

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING
Held on Monday, 13 February 2023 at 08:30,
Via MS Teams**



1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Ms Colette Scheermeyer officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Members of Committee

Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CS) (Chairperson)
Ms Cecilene Muller (CM) (Specialist Heritage Officer)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Chane Herman (CH) (Heritage Officer)
Mr Robin George (RG) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport (SB) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Natalie Kendrick (NK) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB) (Heritage Officer)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SnJ) (Heritage Officer)
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ) (Heritage Officer)

Members of Staff

Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB) (Secretary)
Ms Zikhona Signoya (ZS) (Admin Assistant)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT) (Admin)

Visitors

Ms Berta Hayes
Mr Clive Theunissen
Mr Jonathan Kaplan
Mr Paul Naylor
Ms Petra Broddle
Mr Ashley Lillie

Observers

3 Apologies

Ms Penelope Meyer

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

- 4.1 13 February 2023. The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor edits and Additions. CM moves to adopt the agenda and RG seconds.

5. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting

- 5.1 30 January 2023 The Committee resolved to approve the minutes with minor edits and Additions. CM moves to adopt the agenda and CN seconds.
- 5.2 6 February 2023. Held over to next meeting.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest

- 6.1 None

7. Confidential matters

- 7.1 Grand Parade CMP (SJ)

8. Standing Items

8.1 Site inspections undertaken

8.2 Proposed Site Inspection

8.3 Site Inspection Reports

8.4 Preparation for the upcoming Committee meetings

- 8.4.1. IACom – 15 February 2023

8.5 Interim and Close out Reports

8.6 Incomplete Applications

9. Administrative Matters

10. Discussion of the agenda

- 10.1 Item 11.5

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

11. MATTERS ARISING

11.1 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 726, 20 Bond Street, Tamboerskloof, S34-A&A Case No: 21032402CN1116

Ms Corne Nortje introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 7 February 2023.
- Graded IIIB
- Inside HPO

- CIBRA supports the proposal.
- The Committee notes the work has commenced.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CN

11.2 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2479, 7 Heidelberg Street, Riversdale, S34-A&A Case No: HWC22111706RG1117

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 8 February 2023.
- Unknown grading
- Outside HPO
- Simon van De Stel Foundation supports the proposal
- Hessequa Municipality notes that the stoop has been demolished and state that permission had to be obtained at the Building Control Department

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

11.3 Residential and Mixed-Use Development on the Western Portion of Portion 5 of the Farm 742, Kalpmuts, S38(8)-HIA Case No: 20032416JW0331E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport introduced the item.

Ms Berta Hayes was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- The committee note that final comment is been requested without comments from the registered conservation bodies and local authority as it is pre-application phase.
- The committee note the request and able to provide a comment as the HIA doesn't comply with minimum requirements of Section38(3).

FINAL COMMENT

The HIA does not comply with Section 38 (3) of the NHRA as public participation process has not been undertaken.

SB

11.4 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 149298, 42 Hans Strijdom Avenue, S34-A&A Case No: 22051901SJ0711E

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 7 February 2023.
- Façade portion of the building is declared a PHS and the rest of the building is graded IIIC.
- Outside HPO

- CoCT supports the proposal.
- City Bowl Ratepayer and Residents Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

SJ

11.5 Proposed emergency permit for Erf 518, 7 Church Street, (Dutch Reformed Church), Malmesbury, S27-Emergency permit Case No: HWC23012305KB0123

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item, with further input provided by Ms Stephanie Barnardt-Delport and Ms Natlaie Kendrick.

Mr Jonathan Kaplan, Mr Paul Naylor and Ms Petra Broddle was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- Item held over from HOMs meeting 6 February 2023.
- Graded PHS
- There was sse27 application approved in July 2022 for a new hall. While the contractors were doing the excavation on site human remains were discovered. Heritage Western Cape was informed of the discovery and a site visit was undertaken on 19 December 2022, at which a stop works order was issued. The applicant was requested to submit a reburial plan along with comments from I&APs.
- Most of the excavation was complete -only three more coffins to be scured
- Two alternatives discussed in the reburial plans – sites 1 and 2. Site 2 was preferred as site 1 may impact further on burials.
- Excavations would be monitored by the archaeologist.
- Reburial would be in a single coffin, partitioned in 12 compartments.
- HOMs expressed its concern regarding the graves excavated without a permit during the building work.

DECISION

HOMs has agreed on the following actions to be undertaken;

1. The stop works order to be lifted allow for the disinterment of the remainder of the human remains and allow for the reinterment on site 2 as proposed, with the caveats of the oversight by the archaeologist and the necessary report to be submitted.
2. The reinterment of the human remains in accordance with the burial plan, reflected as site 2
3. All work must be monitored by a suitably qualified archaeologist
4. A close-out report to be submitted within 30-days of practical completion of the reinterment ceremony.
5. The HOMs Committee recommends the CEO considers laying of charges for the illegal disinterment of previous burials. It is noted with concern that the permit for building work clearly stipulates a condition on the reporting of human remains uncovered.

KB

11.6 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 527, 3 Marine Drive, Hermanus, S34-A&A Case No: HWC23011902KB0120

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 2 February 2023
- Graded NCW

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

11.7 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 13494, Wagner Street, Oudtshoorn, S34-A&A Case No: HWC23011207KB0112

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3 February 2023
- HOMs graded NCW
- Oudtshoorn Municipality supports the proposal.
- Oudtshoorn Erfenis supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

11.8 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 87664, 25 Bournemouth Road, Muizenberg, S34-S34-A&A Case No: HWC22120501KB1206

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 2 February 2023
- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Muizenberg Historical Conservation Society supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

11.9 Proposed total demolition on Erf 89729, Duignam Road, Kalk Bay, S34-TD Case No: HWC22121904KB1220

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 2nd February 2023
- Graded NCW
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Kalk Bay and St James Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

- The Committee is in agreement with the heritage design indicators provided and agree with the replacement structure. However, the stone wall must be retained as noted in the report.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

KB

11.10 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 54870, 8 Shirley Road, Claremont, S34-A&A Case No: HWC23011205KB0112

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 2nd February 2023
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Upper Claremont and Residence and Ratepayers Association did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

11.11 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 8222, 1 Hopwood Street, Plettenberg Bay, S34-A&A. Case No: 22072902CM0119

Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 3rd and 8th January 2023
- Outside a HPOZ
- HOMs graded NCW
- Bitou Municipality support the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

CM

11.12 Proposed additions and alterations on Remainder Ptn 1 farm 159, Meerendal Wine Farm, Durbanville, 34-A&A. Case No: 22072201AM0726E

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 February 2023.
- Graded IIIA
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

- Durbanville Heritage Society expressed expectation for an HIA to be conducted.

HELD OVER:

Referred to HOMs on 20 February 2023. All parties to be invited.

AM

11.13 Proposed enlargement of a dam and commercial development on Erf 11233 & 11203, Malmesbury, S38-NID.

Case No: HWC22102111AM1122

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 9 February 2023.
- The Committee is of the opinion that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following specialist studies;

1. Archaeological Impact Assessment

AM

11.14 Erf 1485, 6 Secluse Lane, Simons Town

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Information received on 09 February 2023.
- Graded IIIC
- Outside HPO
- Muizenberg Historical Society did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

1. Simons Town Heritage Foundation and CoCT comment required.

TZ

12. NEW MATTERS

12.1 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2055, 1A Second Avenue, Paarl, S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23012606CH0207

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

Mr Clive Theunissen was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

- HOMs graded 3C
- Outside Paarl Special Character Protected Overlay Zone of Paarl.
- Drakenstein Municipality supports the proposal.
- Drakenstein Heritage Foundation supports the proposal.
- Paarl300 Foundation does not support the proposal with reason that the work has already been completed.
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CH

- 12.2 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 24, 27 Buitenkant Street, Greyton, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC23012708CH0207

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Theewaterskloof Municipality and Ward2 Forum, Greyton Conservation Society comments required.

CH

- 12.3 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 33, 28 Sunny Way, Pinelands, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC23012704CH0207

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Pinelands Ratepayers and Residents Association supports the proposal.
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

CH

- 12.4 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 874, 14 Exner Avenue, Vredehoek, S34-A&A**
Case No: 22062407CH0217

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Greater Vredehoek Action Group comment required.

CH

- 12.5 Proposed residential development on Erf 48744, 48745 and 48746, Newlands, S38(4)-NID**
Case No: HWC23012607CH0206

Ms Chane Herman introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- The Committee is of the opinion that heritage resources will be impacted on.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to require an HIA which complies with S38 (3) of the NHRA, and which includes the following specialist studies;

1. Visual Impact Assessment
2. Archaeological Impact Assessment
3. Screening report
4. Townscape study
5. Socio historical study

- 12.6 **Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1184, 99 Van Riebeeck Street, Strand, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC23011606CM0207
- INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**
CoCT comment, structural engineer's report and SG diagram required.
- 12.7 **Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 188, 19 Rutherford Way, Meadowridge, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC23012308CM0206
- Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.
- DISCUSSION**
- Graded NCW
 - Outside a HPOZ
 - The property falls outside the ambit of the Constantia Ratepayers and Residents Association.
 - CoCT supports the proposal.
- DECISION**
The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.
- 12.8 **Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 867, The Lord Nelson Inn, 58 St Georges Street, Simons Town, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC22122201CM0207
- INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**
Full section 34 application and streetscape images required.
- 12.9 **Proposed Wellness Centre on Portion 48 of Farm 141, Morningstar, Cape Town, S38(4)-NID**
Case No: HWC23020201CM0206
- Ms Cecilene Muller introduced the item.
- DISCUSSION**
- A Wellness Centre consisting amongst other, administration block, consulting and treatment rooms, 22 couple's rooms and a parking area.
 - The main house and small outbuildings located on the property is not older than 60 years.
 - The Committee is of the opinion that no heritage resources will be impacted on.
- DECISION**
The Committee resolved that no further studies are required.
- 12.10 **Proposed additions and alterations on RE of Erf 1256, 5 Welgemeend Street, Gardens, S34-A&A**
Case No: HWC23012701CN0207
- INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:**
Application form, locality plan, external images, COCT and City Bowl Ratepayers and Residents Association comments required.

CH

CM

CM

CM

CM

CN

12.11 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 41590, Drommedaris Road, Paarl, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23012310CN0130

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Internal and external images required.

CN

12.12 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 45127, 8 Lothian Road, Rondebosch, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23011906CN0130

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape images required.

CN

12.13 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 50184, 3 Grey's Inn Road, Newlands, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23020301CN0207

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape images and Newlands Residents Association comment required.

CN

12.14 Proposed additions and alterations on RE of Erf 31750, 13 Smith Street, Rosebank, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23012603CN0130

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Rosebank and Mowbray Planning and Architectural Committee comment required.

CN

12.15 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 2573, 101 Goldburn Street, Goodwood, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23012610RG0206

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

12.16 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 44778, 70 Balfour Street, Rondebosch, S34-A&A
Case No: 22072208RG0206

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape and internal images required

RG

**12.17 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 482, 5 Mission Road, Kuilsriver, S34-Minor Works
Case No: HWC23012706RG0206**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

**12.18 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 6840, 30 2nd Avenue, Parow, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23012602RG0206**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

**12.19 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 945, 40 Upper Tree Road, Camps Bay, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC22120106RG**

Mr Robin George introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Camps Bay & Clifton Residents and Ratepayers Association did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

RG

12.20 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 149294, The Forum Building, Dock Road, V&A Waterfront, S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23012705SJ0130

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Referred to BELCom for their expertise.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 22 February 2023.

SJ

12.21 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 149294, Union Castle Building, 3 Dock Road, V&A Waterfront, S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23012709SJ0130

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- Referred to BELCom for their expertise.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 22 February 2023.

SJ

12.22 Proposed total demolition on Erf 17763 Re Portions 5, Farmhouse Wenga, S34-TD

Case No: SJ0702

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Site is graded IIIB
- Outside HPO
- CoCT noted that the application triggers Section 38.
- Referred to BELCom for their expertise.

HELD OVER:

Referred to BELCom on 22 February 2023.

SJ

12.23 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 16533, Coetzenburg Homestead, Stellenbosch, S34-A&A

Case No: HWC23012004TZ0207

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Full section 34 application, all conservation bodies comments and annotated images required.

TZ

**12.24 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 16618, 206 Rosemead Avenue, Wynberg, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC22121909TZ0206**

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Wynberg East Civic Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

TZ

**12.25 Proposed total demolition on Erf 167620, 62 Sir Lowry Road, Cape Town, S34-TD
Case No: HWC23012504TZ0207**

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the item.

Mr Ashley Lillie was present and took part in the discussion

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- SAHRA did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

TZ

**12.26 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 19858, 70 Berlyn Street, Paarl, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23012707TZ0206**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION

Paarl300 and Drakenstein Municipality comments and application form required.

TZ

**12.27 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 69472, Flat 49 Block 5 Dennekamp, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23012710TZ0206**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Streetscape images required.

TZ

**12.28 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 86282, 10 Main Road, Muizenberg, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23020305TZ0207**

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Muizenberg Historical Society comment required.

TZ

12.29 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 1886, 15 Bellevue, Gardens, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23011701KB0124

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIC
- Inside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- City Bowl Ratepayers and Residents Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

12.30 Proposed minor works on Erf 28173, 2 Dixton Road, Observatory, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC22121914KB

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Minor works application
- Graded IIIA

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that;

1. Work to be monitored by a suitably qualified architect with heritage experience
2. A close-out report to be submitted within 30 days of practical completion.

KB

12.31 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 312, 9 Ceres Road, Milnerton, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23011901KB0124

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

**12.32 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 56022, 9 Doris Road, Claremont, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23012301KB0124**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Upper Claremont Residents Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the proposal does not negatively impact on heritage resources.

KB

**12.33 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 56421, 1 Torquay Avenue, Claremont, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC23011818KB0124**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded IIIA
- Outside HPO
- Upper Claremont Residents Ratepayers Association noted the illegal work.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

1. Applicant to submit a heritage statement noting the illegal work and the impact of the illegal work.

KB

**12.34 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 97438, 14 Rose Street, Newlands, S34-A&A
Case No: HWC22112415KB0124**

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the item.

DISCUSSION

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- The Committee notes that work has been completed.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone illegal work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

KB

13. OTHER MATTERS

14. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

RG adopted and KB supported

15. CLOSURE 13:00

16. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

20 February 2022

Chairperson.....

Secretariat:

APPROVED