APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE, HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING Held on Monday, 14 June 2021, HOMS MEETING VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS, scheduled for 8:30



1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Mr Jonathan Windvogel officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Members

Laura Milandri (LM) Peter Buttgens (PB)

Members of Staff

Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB) (secretary) Mr Jonathan Windvogel (JW) (Assistant Director) Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB) (Case Officer) Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM) (Intern) Ms Anita Shologu (AS) (Intern Admin support) Ms Zikhona Sigonya (ZS) (Intern Admin support) Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS) (Intern)

Legal Advisor

Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CAP)

Visitors

Ms Claire Abrahamse (item 11.3) Ms Adele Joynt (item 11.4) Mr Brendan Joynt (item 11.4) Mr Greg Meagor (item 11.11)

Observers

None

Apologies

3

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM) Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)

Absent None

4. Approval of the Agenda

4.1 14 June 2021

The agenda of 14 June 2021 was approved with one minor edit.

5. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

5.1 7 June 2021

The minutes of 7 June 2021 will be held over to the 24th of June 2021.

- 6. Disclosure of conflict of interest
- 6.1 None
- 7. Confidential matters
- 7.1 None
- 8. Standing Items
- 8.1 Site inspections undertaken
- 8.1.1 None
- 8.2 Proposed Site Inspection
- 8.2.1 None
- 8.3 Site Inspection Reports

8.3.1 Erf 94908, 13 Faure Street, Gardens, Cape Town

The Committee noted that an architect with appropriate experience to be appointed to specify a flashing or joint between the old wall and new wall in order to avoid water ingress and damage to the old wall.

8.3.2 Erf 982, 108 St George Road, Simon's Town, Cape Town

The Committee noted the site inspection report, and that the application has been referred to BELCom on 22 June 2021.

8.3.3 Erf 4655, 27 Trumpeter Street, Pelican Park, Cape Town

The Committee noted the site inspection report.

8.3.4 Erven 155994 & 87311-RE 85352, 3 Royal Road, Muizenberg, Cape Town

The Committee noted the site inspection report, and that the application has been referred to BELCom on 22 June 2021.

8.4 Preparation for the upcoming coming committee meetings

8.4.1 Appeals 15 June 2021

8.5 Interim and Close out Reports

8.5.1 None

8.6 Incomplete Applications

12.30 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 91936, 15 Cogill Road, Wynberg, S34-A&A Case No: 21031604XM0601E

Title deed, Comments from Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association and SG diagram required.

9. Administrative Matters

9.1 None

10. Appointments

- 11.3 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 149294, Union Castle Building, V & A Waterfront Case No: 21072020TZ0724E
- 11.4 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 3275, 38 Princess Path, Pinelands
- 11.11 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 83, 196 Upper Buitenkant Street, Oranjezicht, S34-A&A

Case No: 21041514XM0419E

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

11. MATTERS ARISING

11.1 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 144164, 70 Essex Street, Woodstock, S34-A&A Case No: 20032604KB0807E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information was received on 2 June 2021.
- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Woodstock Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.
- Woodstook Advisory and Aesthetics Committee supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

AM

11.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 25, 46 Melkhout Weg, Die Eiland, Great Brak River, \$34-TD Case No: 21051711AM0531E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 9 June 2021.
- HOMs graded NCW.
- Heritage Mossel Bay supports the proposal.
- Die Eiland supports the proposal.
- The replacement building to conform to the built patterns of Die Eiland.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

AM

11.3 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 149294, Union Castle Building, V & A Waterfront Case No: 21072020TZ0724E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 9 June 2021.
- Graded IIIA
- Within HPO

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

SB

11.4 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 3275, 38 Princess Path, Pinelands

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Ms Adele Joynt and Mr Brendan Joynt was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 1 June 2021.
- Graded NCW
- Within HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal however are concerned about the probability of the boundary wall.
- Pinelands Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal but expressed concerns about the boundary wall.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Client to confirm with CoCT in terms of the boundary wall bylaws and to submit a revised proposal meeting those requirements to HWC for approval.

MS

11.5 Proposed total demolition on Erf 3689, 1 Da Gama Street, Mossel Bay, S34-TD Case No: 21042012MS0422E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 31 May 2021.
- HOMs graded NCW
- Heritage Mossel Bay supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

MS

11.6 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 4782, 28 Killarney Street, Bellville, S34-A&A Case No: 21021108MS0519E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 4 June 2021.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

MS

11.7 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 89743, 35 Gatesville Road, Kalk Bay, S34-A&A Case No: 21042907MS0520E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 3 June 2021.
- Graded NCW
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Kalk Bay & St James Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.
- Kalk Bay Historical Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

MS

11.8 Proposed total demolition on Erf 97230 and 97248, 3 and 6 Midwood Avenue, Claremont, S34-TD

Case No: 21050308MS0504E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 9 June 2021.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- GLCA supports the proposal.
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

MS

11.9 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 98569, 116 Sandown Road, Rondebosch, S34-A&A Case No: 21012711MS0527E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 9 June 2021.
- HOMs graded NCW.
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

MS

11.10 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1940, 38 St John Street, Oudtshoorn, S34-A&A Case No: 20110309ND1124E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 7 June 2021.
- Oudsthoorn Municapility supports the proposal.
- Oudsthoorn Heritage Permit Committee supports the proposal but objects to work that has already been completed.
- HWC does not condone illegal work.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

A heritage practitioner to compile a heritage statement for submission to HWC;

1. The statement must include the grading of structure and an assessment of the impact on unauthorised work on heritage significance.

XM

11.11 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 83, 196 Upper Buitenkant Street, Oranjezicht, S34-A&A

Case No: 21041514XM0419E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

Mr Greg Meagor was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 4 June 2021.
- Graded IIIA
- Boundary wall resortation done without approved plans but to match previous detail.
- Layout and installation of dry walls noted.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

- 1. Removal of the dry wall in the passage making up the new storeroom.
- 2. Existing floor finishes to be indicated on the plans with the proposed floor finishes.
- 3. All new timber doors and windows should be date stamped.
- 4. Lime morters to be used where existing.
- 5. Remove existing door and reuse on site.
- 6. New drawings to be submitted to HWC for approval.

11.12 Proposed extension of permit, Erf 178172, 142 Milner Road, Claremont, S34-A&A Case No: 21051003XM0513E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 4 June 2021.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the permit extension.

ХМ

11.13 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1039, 18 Bright Street, Audas Estate Somerset West, Case No: 20111901SM1130E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 10 June 2021.
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Heldeberg Renaissance Foundation supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ΧМ

11.14 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 138, 17 Sir George Grey Street, Oranjezicht Case No: 21041207XM0413E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 9 June 2021.
- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.
- Committee not of the opinion that the proposal is minor works.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

- 1. Full Section 34 application to be submitted.
- 2. Submission drawings to be revised as follows;
 - Applicant to indicate roof lights on roof plan.
 - A section indicating the roof light construction.

XM

12. **NEW MATTERS**

12.1 Proposed residential development on a 23d/ha land, consisting of a variety of residential Typologies of varying heights within a gated precinct with single access on Ptn 8 of Farm Ronwe 851 Paarl, S38(8)-HIA Case No: 17062709HB0804E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The proposed works are expected to affect the visual aspects of the area.
- No palaeontological impacts anticipated.
- Refer to IACom committee for their expertise.

HELD OVER

Referred to IACom on 23 June 2021.

Proposed new gatehouse on Erf 4761, 15 Kollege Way Caledon, S38(4)-NID 12.2 **Case No:** 21051712SB0602E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Proposed new gatehouse with no negative impact on heritage resources.
- The site is within the red paleo-sensitive area on the SAHRIS map.

DECISION

The Committee resolved that no further studies are required with a fossil find procedure to be included in the NID response.

SB

12.3 Proposed additional fruit packing facilities on Farm 128, La Bouroux, Hermon Road, Wellington, S38(8)-NID Case No: 21052005SB0602E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The original werf consisting of the homestead and winery are graded IIIC
- The landscape setting is of significance, the old barn is to be demolished and the • additional structures may impact on the landscape.
- Since there is a reason to believe that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee requires a HIA consisting of a VIA to conducted.

SB

12.4 Proposed sand mine on Ptn 30 Farm Klein Soebattersvlakte 369, S38- Work Plan **Case No:** 20111808SB1125E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Refer to committee APM committee for their expertise

HELD OVER

Referred to APM on 7 July 2021.

SB

12.5 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 115912, 4 Erica Street, Woodstock, S34-A&A Case No: 21052603KB0607E

Mr Jonathan Windvogel introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor works application
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- The Committee notes work has been completed.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

A heritage practitioner to compile a heritage report for submission to HWC;

1. The report must include an assessment of the impact on unauthorised work on heritage significance on structure and context.

KB

12.6 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 149002, 45 Mountain Road, Woodstock, S34-A&A Case No: 21032606KB0602E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Upper Woodstock Residents and Ratepayers Association comments required.

KB

12.7 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 149294- RE V&A Waterfront Dock House, \$34-A&A Case No: 21052805KB0601E

Mr Jonathan Windvogel introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor works application
- Graded IIIA.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

- 1. Applicant to submit correct minor works application form.
- 2. A close-out report to be submitted within 60 days of practical completion.

KB

12.8 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 173487, Unit 4, 9 Windsor Road, Kalk Bay, S34-A&A Case No: 24041916KB0607E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Kalk Bay & St James Ratepayers and Residents Association comments required.

12.9 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 242, 7 Jagersfontein Lane, Oranjezicht, S34-A&A Case No: 21060108KB0601E

Mr Jonathan Windvogel introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- The Committee noted that this application is not minor works.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

- 1. A full Section 34 application including comments from local authorites and local conservation body to be submitted.
- 2. Plans indicating only the proposed new work.

12.10 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 536, 10 Mortimer Street, Knysna, S34-A&A Case No: 21052609KB0601E

Mr Jonathan Windvogel introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HOMs graded the structure NCW.
- Knysna Municaplity supports the proposal.
- Simon Van De Stel Foundation supports the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Drawings to be revised to show all new work coloured to Sans 10400 requirements including elevations to be submitted to HWC.

KB

KB

12.11 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 56597, 13 Colenso Road, Bishopscourt, S34-A&A Case No: 21060301KB0607E

Mr Jonathan Windvogel introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

KB

12.12 Proposed total demolition on Erf 640, 3A Clifford Road, Seapoint, S34-TD Case No: 21033003KB0604E

Mr Jonathan Windvogel introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

SFA and Seapoint, Fresnaye and Bantry Bay comments required.

12.13 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 66, 31 Queen Victoria, Stanford, S31-A&A Case No: 21041402KB0604E

Mr Jonathan Windvogel introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Inside HPO
- OHAC supports the proposal.
- Stanford Heritage Committee supports the proposal.
- The Committee recommends lime based morters to be utilised.
- HWC cannot condone illegal work

DECISION

A heritage practitioner to compile a heritage report to ascertain the impact of the unauthorised work on the structure.

KB

12.14 Proposed redevelopment on Erf 10892-10869, 21 Albert Road, Woodstock, S38(4)-HIA Case No: 20121401KB0113E

Mr Jonathan Winvogel introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• Referred to IACom for their expertise.

HELD OVER

Referred to IACom on 23 June 2021.

12.15 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1476, 13 Margret Way, Pinelands, S34-A&A Case No: 21031603MS0602E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- CoCT graded IIIB (HOMs queries the IIIB grading and recommends NCW)
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Pinelands Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

12.16 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 31796, 47 Alma Road, Rosebank

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Inside proposed HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal but is of the opinion work may have already started.
- RAMPAC did not comment within the 30 day commenting period.
- HWC does not condone illegal work as the Committee noted that the work has already been completed.

DECISION

Section 51 letter to be issued.

MS

12.17 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 38922, 12 Fortesque Road, Crawford, S34-A&A Case No: 21042601MS0604E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

MS

12.18 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 624, 624 Main Road, Hermanus, S34-A&A Case No: 21052502MS0602E

Under investigation. Case officer to establish which is the appropriate Committee to assess the application.

MS

12.19 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 862, 6 Oxford Street, Durbanville, S34-A&A Case No: 21060107MS0604E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor works application
- Inside HPO

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Durbanville Heritage Society comments and coloured up municipal plans to be submitted to HWC.

MS

12.20 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 87116, 4 York Road and 145 Main Road, Muizenberg, S34-A&A

Case No: 21051208MS0601E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Case officer to confirm if work has been completed and Muizenberg Historical Society comments required.

12.21	Proposed total demolition on Erf 10740, 7 Muller Street, Bellville, S34-TD
	Case No: 21042603MS0602E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application

MS

MS

12.22 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1311, 12 Barnham Avenue, Vredehoek, S34-A&A Case No: 21052708MS0602E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Greater Vredehoek Action Group supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application

MS

12.23 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 8625, 1 16th Avenue, Bellville, S34-A&A Case No: 21052602MS0607E

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor works application
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

- The Committee notes that work has been completed.
- HWC does not condone illegal work.

DECISION

Section 51 letter to be issued.

12.24 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 14, 18 Main Service Street, Bergvliet, S34-A&A Case No: 21060305XM0603E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

CoCT comment required.

12.25 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 153746, 5 Argyle Road, Rondebosch, S34-A&A Case No: 21052806XM0603E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Greater Lynfrae Civic Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

12.26 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 25084. 66, 12th Street, Kensington, S34-A&A Case No: 21052102XM0601E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The Committee notes that work has already been completed.
- HWC cannot condone illegal work.

DECISION

Section 51 letter to be issued.

12.27 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 28657, 7 Olyven Street, Paarl, S34-A&A Case No: 21052503XM0603E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Within Paarl special character protected area overlay zone
- Paarl300 supports the proposal
- DHF supports the proposal.
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the proposal

MS

XM

XM

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

12.28 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 53348, 63 2nd Avenue, Claremont, S34-A&A Case No: 210502412XM0601E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- HOMs graded NCW.
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- Harfield Village Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ΧМ

12.29 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 87011- Re 192, Main Road, Muizenberg, S27-A&A Case No: 21042303XM0603E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIA
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- Kalk Bay & St James Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal
- Referred to BELCom for their expertise, due to the significance of the building and the detailed nature of the alterations of the work.
- In principle, HOMs does not have any objection to the proposed work.

HELD OVER

Referred to BELCOM on 30 June 2021. All parties to be invited

ΧМ

12.30 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 91936, 15 Cogill Road, Wynberg, S34-A&A Case No: 21031604XM0601E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Wynberg Residents and Ratepayers Association comments required.

XM

12.31 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 4273-RE, Picabel Parkade, 58 Strand Street, Cape Town, S34-A&A

Case No: 21051305XM0607E

Ms Xola Mwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- CoCT graded NCW (HOMs proposed a grading on IIIB)
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DOCOMOMO comments required.

13. OTHER MATTERS

13.1 None

14. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions.

15 CLOSURE: 12:40

16 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Chairperson.

Secretariat: A.Brown

24 June 2021

Date:.....24 June 2021.....

Date: 24 June 2021