

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**



**Scheduled for 09:00 and held on Wednesday, 28 October 2020 via
Microsoft Teams**

1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Prof Walter Peters (WP)
Mr Dennis Belter (DB)
Ms Mishkah Collier (MC)
Mr Stuart Hermansen (SH) left at 12:20

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CAP)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Nokubonga Dlamini (ND)
Ms Sandisiwe Matole (SM)
Ms Anita Shologu (AS)

Visitors:

Mr Ron Martin
Ms Berendine Irrgang
Mr Stuart Burnett
Mr Ori Saban
Mr Gordon Metz
Mr Andrew Pratt
Dr Meyer
Dr Shaun Adendorff
Mr Tyrone Engel
Ms Bridget O'Donoghue
Ms Lize Malan
Ms Berta Hayes

Mr Mark Job
Dr Nandi Siegfried
Mr Torben Pheiffer
Mr Andrew Flint
Mr Sean May
Mr Johan Cornelius
Mr Bert Pepler
Mr Riad Davids
Mr B Watkyns
Ms Clotilda Garatsa
Ms Patricia Botha

3. Apologies

Mr Guillaume Narainne (GN)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 28 October 2020.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 28 October 2020.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 15 October 2020.

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 15 October 2020 and resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

6.1 Recusals

None

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the outcomes of the following Appeals and Tribunal matters:

- Proposed additions to an existing structure on Erf 119707, 93 9th Street, Kensington

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

There were no cases to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

Nothing to report.

8.4 Time management

As a guide to proceedings, time slots will in future be allocated based on the following:

- Matters arising: 15 minutes
- New matters excluding PHSs: 20 minutes
- PHSs: 40 minutes

Times will also vary depending on the number of submissions and applicants.

8.5 Wupperthal

The formation of a special sub-committee for Wupperthal has been discussed between the Chair and the CEO and this has been agreed to. BELCom members who have made themselves available to serve on this Committee include GJ, SJ, SH and DB. Members from other standing Committees will be co-opted when necessary.

8.6 Elim

The Chair updated the current Committee on the previous BELCom's outreach involvement in facilitating quicker approvals and more appropriate development solutions in the town.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Site Inspections Conducted

In future, the Committee will only be conducting site inspections under exceptional circumstances. It will be expected that all submissions must include sufficient information for the Committee to be able to adequately consider a matter using submitted documentation only. Site inspections relating to unauthorised work will be similarly assessed.

9.2 Potential Site Visits

- Puntjie (site inspection to be held on 6 November 2020).

9.3 Report back on Closeout Reports

Nothing to report.

9.4 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.5 Discussion of agenda

Noted.

10. Appointments

10.1 None.

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 237,56 Church Street, Elim: NM HM/ELIM/ERF 237

Case No: 20082606KB0916E

A permit application was tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the application.

Mr Tyrone Engel (Draftsman) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is within a PHS.
- The site is located within the most significant streetscape of Elim.
- The front elevation is to be reconsidered as-is, i.e. to be retained intact as far as possible. The least invasive solution is to be achieved.
- A rear extension is supported in principle.
- The proposals include the introduction of concrete which is inappropriate and physically incompatible with regard to the historic fabric.
- The proposals involve the removal of an old ceiling and probably an historic brandsolder, which would reduce historical authenticity and pose an additional fire risk.

- The use of traditional lime mortars and renders is not mentioned.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is of the opinion that the proposed rear extension can be conceived in a different manner in order to achieve the desired accommodation without affecting the front envelope of the building.

The following should therefore be considered:

1. A stepped section with the proposed extension following the slope of the land.
2. Ensuring accurate ground levels around the building to more precisely and realistically determine proposed floor to ceiling heights.
3. Attaching the rear extension in a manner that minimises the impact on the historic thatched portion of the roof.
4. Specifications that include the use of traditional lime mortars and renders in place of Portland cement.

It is strongly recommended that the applicant consider the introduction of an agricultural drain along the front and down the sides of the property to address the current rising damp problem. This likely offers a much better solution than raising ceiling heights.

KB

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 118, 23 Peak Drive, Pinelands: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/PINELANDS/ERF 118**

Case No: 20090902ND0910E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Mr Ron Martin (Heritage Consultant), Mr Mark Job (Town Planner), Ms Berendine Irrgang (CoCT), Dr Shaun Adendorff (Chairperson of PRRA), Mr Riad Davids (PRRA) and Mr B Watkyns (Ward councillor) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a CoCT grade IIIB and located within an HPO.
- Appears illegally to have been fully demolished.
- Certain trees felled without CoCT (HPO-related) approval.
- Issues around process and information contained in the submission.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee cannot condone unauthorised work. The issue of whether the demolitions were conducted in flagrant disregard of the NHRA and the CoCT's HPO requirements, or not, has yet to be properly established.

The Committee recommends that this matter be properly investigated by HWC's legal advisor who is then to make a recommendation to BELCom on how best to proceed.

ND

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Completed Additions and Alterations, Erf 2675, 27 Rugley Road, Vredehoek: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / VREDEHOEK /ERF 2675

Case No: 19101702SB1029E

A Section 34 application, plans and other relevant documents were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Brian Alcock (Project Manager) was present and took part in the discussion.

HELD OVER:

The Committee cannot consider this item in the absence of the author of the drawings who was asked to be present when the item is tabled. The other further requirements as recorded in the minutes of 17 September 2020 also need to be fully complied with.

The further requirements to be submitted for tabling at BELCom's following meeting scheduled for 12 November 2020.

SB

13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 649, 19 Torbay Road Green Point: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/GREEN POINT/ERF 649

Case No: 20030309KB0615E

A permit application was tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Dr Nandi Siegfried (Neighbor), Mr Stuart Burnett (GPRRA), Mr Torben Pheiffer (Property Owner), Mr Ori Saban (Architect) and Ms Bridget O'Donoghue were present and took part in discussion.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered S2.001-S2.007 dated 1st October 2020. In light of the amended and additional information provided, the Committee is of the opinion that heritage resources will not be negatively impacted.

KB

**13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erven 691, 692, 693, 694, 695, 696 and 697, Winchester Mansions, 22 Beach Road, Sea Point, CT: MA
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SEA POINT/ERVEN 691, 692, 693, 694, 695, 696 & 697**

Case No: 20081103SM0907E

A permit application was tabled.

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

Mr Gordon Metz (Sea Point Fresnaye Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association), Mr Ori Saban (Sea Point Fresnaye Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents Association), Mr Andrew Flint (GAPP Architects & Urban Planners) and Ms Bridget O'Donoghue (Heritage Consultant) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIA.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered: F314, F315 & F316 and dated: 9 December 2019 as meeting previous requirements on condition that the detailing of the proposals be submitted to the CoCT (EHRM) for final approval.

The Committee recommends that the applicant consider accenting the giant order of the pilasters to the arcading.

SM

**13.4 Proposed Alteration and Additions, Erf 2243, 9 Rose Street, Paarl: MA
HM/DRAKENSTEIN MUNICIPALITY/PAARL/ERF 2243**

Case No: 20071304ND0713E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

HELD OVER:

The Committee cannot consider this item in the absence of the information that was required. The outstanding information as recorded in the minutes of 29 July 2020 is to be submitted to HWC for consideration no later than BELCom's meeting of 25 November 2020. Should this not be complied with, BELCom will have to consider its legal options including possible recommendation that charges be laid.

The further requirements to be submitted for tabling at BELCom's following meeting scheduled for 25 November 2020.

ND

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 162895, 32 Kenilworth Road, Kenilworth: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KENILWORTH/ERF 162895

Case No: 20072906SM0928E

A permit application was tabled.

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

Ms Clotilda Garatsa (Applicant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The main building is graded by the CoCT as grade IIIA i.e. of highest local significance.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes a lack of information with regards to the following, amongst others:

1. The lack of a roof plan indicating solar panel layouts.
2. Consideration of the location of these panels relative to due north.
3. Alternative locations considered e.g. back building?
4. Implications of existing tree canopies?
5. The visual and performance properties of the panels chosen: what alternatives were considered to mitigate visual impact?
6. The method of fixing solar panels to mitigate visual impact?

Given the above, the Committee has insufficient information to consider this submission properly. Further documentation including considerations of alternatives to be submitted.

SM

13.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1197, 13 Noordwal West Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 1197

Case No: 20040702KB0420E

Committee to take final decision.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Lize Malan (Heritage Practitioner representing the applicant), Ms Patricia Botha (Stellenbosch Interest Group) and Ms Berta Hayes (Stellenbosch Interest Group) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The applicant has resubmitted the proposals without addressing the Committee's previous requirements as there was a question raised by the applicant's legal advisor as to whether such requirements could be imposed.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

That the applicant be required i.t.o regulation 4(3)(a) of the Regulations to the National Heritage Resources Act, 1999, (Act 25 of 1999), published on 29 August 2003, PN 298 of 2003 to motivate within 14 days why the permit should not be withdrawn due to non-compliance.

KB

**13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 7669, 20 Main Road, Somerset West: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SOMERSET WEST/ERF 7669**

Case No: 20071401ND0716E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (Heritage Consultant) and Mr Sean May (Architect) were present and took part in the discussion.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee cannot comment on the revised proposals until I&APs that previously expressed an interest in the proposals have been given an opportunity to provide input. Given that these parties are already familiar with the site, an eleven (11) day commenting period effective from 28 October 2020 is deemed sufficient. That will enable the proposals to be re-tabled at the following BELCom meeting on 12 November 2020.

ND

**13.8 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 64402 and 64403, 29 and 31 Kenilworth Road, Kenilworth:
NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KENILWORTH/ERF 64402 & 64403**

Case No: 20070701ND1006E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Dr Meyer (Property owner) and Mr Bert Pepler (Architect), Mr Roger and Ms Else Scott were present and took part in the

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee cannot consider this item until it can be assured that HWC's minimum guidelines for public engagement (**HWC Public Consultation Guidelines: Public Consultation required for Applications made in terms of the National Heritage Resources Act, Act 25 of 1999, (the NHRA) June 2019**) have been met, including the development of the indicators for the design of any replacement .

ND

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 16:05

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

12 November 2020

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____