

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape  
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**

**Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 26 May 2021 via  
Microsoft Teams**



**1. Opening and Welcome**

**Note:** Due to the Chairperson, Mr. Graham Jacobs, tendering his apologies for not attending the meeting, WD presided over the election of an Acting Chairperson in terms of the rule 12(5) of the Rules of Order and Conduct at Meetings of HWC. The Committee elected Mr Shawn Johnston to chair the meeting.

The (Acting) Chairperson, Mr Shawn Johnston, opened the meeting at 08h30 and welcomed everyone present via Microsoft Teams.

**2. Attendance**

**Committee Members:**

Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)  
Mr Dennis Belter (DB)  
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)  
Prof Walter Peters (WP)  
Ms Mishkah Collier (MC)

**Members of Staff:**

Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)  
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)  
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CAP)  
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)  
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD) (left at 08:45)  
Ms Anita Shologu (AS)  
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM)  
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS)  
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)  
Ms Xola Mlwandle(XM)  
Ms Zikhona Sigonya (ZS)

**Visitors:**

Mr Shamil Gamielien  
Mr Steven Frankel  
Mr Phillip Smith  
Ms Saira Essa  
Mr Chris Erwin Struwig  
Mr Ronald Basson  
Ms Louise van Riet  
Mr Ron Martin  
Ms Doryn Schreude  
Mr Johan Tien  
Mr Sebastian van Gruenen  
Mr Andrew Berman  
Dr Steven Townsend  
Mr Mike Scurr  
Ms Vimtha Rajbansi  
Prof Lucien le Grange  
Mr Chris Baker

Mr Chris Murphy  
Mr Barry Phillips  
Mr Joe Olivier  
Mr Kristof Basson  
Ms Adelaide Combrink  
Mr Louis Phillips  
Ms Sandra van der Merwe  
Dr Rolf Annas  
Mr Leone Bregman  
Ms Liana Jordan  
Ms Leone Wierenga  
Mr Eugene da Silva  
Ms Ursula Rigby  
Ms Albie Olivier  
Ms Simone le Grange  
Ms Quahnita Samie

- 3. Apologies**  
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)
- Absent**  
None
- 4. Approval of Agenda**
- 4.1 Dated 26 May 2021.**  
The Committee approved the agenda dated 26 May 2021.
- 5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings**
- 5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 13 May 2021**  
The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 13 May 2021 and resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.
- 6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:**
- 6.1 Recusals**  
MC: item 13.1
- 7. Confidential Matters**
- 7.1** None
- 8. Administrative Matters**
- 8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**  
Nothing further to report.
- 8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:**  
Nothing further to report.
- 8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition**  
Nothing further to report.
- 9. Standing Items**
- 9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports**  
Nothing further to report.
- 9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings**  
WD reported back on the Council meeting that was held on 21 May 2021 and the Committee noted the report.
- 9.3 Discussion of agenda**  
Noted.
- 9.4 Heritage Statements**  
None.

## **10. Appointments**

**10.1** None.

### **MATTERS DISCUSSED**

## **11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

### **11.1 Proposed Fencing on Erf 3679,5 Wale Street, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ERF 3679**

**Case No:** 21022401KB0308E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

The architects, Prof Lucien le Grange and Ms Simone le Grange, were present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- That new work should be distinctive from the old.
- The site is graded as a PHS.
- This site is located within an HPOZ.

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the revised drawings numbered 2020/STGREV 00, 2020/STGREV 03 & 2020/STGREV 04 dated 27 May 2021 and prepared by Lucien Le Grange as not impacting negatively on heritage resources. The existing brick pier along Queen Victoria Street should be left unchanged. The drawings are to be submitted to HWC for final approval.

**KB**

### **11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 178, 32 Church Street, Tulbagh: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/WITZENBERG/TULBAGH/ERF 178**

**Case No:** 21041906KB0506E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Jayson Auguston Clark (Heritage Practitioner) was present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee cannot approve unauthorised work.
- The external door added to Bedroom 1 and the position of the door in Bedroom 2 is problematic. The door moved southward to the 'middle' of the internal wall.
- No sections are provided. Sections are required.
- The Committee questioned how the new walls of the en-suite bathrooms are founded.

- The Committee questioned whether the timber floors were suspended.
- The Committee questioned how the walls meet the ceiling. The exposed beam positions was carefully considered by Fagan. Clarity is required.
- Bedroom 3 is now proposed as a self-contained unit. This needs to be clarified and tabled with drawings and sections.
- Not all new work has been shown as 'New' on the plan with the appropriate colour coding. This need to be corrected.
- The Committee need veracious drawings, plans and sections, that show clearly (1) what was; and (2) what is in process ie subjected to the building work being stopped; and (3) what's planned.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The matter is held over until the 10 June 2021 to give the applicant sufficient time to prepare a set of drawings illustrating the changes that were made.

KB

**12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

12.1 None

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 149294, Union Castle Building, V & A Waterfront: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/V & A WATERFRONT/ERF 149294**

**Case No:** 21072020TZ0724E

MC recused herself and logged off from MS Teams.

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Heritage practitioner Ms Claire Abrahamse, client representative Mr Neil Schwarz and the architects Mr Pierre Swanepoel and Kelvin Stein were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee concurred with the heritage practitioner that the folded concrete roof dating from 1918 was probably unique and that its integrity was in no way to be jeopardised.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the revised application as meeting previous requirements, as indicated on drawings 08-01-001 Rev A, 02-22-001 Rev A, 06-11-001 Rev B, 06-11-002 Rev B dated 3 February 2021 and prepared by DHK architects as not negatively impacting the heritage resource. All doors on the southern elevation must be unified. The

columns of the roof structure should align with the structure below. The drawings are to be submitted to HWC for final approval.

**SB**

**13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2284, 38 Long Street, Cape Town: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN CBD/ ERF 2284**

**Case No:** 21041907MS0504E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- While not visible from the street, the proposal of a standard rectangular structure with adjustable louvres was not appropriate on a building of this stature.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee cannot take a decision without the applicants being present. This matter is held over to provide the applicants with an opportunity to submit a detailed roofplan to illustrate all existing and proposed structures.

**MS**

**13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1468, 13 Florida Road, Vredehoek: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/VREDEHOEK/ ERF 1468**

**Case No:** 21030410XM0430E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Mr Joe Olivier (owner) and Mr Kristof Basson (architect), as well as Ms Adelaide Combrink of the City's Environment and Heritage Management section were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The need to preserve the viewshed and therefore the need for a transparent intervention.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee requires revised drawings and photo montages to clarify the proposed design within the streetscape.

**XM**

**13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 172010, Cnr Beach and Sidmouth Road, Muizenberg: NM  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MUIZENBERG/ERF 172010**

**Case No:** 21040709AM0422E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

Architect Mr Shamil Gamieldien, developer Mr Steven Frankel and Mr Phillip Smith of the City's Environment and Heritage Management section were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The vertical alignment of the fenestration should be acknowledged.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee has no objections to larger windows on Sidmouth Road. However, the articulation of the new openings should follow the pattern of the existing building by giving each window opening its own arch instead of bridging across two bays. The entrance can be signified by allowing more elaboration, including a segment arched doorway which references the existing doorway. Applicant to submit revised drawings to HWC.

**AM**

**13.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 8676, KWV, La Concorde, Paarl: NM  
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 8676**

**Case No:** 20111805

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Mr Louis Phillips (Architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This was a utilitarian building, but provided with some elaboration at the entrance front, foyer and meeting rooms because of its status also as a headquarters, and had been added to. Now sold, the building has been repurposed for commercial office use, which calls for flexible spaces.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee requires revised plans indicating which portions (location on plan with photographs) of unauthorised work portions have been completed and which sections need to be completed. The heritage practitioner is required to clarify the inconsistent time frame of building phases within the heritage statement.

**XM**

**13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 300, 8a Avenue, Normandie, Fresnaye: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/FRESNAYE/ERF 300: NM**

**Case No:** 21042607MS0428E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Ms Sandra van der Merwe (DOCOMOMO) and Ms Karin-Marie Wilson (Architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The division of the house into two parallel units was appropriate with the original staircase observed.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the revised application as indicated on drawings numbered 1910-MD-200 REV F, 201 REV G, SK 500 REV F, SK 501 REV F, SK502 REV F and SK 503 REV F dated 2021.05.19 and prepared by KM Wilson Architects as not impacting negatively on heritage resources.

**MS**

**13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 8783, Wellington: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/WELLINGTON/ERF 8783**

**Case No:** 20111107XM0505E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Mr Chris Murphy (Heritage Practitioner) was present and took part in the discussions.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved that there was insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention of the existing structure. However, given that the site falls within the Wellington Special Character Protected Area Overlay Zone, approval for demolition is granted with the following condition:

1. The replacement structure is to be approved by the Drakenstein Municipality Heritage Section prior to any land use approval.

**XM**

**13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf RE of Erf 2911,38 Huguenot Road,Franschhoek: MA  
HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/FRANSHHOEK/ERF 2911**

**Case No:** 20112501KB1126E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Barry Phillips (Chairman of the Franschhoek Heritage and Ratepayers Association), Ms Saira Essa (owner), Mr Erwin Struwig (Architect), Ms Louise van Riet (Heritage Practitioner) and Ms RONALDA BASSON were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This was a remodelling of an early 2000s alteration; only the gable was authentic, c.1930s.
- The redesign with steel balustrade, rooflight in lieu of a dormer on the street side, and the two shed dormers along the lane were acceptable.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the revised application drawings numbered PL101, PL102, PL103 & PL104, dated 01 October 2020 and prepared by GASS Architects Studio as not impacting negatively on heritage resources.

**KB**

**13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 8731, Main Road, Paarl: NM  
HM/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 8731**

**Case No:** 20073010

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Sandra van der Merwe (DOCOMOMO), Dr Rolf Annas (Drakenstein Heritage Foundation) and Mr Ron Martin (Heritage Practitioner) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Within the sweeping space as defined by the curve of the roof, a square kiosk was visually intrusive. If it was important to be in that position, which was questioned, the design would best be cylindrical and should preferably not reach to the soffit of the roof.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application with the omission of the kiosk. The applicant to provide a revised drawing, which omits the kiosk, for approval to HWC.

**KB**



**13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 25447, 129 Main Road, Paarl: NM HM/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 25447**

**Case No:** KB0504E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Dr Rolf Annas (Drakenstein Heritage Foundation) , Ms Doryn Schreuder, Ms Leone Bregman, Mr Johan Tien and Ms Liana Jordan were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Insufficient information was provided about the historical house, specifically on the layering that has occurred in the past. and on context.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee requires revised drawings and appropriate photo-montages to clarify the location and footprint of the proposed development within its context as well as a heritage statement for the historical house. Visual design heritage indicators that determined the proposal are to be included.

**KB**

**13.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 27141-RE, 368A Main Road, Observatory: NM HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/OBSERVATORY/ERF 27141 RE**

**Case No:** 21050408KB0504E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Chris Baker, Ms Leone Wierenga (Gas Architects), and Mr Andrew Berman (Heritage Practitioner) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The interface between old and new; the siting relative to the historical cemetery; the bulk of the building in relation to its context.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the revised application as indicated on drawings numbered PP018,0001SL & 0002SL dated 25 March and 05 May2021 prepared by Gas Architects as not negatively impacting the heritage resources.

**KB**

**13.12 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 111, 35 Dennehof Street, Riebeeck West: NM HM/SWARTLAND/RIEBEEK WEST/ ERF 111**

**Case No:** 21050313KB0504E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Mr Eugene da Silva Moreira (Architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENT:**

The Committee supports the current proposal, however the Committee would like to see the scale of the of the new entrance to be sympathetic to the existing building.

**KB**

**14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**14.1** None

**15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**15.1** None

**16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**16.1** None

**17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**17.1** None

**18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

**18.1** None

## 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

### 19.1 Erf 16190, 84 Fenton Road, Dryden Street Primary, Salt River: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SALT RIVER/ERF 16190

**Case No:** 20110907WD1109E

Request for advice.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Ms Ursula Rigby (Heritage Practitioner) was present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The dismantling of the chimneys, the state of the cupola, and the dislodged pointing was of great concern.

#### **ADVICE:**

A site inspection attended by the engineer and architects serving on BELCom would be held on Friday, 28<sup>th</sup> May at 11:00.

**WD**

### 19.2 Erf 3032, 150 Buitengracht Street, Bo-Kaap: NM HM/BO-KAAP/ERF 3032

**Case No:** N/A

Request for advise.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Mr Mike Scurr (Architect and heritage practitioner), Mr Sebastian van Gruenen (Developer), Mr Stephen Townsend (observer) and Ms Vimtha Rajbansi (neighbouring property owner) and Ms Quahnita Samie (observer) were present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The new proposal was far more considered than the previous proposals and responsive to the significance of 148 Buitengracht Street. The new proposal is still not appropriately scaled for the context.

#### **ADVICE:**

The developer to engage in the process of public participation and submit the revised proposals along with comments to HWC for review.

**WD**

**20 OTHER MATTERS**

20.1 None

**21. NON-COMPLIANCE**

21.1 None

**22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

**23. CLOSURE**

The meeting closed at 18:10

**24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**

10 June 2021

**MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:**

CHAIRPERSON \_\_\_\_\_

DATE \_\_\_\_\_

SECRETARY \_\_\_\_\_

DATE \_\_\_\_\_