APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE, HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING 15 March 2021, HOMS MEETING VIA MICROSOFT



HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING Held on Monday, 15 March 2021, HOMS MEETING VIA MICROSOFT TEAMS, scheduled for 8:30

1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Ms Waseefa Dhansay officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Members	Members of Staff
Ms Laura Milandri (LM)	Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB) (secretariat)
Mr Peter Buttgens (PB)	Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)(Assitant Director)
	Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)(Case Officer)
	Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)(Case Officer)
	Ms Sandisiwe Matole (SM)(Case Officer)
	Ms Xola Mwandle (XM) (Intern)
	Ms Nokubonga Dlamini (ND) (Case Officer)
	Ms Anita Shologu (AS)(Intern Admin support)
	Ms Zikhona Sigonya (ZS)(Intern Admin support)

Legal Advisor

Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CAP)

Visitors

Mr Bernard Bruwer (Item 11.1)
Ms Tasneem Ebrahim (Item 11.2)
Mr Allistar Rendall (item 11.2)
Mr Johan Cornelius (item 11.3)
Mr Nic Smith (item 11.3)

Observers

None

3 Apologies

None

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

- **4.1** The Committee resolved to approve the Agenda dated 15 March 2021.
- 5. Approval of Minutes of the Previous Meeting
- 5.1 The Committee resolved to approve the Minutes dated 9 March 2021.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest

PB: item 11.11, 12.1 & 12.8 LM: item 12.23, 12.24 & 12.25

7. Confidential matters

None

8. Standing Items

8.1 Site inspections undertaken

None

8.2 Proposed Site Inspection

None

8.3 Site Inspection Reports

None

8.4 Preparation for the upcoming committee meetings

8.4.1 Appeals committee meeting 17 March 2021

8.5 Interim and Close Out Reports

None

8.6 Incomplete Applications

- 12.2 Erf 11227, 46 Church Street, Woodstock
- 12.5 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 11953, 11 Goeie Hoop Street, Bellville, \$34-Total Demolition
- 12.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1660, Victoria Close, Stanford, S31-A&A
- 12.12 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 6299, 40 Sir Lowry Road, District 6, \$34-A&A
- 12.13 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 17299, 110A Main Road, Paarl, S34-A&A
- 12.15 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 258, 50 Oak Street, Greyton, S34-A&A
- 12.21 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 88211, 266A Main Road, Muizenberg, \$34-A&A
- 12.25 Proposed Alterations, Additions and Partial demolition, on Erf 14760, 111 Albert Road, Woodstock, S34-A-A
- 12.26 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 51879, 12 Greenlawns Square, Claremont, S34A&A

9. Administrative Matters

9.1 None

10. Appointments

11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 870, 3 Oxford Street, Durbanville, \$34-A&A Case No: 20101405ND1021E – 09:00

11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 26972- RE, 26973, 27 Trill Road, Observatory, \$34-A&A Case No: 20121508ND0104E – 09:30

11.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 46972, 82 Campground Road, Rondebosch, S34-A&A Case No: 20080310ND0805E – 10:00

MATTERS TO BE DISCUSSED

11. MATTERS ARISING

11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 870, 3 Oxford Street, Durbanville, S34-A&A

Case No: 20101405ND1021E

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

PB recused himself from the meeting and left the discussion.

Mr Bernard Bruwer (Architect) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Parties were all invited. Only the architectural team was present and the Committee agreed to proceed with the matter.
- Graded NCW
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

ND

11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 26972- RE, 26973, 27 Trill Road, Observatory, \$34-A&A Case No: 20121508ND0104E

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Ms Tasneem Ebrahim (Architect) and Mr Allistar Rendall (Architect) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 05 March 2021
- Graded IIIC
- Within HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Observatory Civic Association did not attend the meeting but comments were noted.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

ND

11.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 46972, 82 Campground Road, Rondebosch, \$34-A&A Case No: 20080310ND0805E

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (Heritage Consultant) and Mr Nic Smith (Architect) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Within HPC
- Application was previously approved by BELCom and required endorsement from HOMs.

ENDORSEMENT

The Committee resolved to endorse the application.

ND

11.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3803, 16 Upper Auret Street, Paarl, S34-A&A

Case No: 21011807KB126E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received 05 March 2021.
- Graded NCW
- Municipality supports the proposal.
- Paarl300 supports the proposal.
- DHF supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application.

ΚB

11.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4038, 24 Protea Street, Paarl, \$34-A&A

Case No: 20032422KB0724E

Ms Khanvisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 06 March 2021
- Graded IIIC
- Municipality supports the proposal.
- Paarl300 supports the proposal.
- DHF did not support the proposal.

DECISION

HWC cannot condone unauthorised work. Section 51 letter to be issued.

ΚB

11.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 148039, 17A Balfour Street, Woodstock, \$34-A&A Case No: 21020801KB0209E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 05 March 2020
- Graded IIIB
- Within HPO.
- CoCT Support.
- Woodstock Ratepayers and Residents Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

ΚB

11.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1876, Adderly Street, Oudtshoorn. \$34A&A Case No: 19101405TZ0701E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Information received on 10 March 2021.
- Graded IIIC
- Simon van de Stel supports the proposal.
- Oudtshoorn Heritage and Oudtshoorn Erfenis supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

ΤZ

11.8 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 68781 37 Inns Road, Wynberg, S34-Total demolition Case No: 2010406SM1022E

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded potential IIIC
- Inside proposed HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Wynberg Ratepayers and Residents Association does not support the proposal.
- I&APs were invited in the meeting on the 26 February but did not attend.
- HOMs requested heritage indicatiors which were received on the 9th March.

DECISION

The Committee endorsed the heritage indicators prepared by Ron Martin dated 16 February 2021 on condition that;

1. These indicators must be implemented in the re-development on site and approved by the City of Cape Town's Heritage Branch prior to approval.

SM

12. NEW MATTERS

12.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 177 &178, FD Conradi Primary School, Prince Albert Hamlet, S34-A&A

Case No: 21030401ND0308E

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor Works Application.
- HOMs graded the site to be IIIB.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that a close out report is submitted to HWC within 30-days of practical completion.

ND

12.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 11227, 46 Church Street, Woodstock

INCOMPLETE:

Internal, external and contextual images required.

ND

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 14704, 14 Rue Orleans Somerset West, \$34-Total Demolition Case No: 21021504ND0304E

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Objections from three elderly occupants who are to be invited to the 29th of March meeting.

HELD OVER:

Referred to HOMs on 29 March 2021. All parties, specifically the objectors are to be invited to the meeting.

ND

12.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 31888, 376 Hoofstraat, Paarl

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIB.
- Paarl300 did not support the proposal.
- DHF did not support the proposal.
- Drakenstein Municipality did not support the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Applicant to provide a statement which indicates all the illegal works conducted on site as well the impacts to heritage resources to HWC. The statement is to be provided by a suitable qualified heritage practitioner with architectural experience.

ND

12.5 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 11953, 11 Goeie Hoop Street, Bellville, S34-Total Demolition

Case No: 21022302ND0308E

INCOMPLETE:

CoCT comments required.

ND

12.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2060, Devine Street, Paarl, S34- A&A

Case No: 21030405SM0308E

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Municipality supports the proposal.
- DHF supports the proposal.
- Paarl300 supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

SM

12.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4207, No.8 Corner of Joubert and Kloof Street, Paarl, \$34-A&A

Case No: 21020305SM0308E

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- IIIC
- Municipality did not comment on the proposal.
- DHF supports the proposal.
- Paarl300 supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

SM

12.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 691-697, 22 Beach Road, Sea Point, S34-A&A Case No: 21030308SM0309E

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

PB recused himself from the discussion and left the meeting.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Minor Works Application
- Graded. IIIC
- CoCT supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

SM

12.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1660, Victoria Close, Stanford, S31-A&A

Case No: 21022612SM0309E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Whale Coast Conservation body comment required.

SM

12.10 Proposed Total demolition of Erf 3422, 43 Diamantveldlaan, Hartenbos, Mossel Bay.

S-34-Total Demolition Case No: 21030502TZ

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Heritage Mosselbay supports the proposal.
- Mossel Bay Municipality supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

ΤZ

12.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 5176, 44 Barrack Street, Cape Town. \$34-A&A Case No: 21030409TZ

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIC
- Within HPO
- The notes this is a minor works submission

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal on condition that;

- 1. The surrounding plaster work of the new glass door be retained and/or repaired to match existing detailing.
- 2. Lime mixers should be used if existing.

ΤZ

12.12 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 6299, 40 Sir Lowry Road, District 6, S34-A&A

Case No: 21022604TZ0304E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

CoCT, City Bowl ratepayers Association comments required.

Case Officer to confirm conservsation body and work they applying for has been started or not.

ΤZ

12.13 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 17299, 110A Main Road, Paarl, \$34-A&A Case No: 21030215TZ0304E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Full Application required. Power of Attorney, SG diagram, stamped coloured up plans, Paarl300 and DHF comments required.

TZ

12.14 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 31396, 132 Main Road, Paarl, S34-A&A Case No: 21021803TZ0304E

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded a PHS within the special character of Paarl
- Drakenstein Municipality support the proposal.
- Paarl300 and Drakenstein Heritage Foundations comments are not required since it is a minor works application.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

ΤZ

12.15 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 258, 50 Oak Street, Greyton, S34-A&A

Case No: 20120104KB304E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Greyton Conservation Society comment required.

ΚB

12.16 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 458, 19 Shanklin Crescent, Camps Bay, S34-Total Demolition Case No: 21011106KB0304E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Camps Bay Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as there is insufficient heritage to warrant retention.

ΚB

12.17 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 459, 16 The Cheviot, Camps Bay, \$34-A&A

Case No: 20122102KB0304E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded NCW
- Outside HPO
- Camps Bay Residents and Ratepayers Association supports the proposal.

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

ΚB

12.18 Proposed Roof replacement on Erf 3745, 11 Versfeld, Still Baai West, S34-Roof replacement Case No: 21012605KB0305E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee noted that this is an application for Minor Works
- HOMs graded the site to be IIIC

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that

1. Metal roof sheeting is the tradition Victorian S-Profile.

ΚB

12.19 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4345, 16 Nantes Street, Paarl, S34-A&A

Case No: 21030404KB0305E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee noted that this is an application for Minor Works
- Graded IIIC
- In Paarl Special Character Area Overlay Zone
- Drakenstein Heritage Foundation supports the proposal
- Municipality supports the proposal

DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

KB

12.20 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 20723 and 20724, 10-12 Zion Street, Paarl, S34-A&A Case No: 21030406KB0305E

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Graded IIIA
- Municipality objected the proposal
- In Paarl Special Character Area Overlay Zone
- Paarl300 did not support the proposal

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

Applicant to provide a statement which indicates all the illegal works conducted on site as well the impacts to heritage resources to HWC. The statement is to be provided by a suitable qualified heritage practitioner with architectural experience.

ΚB

12.21 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 88211, 266A Main Road, Muizenberg, S34-A&A Case No: 21030507KB0309E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

CoCT and Muizenberg Historical Society comment required.

ΚB

12.22 Proposed Restoration on Farm 168 Clanwilliam, 5 Middel Street, Wupperthal, S31-Restoration Case No: 21031008KB0309E

HELD OVER:

Referred to Wupperthal Sub-Committee. Date to be confirmed.

ΚB

12.23 Proposed Restoration on Farm 168 Clanwilliam, 7 Middel Street, Wupperthal, S31-Restoration Case No: 21031009KB0309E

HELD OVER:

Referred to Wupperthal Sub-Committee. Date to be confirmed.

KB

12.24 Proposed Restoration on Farm 168, Clanwilliam, 10 Middel Street, Wupperthal, S31-Restoration Case No: 21031010KB0309E

HELD OVER:

Referred to Wupperthal Sub-Committee. Date to be confirmed.

KB

12.25 Proposed Partial Demolition on Erf 14760, 111 Albert Road, Woodstock, S34-Partial Demolition

Case No: 21021509XM0303E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

WRA, WAAC, COCT and contextual images is required.

ΧM

12.26 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 51879, 12 Greenlawns Square, Claremont, \$34-A&A Case No: 21030801XM03309E

INCOMPLETE APPLICATION:

Greater Lynfrae Civic Association comment required. Contextual photographs is required.

ΧM

12.27 Proposed Rezoning of Portion 248/192, Treedom Villas, Wilderness, George, \$38(8)- HIA Case No: 20101508SB1015E

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

DISCUSSION

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

• HIA was initial tabled at APM committee meeting of 2 December 2020, committee required proof of consultation be incorporated into the HIA and submitted to HOMs.

ENDORESEMENT

The HIA dated 19 February 2021 prepared by Dr Peter Nilssen and the recommendations as per page 8-9 of the report are endorsed as it complies with Section 38(3).

SB

- 13. OTHER MATTERS
- 13.1 None
- 14. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions.

15 CLOSURE: 11:00

16 DATE OF NEXT MEETING 29 March 2021

Chairperson...... Date: 25 March 2021

Secretariat A.Brown Date: 25 March 2021

