## APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE, HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING



# HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING Held on Monday, 29 March 2021, HOMS MEETING VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS, scheduled for 8:30

#### OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Mr Jonathan Windvogel officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

#### 2. ATTENDANCE

Members of Staff

None

Ms. Aneeqah Brown (AB) (secretary)

Mr. Jonathan Windvogel (JW) (Assistant Director)

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt (SB) (Case Officer)

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile (KB) (Case Officer)

Ms. Sandisiwe Matole (SM) (Case Officer)

Ms. Xola Mwandle (XM) (Intern)

Ms. Nokubonga Dlamini (ND) (Case Officer)

Ms. Anita Shologu (AS) (Intern Admin support)

Ms. Zikhona Sigonya (ZS) (Intern Admin support)

#### **Legal Advisor**

Ms. Penelope Meyer (PM)

#### **Visitors**

Mr. Mogammad Mallick (item 11.3) Ms. Bridget O'Donoghue (item 11.7) Mr. David Curry (item 11.7) Mr. Philip Smith (item 11.7) Mr. Mike Scurr (item 12.32)

Ms Laura Milandri (item 12.32)

#### **Observers**

None

#### 3. Apologies

None

#### Absent

None

## 4. Approval of Agenda

- **4.1** 29 March 2021
- 5. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting
- **5.1** 25 March 2021
- 6. Disclosure of conflict of interest
- 6.1 None

- 7. Confidential matters
- **7.1** None
- 8. Standing Items
- 8.1 Site inspections undertaken.
- **8.1.1** None
- 8.2 Proposed Site Inspection
- **8.2.1** None
- 8.3 Site Inspection Reports
- **8.3.1** None
- 8.4 Preparation for the upcoming committee meetings
- **8.4.1** HOMs 6 April 2021
- 8.5 Interim and Close Out Reports
- **8.5.1** None
- 8.6 Incomplete Applications
- 9. Administrative Matters
- 9.1 None
- 10. Appointments
- 11.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 127706, 31A Regent Street, Woodstock, S34-A&A
- 11.7 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 14704, 14 Rue Orleans, Somerset West, \$34-Total Demolition
- 12.32 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 90530 to Rem 95031 Leinster Hall, Weltevreden Street, Gardens, S27-A&A

## MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

- 11. MATTERS ARISING
- 11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2571, 10 Street Avenue, Hermanus, \$34-A&A Case No: 21030201SM0303E

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

- Information received on 24 March 2021.
- Graded IIIC
- Whale Coast Conservation Body supports the proposal.
- Overstrand Heritage Aesthetics Advisory Committee indicated that the applicants should submit to HWC.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

SM

# 11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 26056, 41 Milton Road, Observatory, \$34-A&A Case No: 21021706SM0224E

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor Works Application.
- Information received on 25 March 2021.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

A full Section 34 Application to be submitted.

SM

# 11.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 127706, 31A Regent Street, Woodstock, \$34-A&A Case No: 21012102TZ0121E

Mr. Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Mr Mogammad Mallick (Applicant) was present and took part in the discussion.

## DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Woodstock Resident's Association supports the proposal.
- Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee had concerns regarding the proposal.
- Salt River Heritage Society did not comment within 30-day commenting period.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. A close-out report is submitted within 30-days of practical completion.

ΤZ

# 11.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 57605, 27 Mark Road, Claremont, \$34-A&A Case No: 20121505KB1221E

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

- Information received on 25 March 2021.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

UCRRA said they will not comment on illegal work.

#### **DECISION**

HWC does not condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

# 11.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 415, 11 Pypies Square Vredehoek, \$34-A&A Case No: 21021203ND2022E

Ms. Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 15 March 2021.
- Graded NCW
- Not within HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group supports the proposal.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ND

## 11.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1187, 371 - 373 High Street, Paarl, \$34-A&A

Case No: 20081708ND1119E

#### **HELD OVER:**

Referred to BELCom on 16 April 2021.

ND

# 11.7 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 14704, 14 Rue Orleans, Somerset West, \$34-Total Demolition Case No: 21021504ND0304E

Ms. Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue (applicant), Mr David Curry (I&AP) and Mr Philip Smith were present and took part in the discussion.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Heldeberg Renaissance Foundation supports the proposal.
- The three objections received were not heritage related.
- All interseted and affectd parties were invited to the meeting.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ND

## 11.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 89617, Beaufort Villa 12 Main Road, Kalk Bay, \$34-A&A

Case No: 20111801ND1125E

Ms. Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Inside HPO
- Graded IIIA
- Previous permit dated 8 December 2020.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ND

# 11.9 Proposed Partial Demolition, Additions and Alterations on Erf 35364, 5 Van der Mer Street, Strand Case No: 21021007ND0224E

Ms. Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- HRF supports the proposal.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the amended plans.

ND

# 11.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 404, 19 Carstens Street, Tamboerskloof, S34-A&A Case No: 20112403TZ1222E

Mr. Thando Zingange introduced the case.

## **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 25 March 2021.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- City Bowl Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ΤZ

#### 11.11 Proposed additions and alteration on Erf 52973, 19 Surrey Street, Claremont, S34-A&A

Case No: 21022310SM0224E

#### **DISCUSSION**

- Information received on 25 March 2021.
- Graded IIIC
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Harfield Civic Association supports the proposal.

Inside HPO

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

SM

#### 12. NEW MATTERS

# 12.1 Proposed promenade and observation tower, Collier Jetty, V&A Waterfront, Cape Town. \$38(4)

Case Number: 1812579AS0712E

**HELD OVER:** 

Referred to IACom on 14 April 2021.

SB

# 12.2 Proposed Residential Development on Erf 317 Belville, Cape Town, \$38(8)-NID

Case No: 21022303\$B0316E

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Proposed Residential Development will not have a negative impact on heritage resources.
- The application was previously approved.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

## 12.3 Proposed Rezoning on Erf 7614 Knysna, Bitou, \$38(4)-NID

**Case No:** 21030213SB0316E

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• The site is within the red palaeo-sensitive area on SAHRIS Map.

#### DECISION

The Committee requires a HIA consisting of a desktop PIA and a VIA.

SB

# 12.4 Proposed Restoration on Erf 95135 Company Gardens, Queen Victoria Street, Cape Town, S27-Restoration

Case No: 21021802SB0316E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Graded PHS
- Applicant to complete emergency Section 27 application form.

#### **DECISION**

# 12.5 Proposed development of dams and orchards on portion 7 of the farm Twistwyk no. 182, Caledon, Riviersonderend. \$38(8)- HIA

Case No: 18011803SB0122E

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

 The Committee notes that the application is mded in terms of regulations 24G (NEMA).

#### **DECISION**

HWC has no comment as heritage resources has not been negatively affected.

SB

## 12.6 Proposed Sandmine on Ptn 1 of Farm Aude Opstal, Robertson. \$38(8)-HIA

Case No: 20090305SB1012E

#### **HELD OVER:**

Referred to APM on 7 April 2021.

SB

# 12.7 Proposed Clearance of Vegetation to establish Solar Panel and Warehouses on Rem of Ptn 1 of Farm 582 Villiersdorp, S38(8)-NID

**Case No:** 21022606SB0316E

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Proposed development has a small development footprint,
- Proposed Clearance of Vegetation to establish solar panel and associated infrastructure will not negatively impact on heritage resources.

## **DECISION**

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

## 12.8 Proposed Redevelopment on Ptn 5 of Farm Ronwe 849 Paarl, \$38(4)-NID

Case No: 21031609\$B0316E

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Modern structure on the farm,
- Proposed Redevelopment will not have a negative impact on heritage resources.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

# 12.9 Proposed development of bottling plant on Ptn 8 of Farm Dennehof 1038, Franschhoek. \$38(4)

Case No: 21030908SB0309E

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- It is likely that archaeological resource will be encountered.
- The committee had visual concerns due to scale of the proposed development.
- The site is within the blue palaeo-sensitive area on SAHRIS Map.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee requires a HIA consisting of AIA and VIA.

SB

# 12.10 Proposed new pre-primary school on Ptn 18 of Farm Gustrow 918, Stellenbosch. S38(8)- NID Case No: 21022304SB0315E

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Proposed new pre-primary school with no negative impact on heritage resources.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

## 12.11 Resubmission of Proposed Subdivision on Erf 177476, St James, S38(8)-HIA

Case No: 17090415AS0914E

#### HELD OVER:

Referred to IACom on 16 April 2021.

SB

# 12.12 Proposed maintenance and upgrades of various roads. 1. Trunk Road 83/1 from km 25.78 to km 34.00, 2. Trunk Road 83/1 from km 48.50 to km 58.00, 3. Trunk Road 83/2 from km 0.00 to km 11.16, 4. Trunk Road 83/2 from km 15.25 to km 23.01, 5. Main Road 365 from km 0.00 to km 14.12, 6. Trunk Road 31/5 from km 0.42 to km 0.90Trunk Road, Riversdale, Ladismith, S38(8)-NID

Case No: 21020312SB0319E

Ms. Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Proposed maintenance within the existing road reserve and no new roads will be constructed.
- Proposed maintenance and upgrades of various roads with no negative impact on heritage resources.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

## 12.13 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 506, 18 Prince Street, Oranjezicht, S34-A&A

Case No: 21011406KB0315E

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Inside HPO
- Graded IIIB
- CoCT supports the proposal
- Work is completed

#### **DECISION**

Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

## 12.14 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 557, 519 Main Road Paarl, \$34-A&A

Case No: 21031606KB0316E

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Main building graded IIIB, outbuilding is not older than 60 years.
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the proposal.
- Paarl300 supports the proposal.

#### **DECISION**

As the structure (outbuilding) is not older than 60 years, Section 34 of the NHRA is not applicable.

ΚB

## 12.15 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 730, 3 Royal Street, Hermanus, \$34-A&A

Case No: 2102707KB0316E

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

Whale Coast Conservation Body comment required.

ΚB

# 12.16 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1061, 14 Dunkeld Road, Camps Bay, \$34-A&A

Case No: 21020808KB0315E

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

## **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CBCRA supports the proposal.
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ΚB

#### 12.17 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 1146, 61 Waterfront Drive, Knysna, S34-TD

Case No: 2102707 KB0316E

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Extension of previous permit on 29 June 2018

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ΚB

# 12.18 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1834, No 7 Unie Street, Oudtshoorn, \$34-A&A Case No: 21031501KB0317E

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• The Committee notes that the work is completed.

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

Simon Van de Stel comments required.

KB

# 12.19 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 28113, 88 Strubens Road, Observatory, \$34-A&A Case No: 21031508KB0315E

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- OCA supports the proposal.

## **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

CoCT comments to be submitted.

ΚB

# 12.20 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 48882, 5 Ravensburg Avenue, Newlands, \$34-A&A Case No: 21031507KB0316E

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

## **DISCUSSION**

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- NRA supports the proposal.
- CoCT supports the proposal.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

KB

## 12.21 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 88418, 86 Boyes Drive, St James, S34-A&A

Case No: 21020807KB0315E

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- Kalk Bay and St James Ratepayers and Resident's Association supports the proposal.

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

Kalk Bay Historical Association comment required.

KB

## 12.22 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 96198, 1 Park Road, Gardens, \$34-A&A

**Case No:** 21030815KB0316E

Ms. Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CIBRA supports the proposal.
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ΚB

## 12.23 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1524, 3 Escombe Road, Vredehoek, \$34-A&A

Case No: 21031701KB0317E

#### DISCUSSION

• The Committee does not deem this application to be an emergency as no heritage resources seem to be in a threat.

#### **INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**

A full Section 34 application to be submitted.

ΚB

## 12.24 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 46732-RE, 22 Rouwkoop Road, Rondebosch, S38(4)-

HIA

Case No: 19112802LB0129E

#### **HELD OVER:**

Referred to IACom on 14 April 2021.

ΚB

## 12.25 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 866, Unit 16 Creswell Court 267, High Level Road,

Seapoint, \$34-A&A

Case No: 20210223XM0316E

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

Seapoint For All comments required.

ΧM

#### 12.26 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 989, 10 Scouts Place, Pinelands, S34-A&A

**Case No:** 21030413XM0317E

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

CoCT and Pinelands Ratepayers comments required.

ΧM

## 12.27 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1111, 9 Glen Crescent, Gardens, \$34-A&A

Case No: 21031004XM0316E

Ms. Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIA
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ΧM

# 12.28 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1691, 48 Cummings Street, Wellington, S34-A&A Case No: 21081702XM0317E

Ms. Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

## DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor Works Application
- HOMs graded NCW
- Inside special character area overlay zone.
- Municipality supports the proposal.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ΧM

# 12.29 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 12170, 13 Protea Avenue, Fish Hoek, \$34-A&A Case No: 21022608XM0316E

Ms. Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

XM

### 12.30 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 13483, 27 Van Reenen Street, Goodwood, S34-A&A

**Case No:** 21030806XM0315E

Ms. Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

XM

# 12.31 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 90530 to Rem 95031 Leinster Hall, Weltevreden Street, Gardens, S27-A&A

Case No: 21031109XM0315E

Ms. Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

Mr Mike Scurr and Ms Laura Milandri (architect) were present and took part in the discussion.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor Works Application
- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that:

- 1. An architect with heritage experience monitors the work.
- 2. A close-out report to be submitted within 30-days of practical completion.

XM

# 12.32 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 98639, 18 Kromboom, Rondebosch, S34-A&A Case No: 21031511XM0315E

#### **HELD OVER:**

Referred to HOMs on 6 April 2021. All parties to be invited.

ΧM

# 12.33 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 98737, 11 Gambonia Road, Rondebosch, S34-A&A Case No: 21030907XM0316E

Ms. Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

Graded IIIC

- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

Case officer to confirm with applicant if work is already completed.

ΧM

# 12.34 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 125769, 10 Princess Alice Avenue, Brooklyn, \$34-A&A

Case No: 20111601ND1015E

### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

CoCT comments, internal, external, and contextual photographs required.

XM

# 12.35 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Murray Ryveld Street, Stellenbosch University, S27-A&A Case No: 20110205XM0115E

Ms. Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor Works Application
- IT fibre cabling
- The Committee noted that no heritage resources will be negatively impacted on.
- Graded PHS

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

XM

# 12.36 Proposed Additions and Alterations on REM of Erf 51557, 29 Garfield Road, Claremont, S34-A&A

Case No: 21030503XM0317E

Ms. Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

#### DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

#### **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

XM

# 12.37 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Farm 1054, Franschhoek, \$34-A&A Case No: 20102803TZ

Mr. Thando Zingange introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION**

- Graded IIIC
- Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

- Stellenbosch Interest Group supports the proposal.
- Stellenbosch Heritage Trust and Stellenbosch Municipality did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ΤZ

#### 13. OTHER MATTERS

13.1 None

## 14. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions. KB moves to adopt and SB seconds.

15 CLOSURE: 12:15

16 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

6 April 2021

Chairperson... Date: 6 April 2021

Secretariat: A.Brown Date: 6 April 2021