

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**

**Commenced at 09:00 and held on Wednesday, 27 January 2021 via
Microsoft Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)
Prof Walter Peters (WP)
Mr Dennis Belter (DB)
Ms Mishkah Collier (MC)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Ms Sandisiwe Matole (SM)
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Nokubonga Dlamini (ND)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CAP)

Visitors:

Mr Mike Scurr
Mr Johan Cornelius
Mr Bert Pepler
Mrs Alma Mentz
Mr Willem Visser
Mr Aiden Handler
Ms Sasha Handler
Ms Claire Abrahamse
Ms Maura Sanderoff
Ms Carina Wiggill
Ms Irmela Alberts
Ms Robyn Connors
Ms Patricia Botha
Mr Chris Bakker
Mr David Hart
Ms Summer De Nobrega
Mr Erwin Struwig
Ms Saira Essa

Ms Margot van Heerden
Mr Kobus Scott
Mr Ashley Lillie
Mr Carla van der Spuy
Mr Rian Miller
Ms Jenny Collins
Ms Wendy Wilson
Mr David Pike
Mr Henry Aikman
Ms Louise van Riet
Mr Wilh van der Merwe
Ms Berta Hayes
Mr Cor Van Der Merwe
Mr John Wilkinson
Mr Philip Smith
Ms Jacqui Perrin
Mr Rudolf Weyers
Mr Alexis van der Merwe

3. Apologies

None

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 27th January 2021.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 27th January 2021.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 10th December 2020.

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 10 December 2020 and resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

- MC: item 13.6 and 13.13

6.1 Recusals

None

7. Confidential Matters

7.1

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the outcomes of the following appeals and tribunals matters:

- Proposed additions and alterations, Erf 86617, 16 Wherry Road, Muizenberg
- Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 649, 19 Torbay Road, Greenpoint
- Cannon Street Brewery site, Erf 49306 Newlands

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

There were no cases to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

Nothing to report.

8.4 New Commonwealth War Graves Commission Memorial - For noting

The following recommendation of the IACom was tabled:

“The Committee agreed that a S27 process rather than S38 should be followed given that the entire Company’s Garden is a PHS. The CoCT and Heritage consultant can define the process and content of the application to suit the desired interim statement and process. The CoCT will revert to HWC at an early stage with an outline of a public process for comment and this submission should include the scope of the heritage study being undertaken. It was further agreed that two members of BELCom would be co-opted to IACom as and when required for this matter/application.”

The Committee noted the above and will nominate co-optees in due course.

8.5 BELCom member

SH has had to resign from Committee to take up an appointment on Appeals Committee. BELCom has noted this and members have been asked to submit names for a potential replacement via email, taking into account skill sets useful to BELCom decision making.

8.6 Wupperthal Sub-Committee

Due to the resignation of SH from BELCom Committee, the Committee resolved that Professor Peters will serve on the Wupperthal Sub-Committee.

8.7 Starting Times

The Committee resolved to commence future BELCom meetings at 08:30 given that future meetings will be via video conferencing.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Closeout Reports

DB reported back on his inspection of the stripping of the Gantry Cranes at the V&A Waterfront.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

The Chair reported back on a special Council meeting held to re-assign and appoint new committee members and a Chair for one of the standing Committees.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted.

10. Appointments

10.1 None.

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Refurbishment of the Auditorium, Allied Spaces and Services, Erf 4942, City Hall, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN CBD/ERF 4942

Case No: 17103111WD1101M

Additional information was tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Mr Mike Scurr (Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects), Ms Margot van Heerden (CoCT) and Mr David Hart (CoCT) were present. Mr Scurr took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Various alternative proposals were submitted by the applicants as requested by BELCom. These were discussed.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application (drawing numbered: 4605E), dated 22nd December 2020: Alternative D, on the understanding that the detailing will preclude the possibility of rising damp within the adjacent walls. This will include adequate measures for under floor ventilation and damp insulation of the new work from adjacent wall fabric.

WD

11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 192 RE 193 - 195, Swartberg Hotel, Church Street, Prince Albert: MA HM/CENTRAL KAROO/ PRINCE ALBERT/ERF 192 RE 193 - 195 Case No: 20121701KB0717E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (Heritage Consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Mr Cornelius elaborated on the work that was unauthorized and the proposed work requiring approval.
- The site is graded as a PHS

RECORD OF DECISION:

The unauthorised work:

1. The Committee cannot legally approve unauthorised work.

2. Nonetheless, the Committee is of the view that the unauthorised work has not substantially impacted heritage significance and therefore does not recommend that legal action be taken against the applicant.

The proposed work:

The Committee approves the proposed work on the understanding that the proposed pergolas will be totally free standing, and on condition that all proposed alterations involving historic masonry are conducted using compatible mortars and renders under the supervision of an appropriately qualified and experienced architectural heritage practitioner.

KB

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 64402 & 64403, 29 and 31 Kenilworth Road, Kenilworth: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KENILWORTH/ERF 64402 & 64403

Case No: 20070701ND1006E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Mr Philip Smith (CoCT), Mr Kobus Scott (Town Planner Consultant), Mr Bert Pepler (Architect) and Ms Summer De Nobrega (Neighbour) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Proposed total demolition of two structures on 2 sites for a construction of a rehab centre.
- The site is within the proposed Kenilworth HPOZ and the grading is IIIC.
- CoCT does not support the demolition and replacement structures.
- HVA supports the demomlition of the buildings and recommends that attention is paid to the replacement structure.
- Immediate neighbour(s) are objecting to the demolition as the buildings are believed to have heritage value and are part of the Victorian style buildings in the area.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has insufficient information to apply its mind to properly adjudicate this application, particularly considering that the subject site falls within an HPOZ with a very distinctive character.

Additional information must include as a minimum:

1. Graphic heritage indicators elaborating further on the street elevations provided; and
2. 3D photo-montages of the proposal within its spatial context including from street level.

The purpose is for the Committee to be able to consider the impact of the proposals holistically within their spatial context and for the indicators to inform the architect as how best to adjust/re-consider the current proposals if/where necessary.

All proposed alterations to the current proposals, as well as all additional documentation clarifying this proposal, are to be circulated to the I&AP's prior to, or at the time of re-submission to HWC.

ND

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1852, 2 Lion Street, Bo-Kaap: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BO-KAAP/ERF 1852**

Case No: 20110209ND1125E

The matter was withdrawn from the agenda at the request of the applicant.

ND

**12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 49821, 2 Moss Street, Newlands: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/NEULANDS/ERF 49821**

Case No: 20112002TZ1123E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Mr Ashley Lillie (Heritage Consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- CoCT expressed no objection to the proposals.
- The subject site is located outside a HPOZ.
- There are no HWC registered conservation bodies in the area.
- A notice was placed on the front gate of the property for informing passing neighbours and others of the proposals.
- The site is graded NCW.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition on the basis that it has no heritage significance.

The Committee does note the presence of at least one unregistered public body in the area which could result in an appeal should this body decide accordingly.

TZ

12.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 12459, Quay 3, Port of Mossel Bay: NM HM/MOSSEL BAY/ERF 12459

Case No: 20100502KB1027E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Carina Wiggill (Mossel Bay Heritage) was present and took part in the discussion. Mr Henry Aikman (Heritage Consultant) was unable to connect.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The proposal falls within the historic port of Mossel Bay.
- The existing structure incorporates early stone wall fabric.
- Mossel Bay Heritage expressed an interest in this wall fabric which they submit has potential to be re-used on the site.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

It is not clear whether the site context requires special design considerations. Further information is therefore required for the Committee to determine whether the so-called Gees judgement needs to be applied.

KB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 3480, 35 Bosman Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 3480

Case No: 20071408ND0716E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Ms Alma Mentz (Architect), Ms Berta Hayes (Stellenbosch Interest Group) and Ms Patricia Botha (Stellenbosch Interest Group) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Application is for proposed additions and alterations to existing structures. A single storey to be changed into a double storey on the street façade and three storeys to the back of the house.
- SIG and SHF do not support the application.
- No comment from Stellenbosch Municipality has been received.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee remains concerned about the gutting of the existing house and therefore recommends that the additional accommodation in this building be taken up as loft accommodation that could include raising the eaves of the roof without substantially altering its overall massing and the general character of the area.

It is reminded that to come to an appropriate solution all alternatives need to be considered by the applicant. The above alternative will enable the ground floor room configuration and fittings to be retained substantially as currently existing with the possibility of further obscuring the rear extension from Bosman Street.

The Committee's previous requirements remain applicable.

ND

**13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2243, 9 Rose Street, Paarl: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN /PAARL/ERF 2243**

Case No: 20071304ND0713E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Mr Carla van der Spuy (Property Owner) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is within the Drakenstein Special Character Overlay Zone and is graded III B.
- Drakenstein Municipality objected to the proposal, commenting that the work is already done.
- DHF objected to the proposal, noting the ornate work not shown on the plans and requested that a Heritage Impact Assessment to be done.
- Paarl300 noted that they cannot comment on work that has already been done.

RECOMMENDATION AND FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

1. Based on the additional information submitted, the Committee recommends that no further actions be taken with regard to the unauthorised external toilet alternations.
2. The Committee has no objections to the proposed rear dormer balcony and proposed internal staircase.
3. The Committee has no objections in principle to the proposed alterations to the saddle store.
4. Points 2 and 3 are conditional on the following:
 - a. That a full drawing of the new staircase be submitted to HOMs for discretionary approval, and
 - b. The roof of the saddle store be reconfigured to fall as a lean-to from the rear façade to a horizontal gutter line running parallel with the rear façade.

ND

13.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 21518, 32 Links Road, Bellville: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BELLVILLE/ERF 21518

Case No: 20110507TZ1127E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Mr Willem Visser (Owner) and Mr Rian Miller (Architect) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded 3C and falls outside a HPO.
- CoCT does not support the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee has no objections to the proposed alterations on the basis that the building remains have insufficient significance to warrant retention and the building is not within a declared or proposed heritage area.

RECOMMENDATION:

While heritage significance is not negatively impacted, the Committee urges the applicant to explore alternatives that would be more in keeping with the residential character of the surrounds.

TZ

13.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 746,10 Milner Road, Sea Point: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SEA POINT/ERF 746

Case No: 20102309KB1207E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Aiden Handler and Ms Sasha Handler (Owners) and Ms Jenny Collins (Architect) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC within a HPOZ.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Sea Point For All supports the proposal.
- Sea Point, Fresnaye & Bantry Bay Ratepayers & Residents' Association does not support the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting either significant built fabric or the streetscape in this specific instance. The additional storey and the manner in which that has been treated will improve visual links between the site and street surroundings.

KB

**13.5 Proposed Restoration, Erf 55307, 43 Vineyard Road, Claremont: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 55307**

Case No: 20101305SM1013E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

Mr Mike Scurr (Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects), Ms Wendy Wilson (Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects), Mr Cor Van Der Merwe (Planner) and Ms Jacqui Perrin (Upper Claremont Residents and Ratepayers Association) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The CoCT has graded the site Grade IIIA.
- The site falls outside a HPO.
- The Committee complemented the applicant on a thorough study.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage significance in as far as the NHRA affords this Committee jurisdiction.

Given the historical significance of the property, the Committee strongly recommends that the well on the site be thematically if not spatially linked and its presence acknowledged in a manner that contributes and reinforces the significance and interpretation of the property as a whole.

SM

13.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 56309,6 Paradise View Claremont: NM HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 56309

Case No: 20112412KB1209E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (Heritage Consultant), Mr Alexis van der Merwe (Chair, Upper Claremont Residents and Ratepayers Association) and Ms Jacqui Perrin (Upper Claremont Residents and Ratepayers Association) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB, outside HPOZ.
- The Upper Claremont residents and Ratepayers association is of the opinion that the site should be graded IIIA.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

While the Committee is in general support of the proposal and the heritage report, reservations are expressed regarding:

1. The close proximity between the manor house and the new south wing extension; and
2. The over-elaboration of the proposed parapets.

The applicant is encouraged to explore alternatives that provide more “breathing space” between the manor house and this extension and consider simpler treatments for the above parapets.

KB

13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 50441, 38 Malcolm Road, Rondebosch: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 50441

Case No: 20121702TZ1217E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Mr David Pike (architect) and Ms Maura Sanderoff (GLCA Planning Sub Committee) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded 3C and falls outside a HPO.
- GLCA & CoCT support the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

TZ

**13.8 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 17958, 14A De Beers Avenue, Paardevlei, Somerset West: NM
HM/SOMERSET WEST/PAARDEVLEI/ERF 17958**

Case No: 20090905ND1104E

The matter was withdrawn from the agenda.

ND

**13.9 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 9785, 13 Upper Wheelan Street, Newlands: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ERF 9785**

Case No: 20102908ND1201E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Ms Marlene Morilly (on behalf of the owner) tendered her apology. Ms Robyn Connors (representing the Applicant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- CoCT stated that the site is graded IIIC.
- Structure is located within a proposed HPO.
- CoCT does not support the proposal.
- NRA has no objections to the alterations on the rear of the house or the roof lights to be inserted into the existing roof. NRA does, however, object to the enclosure of the current parking bays with a roof and double garage door as that will interfere with the façade.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved in this instance to approve the application given that this specific streetscape is already predominately characterised by garages and carports on the street boundary. Consequently, heritage significance will not be negatively impacted.

ND

13.10 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2911,38 Huguenot Road, Franschhoek: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/FRANSCHHOEK/ERF 2911

Case No: 20112501KB1126E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Louise Van Riet (Applicant), Ms Irmela Alberts (Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayers Association), Mr Chris Bakker (Architect), Mr Erwin Struwig (Architect) and Ms Saira Essa (Owner) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC and falls just at the edge of the Franschhoek special area.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has insufficient information to make a decision on this proposal at this stage although it has no objection in principle to the use of the roof space, the inclusion of roof dormers/doors nor the glazed enclosure of the ground floor colonnade. This issue, however, is how this is executed and detailed.

The Committee has concerns regarding the following amongst others:

1. The location and treatment of the proposed roof dormers;
2. The treatment of the proposed canopy balustrade if this area is to be occupied;
3. The enclosure of the ground floor colonnade which currently does not allow for existing columns to be sufficiently expressed.

The Committee recommends that the amended proposals include 3D presentations that help to clarify and motivate the positions of the proposed new dormers in relation to the manner in which the building turns the corner from its street elevation to the adjacent pedestrian alley and bank building.

The Committee requires that the revised proposals be circulated for comment to all I&AP's who previously commented and that this be done at the time of re-submission to HWC at the latest.

KB

13.11 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 11139-11140, 3 3A Sussex Street, Woodstock: NM HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 11139-1114

Case No: 20009807KB1019E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Wilh van der Merwe (Applicant) and Mr Rudolf Weyers (Architect) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC and it is located outside a HPO.
- Woodstock Residents Association supports the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve Option 4 as indicated in drawing number H027 dated 15th January 2021 as having met previous heritage related concerns and requirements.

KB

13.12 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 54726, Kenilworth: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KENILWORTH/ERF 54726

Case No: 20112411SM1136E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (Heritage Consultant) Mr Alexis Van der Merwe (Chair, Upper Claremont Residents and Ratepayers Association), Mr Jacqui Perrin (Upper Claremont Residents and Ratepayers Association), Ms Robyn Connors (Project Manager) and Mr John Wilkinson (Neighbour) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIA located within a proposed HPO.
- The “pinch point” at the entrance to the property was clarified by the heritage consultant.
- Concerns expressed by the UCRRRA were addressed during discussion.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application substantially in accordance with drawings numbered 3.100,3.101,3.102,3.103,3.104,3.105,3.106 &3.107. dated July 2020 as not impacting heritage significance on condition that appropriate mortars, renders and other materials to the satisfaction of the heritage consultant are used on historic parts of the fabric.

SM

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 18:35

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

24 February 2021

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____