

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape  
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**

**Scheduled for 09:00 and held on Wednesday, 30 September 2020 via  
Microsoft Teams**



**1. Opening and Welcome**

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Committee Members:**

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)  
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)  
Mr Dennis Belter (DB)  
Ms Mishkah Collier (MC)  
Prof Walter Peters (WP)  
Mr Stuart Hermansen (SH) arrived at 14:15

**Members of Staff:**

Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)  
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)  
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)  
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)  
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)  
Ms Nokubonga Dlamini (ND)  
Ms Sandisiwe Matole (SM)  
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)  
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)  
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)  
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)  
Ms Anita Shologu (AS)

**Visitors:**

Mr Mike Scurr  
Ms Claire Abrahamse  
Mr Dominik Zuvela  
Ms Samantha Dyer  
Mr Etienne Stols  
Ms Alma Mentz  
Ms Elize Mendelsohn  
Ms Bridget O'Donoghue  
Ms Adelaide Combrink  
Ms Berta Hayes  
Mr Andrew Flint  
Ms Christine Havenga

Ms Laura Milandri  
Mr Pierre Swanepoel  
Mr Neil Schwartz  
Mr Riaan Steenkamp  
Mr Chris Kotze  
Mr Johan Cornelius  
Mr Gordon Metz  
Mr Rudolf de Bruyn  
Ms Patricia Botha  
Ms Constance Kotze  
Ms Ursula Rigby  
Mr Andrew Berman

**3. Apologies**

Mr Guillaume Narainne (GN)

**Absent**

None

**4. Approval of Agenda**

**4.1 Dated 30 September 2020.**

The Committee approved the agenda dated 30 September 2020.

## **5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting**

### **5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 17 September 2020.**

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 17 September 2020 and resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

## **6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:**

### **6.1 Recusals**

- MC: Items 13.1, 13.2 and 13.5
- GJ: items 13.4 and 13.8
- SH: item 11.1

## **7. Confidential Matters**

### **7.1 None**

## **8. Administrative Matters**

### **8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

Nothing to report.

### **8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:**

There were no cases to report.

### **8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition**

Nothing to report.

## **9. Standing Items**

### **9.1 Site Inspections Conducted:**

#### **9.1.1 None**

### **9.2 Potential Site Visits**

- Puntjie: Due to the distance from Cape Town, GJ to approach the Puntjie Trust for overnight accommodation on site.
- Erf 1197,13 Noordwal West Stellenbosch: (GJ, SJ, WP and DB to conduct a site inspection on 8 October 2020 at 11:30).
- Transgression Report of Erf 3, 217 Kloof Road, Camps Bay (GJ, SJ, WP and DB on 8<sup>th</sup> October 2020)
- Hazendal Estate, proposed new storage facility (GJ, SJ, WP and DB on 8<sup>th</sup> October 2020)

### **9.3 Report back on Closeout Reports**

Nothing to report.

### **9.4 Report back on HWC Council Meetings**

GJ gave a verbal report on the Council meeting that was held on 28 September 2020 and the Committee noted the report.

### **9.5 Discussion of agenda**

Noted.

## **10. Appointments**

**10.1** None.

### **MATTERS DISCUSSED**

## **11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

### **11.1 Proposed New Storage Facility on Hazendal Estate, Farm Haasendal 222, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/FARM HAASENDAL 222**

**Case No:** 19102928AS1107M

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The case officer made a brief presentation.

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on 8 October 2020 at 12:30 (GJ, SJ, WP and DB).

**SB**

### **11.2 Maintenance and Upgrades, Erf 4942, City Hall, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD/ ERF 4942**

**Case No:** 20020303WD0205E

A revised proposal for the Third Floor Mezzanine Stair was tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Mr Mike Scurr and Ms Laura Milandri (both from the project architects, Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects) were present and took part in the discussion.

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated in the drawings of the supplementary application to HWC dated 28 September 2020, as having met previous requirements.

**WD**

**11.3 Transgression Report of Erf 3, Round House, 217 Kloof Road, Camps Bay: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAMPS BAY/ERF 3**

**Case No:** 20083101TZ0903E

Application documents were tabled.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENT:**

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection on 8 October 2020 at 09:30 (DB, SJ, GJ and WP).

TZ

**12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

12.1 None

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 149294,3 Dock Road, V & A Waterfront: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/V & A WATERFRONT/ERF 149294**

**Case No:** 20071405TZ0722E

MC recused herself and logged off MS Teams.

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (Heritage Consultant), Mr Pierre Swanepoel (DHK Architects), Mr Dominik Zuvela (DHK Architects), Mr Neil Schwartz (V&A Waterfront), and Ms Samantha Dyer (V&A Waterfront) were present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and does not fall within a HPO.
- CoCT supports the proposal.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the SDP as indicated in drawings numbers 01-08-100, 02-02-003, 03-02-007, 06-11-001 Revision A dated 13 July 2020 and 17 August 2020 as having met previous requirements.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee requires a detail of the interface between the glass canopy and flanking gable ends indicated in Section EE of the drawings numbered 02-02-003 Revision A and dated 17 August 2020 This to be resolved to the satisfaction of HWC prior to municipal plans approval.

TZ

**13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 149294, Union Castle Building, V & A Waterfront: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/V & A WATERFRONT/ERF 149294**

**Case No:** 21072020TZ0724E

MC recused herself and and logged off MS Teams.

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (Heritage Consultant), Mr Pierre Swanepoel (DHK Architects), Mr Dominik Zuvela (DHK Architects), Mr Neil Schwartz (V&A Waterfront), and Ms Samantha Dyer (V&A Waterfront) were present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded a IIIB and does not fall within a HPO.
- CoCT does not support the proposal.
- South African Naval Museum support the proposal.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the SDP as indicated on drawings numbers 01-08-001, 01-08-100, 02-02-001, 02-02-002, 02-02-003, 03-02-003, 03-02-007, 06-11-001 Revision D dated 13 July 2020 and 17 August 2020 as having met previous requirements.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee requires a drawing that clearly indicates the ridges, valleys and grid system of the folded concrete roof of the Union Castle Building in relation to the spatial proposals. This to be resolved to the satisfaction of HWC prior to municipal plans approval.

**TZ**

**13.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 10080, 4 Blinde Street, Zonnebloem: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ZONNEBLOEM/ERF 10080**

**Case No:** 20071402ND0728E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Riaan Steenkamp (Architect) was present and took part in the discussion.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on additional or revised drawings numbered: A-1101 to 1104 (Plans); A-2101 (Elevations); A-3101 to 3103 (Sections), dated: 27/07/2020 as meeting the Committee's previous requirements.

**ND**

**13.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 569,16 Marine Drive, Wendy Cottage, Hermanus, Overstrand, Overberg: MA  
HM/OVERBERG/OVERSTRAND/HERMANUS ERF 569**

**Case No:** 20080313KB0805E

GJ recused himself and logged off MS Teams. The Committee elected DB as Chair for this item.

Permit application was tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Etienne Stols (Architect), Mr Chris Kotze (Owner), Ms Constance Kotze (Owner) were present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Wendy Cottage is graded IIIB.
- Overstrand Municipality support the proposal.
- Overstrand Heritage Committee did not comment within 30 days commenting period.
- The separation of the historical building from the new and its relationship to the spring has been satisfactorily achieved with this proposal.
- The original calcrete stone of the area is widely used for boundary wall elements, this to be duplicated as much as possible.
- Consultation with the heritage consultant as to the method and manner of reconstruction of the historical elements is recommended.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as meeting previous requirements with the request that the porch be removed, the gables are restored in accordance with the historical photograph of 1897, and that calcrete stone be used where possible.

**KB**

**13.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 609, 27 Alexandra Avenue, Oranjezicht: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ORANJEZICHT/ERF 609**

**Case No:** 18030512HB0315E

The Committee cannot consider this item further until CoCT and CIBRA (previous commenting parties) have been given an opportunity to comment on the work deviation. The Committee resolved to give these I&APs 14 days in which to do so. The applicant to be informed accordingly.

**HELD OVER**

**TZ**

**13.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 1017,6 Hospital Street, Paarl: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 1017**

**Case No:** 20030202TZ0304E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Ms Ursula Rigby (Applicant) was present and took part in the discussion.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as indicated on drawings numbered 608, 609, 610, 611, 612, 613, 614, 615, 616, 620, 625, 626, 638 Revision 1, 301, 302, 515 Revision B, 513, 100, 101, 102, 104, 105 Revision B, 501, 502, 503 Revision 1, 507, 508, 509, 510, 511, 512 and dated 05 June 2020, 24 August 2020, 28 May 2020 and 23 January 2020, apart from the proposed enclosure of the loggia on the 1<sup>st</sup> floor of the southern façade, as having met previous requirements.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee requires the detailed resolution of the 1<sup>st</sup> floor loggia enclosure to be resolved to the satisfaction of HWC prior to municipal plans approval.

**TZ**

**13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 3480, 35 Bosman Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN /WELLINGTON/ERF 3480**

**Case No:** 20071408ND0716E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Ms Alma Mentz (Architect and applicant), Ms Patricia Botha (Stellenbosch Interest Group) and Ms Berta Hayes (Stellenbosch Interest Group) were present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The item is held over.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

This matter is held over until 6<sup>th</sup> October 2020 to give sufficient time for I&APs to respond to the revised proposals.

**ND**

**13.8 Farm 36/141 Roodeheuvel Historic Homestead, Fabric Management Plan, Oudtshoorn: NM FARM 36/141ROODEHEUVEL HOSTORIC HOMESTEAD/OUDTSHOORN**

**Case No:** N/A

GJ recused himself and logged off MS Teams. The Committee elected DB as Chair for this item.

An application for the approval of the fabric management plan was tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This building is owned by the Western Cape Government.
- Discussion was held around the implementation priorities of various items.
- The Committee regards repairing items of a structural, waterproofing and rising damp nature should take priority over repairs to decorative items. The thoroughness of the report is exemplary.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

The Committee recommends to approve the methodologies proposed for the fabric management and repairs to the historic structure.

**KB**

**13.9 Proposed Alterations to structures older than 60 years old, Erf 11568, Main Road, Constantia: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CONSTANTIA/ ERF 11568**

**Case No:** 20081304SM0902E

A permit application was tabled.

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

Ms Christine Havenga (Applicant) and Mr Andrew Berman (Architect) were present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The work has been completed over an extended period.
- It is not possible to accurately determine the appearance of the buildings before the unauthorized work commenced, and therefore to ascertain the full extent of the unauthorized work.
- The group of cottages nonetheless retains heritage significance despite the alterations.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

HWC cannot approve unauthorised work. However, given the recognised significance of this group of buildings, this Committee will not hesitate in considering legal action for any further unauthorised work. A letter i.t.o Section 51 of the NHRA to be sent.

**SM**



**13.10 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 987,95 New Church Road, Gardens: NM  
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/GARDENS/ERF 987**

**Case No:** 20080311KB0805E

A permit application was tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (Heritage Consultant) and Ms Adelaide Combrink (CoCT) were present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This submission forms part of an extensive hotel complex of which the abutting site namely erf 980 has been the subject of extensive discussion between the CoCT and HWC including the CEO of HWC.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee is not in a position to consider this application due to the inadequate information that has been submitted. As a minimum this Committee therefore requires the following:

1. A clear distinction between work that has already been completed (including work that was not completed in accordance with previous approvals) and work that is currently proposed.
2. A heritage statement and heritage indicators for informing the current proposals. These indicators must be supplemented by photographs and drawings providing an accurate indication of the surrounding context including the quantum of earlier development relating to the hotel of which the subject property forms a part.

The above work to be completed and submitted to HWC within 30 days of notification of the above.

**KB**

**13.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erven 691, 692, 693, 694, 695, 696 and 697, Winchester Mansions, 22 Beach Road, Sea Point, CT: NM  
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SEA POINT/ERVEN 691, 692, 693, 694, 695, 696 & 697**

**Case No:** 20081103SM0907E

A permit application was tabled.

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

Ms Elize Mendelsohn (CoCT), Mr Gordon Metz (Sea Point Fresnaye Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association), Ms Bridget O'Donoghue (Heritage Consultant) and Mr Andrew Flint (GAPP Architects) were present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee supports the relocation of the hotel sign from the proposed central canopy to the building.
- There are no reservations in principle with the extension of the existing verandas and canopy additions.
- The Committee recognizes the need for hotel patrons to be sheltered from the weather at the main entrance.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee encourages the applicant to consider further alternatives that focus on the proposed veranda having a stronger central emphasis with the new end-extensions articulated to relate more closely with the 'book-end' composition of the historic façade.

The Committee encourages the applicant to retain the central moulding rather than altering it to accommodate a new central canopy.

**SM**

**13.12 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 8717, 19 Olyven Street, Paarl: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/ AARL/ERF 8717**

**Case No:** 20090304ND0909E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Mr Rudolf de Bruyn (Company and property owner) were present. However he was unable to participate in the discussion as his video sound track on MS Teams was not working.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee is not in a position to consider this application due to the inadequate information that has been submitted. As a minimum this Committee therefore requires the following:

1. A clear distinction between work that has already been completed and work that is currently proposed.
2. A heritage statement and heritage indicators for informing the current proposals. These indicators must be supplemented by photographs and drawings providing an accurate indication of the surrounding context.

The above work to be completed and submitted to HWC within 30 days of notification of the above.

**ND**

**14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**14.1** None

**15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

15.1 None

**16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

16.1 None

**17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

17.1 None

**18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

18.1 None

**19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

19.1 None

**20 OTHER MATTERS**

20.1 None

**21. NON-COMPLIANCE**

21.1 None

**22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

**23. CLOSURE**

The meeting closed at 17:00

**24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**

15 October 2020

**MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_