APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE, HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING (HOMS)



Held on Monday, 17 August 2020, HOMS MEETING VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS, scheduled for 09:00

1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Ms Colette Scheermeyer. officially opened the meeting at 9:02 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Members of HOMS Committee

Ms Laura Milandri(LM)

Mr Peter Buttgens(PB)

Ms Nosiphiwo Tefeni (NT) (secretary)

Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)

Ms Sandisiwe Matole (SM)

Ms Waseefa Dhansay(WD)

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini (ND)

Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)

Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CP)

Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)

Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)

Ms Penelope Meyer(PM)

Visitors

None

Observers

None

3. APOLOGIES

None

Absent

None

4. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

4.1 Dated 17 August 2020.

The items relevant to the meeting were noted as those assigned in the case allocation for the meeting of 17 August 2020. PB move to adopt and SM seconded

5 APPROVAL OF MINUTES AND MATTERS ARISING FROM PREVIOUS MEETING

- **5.1** The committee approved the minutes of the following meeting dates:
 - 1 June 2020
 - 8 June 2020
 - 15 June 2020
- 6. DISCLOSURE OF INTEREST
- 6.1 PB Item 11.3
- 7. CONFIDENTIAL MATTERS
- 7.1 None
- 7 Confidential Matters
- 7.1 None
- 8. Site inspections
- 8.1 Proposed Site Inspection
- 8.1.1 None
- 8.2 Site Inspection Reports
- 8.2.1 None
- 8.3 Preparation for the upcoming coming committee meetings
- 8.3.1 Appeals Committee Meeting 19 August 2020
 SM and SB confirmed that all items have been loaded and parties invited for the meeting.
- 8.4 Interim and Close Out Reports
- 8.4.1 Wupperthal Church Werf Restoration, interim report No. 14 dated 6 August 2020, prepared by Arcon.

Noted

The committee notes the report dated 6 August 2020 (prepared by ARCON). The committee appreciates the conservation approach throughout the project thus far and supports the contents of the report.

WD

- 9 Administrative Matters
- 9.1 LM will be on leave 31 August 2020.
- 10. Appointments
- 10.1 None

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

11. Matters Arising

11.1 Proposed expansion of Goue Akker Cemetery, Remainder of 185, Beaufort West. \$38(8)-NID

HM/ CENTRAL KAROO/ BEAUFORT WEST /RE 185

Case No: 20072207SB0724E

SB introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The proposed cemetery expansion falls within an area of high palaeontological sensitivity and is not very well researched in terms of palaeontological and lithological data;
- There is a reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted upon, mainly palaeontological resource.

DECISION

A HIA consisting of a field based palaeontological impact assessment.

SB

11.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1073, 32A Rosemead Avenue, Oranjezicht, CTS34-A&A

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ORANJEZICHT/ ERF 1073

Case No: 20071501KB0724E

KB introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC by the CoCT;
- The site falls outside an HPO;
- The committee is of the opinion that there appears to be enough internal fabric to warrant a higher grading of IIIB;
- CoCT and City Bowl Ratepayers and Residents Association supports the proposal;
- Photographs were requested and the information was received on 7.8.2020;
- The case officer confirmed work has not commenced on site;
- HOMs strongly recommends that the original timber floors and joinery be kept where possible;
- The proposal will not negatively impact the heritage resource.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application.

ΚB

11.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2743, 3 The Drive, Camps Bay, CT S34-A&A HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAMPS BAY /ERF 2743

Case No 20050402KB0504E

KB introduced the item

PB recused himself and left the meeting.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC;
- The site is located outside a HPO;

- The east elevation plan was requested and the information received on the 31.7.2020:
- CoCT does not support the proposal in respect of its impact on the gable end;
- Camps Bay and Clifton Ratepayers Association supports the proposal;
- The committee is concerned that the extraction canopy and ventilation grill is not shown on one plan with other proposed work and therefore creates confusion as to the extent of the work.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The committee requires the following information:

- The applicant must show dimensions of the vent in plan and elevations, on the drawing including the deck addition (drawing no 19031-015). This drawing must be marked with a new revision number;
- The revised drawing must be submitted to the CoCT Heritage Branch for comment before resubmission to HWC.

KB

11.4 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1744, 48 van der Stel Street, Mosterts Drift, Stellenbosch .S34-Total Demolition

HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH/ ERF 1744

Case No: 20072708ND0729E

ND introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded NCW;
- The site is located inside Stellenbosch Heritage Special Area;
- Stellenbosch Municipality and Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation did not comment within the 30 day commenting period;
- Stellenbosch Interest Group supports the demolition of the building, but is concerned about the replacement structure given the heritage context of the area.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The committee requires the following information:

- 1. Heritage design indicators are to be prepared by a suitably qualified architect, urban designer or town planner with heritage expertise for the replacement structure;
- 2. Mature trees on site must be noted for retention:
- 3. The design indicators are to be circulated for comments to I&APs prior to submission to HWC.

ND

11.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 3045, 31 St Quintons Street, Oranjezicht, CT S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ORANJEZICHT/ ERF 3045

Case No: 20060518ND0713E

ND introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• The building is graded IIIB;

- The site is located inside a HPO;
- The CoCT and City Bowl Ratepayers and Residents Association supports the proposal;
- The committee has concerns with the application and recommends the applicant be invited to the HOMs meeting on 24.8.2020.

COMMENT

The case officer to invite the applicant and I&APs to the HOMs meeting of the 24th of August 2020.

ND

11.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 148791, 112 Buitengracht Street, CT. Cape Town CBD. S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN CBD/ERF 148791

Case NO: 20012401TZ0130E

TZ introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIB;
- The site is located inside a HPO;
- CoCT, City Bowl Residents and Ratepayers Association and Bo-Kaap Youth Movement support the proposal;
- Comment from the Bo-Kaap Civic Association was requested and information was received on the 11.8.2020 BKCA supports the proposal;
- The proposal will not negatively impact the heritage resource.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application.

TZ

11.7 Proposed Development, Erf 103,104 & Portion of Rottedam Street, Wittedrift, S38(8), Draft BAR for comment (Referred from IACom)

HM/BITOU/WITTEDRIFT/ERF 103,104 & A PORTION OF ROTTEDAM STREET

Case No: 19090401AS0927E

TZ introduced the item

INTERIM COMMENT

The committee notes the following comments in respect of the draft BAR Erf 103,104 & Portion of Rottedam Street, Wittedrift:

- 1. The draft BAR does not comply with the requirements of \$.38(8) in terms of the National Heritage Resources Act.
- 2. The report lacks an assessment of heritage resources, and in particular an assessment of the visual impact of the proposal on the cultural landscape as required in the HWC Notification of Intent to Develop response dated 9.10.2019.
- 3. Further assessment of the broader context and immediate site development area needs to be articulated further with the use of conceptual diagrams and 3D images, as the current report lacks an understanding of the site heritage context.
- 4. The contemporary rural architecture and materiality has not been expressed thoroughly enough.
- 5. It is strongly advised that a suitably qualified architect, urban designer or town planner with heritage expertise assist with the revision of the HIA.
- 6. HWC reserves its right to request additional information.

11.8 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 188, 15 Burger Street, De Rust, Prince Albert. S34-A&A

HM/ CENTRAL KAROO/ PRINCE ALBERT /ERF 188

Case No: 20072307TZ0729E

TZ introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIB;
- The site is located inside the historical core of De Rust;
- Comment of Simon Van Der Stel Southern Cape was requested and information was received on the 12.8.2020;
- Simon Van Der Stel Southern Cape and Outshoorn Heritage supports the proposal;
- The proposal will not negatively impact the heritage resource.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application.

 TZ

11.9 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 106, Main Road, Klapmuts, Stellenbosch. S.34-Additions

HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH/ ERF 106

Case NO: 2002116TZ0212E

TZ introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC;
- The site is located outside a HPO;
- Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation has no objection to the proposal;
- Stellenbosch Interest Goup does not support the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Detailed annotated internal and external images are required

TZ

12 New Matters

12.1 Proposed Development of A New House, Entertainment Area and Caretaker Cottage on Portion 6 of Farm Mosselbank Fontein 496 Riversdale, S38(8)-HIA (DBAR) **HM/ EDEN/ RIVERSDALE/ PTN 6/496**

Case No: 20070607\$B0707E

SB introduced the item

COMMENT

The matter is referred to APM 2.9.2020 and IACom 9.9.2020.

SB

12.2 Proposed expansion of existing dam, new pipeline and sand borrow pit on Ptn 2/16 and 1/18, Tulbagh, S38(8)-NID

HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ TULBAGH /PTN 2/16 AND 1/18

Case No: 2008110SB0811E

SB introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The proposal is for a expansion of existing dam, new pipeline and sand borrow pit on Portion 2 of Farm 16 and Portion 1 of Farm18, Tulbagh;
- There is no reason to believe that the proposed expansion of existing dam, new pipeline and sand borrow pit will impact negatively on heritage resources.

DECISION

No further studies are required in terms of Section 38 of the NHRA.

SB

12.3 Proposed subdivision, consolidation and road closure, Mission Street, ERF 847, George . \$38(4)-NID

HM/ EDEN / GEORGE/ ERF 847

Case No: 20080714SB0811E

SB introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The proposal is for the subdivision, consolidation and road closure on Erf 847, George;
- There is no reason to believe that the proposed subdivision will impact negatively on heritage resources.

DECISION

No further studies are required in terms of Section 38 of the NHRA.

SB

12.4 Proposed addition and alterations, Erf 70400, 45 St Catherine Road, Timour Hall Estate, Plumstead CT.S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ PLUMSTEAD / ERF 70400

Case No: 20052707KB0807E

KB introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded NCW;
- The site is located outside a HPO;

- CoCT supports the proposal;
- The proposal will not impact a heritage resource.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the application.

ΚB

12.5 Proposed addition and alterations, Erf 121495, 40 Ensor Street, Retreat CT.S34-A&A HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ RETREAT/ ERF 121495

Case No: 2008052KB0807E

KB introduced the item

COMMENTS

CoCT comments, additional photographs and a correct motivation relating to the application is required.

ΚB

12.6 Proposed addition and alterations, Erf 144164, 70 Essex Road, Woodstock CT.S34-A&A HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WOODSTOCK/ ERF 144164

Case No: 20032604KB0807E

KB introduced the item

COMMENTS

Comments from Woodstock Aesthetics Advisory Committee, Upper Woodstock Residents Association and Salt River Heritage Society and more contextual photographs required.

ΚB

12.7 Proposed addition and alterations, Erf 174092, 239 Imam Haron Road, Claremont CT.S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CLAREMONT/ ERF 174092

Case No: 20080601KB0807E

KB introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded NCW;
- The site is located outside a HPO;
- CoCT supports the proposal;
- The proposal will not impact a heritage resource.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the proposal.

ΚB

12.8 Proposed addition and alterations, RE of Erf 645, Village Green Stanford.S31-A&A

HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ STANFORD/ RE OF ERF 645

Case No: 20062606KB0807E

KB introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The village green is graded IIIA;
- The site located in the Stanford Heritage Area;
- Overstrand Municipality supports the proposal;
- Stanford Heritage Committee supports in principle however has concerns;
- Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee supports the proposal;
- The committee notes the revised proposal as indicated on pages 26-32 of the heritage report dated August 2020 as the preferred option of the I&APs.

COMMENT

The matter is referred to IACom on the 9.9.2020.

ΚB

12.9 Proposed additions and alterations, Erf 19531,13 Gardener Williams Avenue, Paardevlei. Somerset West CT.S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SOMERSET WEST /ERF 19531

Case No: 20022404ND0805E

ND introduced the item

COMMENT

The application is incomplete as it requires comments from Heritage Renaissance Foundation and additional annotated photographs (internal, external and streetscape photographs).

ND

12.10 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 48903, 20 Finsbury Avenue, Newlands, CT \$34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ NEWLANDS /ERF 48903

Case No 20072907ND0811E

ND introduced the item

COMMENTS

A set of plans and CoCT comments required.

ND

12.11 Proposed additions and alterations Farm 167, Diemersdal, Adderley Street, Durbanville, CT.S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ DURBANVILLE /FARM 167

Case No: 20072402ND0811E

ND introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The entire farm is graded IIIA;
- The committee is concerned with any potential minor work that may interfere with the fabric and integrity of the historic wall.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the proposal with the following condition:

No work is to be done that will impact the integrity and fabric of the historic
wall, ie: placement of fire safety equipment is not to be directly attached to
the historic wall. The preferred method for attachment would be placement
on a pole not attached to the original fabric.

ND

12.12 Proposed telecommunications mast, Erf 22218, 11th Avenue, Kensington, CT. \$38(4)-NID

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ KENSINGTON / ERF 22218

Case No: 20080709ND0811E

ND introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The proposal is for a telecommunications mast on Erf 22218, 11th Avenue, Kensington;
- The committee notes the application must be submitted as \$34 application as \$38 of the NHRA is not triggered.

COMMENT

A \$34 application must be submitted as \$38 of the NHRA is not triggered. Applicants must show images of proposed antenna with camouflage.

ND

12.13 Proposed telecommunications mast, Farm 211, Mountain View Farm, Atlantis, CT. \$38(4)-NID

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ATLANTIS / FARM 211

Case No: 20080403ND0811E

ND introduced the item

COMMENTS

Ground images of where the mast will be located, and aerial image showing the location of the mast.

ND

12.14 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 27075 RE 99 101, 102, 103 Lower Main Road Observatory, CT. S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ VREDEHOEK /ERF 926

Case No: 20073108ND0811E

COMMENTS

Observatory Civic Association and Salt River Heritage Association comments required.

12.15 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 926, 11 Clive Road, Vredehoek, CT. S34-A&A HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ VREDEHOEK /ERF 926

Case No: 20080404SM08011E

MS introduced the item

COMMENT

Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group comments required.

SM

12.16 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1583, 59 Kerk Street, Strand, CT. S34-A&A **HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ STRAND /ERF 1583**

Case No: 20060503SM0811E

SM introduced the item

COMMENTS

Comments from CoCT and Helderberg Renaissance Foundation, internal and contextual photographs required.

SM

12.17 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1964, 2A Wodehouse Crescent, Constantia, CT. S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CONSTANTIA /ERF 1964

Case No: 20030409SM0811E

SM introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The outbuilding on which the third dwelling is proposed is noted as NCW by the CoCT;
- The property it is located inside a HPO;
- CoCT support the proposal;
- The proposal will not impact a heritage resource.

DECISION

The committee resolved to approve the proposal.

SM

12.18 Proposed Total Demolition , Erf 2292, 21 Dal Road, Camps Bay, CT. S34-Total Demolition

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAMPS BAY /ERF 2292

Case No: 20071608SM0811E

SM introduced the item

COMMENTS

CoCT and DOCOMOMO-SA comments required.

SM

12.19 Proposed additions and alterations, Erf 1567, Old Post Office, Piet Retief Street, Tulbagh ,S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ TULBAGH/ ERF 1567

Case No: 20081203SM0811E

SM introduced the item

COMMENTS

Set of plans required.

SM

12.20 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 557, 19 Avenue Normandie, Fresnaye, CT. S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ FRESNAYE/ ERF 557

Case No: 20080706TZ0806E

TZ introduced the item

COMMENTS

Comments from Sea Point For All and CoCT are required.

TZ

12.21 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 10046, 58 Lymington Way, Zonnebloem, CT, S34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ZONNEBLOEM/ ERF 10046

Case NO: 20062308TZ0806E

TZ introduced the item

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC;
- The site is located outside a HPO; and within the SAHRA proposed Grade 1 area;
- SAHRA did not comment within the 30 day commenting period;
- CIBRA objects to the proposal with comments;
- CoCT supports the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The committee requires the following information:

- 1. Coloured up plans of the new mitigated proposal.
- 2. Clarity is required as to where the existing timber floors is proposed to be changed to tile.

TZ

12.22 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 110644, 56 Park Road, Rondebosch, CT, \$34-A&A

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ RONDEBOSCH/ ERF 110664

Case NO: 20072310TZ0806E

TZ introduced the item

COMMENTS

Streetscape Images are required.

ΤZ

12.23 Proposed alterations and restoration, Drostdy Museum, Admin Building, 18 Swellengebrel Street, Swellendam, S27-A&A

HM/ OVERBERG/ SWELLENDAM/ ERF 1617

Case NO: 20030306TZ0806E

TZ introduced the item.

COMMENT

The committee is concerned about the lack of a Conservation Management Plan as previously requested by HWC. Since the building is located within a PHS such information is pertinent to HWC's understanding of the long-term maintenance of the property. CS, WD, PM, CP and TZ to meet with the relevant officials at the DCAS Museum Services.

TZ

12.24 Proposed alterations and restoration, Drostdy Museum, Horse Mill Rethatching, 18 Swellengebrel Street, Swellendam, S27-A&R

HM/ OVERBERG/ SWELLENDAM/ ERF 1617

Case NO: 20021102TZ0806E

TZ introduced the item

COMMENT

The committee is concerned about the lack of a Conservation Management Plan as previously requested by HWC. Since the building is located within a PHS such information is pertinent to HWC's understanding of the long-term maintenance of the property. CS, WD, PM, CP and TZ to meet with the relevant officials at the DCAS Museum Services.

TZ

12.25 Proposed alterations and restoration, Drostdy Museum, Schuur Kaar Rethatching, 18 Swellengebrel Street, Swellendam, S27-A&R

HM/ OVERBERG/ SWELLENDAM/ ERF 1617

Case NO: 20021103TZ0806E

TZ introduced the item

COMMENT

The committee is concerned about the lack of a Conservation Management Plan as previously requested by HWC. Since the building is located within a PHS such information is pertinent to HWC's understanding of the long-term maintenance of the property. CS, WD, PM, CP and TZ to meet with the relevant officials at the DCAS Museum Services.

12.26 Proposed alterations and restoration, Drostdy Museum, Old Gaol, 18 Swellengebrel Street, Swellendam, S27-A&R

HM/ OVERBERG/ SWELLENDAM/ ERF 1617

Case NO: 20021104TZ00806E

TZ introduced the item

COMMENT

The committee is concerned about the lack of a Conservation Management Plan as previously requested by HWC. Since the building is located within a PHS such information is pertinent to HWC's understanding of the long-term maintenance of the property. CS, WD, PM, CP and TZ to meet with the relevant officials at the DCAS Museum Services.

ΤZ

- 14 OTHER MATTERS
- 14.1 None

15. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions. PB and LM moved and supported the adoption and the resolution. ND and SB moved to adopt the minutes of the 17th of August 2020/LM and PB left 14:34

16 CLOSURE

The meeting adjourned at: 17:30

17 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 21 August 2020

Chairperson's Signature.......

Date: 18/08/2020

Secretariat's Signature......

Date: 18.8.2020