

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**

**Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 29 September 2021
via Microsoft Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

Note: Due to the Chairperson, Mr. Graham Jacobs, being unable to attend the meeting and tendering apologies, Ms Waseefa Dhansay presided over the election of an Acting Chairperson in terms of the rule 12(5) of the Rules of Order and Conduct at Meetings of HWC. The Committee elected Ms Helene van der Merwe to chair the meeting.

The Acting Chair, Ms Helene van der Merwe, officially opened the meeting at 08:25 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)
Prof Walter Peters (WP)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Dave Saunders (DS) co-opted (left at 15:45)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS)

Visitors:

Mr Raymond Bouma
Ms Doryn Schreuder
Ms Patricia Botha
Ms Lauren Buchanan
Mr Ron Martin
Ms Janine de Waal
Mr Stephen Atkinson
Mr Bruce Burmeister
Ms Heidi Boise
Mr Christo Beukes

Mr Dupre Lombaard
Mr Rouan Theart
Ms Berta Hayes
Ms Tasneem Higgins
Mr Henry Aikman
Mr Johan Cornelius
Mr Gaarith Williams
Ms Alma Mentz (AM)
Ms Zainab Fakier

3. Apologies

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)
Ms Mishkah Collier (MC)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 29 September 2021.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 29 September 2021.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 14 September 2021

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 14 September 2021 and resolved to approve them with amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

6.1 Recusals

WP: item 13.1

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 Proposed Parliament Security Access Points at Roeland and Belvedere Entrances, Cape Town, CBD

See attached confidential minutes.

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

Nothing to report.

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

None.

8.4 Feedback on Erf 8731, Droomers Garage, Main Street, Paarl

Awaiting written feedback from the applicant. Case officer to follow up.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 50290, 15 Colinton Road, Newlands

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

None

10. Appointments

The Committee noted the appointment for item 13.4 set for 14:40

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4140, CL Marais Library, Crozier Street, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 4140**

Case No: 21040627MS052E

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Raymond Bouma (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is a PHS and in a HPOZ.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as having met previous requirements with two members dissenting (being in favour of further exploration of a metal enclosure informed by the historic wrought iron gate). The Committee requires that an architect with suitable heritage experience monitors the project and submits a closeout report.

MS

**11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2108, 2109, 6176, 18-24 Crozier Street, Stellenbosch: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 2108,2109,6176**

Case No: 21040628MS0520E

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Raymond Bouma (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is a PHS and in a HPOZ.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as having met previous requirements, with one condition that the gap between glass panels be increased. The Committee also requires that an architect with suitable heritage experience monitors the project and submits a closeout report.

MS

11.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on ERF 110892, Constantia, Steenberg Farm, Tokai: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/TOKAI/ERF 110892 (Agenda item 13.7 moved to item 11.3)

Case No: 21071507KB0715E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The area including the historic buildings is a PHS, but not the whole farm.
- What precedent would be set by a subdivision?

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee expressed a number of concerns regarding the application to subdivide the Steenberg Farm whereby the historic buildings would become a separate site that would also require redefining of the PHS boundary, specifically:

1. HWC legal advisor to establish whether S.38 of the NHRA would be triggered?
2. The Committee requires clarification from the HWC legal advisor regarding the wider implications of the proposed subdivision and its potential impact on heritage resources.

KB

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 50290, 15 Colinton Road, Newlands: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ NEWLANDS/ ERF 50290

Case No: 21083101MS0903E

Application documentation was tabled.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection.

MS

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition Erf 11204, 40 Frere Street, Woodstock: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WOODSTOCK/ERF 11204 (Agenda item 13.11 moved to
item 12.2)**

Case No: 21071507KB0715E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Gaarith Williams (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC and not in a HPOZ.
- The City had no objection to demolition but requested salvage & re-use of period elements.
- Woodstock Residents Association objected.
- The area has been much altered and has taken on a semi-industrial character.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not having sufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

KB

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 600, 72 and 74 Bosch Street, Paarl: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ PAARL/ERF 600**

Case No: 19102932KB0820E

WP recused himself and logged off.

Application documentation was tabled.

Mr Dupre Lombaard (planner) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The historic house (c.1890s) is graded IIIB and not in a HPOZ.
- The development presents an opportunity to restore and protect the historic house.
- Drakenstein Municipality, Drakenstein Heritage Foundation and Paarl 300 all support the development but requested details regarding the restoration of the historic house.
- The boundary treatment is proposed to be a dwarf wall with visually permeable fencing and planting.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to the following condition:

1. That a minimum distance of 1.8m open space be retained between the historic building and any new development.
2. That any structure connecting the historic building and new development be visually permeable and lightweight.
3. The above revised drawings are to be approved by Drakenstein Municipality heritage section.

RECOMMENDATION:

The Committee recommends that the overall height of the new development be reconsidered.

KB

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 41855, 129 Main Road, Paarl: MA HM/PAARL/ERF 797

Case No: 21071507KB0715E

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Doryn Schreuder (architect) and Mr Rouan Theart (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The historic building is graded III B and in the Paarl Special Character Protected Overlay Zone.
- The proposal retaining the open veranda connected to the streetscape and with minimal alterations to existing boundary elements is supported.
- That a visual connection be retained between the proposed lobby and the street where existing sash windows are being replaced by doors, also to ensure adequate daylighting and ventilation into the proposed lobby.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application subject to the following conditions:

1. That the proposed period style doors include glazed top panels and a glazed openable fanlight.
2. That exterior joinery be painted.
3. That where interior walls are proposed to be demolished that stubs and walls above lintels be retained to ensure a memory of the historic compartmentalised layout, as well as compliance with the national building regulations.

KB

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3480, 35 Bosman Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 3480

Case No: 20071408ND0716E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Ms Patricia Botha (Stellenbosch Interest Group), Ms Berta Hayes (Stellenbosch Interest Group) and Ms Lauren Buchanan (Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The historic building is graded IIIC and is located in the Stellenbosch Urban Conservation Overlay Area.
- The landscape is graded II.
- Stellenbosch Interest Group and Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation do not support the proposals.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to refuse the application as not responding to the previous request for further requirements as per Approved Belcom Minutes dated 27 January 2021, item 13.1.

XM

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 12563, 26 Coronation Road Walmer Estate: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WALMER ESTATE/ ERF 12563

Case No: 21081111MS0816E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Ms Tasneem Higgins (owner) and Mr Ron Martin (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC and is located in a HPOZ.
- The City does not support the proposal.
- The Walmer University Estate Conservation Group has no objection to the proposal.
- While supporting alterations and additions, some members of the Committee recommended that significant elements of the historic building be retained and integrated into the new

proposal. Other members recommended a refinement of architectural detail of the proposed design.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee, with two members dissenting, resolved not to approve the application in its current form.

MS

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on ERF 44736, 18 Firth Road, Rondebosch: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 44736

Case No: 21060805KB0830E

Application documents were tabled.

HELD OVER:

The matter to be held over pending submission of the drawings.

KB

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 47721, 4 Lea Road, Rondebosch: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ ERF 47721

Case No: 21071501XM0813E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The historic house is graded IIIB and is not in a HPOZ.
- The City did not support the proposal on grounds of inappropriate detailing.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports in principle the covered veranda, however, has concerns regarding the refinement of detailing.

1. The proposed new roof be reconsidered in terms of form and detailed junction with the existing structure and oversailing eaves should be considered.
2. All elevations to be provided.

XM

**13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 58147, 13 Stanley Road Claremont: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT/ ERF 58147**

Case No: 21081202MS0813E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Ms Janine de Waal (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC and is not located in a HPOZ.
- The City objected to the detail of the proposed carport.
- The Greater Lynfrae Civic Association had no objection.
- No 13 forms part of a terrace house consisting of six units, which sits back-to-back with another very similar terrace house likely built at the same time.
- Many units have been altered in terms of parking and boundary treatment, reducing heritage significance. No 13 is one of the most intact houses in terms of original character.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not impacting on heritage resources.

MS

**13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on RE 4486, Erf 7669, Somerset Lodge, Somerset West:
NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SOMERSET WEST/RE 4486 ERF 7669**

Case No: 21071508KB0716E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The historic building is graded IIIC and is not located within a HPOZ.
- The proposal for a new development is supported but detailed information regarding interventions to the historic house is required.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requests detailed and accurate information regarding the interventions to the historic house which is to be submitted to HWC. All elements to be demolished to be shown on plans, sections and elevations.

KB

13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 848, Bay View Avenue, Tamboerskloof: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITANTAMBOERSKLOOF/ERF 848

Case No: 2107405KB0717E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Stephen Atkinson (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC and is not located in a HPOZ.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.
- The City's Heritage management objects to the boundary treatment.
- However, permanent departures including building line encroachments were approved by the City in March 2021.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not impacting on any heritage resources.

KB

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

**19.1 Proposed Parliament Security Access Points at Roeland and Belvedere Entrances, Cape Town, CBD: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD/ PARLIAMENT PRESCIENT**

Case No: N/A

Dealt under item 7.1.

WD

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 16:30.

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

14 October 2021

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____