

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Monday, 15 May 2023 at 08:30,
Via MS Teams**



1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Ms Colette Scheermeyer officially opened the meeting at 08:40 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Members of Committee

Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CS) (Chairperson)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Chane Herman (CH) (Heritage Officer)
Mr Robin George (RG) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport (SB) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB) (Heritage Officer)

Members of Staff

Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB) (Secretary)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya (ZS) (Admin)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT) (Admin)

Legal Advisors

Ms Penelope Meyer
Ms Naushina Rahim

Visitors

Mr Jonathan Kaplan
Mr Stuart Hermansen
Mr Ashley Lillie
Ms Emmylou Bailey
Mr Stuart Hermansen

Observers

Mr Chris Charlton

3 Apologies

None

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

- 4.1 15 May 2023. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits and Additions. KB moves to adopt the agenda and MS seconds.

5. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

- 5.1 4 May 2023. The Committee resolved to approve the minutes. AM moves to adopt the minutes and KB seconds.
- 5.2 8 May 2023. The Committee resolved to approve the minutes. MS moves to adopt the minutes and RG seconds.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest

None

7. Confidential matters

None

8. Standing Items

8.1 Site inspections undertaken

8.2 Proposed Site Inspection

8.3 Site Inspection Reports

8.3.1 Erf 2231, 165 Main Road, Paarl (CN)

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 21 April 2023.
- Unauthorised maintenance and repair had taken place to the Victorian house, as well as unauthorised new buildings being built at the back of the property without a permit from HWC.
- No stop works order was issued, as the owners, contractor and architect confirmed that work will be stopped until a permit has been obtained.
- A Section 27 application will be submitted in due course.

8.3.2 RE of Erf 2246, 163 Main Road Paarl - NG Kerk Die Paarl (Strooidakkerk) (CN)

- The Committee notes the site inspection undertaken on 21 April 2023.
- Unauthorised work has been completed on the property. The church constructed a new children's play area with a trampoline and jungle gym.
- A Section 27 application will be submitted in due course.

8.4 Preparation for upcoming Committee meetings

8.4.1 IACOM-17 May 2023

8.5 Interim and Close out Reports

8.5.1 None

8.6 Incomplete Applications

8.6.1 listed under items

9. Administrative Matters

9.1 APP Engagement Prep Session (WD)

9.2 NGK burials Erf 518 Malmesbury (KB)

Mr Jonathan Kaplan was present and took part in the discussion.

- HOMs required a formal report to be submitted to HWC by Thursday, 18 May 2023

10. Discussion of the agenda

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

11. MATTERS ARISING

11.1 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 19716, 25 Lourensford Road, Somerset West, S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23031504CN0316

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 May 2023.
- Minor works application
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

11.2 Proposed additions, alterations and partial demolition on Erf 234, 22 Huguenot Street, Franschhoek, S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23032316CN0324

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 8 and 14 April 2023.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- Stellenbosch Municipality supports the proposal
- FHRR provided detailed comments and noted a few concerns. These concerns were addressed in Mr. Aikman's Draft Heritage Statement on page 12.
- SHF supports the proposal.
- Referred to BELCom to determine if the heritage concerns raised by the Franschhoek Heritage & Ratepayers Association were adequately addressed.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 31 May.

CN

**11.3 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 284, 15 Ocean View Drive, Greenpoint, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23030709CN0324**

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 & 5 May 2023.
- Grade NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- GPRRA did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

**11.4 Proposed total demolition on Erf 51818, 21 Lincoln Road, Claremont, S34-TD
Case No: HWC23042807CN0502**

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 8 May 2023
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

**11.5 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 798, 9 Camden Road, Tamboerskloof, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23021606CN0217**

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 26 March & 6 May 2023.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

**11.6 Proposed additions and alterations on Erven 305 and 306, Excelsior Road, Franschhoek, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23030107CN0403**

Under investigation.

CN

**11.7 Proposed additions and alterations on Farm 628, Henkershoek, Riversdale, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050205CN0502**

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 7, 9 and 10 May 2023.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- The Committee notes the work is completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CN

**11.8 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 10536 Unit 3, 7 Central Road, Fish Hoek, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042603CH0429**

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 8 May 2023
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

**11.9 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 16337, 267 Victoria Road, Salt River, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC22052709CH0316**

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 May 2023
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- WAAC did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- CoCT did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- Salt River Heritage Society had no objections.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

11.10 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 7244, 21 Highway, Fish Hoek, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042610CH0429

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 May 2023
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

11.11 Proposed expansion of existing accommodation and event venue on Farm 921, Caledon, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23041705AM0418

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 5 May 2023.
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

AM

11.12 Proposed wind energy facility on Various farms, Kariega 4 WEF, Beaufort West, S38(8)- NID
Case No: HWC23041907AM0426

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- There is reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following;

1. AIA
2. PIA
3. Cultural Landscape Study

AM

11.13 Proposed redevelopment on Portions 8 and 10 of Farm 654, Croydon Gardens, S38(8)-HIA
Case No: HWC22102611AM1027

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 30 April 2023.

- The case officer communicated the concerns raised on the deficiencies with the author of the HIA. The final report submitted is still not compliant with Section 38(3) of the NHRA.

DECISION

The HIA is not compliant with Section 38(3) of the NHRA

AM

11.14 Proposed construction on Remainder of portion 9 of Farm Leeuwentuin No 1745 Division Paarl, S38 (4)

Case No: HWC23032804AM0418

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3 May 2023.
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

AM

11.15 Proposed sample analysis on antelope craniums and fossil fragments from Besaansklip, S35

Case No: HWC23032303AM0426

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 8 May 2023.
- Sampling of three fossil fragments and three historical blue antelope craniums/horns to extract sequence ancient DNA.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve Section 35 application. An export permit must be obtained from SAHRA.

AM

11.16 Proposed minor works on Erf 275, 24 Klip Street, Prince Albert, S34-A&A-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23041812AM0425

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 May 2023.
- Minor works application
- Graded IIIC

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

AM

**11.17 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 4580, 86 Zwaanswyk Road, Constantia, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23041905AM0425**

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 8 May 2023.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- FoCVGB supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

AM

**11.18 Erven 1210, 1209-RE and 3460, 10 and 31 Tuna Road and 31 Agnes Crescent,
Matroosfontein, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23042002MS0425**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 11 May 2023.
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

MS

**11.19 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1410-RE, 16 The Avenue, Stellenbosch, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC230425055MS0502**

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 May 2023.
- Minor works application
- HOMs graded IIIB

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

11.20 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 51023, 20 St Denis Road, Claremont, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23041802MS0425

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 8 May 2023.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- GLCA supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

11.21 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 9616, 11-18 Avenue, Fish Hoek, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042402MS0426

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 May 2023.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT had no objections.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Plans depicting work completed and yet to be completed.

MS

11.22 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 70955, 5 Morpeth Road, Plumstead, S34-TD
Case No: HWC23032223RG0323

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 4 May 2023.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

RG

**11.23 Proposed minor works on Erf 419, 107 Marais Street, Strand, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23042601RG0502**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 May 2023
- Minor works application
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT declined their opportunity to comment.
- The Committee notes the work is completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

RG

**11.24 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 14379, 90 Skool Street, Paarl, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23041709RG0502**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 May 2023.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside Special Character Protected Area Overlay Zone of Paarl.
- Drakenstein Municipality has no objections.
- Paarl300 supports the proposal.
- DHF had an objection to the repositioning of the front door
- The applicant addressed the objections raised by DHF.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

**11.25 Proposed total demolition on Erf 524, 20 The Fairway Avenue, Camps Bay, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC23041404SJ0425**

Ms. Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 May 2023.
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CBCRRA did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

SJ

11.26 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 57896, 14 Devon Street, Claremont, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042404SJ0426

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

Mr Chris Charlton (owner/applicant) was present and observed the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 May 2023.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Harfield Village did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

11.27 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 6260, 123 Merriman Road, Goodwood, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23041918SJ0425

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 May 2023.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

11.28 Proposed restoration on ERF 1511, 84 Kloof Street, Gardens, S34-Restoration
Case No: 220300813SJ0329E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 May 2023
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CIBRA noted the unauthorised work and did not comment.
- The Committee notes the work is completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

11.29 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 54852, 12 Linda Road, Claremont, S34-A&A
Case No:

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 May 2023
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- The comment from UCRRA is not heritage related.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

11.30 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2773, 41 Huguenot Street, Franschhoek, S34-A&A
Case No.: HWC23040514CH0411

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 May 2023.
- Graded IIIC
- Stellenbosch Municipality supports the proposal.
- SHF supports the proposal.
- FRRA supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

11.31 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 601, Unit 27 Knightbridge, 235 Beach Road, Sea Point
S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23032802CH0405

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 May 2023.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

11.32 Proposed additions and alterations on Farm 646, Kleinriver, Stanford, S31-A&A
Case No: HWC23020308CH0208

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 May 2023.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- OHAC supports the proposal.
- Stanford Heritage supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

11.33 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1892, 48 Brookdale Avenue, Pinelands, S34-A&A
Case No.: HWC23042103MS0502

Item removed from the agenda.

MS

11.34 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 144496, 13 Lower Collingwood Road, Observatory
Case No: HWC23042103KB0502

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 May 2023
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- OCA supports the proposal.
- CoCT did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal on condition that;

1. Revised plans to be submitted to HWC for permitting indicating the retention of the fireplace.

KB

11.35 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 3560, 57 Church Street, Cape Town CBD, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23032906RG0330

Under investigation – Case officer to confirm if CoCT's comment is valid.

RG

11.36 Proposed construction of a dam along with associated infrastructure, Citrusdal, Cederberg, West Coast, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23022202SB0224

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 10 May.
- The proposal is for an off-stream balancing dam, with a capacity of 250 000m³ using an existing abstraction point along the Olifants River.
- The dam is situated in the low to high palaeontological sensitive area, given the nature of the development, unlikely to have impact on heritage resources.
- No other heritage resource was noted.
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Fossil finds procedure to be included.

SB

11.37 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 4419, 20 Batavia Road, Ruyterwacht, S34-A&A Case No: HWC23041810RG0426

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 11 May 2023
- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

12. NEW MATTERS

12.1 Proposed minor works on Erf 149294-RE, 9 Portswood Road, Moorings 5, V&A Waterfront, S34-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23050214SJ0504

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- Graded IIIA
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. Work to be monitored by a suitably qualified architect to monitor the work.
2. A close-out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

SJ

**12.2 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 169697, 11 Upper Quarterdeck Road, Kalk Bay, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050308SJ0508**

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Inside HPO
- KBSJRRRA had no objections
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

12.3 Proposed maintenance and repair on Erf 177447, The Old Granary, 11 Buitenkant Street, S27-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23041107SJ0503

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- Graded PHS
- Inside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. Work to be monitored by a suitably qualified architect to monitor the work.
2. A close-out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

SJ

12.4 Proposed minor works on Erf 4651-Re, Grand Parade, 17 Darling Street, Cape Town, S27-Minor Works

Case No: HWC23032811SJ0504

HELD OVER:

Referred to next HOMs meeting. All parties to be invited.

SJ

12.5 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 61346, 12 Sunlands Avenue, Kenwyn, S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23050405SJ0508

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form required.

SJ

12.6 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 67175, 40 Silverlea Road, Wynberg, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050407SJ0505

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- WRRRA did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

12.7 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 87532, 22 Yarmouth Road, Muizenberg, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050206SJ0503

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT noted that the work has been completed.
- MHCS had no objections.
- The Committee notes the work is completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

SJ

12.8 Proposed emergency work on Erf 9998, 13 Adderley Street, Standard Bank Building, Cape Town, S34-Emergency Works
Case No: HWC23050204SJ0503

Under investigation.

SJ

12.9 Proposed permit extension on Erf 149294-RE, 9 Portswood Road, Moorings 5, V&A Waterfront, S34-Permit Extension
Case No: HWC23051003SJ0511

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The Committee notes the previous permit dated 8 May 2023.
- Graded IIIA
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the permit extension.

SJ

12.10 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1592-RE, Adara Farm, Paarl, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042508SB0426

Under investigation.

SB

12.11 Proposed minor works on Erf 16540, Unit 8, 64 Bland Street, Mossel Bay, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23033113SB0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Internal and streetscape images required.

SB

12.12 Proposed development on Erf 34787, 1142-Re, 34689, 93 Beach Road, 1 Main Road and 77 Beach Road, Strand, S38(4)-NID
Case No: HWC23032306SB0505

Item removed from the agenda. Item already heard

SB

12.13 Proposed Low density development on Portion 78, 216 Uitzicht, Knysna, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23050303SB0505

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

Ms Emmylou Bailey was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The proposed development of holiday accommodation of 22 units and associated road network.
- The development will have a visual impact on the entrance road to Brenton on Sea.
- There is a possibility of unidentified archaeological resources during earthworks or clearing.
- The site has been identified as being of medium paleontological significance.
- There is reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following;

1. Archaeological Impact Assessment
2. Visual Impact Assessment
3. Desktop Palaeontological Impact Assessment

SB

12.14 Proposed construction of bulk sewer and bulk water pipeline on Portions 5; 13; 14; 17 and 19 of the farm Saxenburg No. 419, Remainder of Farm Sandown 1053, Portion 2 of the Remainder of Farm Sandown 1053, Portion 1 of Farm Sandown 1053, Zevenwacht Development, Kuils River, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23050207SB0503

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

**12.15 Proposed development on Erf 3868, Erf 5365, Erf 4171, RE 325, Pacaltsdorp, George, S38
Case No: HWC23042605SB0426**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Full application required.

SB

**12.16 Proposed mixed-use development on Portion 7 of Farm 716, Groenfontein, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23042102SB0426**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Proposed Lifestyle Estate, multi-unit apartments, private school and access roads.
- The site was subject to historical disturbance and vegetation clearance.
- Not within the special character area of Paarl
- There is no heritage resource of site according to the Stellenbosch Survey.
- Not along declared scenic routes.
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

SB

**12.17 Rectification application for unlawful development on RE of Portion 1 of Farm 492 Melk,
Hout Rivier, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23030704SB0426**

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- The application is for the unlawful expansion and cleaning of two existing dams; additional vegetation clearance around the dams, creation of a firebreak and construction of access road, construction of lodge on existing derelict quarry area and new landowner's house
- The heritage resources in the area proposed for development were sufficiently recorded and it is unlikely that the resource was impacted by the unlawful development.
- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required. Fossil finds procedure to be included.

SB

12.18 Proposed rezoning, subdivision, and adaptive reuse of structure on Erf 1220, Pinard Street, Malmesbury, S38(4)-HIA
Case No: HWC23050801SB0509

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Referred to IACOM for their expertise given the objections raised.

HELD OVER:

Referred to IACOM on 14 June 2023.

SB

12.19 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2378, 27 St James Street, Vredehoek, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050802SB0509

Under investigation.

SB

12.20 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 145, Sarel Cilliers Street, Riebeeck Kasteel, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050504MS0508

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- Graded IIIC
- Swartland Municipality supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

12.21 Proposed minor works on Erf 1700, 9 Bath Street, Oranjezicht, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23050209MS0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Internal images and applicant to confirm how much work has been completed required.

MS

12.22 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1957, 6 Higgs Crescent, Oranjezicht, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050305MS0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Locality map and a formal comment from CIBRA and CoCT on the proposed works.

MS

12.23 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2919, 21A Bryant Street, Bo-Kaap, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050201MS0505

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

BKYM and BKCA, CoCT comments and streetscape images required.

MS

12.24 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2924, 21 Bryant Street, Bo-Kaap, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050202MS0505

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

BKYM and BKCA, CoCT comments and streetscape images required.

MS

12.25 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 55318, 9 Quiet Street, Claremont, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050304MS0504

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- UCRRA supports on condition that the existing front wooden entrance door and side glass panel design be retained / reused.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

MS

12.26 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 69472, Dennekamp Apartments, Unit 5, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042504MS0426

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

CoCT comment and additional internal and streetscape images required.

MS

12.27 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 98023, 13 Mulvihl Road, Rondebosch, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042805MS0508

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form and internal and streetscape images required.

MS

12.28 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 10546, 84 6th Avenue, Vredelust , S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050216KB0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form and local authority comment and all images required.

KB

12.29 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1355, 25 Yeoville Street, Vredehoek, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042403KB0426

HELD OVER:

Referred to next HOMs meeting.

KB

- 12.30 Proposed additions on Erf 153735, No 94 Pope Street, Observatory, S34-Addition**
Case No: HWC23040502KB0426
- INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**
New application form required.
- KB
- 12.31 Proposed additions on Erf 1735 Three Anchor Bay, 19 Grimsby Road, S34-Addition**
Case No: HWC23042609KB0505
- HELD OVER:**
Referred to next HOMs meeting.
- KB
- 12.32 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1843, 32 Margaret Avenue, Pinelands, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC23041712KB0426
- INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**
New application form and contextual images required.
- KB
- 12.33 Proposed minor works on Erf 22324, 87 6th Street Kensington, S34-Minor Works**
Case No: HWC23042604KB0508
- INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**
New application form and CoCT comment and contextual required.
- KB
- 12.34 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 32518, 1 Grenville Avenue, Epping, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC23042406KB0426
- INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**
New application form required.
- KB
- 12.35 Proposed minor works on Erf 5758, Nedbank Oudtshoorn, S34-Minor Works**
Case No: HWC23050203KB0508
- INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**
New application form and SvdS and Oudtshoorn Municipality comments required.
- KB
- 12.36 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 10569, Lady Loch, Wellington, S38-NID**
Case No: HWC23050401CN0504
- INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**
New application form, SDP and internal and streetscape images required.
- CN
- 12.37 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1128, 36 Ludlow Road, Vredehoek, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC23050507CN0505
- INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**
New application form, and SG diagram and streetscape images required.

**12.38 Proposed total demolition on Erf 1201, 78 Voortrekker Road, Velddrif, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC23050210CN0503**

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- Bergriver Municipality supports the proposal.
- Velddrif Heritage Foundation has no objection.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

CN

**12.39 Proposed Residential Dwelling on Erf 2162, 12A King Street, Standford, S31-New Building
Case No: HWC23050408CN0505**

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Ungraded
- Outside HPO
- SHF has no objections.
- Overberg Aesthetics and Advisory Committee notes for the applicant to submit an application to HWC.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

**12.40 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 570, 28 Alexandra Avenue, Oranjezicht, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23032702CN0505**

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- CIBRA supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

12.41 Proposed minor works on Erf 1212, 39 Beach Road, Mouille Point, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23050503CN0505

Ms. Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- HOMs graded NCW
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CN

12.42 Proposed total demolition on Erf 51818, 21 Lincoln Road, Claremont, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC23042807CN0503

Item removed from the agenda. Duplicate.

CN

12.43 Proposed minor works on Erf 159, St Thomas Church, Stanford, S27-Minor works: Repair
Case No: HWC23050211CH0504

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application for repairs to the thatch roof and stonework of the Church and hall buildings.
- Graded PHS
- Inside the Stanford Heritage Area
- The Committee notes that the work will be supervised by Mr. Gregg Goddard (a qualified architect with extensive experience with historic buildings).

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. Work to be monitored by a suitably qualified architect to monitor the work.
2. A close-out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

CH

12.44 Proposed minor works on Erf 159, St Thomas Church, Stanford, S27-Minor works: Tree Removal
Case No: HWC23042507CH0504

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application for the removal of four palm trees.
- Graded PHS
- Inside the Stanford Heritage Area.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. A close-out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

CH

**12.45 Proposed emergency permit on Erf 162784, 87 Kildare Road, Newlands, S34-Emergency
Case No: HWC23042501CH0426**

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

**12.46 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 3991, 27 Main Street, Durbanville, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23041208CH0503**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form, CoCT comment and internal images required

CH

**12.47 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 493, 99 Park Road, Greyton, S27-A&A
Case No: HWC23042602CH0426**

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

Mr Stuart Hermansen was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIA
- The Committee noted that there was no gazette notice on SAHRIS that would suggest that the property is a PHS.
- Greyton Conservation Society supports the proposal.
- Theewaterskloof Municipality did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. Work to be monitored by a suitably qualified architect to monitor the work.
2. A close-out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

CH

**12.48 Proposed minor works on Erf 595, 6 Kloof Street, Bredasdorp, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23050403CH0505**

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- HOMs graded IIIB
- Outside HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

**12.49 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 646, 11 Aloe Street, Vredehoek, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23032207CH0426**

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- GVAG did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.
- CoCT declined their opportunity to comment and noted that the proposal will have a low impact on the heritage resource.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CH

**12.50 Proposed total demolition on Erf 49969, 38 Almond Street, Fernwood, S34-Total Demolition
Case No: HWC23050505CH0509**

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT does not support the proposal. The CoCT notes that the building is one of the last remaining heritage resources within the area. The building has sufficient value to argue its retention.
- The Committee did not have any objections to the total demolition of the building. The Committee notes that the building is situated outside of an HPOZ and the immediate context consists largely of non-conservation worthy buildings. There is no descriptive streetscape which the subject building contributes to.
- Referred to BELCom for their expertise given the heritage objection.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 31 May 2023.

CH

12.51 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 179202, 3, 5 and 7 Upper Union Street, Gardens, S34 and S27-A&A

Case No.: 23011802CH

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- No. 3 graded IIIC
- No. 5 graded PHS
- No. 7 graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CIBRA supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. Work to be monitored by a suitably qualified architect to monitor the work.
2. A close-out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

CH

12.52 Proposed subdivision and mixed-use development on Erf 180, Boy Briers Drive, Fisantekraal, S38(8)-NID

Case No: HWC23041805AM0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form required.

AM

12.53 Proposed redevelopment of service station on Erf 32402, Corner Jan Smuts and Viking Way, Epping, S38(4)-NID

Case No: HWC2340402AM0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form required.

AM

12.54 Proposed subdivision on Erf 43795, Corner Nyanda and Hlanga Crescent, Khayelitsha, S38(4)-NID

Case No: HWC2340407AM0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form required.

AM

12.55 Proposed residential development on Erf 7742, Corner Odendaal Road and Robertson Street, Durbanville, S38(4)-NID

Case No: HWC2340404AM0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form required.

AM

12.56 Proposed consolidation, subdivision and rezoning on Erf 83346, White Road, Retreat, S38(4)-NID
Case No: HWC2340406AM0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form required.

AM

12.57 Proposed vegetation clearing and cultivation expansion on Farm 234, Robertson, S38(8)-NID
Case No: HWC23050402AM0504

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form required.

AM

12.58 Proposed subdivision, rezoning and mixed-use development on Erf 564, Khayelitsha, S38(4)-NID
Case No: HWC23041803AM0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form required.

AM

12.59 Proposed market upgrade on Erven 1728 & 1866 Masiphumelele, S38(4)-NID
Case No: HWC23042506AM0426

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

Ms Emmylou Bailey was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.

AM

12.60 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1071, Bergzicht Street, Malmesbury, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050212RG0503

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

New application form, internal images and FoBCA comment required.

RG

12.61 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2403, 11 Bien Donne Road, Pinelands, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23041904RG0504

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- PRRA supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

**12.62 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2506, 73 Merriman Street, George, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23031308RG0426**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- George Heritage Trust did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- George Municipality did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- Simon van der Stel Foundation did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.
- The Committee notes the work is completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

RG

**12.63 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 253, 39 Sweet Valley Road, Bergvliet, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042509RG0426**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Plans and streetscape images required.

RG

**12.64 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 295, 12 Lombaard Street, Wellington, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042804RG0503**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Application form, internal and streetscape images and DHF and Drakenstein Municipality comments required.

RG

**12.65 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 50188, 19 Bucksburn Road, Newlands, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23050307RG0505**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- NRA has no objections.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

**12.66 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 53246, 21 Leicester Road, Claremont, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23022109RG0425**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- Harfield Village did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

**12.67 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 7464, 16 Chateau Street, Paarl, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23042611RG0508**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

PoP with reference number required.

RG

13. OTHER MATTERS

SJ moves to adopt and MS seconds.

14. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

15. CLOSURE 14:00

16. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

22 May 2023

Chairperson.....

Secretariat:

Annexure A – HWC Heritage Officer Meetings

Abbreviations

APHP - Association of Professional Heritage Practitioners	ASAPA - Association of Southern African Professional Archaeologists
AHP - Agulhas Heritage Society	ABHC - Associated Bibbeys Hoek Conservancy (Knysna)
BKCA -Bo-Kaap Civic Association	BELCOM - Built Environment and Landscapes Committee
BKYM - Bo-Kaap Youth Movement	CBCRA -Camps Bay Clifton Ratepayers Association
CIBRA - City Bowl Ratepayers ' & Residents Association	CSDBOA - Clifton-On-Sea & District Bungalow Owners Association
CoCT – City of Cape Town	CTHF - Cape Town Heritage Foundation
CTHT – Cape Town Heritage Trust	CRRA - Constantia Ratepayers & Residents Associations
CRM - Cultural Resources Management	CMP – Conservation Management Plan
DRHCA - De Rust Heritage Conservation Association	DWCA - De Waterkant Civic Association
Docomomo South Africa	DHF - Drakenstein of Heritage Foundation
DHS -Durbanville Heritage Society	EMPr - Environmental Management Program
EHM – Environmental Heritage Management department	FHRA -Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayer Association
FoBCA - Friends of Blaauwberg Conservation Area	FoCVGB - Friends Of Constantia Valley Green Belts
FE - Friends of Elim	GBRM - Great Brak River Museum
GLCA - Greater Lynfræe Civic Association	GVHAG - Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group
GPRRA - Green Point Ratepayers & Residents Association	GCS - Greyton Conservation Society
HVA - Harfield Village Association	HRF - Heldeberg Renaissance Foundation
HMB - Heritage Mossel Bay	HOMS - Heritage Officers Meeting
HVTA - Hex Valley Tourism Association	HPO – Heritage protect overlay
HBRRA - Hout Bay & Ratepayers and Residents Association	HWC – Heritage Western Cape
HIA - Heritage Impact Assessment	IACom - Impact Assessment Committee
ILASA - Institute for Landscape Architecture in South Africa	IGIC - Inventories, Gradings and Interpretations Committee
KBHA - Kalk Bay Historical Association	KHS - Kommetjie Heritage Society
KBSJRR - Kalk bay-St James Ratepayers & Residents Association	MGHS - McGregor Heritage Society
LKID - Lower Kenilworth Improvement District	NHC - Napier Heritage & Conservation
MHCS - Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society	NASDB - Nelspoort Agency of Sustainable Development body
NCW – Not Conservation Worthy	NHRA - National Heritage Resources Act (No. 25) of 1999
NEMA - National Environmental Management Act (No. 107 of 1998)	NRA - Newlands Residents Association
NID - Notification of Intent to Develop	OCA - Observatory Civic Association
NCOA - Noetzie Conservancy Owners Association	OHAC - Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee
OH - Oudtshoorn Heritage	PPP - Public Participation Process
Paarl300 Foundation	PHCT - Pniel Heritage and Cultural Trust
PRRA - Pinelands Ratepayers & Residents Association	RMCA - Rosebank and Mowbray Planning & Architectural Committee
PACF - Prince Albert Cultural Foundation	SAHRIS - South African Heritage Resources Information System
SAHRA - South African Heritage Resources Agency	SPFA - Sea Point for All Group
SRHS - Salt River Heritage Society	
SFB - Sea Point,Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association	
SvdSF - Simon van der Stel Foundation Cape Town	
STHS - Simon's Town Historical Society	SHC - Stanford Conservation Trust & Stanford Heritage Committee
SHF - Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation	SIG - Stellenbosch Interest Group
SHCT - Stillbaai Heritage Conservation Trust	SHA - Swellendam Heritage Association
GHT - George Heritage Trust	OWVS - Old Wynberg Village Society
RVRA - Rustenburg Valley Residents Association	TVHF - Tulbagh Valley Heritage Foundation
TRHCS - Touws River Heritage and Conservation Society	UCRRA - Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association
VASSA - Vernacular Architecture Society of South Africa	WERRA - Walmer Estate Ratepayers and Residents Association
WUECAG - Walmer/University Estate Conservation Action Group	Ward 2 Forum
WCAC - West Coast Aboriginal Council	WCC - Whale Coast Conservation
WAAC - Woodstock Aesthetic Advisory Committee	WRA - Woodstock Residents Association
WHCS - Worcester Heritage & Conservation Society	WECA - Wynberg East Civic Association
WRRRA - Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association	