

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING**
Held on Monday, 28 June 2021, HOMS MEETING VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS,
scheduled for 8:30



1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Ms Waseefa Dhansay officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Members

None

Members of Staff

Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB) (secretary)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD) (Assistant Director)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB) (Case Officer)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya (ZS) (Intern Admin support)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS) (Intern)
Ms Ayanda Mdludle (AM) (Intern)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (case officer)

Legal Advisor

Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter

Visitors

None

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Ms Xola Mwandle
Ms Anita Shologu

Absent

None

4. Approval of the Agenda

28 June 2021. SB moves to adopt and RC supports.

5. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

24 June 2021. Approval held over to the next available HOMS meeting.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest

LM: Item 12.18, Erf 9731, 255 Main Road, Paarl.

7. Confidential matters

None

8. Site Inspection Reports

None

9. Preparation for the upcoming coming committee meetings

BELCom 30 June 2021

10.1 Interim and Close out Reports

Farm 733, Bokbaai, Malmesbury progress reports. The Committee notes the report.

10.2 Incomplete Applications

Item 12.21: Erf 13590, 24 Victoria Road, Woodstock: WAAC, WRA/UWRA comments outstanding. SG Diagram outstanding.

Item 12.26: Erf 69545, 7 Westbury Circus, Wynberg: WECA comment outstanding. Annotated photographs comprising of internal images outstanding.

Item 12.6. Erf 68775, 48 Innes Road, Wynberg: WECA comment outstanding.

Item 12.20. Erf 994, 19 Voortrek Street, Swellendam: Drawings are outstanding.

10.3. Administrative Matters

None

10.4 Appointments

None

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

11. MATTERS ARISING

11.1 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1871, 5 Du Toit Street Esterville, Paarl, S34-A&A Case No: 21020809SM0211E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC and falls within the Special Characteristic Protection Overlay Zone.
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the proposal.
- DHF and Paarl300 comments submitted on 18 June 2021, and both indicate support for the proposal.
- The Applicant confirmed in writing that no work has commenced.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not negatively impact the heritage resources.

MS

11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations of Erf 766, 24 Derry Street, Vredehoek, S34-A&A Case No: 21012105MS0413E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC and does not fall within an HPO.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- GVAC comment received on 24 June 2021, which indicates support the proposal.
- The Applicant confirmed in writing that the work had been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone unauthorised work. The Committee resolved to issue a S51 letter.

MS

11.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations of Erf 12686, 9 Huising Street Somerset West, S34-A&A
Case No: 21050403AM0519E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC and does not fall within an HPO.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- HRF indicated that the work had commenced.
- Confirmation that the work had commenced was received from the Applicant on 25 June 2021.
- The Committee notes that the work has stopped, and there is pending work to commence.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not negatively impact the heritage resources.

AM

11.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations of Erf 95013, 2 Krynauw Street Gardens, S34-A&A
Case No: 21041302AM0414E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and falls within an HPO.
- The full S34 application form was submitted on 23 June 2021.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to hold the matter over pending confirmation of work having commenced.

AM

11.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations of Erf 2077, 13 Faure Street Gordon's Bay, S34-A&A
Case No: 21033106AM0429E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded NCW and does not fall within an HPO.
- Information was received on 23 June 2021.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- HRF supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not impact on heritage resources.

AM

11.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations of Erf 172010, Cnr Beach & Sidmouth Road Muizenberg, S34-A&A
Case No: 21040709AM0422E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIA and falls within an HPO.
- BELCom previously the rhythm and symmetry of the façade was of concern, and the individual arches were to be separated instead of being doubled.
- The Committee has reviewed the plans in relation to the comments provided by BELCom on 26 May 2021, which the Applicant has responded to within their revised plans received on 10 June 2021.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that lime mortars be used where existing.

AM

12. NEW MATTERS

12.1 Proposed addition on Erf 10850, SAPS, 26 Voortrekker Road, Belville, S34-Alterations Case No: 21061104AM0617E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded NCW and does not fall within an HPO.
- The Committee notes that the application is for minor works.
- Concerns have been raised regarding the change of the character of the building however notes there is little to no heritage value remaining within the immediate context .

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not impact heritage resources.

AM

12.2 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 127121, 40 Denchworth Road, Athlone, S34-A&A Case No: 21051702AM0617E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded NCW and does not fall within an HPO.
- CoCT supports the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not impact heritage resources.

AM

12.3 Proposed total demolition on Erf 192, 6 Oester Street, Langebaan, S34-Total Demolition Case No: 21060204AM0617E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded NCW and does not fall within an HPO.
- Saldhana Municipality commented which indicates deferral to HWC to make a decision.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the structure does not hold heritage significance to warrant retention. A S35 Application must be submitted by a suitably qualified archaeologist prior to any demolition and earth works of the existing structure take place. The formal S34 permit for demolition will thereafter be issued.

AM

12.4 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 46308, 3 Alfred Road, Rondebosch, S34-A&A Case No: 21050511AM0615E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC and falls within an HPO.
- CoCT and NRA support the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not negatively impact the heritage resources.

AM

12.5 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 521, 2 Arum Street, Vredehoek, S34-A&A Case No: 21060903AM0615E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded NCW and does not fall within an HPO.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The Committee noted that this can be an application for minor works.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to hold the matter over pending confirmation of work having commenced.

AM

12.6 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 68775, 48 Innis Road, Wynberg, S34-A&A Case No: 21052108AM0617E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

INCOMPLETE:

WECA comment outstanding.

AM

12.7 Proposed additions and alterations on RE-Erf 48506, 50 Palmboom Road, Newlands, S34-A&A Case No: 21051311AM0617E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and falls within an HPO.
- CoCT and NRA support the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that, where possible, lime be utilised instead of cement.

AM

12.8 Proposed total demolition on Erf 10617, Cnr Tabak & Station Street Paarl, S34-Total Demolition Case No: 21050609KB609E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC and falls within the Special Character Protection Overlay Zone.
- DHF do not have an objection pending the redevelopment.
- Paarl 300 does not support.
- Drakenstein Municipality did not comment within the 30 day commenting period.

HELD OVER

The Committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on 15 July 2021.

KB

12.9 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 149639, 18 Kloof Street, Gardens, S34-A&A Case No: 21061001KB0510E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Applicant requested to be in attendance for the item, however, given that other I&APs would not be able to make representations, the item is was considered in terms of the merits of the application.
- CoCT did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- CIBRA has not supported the application.
- The site is graded IIIA and falls within an HPO.

HELD OVER

The Committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on 15 July 2021.

KB

12.10 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 19553, 17 Eva Palse Street, Paarl, S34-A&A Case No: 21052008KB0611E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee is of the opinion that the site is graded NCW and does not fall within a Special Character Protection Overlay Zone.
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the proposal.
- Paarl300 and DHF support the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not impact on heritage resources.

KB

12.11 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 389, 3 van Ryneveld Avenue, Vredehoek, S34-A&A Case No: 21052504KB0617E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded NCW and does not fall within an HPO.
- The Committee resolved to treat the application as one for minor works.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not impact on heritage resources.

KB

12.12 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 423, 10 Pine Way, Pinelands, S34-A&A Case No: 21051403KB0611E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC and falls within an HPO.
- PRRA supports the proposal.
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not negatively impact the heritage resources.

KB

12.13 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 427, 10 Church Street, Piketberg, S34-A&A Case No: 21052109KB0617E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIA.
- The Berg River Municipality supports the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

In principle, the copying of existing architectural detail is concerning in terms of conservation methodology, as it causes confusion of layering. The Committee requires the following in order to address its concerns:

1. The detail of how the new roof meets the existing windows and sills must be shown in section.
2. There should be further set-back in terms of the new addition. Alternatives need to be explored and motivated.

KB

12.14 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 4383, 25 Hout Street, Cape Town, S34-A&A Case No: 21031005KB0608E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC and falls within a HPO.
- CoCT and CIBRA support the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve option 1 of the application on condition that:

1. The technical advice from Marmoran supplied be given.
2. Existing detailing, including raised portions, banding and stepping, must be replicated.

KB

12.15 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 4779, 466 Main Road, Paarl, S34-A&A Case No: 21061007KB0510E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC and falls within the Special Character Protection Overlay Zone.
- Drakenstein Municipality and Paarl300 support the proposal.
- DHF has an objection to aspects of the proposal regarding the car port.

HELD OVER

The Committee resolved to refer the matter to the meeting of 5 July 2021 to which all parties must be invited.

KB

12.16 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 7168, 287 Main Street, Paarl, S34-A&A Case No: 21040804KB0608E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and falls within Special Character Protection Overlay Zone.
- The Drakenstein Municipality, Paarl300 and DHF support the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that lime mortars are used for interventions in the existing wall.

KB

12.17 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 8767, 57 Main Road, Paarl, S34-A&A Case No: 21061002KB0611E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee is of the opinion that this is an application for minor works.
- The Committee notes that there is a large volume of work, but that it will not have a substantial impact.
- The site falls outside the Special Character Protection Overlay
- The building is graded IIIC

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not impact heritage resources.

KB

12.18 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 9731, 255 Main Road, Paarl, S34-A&A Case No: 21032903KB0608E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

LM recused herself from the item.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIA and falls within a Special Character Protection Overlay Zone.
- The Committee notes that this is an application for a mixed-use development.

HELD OVER

The Committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on 15 July 2021.

KB

12.19 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 932, 58 Long Street, McGregor, S34-A&A Case No: 21050401KB0510E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee is of the opinion that the site is graded IIIC.
- The McGregor Municipality and MHS support the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not negatively impact the heritage resources.

KB

12.20 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 994, 19 Voortrek Street, Swellendam, S34-Alteration Case No: 21060809KB0615E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

INCOMPLETE: All photographs are outstanding.

HELD OVER

The Committee has concerns regarding the changing of character from thatch to corrugated iron and how this may negatively impact heritage resources and set a precedent. As such, the Committee resolved to refer the matter to BELCom on 15 July 2021, and Case Officer to obtain the outstanding information by 5 July 2021, or the matter will be withheld from the BELCom agenda until such information is provided.

KB

12.21 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 13590, 294 Victoria Road, Woodstock, S34-A&A Case No: 21060813MS0614E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

INCOMPLETE:

WAAC, WRA/UWRA comments outstanding. SG Diagram outstanding.

MS

12.22 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1597, 10 Derry Street, Vredehoek, S34-A&A
Case No: 21061009MS0614E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC and does not fall within an HPO.
- GVAG comment is outstanding, but the matter has appeared before the Committee previously.
- The Committee is satisfied with proceeding with the application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not negatively impact the heritage resources.

MS

12.23 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 46777, 61 Albion Road, Rondebosch, S34-A&A
Case No: 21052004MS0614E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee is of the opinion that the site is graded IIIC and does not fall within an HPO.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The Committee is of the opinion that this is an application for minor works.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not negatively impact the heritage resources.

MS

12.24 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 54921, 11 Cornwell Street, Simonstown, S34-A&A
Case No: 21061403MS0614E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIA and falls within an HPO.
- CoCT and HRMS do not object to the proposal on condition that the work be monitored by a suitably qualified architect.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on conditions:

1. All timber flooring is to be retained.
2. The work must be monitored by a suitably qualified architect with heritage expertise.
3. A close-out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

MS

12.25 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 68215, 37 Bathurst Road, Kenilworth, S34-A&A
Case No: 21052003MS0611E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC and falls within an HPO.
- LKID and CoCT have no objections to the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not negatively impact the heritage resources.

MS

**12.26 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 69545, 7 Westbury Circus, Wynberg, S34-A&A
Case No: 21061010MS0611E**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

INCOMPLETE:

WECA comment outstanding. Annotated photographs comprising of internal images are required

MS

**12.27 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 52962, 17 Sussex Street Claremont, S34-A&A Minor Works
Case No: 21042909MS0614E**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee is of the opinion that this is an application for minor works.
- The site is graded IIC and falls within a proposed HPO.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee resolved to hold the matter over pending confirmation of work having commenced.

MS

**12.28 Proposed fibre-optic installation on Bloem, Lion, Wale & Pentz street Bo-Kaap, S38(4)-NID
Case No: 21031205SB0617E**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee notes this to be a CoCT project.
- The Committee is of the opinion that an HIA may be required.
- The Committee raised concerns regarding the impact on heritage resources, especially in terms of disturbance to the built environment and the potential finding of archaeological resources.

HELD OVER

The Committee resolved to refer the matter to APM on 7 July 2021.

SB

**12.29 Proposed fibre-optic installation on Carisbrook, Buitengracht, Lion & Bloem street Bo-Kaap, S38(4)-NID
Case No: 21031204SB0617E**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee notes this to be a CoCT project.
- The Committee is of the opinion that an HIA may be required.
- The Committee raised concerns regarding the impact on heritage resources, especially in terms of disturbance to the built environment and the potential finding of archaeological resources.

HELD OVER

The Committee resolved to refer the matter to APM on 7 July 2021.

SB

12.30 Proposed fibre-optic installation on Lion, Wale, Buitengracht & Bloem street Bo-Kaap, S38(4)-NID

Case No: 21031207SB0617E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee notes this to be a CoCT project.
- The Committee is of the opinion that an HIA may be required.
- The Committee raised concerns regarding the impact on heritage resources, especially in terms of disturbance to the built environment and the potential finding of archaeological resources.

HELD OVER

The Committee resolved to refer the matter to APM on 7 July 2021.

SB

12.31 Proposed fibre-optic installation Upper Longmarket, Ella, Astana & Dawes street Bo-Kaap, S38(4)-NID

Case No: 21031206SB0617E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee notes this to be a CoCT project.
- The Committee is of the opinion that an HIA may be required.
- The Committee raised concerns regarding the impact on heritage resources, especially in terms of disturbance to the built environment and the potential finding of archaeological resources.

HELD OVER

The Committee resolved to refer the matter to APM on 7 July 2021.

SB

12.32 Proposed fibre-optic installation Wale, Dawes, Buitengracht & Strand street Bo-Kaap, S38(4)-NID

Case No: 21031208SB0617E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee notes this to be a CoCT project.
- The Committee is of the opinion that an HIA may be required.

- The Committee raised concerns regarding the impact on heritage resources, especially in terms of disturbance to the built environment and the potential finding of archaeological resources.

HELD OVER

The Committee resolved to refer the matter to APM on 7 July 2021.

SB

13. OTHER MATTERS

None

14. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions. RC moved to adopt, and LM supported.

15. CLOSURE: 11:55

16. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

5 July 2021

Chairperson.....

Date:..... 5 July 2021.....

Secretariat: A Brown

Date: 5 July 2021

APPROVED