
Agulhas Heritage
Mr. Mark Bell
Mr. Wouter Swart
Mr. Stephan Kirsten
Ms. Christiana Groenewoud
Dr Pierre Viviers
Ms. Leonie Marais-Botes
Mr. Wynand Claassen
Mr. Edwin Pieterse
Ms. Bridget O 'Donoghue
Mr. Ebrahim Cassiem

Dr Lita Webley
Mr. Johan Visagie'
Mr. Pedro April
Ms. Quahnita Samie
Ms. Ansa Ferreira
Mr. Paul Naylor
Mr. Jan Kotze
Mr. Wynand Mac
Ms. Lize Malan
Ms. Nazeem Brown
Ms. Lara Colananni
Mr. Johann Loubser
Mr. Rian Oberholzer
Mr. Wesley Cowan
Ms. Katherine Dumbrell

Mr. Piet De Jager
Mr. Greg Guthrie
Mr. Ashley Lillie
Ms. Carla Nortje
Ms. Shantel du Pisani
Mr. Chris Swift
Mr. Dan Retief
Ms. Diana Pfaff
Mr. Harold Moses
Mr. Michael Bishop
Mr. Sean Galant
Mr. Graeme Wilson
Ms. Claudia Tennant

Mr. Kevin Kiewitz
Ms. Karen Munting
Mr. Bewin September
Ms. Cindy Postlethwayt
Mr. Chrissie te Groen
Mr. Dacre Hattingh
Mr. Denzil Titus
Mr. Ebrahim Cassiem
Mr. Johan Small
Mr. Michael McLaggan
Mr. Danny Bolton
Mr. Henri de Wet
Chief Sedaf (Xam leader)

Legal Advisor

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)

3. Apologies

None

Absent

None

4. Approval of the agenda dated 17th of February 2023.

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated **17th of February 2023** with minor edits. JL moved to adopt the approval of the agenda and LM seconded.

5. Approval of the previous minutes

5.1 IGIC Minutes dated 4th of November 2022.

The Committee resolved that the minutes dated 4th of November 2022 will be approved at the next IGIC Committee meeting 5th of May 2023.

6. Disclosure of Interest

6.1 None

7. Confidential matters

7.1 None

8. Appointments

Approved IGIC Minutes 17th February 2023

8.1 Newlands Rugby Stadium (12h00)

9 Administrative Matters

9.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the following appeals matters:

9.1.1 Tribunal Directive
Green Point Common.

9.1.2 Outcome of Appeals

Athlone Power Station: To proceed with the 60 days public participation process in terms of S 27(8)(a)(b) and (c) of the NHRA: Re 32564 Athlone Power Station.
HM/CAPEMETROPOLITAN/ATHLONE POWER STATION/RE 32564/ATHLONE
Case No: N/A

HELD OVER

The matter was held over by agreement of the parties to the meeting of 8 March 2023.

10. Site inspections and inspection reports

10.1 Erf 37, 38, 39. 33 Van Brede Street, L'Agulhas (Matter Arising).

Site inspection was undertaken on the 10th of November 2022 by Ms. Maureen Walters and Dr Bongani Ndhlovu.

The site visit report has not been provided to the IGIC for the record
HWC is requested to follow up regarding the submission of the Site Visit Reports

10.2 Agulhas Mountain, Erven 600, 601, 609, 610, 2265, Farm 281 and Portion 55 (Matter Arising)

Site inspection was undertaken on the 10th of November 2022 by Ms Maureen Walters and Dr Bongani Ndhlovu.

The site visit report has not been provided to the IGIC for the record
HWC is requested to follow up regarding the submission of the Site Visit Reports

JW

11. Policy matters

11.1 None

Approved IGIC Minutes 17th February 2023

12. Surveys

12.1 None

13. Proposed nominations of Provincial Heritage Sites

13.1 Farm 731, Ganzekraal, West Coast (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave presentation.

Mr. Katherine Dumbrell, Mr. Paul Naylor, was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel noted that:

- The matter was previously heard on the 6th of May, on the 5th of August and on the 4th of November 2022, IGIC committee meetings.
- The farm was nominated by Mr. Paul Naylor.
- The nominator Mr. Naylor said the site has representativity, related historical, aesthetic, scientific, and social significance.

The committee noted:

- Insufficient information is presented in the application regarding tangible heritage resources. The nomination application reflects a number of significances including a spring, burial grounds and graves as well as archaeological heritage, however no detailed information regarding these significances is provided.
- The status of the intangible heritage value of the site needs to be clarified and detailed, including ongoing use of the site by local communities in relation to traditional practices, physical landscape features and elements on the site.
- It is suggested that Heritage Western Cape communicate with Cape Nature with regards to the ongoing pro-active management of the site to prevent further degradation of the structures on site
- The nominator is requested to provide a site map indicating the boundaries of the proposed provincial heritage site, and to take the location of intangible and tangible resources into account.
- The nominator is requested to consult with all parties that have made verbal representations at this meeting regarding the heritage values identified at this site.
- The committee must be provided with sufficient information to determine whether or not the site that has been nominated has sufficient heritage value to warrant Grade II status in its current state.

RECOMMENDATION

The committee recommends that additional information is required from the applicant to clarify the above discussion points in order to ensure the completeness of the nomination application.

DECISION

The committee resolved to initiate the 30-day consultation period with the owner in terms of S27(d) of the NHRA.

JW

13.2 Farm 40 Boebezaks Kraal, Kasteelberg (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave a presentation.

Ms. Quahnita Samie, Dr Webley Lita, Katherine Dumbrell, Kevin Maart and Danny Bolton, were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel noted:

- The matter was previously heard at various IGIC Committee meetings.
- The matter was referred to be tabled at the next IGIC Committee meeting.

The committee noted:

- The committee agreed that the scientific value of the site is worthy of being graded a GII.
- It was noted that the notice to the owner in terms of S27(8)(a) has expired.

DECISION

The committee resolved to re-send the notice in terms of S27(8)(a) to the owner of the site and recommended that staff engage with the owner regarding his objections.

JW

13.3 Alexander Sinton (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

Ms. Quahnita Samie, Karen Munting and Ansa Ferreira were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

- Insufficient information is provided in the nomination applications presented. Outstanding information includes:
 - Detailed maps and site boundaries and a clear description of the heritage resource being nominated
 - Expanded statement of significance with evidence

HELD OVER

The committee resolved to hold over the matter pending receipt of additional information.

JW

13.4 Athlone Secondary (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

Ms. Quahnita Sammie, Karen Munting and Ansa Ferreira were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

- Insufficient information is provided in the nomination applications presented. Outstanding information includes:
 - Detailed maps and site boundaries and a clear description of the heritage resource being nominated
 - Expanded statement of significance with evidence

HELD OVER

The committee resolved to held over the matter pending receipt of additional information.

JW

13.4 Cathkin High (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

Ms. Quahnita Sammie, Karen Munting and Ansa Ferreira were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

- Insufficient information is provided in the nomination applications presented. Outstanding information includes:
 - Detailed maps and site boundaries and a clear description of the heritage resource being nominated
 - Expanded statement of significance with evidence

HELD OVER

The committee resolved to held over the matter pending receipt of additional information.

JW

13.6 Fezeka High (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

Ms. Quahnita Sammie, Karen Munting and Ansa Ferreira were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

- Insufficient information is provided in the nomination applications presented. Outstanding information includes:
 - Detailed maps and site boundaries and a clear description of the heritage resource being nominated
 - Expanded statement of significance with evidence

HELD OVER

The committee resolved to held over the matter pending receipt of additional information.

JW

13.7 Livingstone High (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

Ms. Quahnita Sammie, Karen Munting and Ansa Ferreira were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

- Insufficient information is provided in the nomination applications presented. Outstanding information includes:
 - Detailed maps and site boundaries and a clear description of the heritage resource being nominated
 - Expanded statement of significance with evidence

HELD OVER

The committee resolved to held over the matter pending receipt of additional information.

JW

13.8 Mount View High (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

Ms. Quahnita Sammie, Karen Munting and Ansa Ferreira were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

- Insufficient information is provided in the nomination applications presented. Outstanding information includes:
 - Detailed maps and site boundaries and a clear description of the heritage resource being nominated
 - Expanded statement of significance with evidence

HELD OVER

The committee resolved to held over the matter pending receipt of additional information.

JW

13.9 Rylands High (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

Ms. Quahnita Sammie, Karen Munting and Ansa Ferreira were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

- Insufficient information is provided in the nomination applications presented. Outstanding information includes:
 - Detailed maps and site boundaries and a clear description of the heritage resource being nominated
 - Expanded statement of significance with evidence

HELD OVER

The committee resolved to held over the matter pending receipt of additional information.

JW

13.10 Belgravia High (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

Ms. Quahnita Sammie, Karen Munting and Ansa Ferreira were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

- Insufficient information is provided in the nomination applications presented. Outstanding information includes:
 - Detailed maps and site boundaries and a clear description of the heritage resource being nominated
 - Expanded statement of significance with evidence

HELD OVER

The committee resolved to held over the matter pending receipt of additional information.

JW

13.11 Langa High (Matter Arising)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

Ms. Quahnita Sammie, Karen Munting and Ansa Ferreira were present and took part in the discussion.

Approved IGIC Minutes 17th February 2023

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

- Insufficient information is provided in the nomination applications presented. Outstanding information includes:
 - Detailed maps and site boundaries and a clear description of the heritage resource being nominated
 - Expanded statement of significance with evidence

HELD OVER

The committee resolved to held over the matter pending receipt of additional information.

JW

13.12 Newlands Rugby Stadium (Matter Arising)

Site inspection was undertaken on the 10th of November 2022 by Dr B Ndhlovu and Ms. M Walters.

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

Mr. Wynand Claassen, Mr. Wynand Mac, Ms. Bridget O 'Donoghue, Ms. and Mr. Greg Guthrie, were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

Jonathan Windvogel noted that:

- The matter was heard previously at the 4th of November 2022 IGIC Committee meeting.

The Committee noted:

- Both the nominator and the landowner agree that the heritage value of the site does not reside within its tangible resources and structures but in its associative value with the cultural practice of rugby and its role in regional sociopolitical history including both exclusion of, and reconciliation between communities.
- The important South African cultural practice of playing rugby and attending rugby matches will be able to continue in other locations. The history of the Newlands Rugby Stadium can be highlighted and celebrated in alternative and appropriate ways as proposed by the landowner in their submissions

RECOMMENDATION

The committee considers that the Newlands Rugby Stadium as nominated does not possess enough intrinsic heritage value to warrant a grading of GII and accordingly does not recommend declaration as a Provincial Heritage Site.

JW

14. Provincial Heritage Site plaque replacement

14.1 None

5 Formal Protection

15.1 Erf 37, 38, 39. 33 Van Brede Street, L'Agulhas (New Matter)

Site inspection was undertaken on the 10th of November 2022 by Ms Maureen Walters and Dr Bongani Ndhlovu.

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

was present and took part in the discussion

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters was discussed.

Mr. Windvogel noted that:

- The Site visit report has not been provided to IGIC for the record.
- The IGIC requires the information included in the Site visit further comment can be made.
- The I&AP's need to be present during the discussion of this item.

HELD OVER

The committee resolved matter be held over to the next IGIC committee meeting for the 5th of May 2023

JW

15.2 Agulhas Mountain, Erven 600, 601, 609, 610, 2265, Farm 281 and Portion 55 (New Matter)

Approved IGIC Minutes 17th February 2023

Site inspection was undertaken on the 10th of November 2022 by Ms Maureen Walters and Dr Bongani Ndhlovu.

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel gave the presentation.

was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following matters were discussed.

Mr Windvogel noted that:

- The Site visit report has not been provided to IGIC for the record.
- The IGIC requires the information included in the Site Visit report before further comment can be made.
- The I&AP's need to be present during the discussion of this item.

HELD OVER

The committee resolved matter be held over to the next IGIC committee meeting for the 5th of May 2023

JW

15. Proposed Provisional Protection

16.1 None

17. Conservation Body Registration

17.1 None

18. Conservation Management Plans

18.1 None

19. Other Matters

19.1 None

20. Adoption of Resolutions and Decisions

The Committee unanimously adopted the decisions and resolutions, with JL proposing and LM seconding the proposal.

21. Date of next meeting: 5th of May 2023

Approved IGIC Minutes 17th February 2023

21.1 CLOSURE: 15:59

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____ DATE 5 May 2023 _____

SECRETARY  _____ DATE 5 May 2023 _____

APPROVED