

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**



**Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 26 January 2022 via
Microsoft Teams**

1. Opening and Welcome

Note: Due to the Chairperson, Mr. Graham Jacobs being unable to attend the meeting, and tendering apologies. Ms Waseefa Dhansay presided over the election of an Acting Chairperson in terms of the rule 12(5) of the Rules of Order and Conduct at Meetings of HWC. The Committee elected Mr Dennis Belter to chair the meeting.

The Acting Chair, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)
Prof Walter Peters (WP)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)
Mr Dave Saunders (DS) co-opted (joins at 09:00)
Mr Mike Scurr (MS) co-opted (joins at 12:10)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Sneha Jhupsee (SJ)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS)
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Natalie Kendrick (NK)
Ms Chane Herman (CH)
Mr Robin George (RG)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)
Ms Colette Scheermeyer (CSc)
Mr Michael van Rensburg (MvR)

Visitors:

Mr Mike Scurr
Mr Jacques Mouton
Ms Berta Hayes
Ms Katie Smuts
Mr Anacreon Barnard
Mr Alexandra Singer
Ms Tamar Shem-Tov
Mr Temba Jauch
Mr Neels Nel
Mr Nicki van Zyl
Mr Rushdi Abrahams

Ms Sarah Winter
Ms Patricia Botha
Mr William George
Ms Helen May
Mr Henry Aikman
Mr Andrew Greeff
Mr James Minchener
Mr Henry Paine
Dr Carnie Matisonn
Mr Paul Luck
Mr Aton Twigg

Ms Clair Harriman
Ms Adelaide Combrink

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue

3. Apologies

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 26 January 2022.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 26 January 2022.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 14 December 2021

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 14 December 2021 and resolved to approve them with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

6.1 Recusals

- MS: item 11.1

7. Confidential Matters

None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM reported back on the following appeals matters:

- MEC Tribunal Directive: Proposed Partial Demolition, Alterations and Additions, Erven 2544 and 2456, Corner Joubert Street and Merriman Avenue, Stellenbosch – S34, A&A.
- Appeal against decision of BELCom: Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 12563, 26 Coronation Road, Walmer Estate, Revised Proposal to be tabled – S34, A&A.
- Appeal against decision of HOMS: Proposed mixed-use development on Erven 1378 and 1379, Paarl, S38(4)-NID.
- Appeal against decision of HOMS: Proposed Construction of a Commercial Facility and Parking on Erven 1376 and 1377, Paarl, S38(4) -NID.
- Appeal against decision of HOMS: Proposed Demolition of an existing accommodation facility and redevelopment of the site, Portion 5 of Farm 296, Arch Rock, Keurboomstrand- S38(4)-NID.
- Appeal against the decision of BELCom: Proposed Total Demolition of Erven 977 and 978, 11 and 13 Virginia Avenue, Vredehoek, S34-TD.

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

Nothing to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

None.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

Nothing to report.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted

9.4 Proposed Site Inspections

- Proposed New Agricultural Werf and Associated Buildings Kleinbosch Farm, Dal Josaphat
- Proposed Alteration and addition on REM 10829, Off Steenberg Road, Tokai

9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken

- Proposed Additions and Alterations to Boschendal Cellar Building, Off R310, Dwars River Valley Farm 10, 167 Stellenbosch

10. Appointments

None

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Boschendal Cellar building, Off R310, Dwars River Valley Farm 10, 167 Stellenbosch: NM
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH / BOSCHENDAL / PORTION 10 OF FARM 167**

Case No: 21090305SB1020E

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 12 January 2022. See attached annexure SI1.

Mr Mike Scurr (heritage consultant), Ms Katie Smuts (heritage consultant), Ms Sarah Winter (heritage consultant), Mr Jacques Mouton (architect), Ms Patricia Botha (Stellenbosch Interest Group), Ms Berta Hayes (Stellenbosch Interest Group) and Mr William George (Boschendal) were present and took part in the discussions.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Following the site visit, the Committee is in support of the general form, shape and landscaping of the proposed remodelling. Certain question remains as to detailing and selection of materials. This is to be covered in a future submission as design development drawings are completed.

The Committee is in support of the permeability proposed in options 1 and 2. Council drawings are to be submitted at the next BELCom meeting to be held on 10 February 2022 for approval.

SB**11.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2755, 11 van Oudtshoorn Road, Swellendam: NM HM/OVERBERG/SWELLENDAM/ ERF 2755**

Case No: 21102604SJ1118E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Ms Helen May (heritage consultant), Mr Anacreon Barnard (property owner) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- It was noted that the hand-drawn sketches show final design intentions as opposed to the 3D rendered views which differ slightly from the sketches (refer Annexure 2 – Design Proposals and 3Ds).
- Whilst the Committee cannot enforce the alteration of existing features, given the high significance of the building, the proposed building work offers an opportunity to improve the prominent east / street facing modern window and replace such to replicate the original.
- If possible, a refinement of the carport and its siting will be advantageous.
- The site is Grade II resource and is situated inside Swellendam Conservation Area.
- Swellendam Aesthetics and Conservation Advisory Committee requested an architect with heritage experience be appointed. Swellendam Heritage Association supports the proposal.

FUTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is in support of the proposed alterations and additions. However, further refinement of the eastern façade lounge window is required, along with exploration of the possibility to retain the columns of the north veranda. These revisions are to be submitted to HOMs for approval.

SJ

11.3 Proposed Alteration and addition on REM 10829, Off Steenberg Road, Tokai: MA HM/TOKAI/REM 10829

Case No: 21072704KB0826E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Henry Aikman was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is located on grade I site.
- The historic building is a PHS and not the whole site.
- CoCT supported the subdivision.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to conduct a site inspection on Thursday, 3 February 2022 at 11:00 (WP, SJ, DB and HvdM).

KB

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition Erf 1487, 15 Davenport Road, Vredehoek: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ VREDEHOEK/ERF 1487

Case No: 21092002KB0927E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Temba Jauch (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- 3D views showing the proposed new building in the streetscape were presented.
- The building is graded IIIC and located outside an HPOZ.
- CoCT did not support the proposal. GVHAG did not comment within 30 days commenting period.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the subject building has insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention. The replacement structure on Erf 1487, 15 Davenport Road, Vredehoek as shown on the plans dated 10 December 2021 prepared by Jauch Architects, is approved. The replacement development must be completed within five years of the permit for

demolitions date of issue, failing which, a new application to approve the replacement structure will be required in terms of the NHRA, regardless of whether the demolition of the existing structure has taken place or not. The period may be extended by HWC on good cause shown, provided that the application for the extension is made prior to the lapsing of the approval referred to above.

KB

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 3551, 232 10th Street, Hermanus: NM HM/OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/HERMANUS/ ERF 3551

Case No: 21102109MS1102E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Andrew Greeff (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee (OHAC) did not support the application, they preferred an adaptive re-use option.
- The retention of the mature trees is encouraged and desired by the applicant.
- The site is ungraded and located inside an HPO.
- Heritage Officers' Meeting (HOMs): Request for illustration of the layers in terms of what was original and what were the later accretions in plan and elevation form.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition. All subsurface works and excavations are to be monitored by a professional archaeologist.

MS

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 25886, 21 Scott Road, Observatory: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ OBSERVATORY / ERF 25886

Case No: 21070511SB0708E

Application forms and relevant documentation prepared by Ms Bridget O'Donoghue was tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Rushdi Abrahams (property owner), Ms Tamar Shem-Tov (CoCT) and Ms Bridget O'Donoghue were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is inside an HPO.
- CoCT and OCA have not supported the unauthorized demolition.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee agreed on reconstruction of the dwelling. A heritage agreement is to be entered into between HWC and the applicant for the re-construction in accordance with the recommendations of the heritage consultant contained in the report dated 17 January 2022 prepared by Bridget O'Donoghue along with the appointment of a heritage practitioner to monitor the construction and submit a closeout report within 60 days after completion.

SB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1637, 43 Exner Avenue, Vredehoek: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ VREDEHOEK/ERF 1637

Case No: 21071904 KB0719E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Adelaide Combrink (CoCT) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The apartment concerned forms part of an intact Grade IIIB Art Deco block. The corner window on the northern elevation, along with its associated post, is a significant, and important, component of the architecture of the building as a whole.
- The Committee has no objection to proposed internal alterations.
- The building is graded IIIB and located outside an HPOZ.

- CoCT does not support the proposal.
- CIBRA supported the proposal. GVHAG did not comment within 30 days commenting period.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to refuse the application since aluminium windows cannot replicate steel. Any replacement of windows is to be like for like.

KB

13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, PTN 10 + 13 of Farm 30, Nooitgedagt, Oudtshoorn: NM HM / EDEN / OUDTSHOORN / SHAMMAH VALLEY / PTN 10 + 13 OF NOOITGEDAGT FARM 30

Case No: 21111909SJ1129E

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

Mr Henry Paine (architect) and Mr Neels Nel (property owner) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee requires further refinements of the fenestration and door elements They recommend that cues should be taken from the previous site inspection reports and publications available (photographs in Hans Fransen's book).
- The site is recommended Grade II or IIIA resource and is situated outside an HPO.
- Heritage Oudtshoorn Erfenis and Municipality overall in support but with some thoughts for consideration. Simon van der Stel Southern Cape supports the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee agrees with the applicant's request to split the internal and external works application. A revised set of drawing reflecting the internal modifications will be required for approval by HWC.

SJ

**13.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 54891, 4 Eyton Road, Claremont: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT / ERF 54891**

Case No: 21112606SJ1126E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Sneha Jhupsee introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is Grade IIIC resource and is situated outside an HPO.
- CoCT did not comment within 30 days commenting period.
- Upper Claremont Residents & Ratepayers Association and Heritage Conservation Body objected to the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is concerned about the interface with Eyton Road and the proximity of the alteration to the boundary. The Committee requires a photomontage of the streetscape accurately depicting the visual impact along with heights of the neighbouring buildings. In terms of design the Committee is concerned about the junction between the existing house and the proposed addition. The Committee requires the applicant to relook at this and to be present when this matter comes before the Committee again.

SJ

**13.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 10685, 55 Main Road, Fish Hoek: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/FISHHOEK/ERF 10685**

Case No: 19090206TZ1119E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Dr Carnie Matisonn (developer) and Mr Paul Luck (architect) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Comments were made around the raising of the parapet and insertion of a 3rd storey with associated windows on the façade (resulting in four levels - ground floor +3).
- Concerns were raised about the suitability and legality of the rectangular structure that has been added to the north of the rounded façade.
- The elevations do not show the large antennas mounted on the upper part of the parapet.
- The site is graded IIIC and falls outside an HPO.
- CoCT and Fish Hoek Valley Residents and Ratepayers Association supported the proposal.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requires clarification on the legality and approval status of the timber structures on the northern façade. The application cannot proceed until this has been determined. The Committee also requires a distinction between what has been illegally built and when the transgression/s occurred, and to distinguish this from proposed new work that has not yet been built.

TZ

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations, ERF 68853, 82 Sussex Road, Wynberg: NM HM/WYNBERG/ERF 68853

Case No: 21531102RG1119E

The matter was removed from the agenda.

RG

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 Wupperthal Application Feedback

The Committee reported back on the site inspection that was undertaken on 21 January 2022.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee will prepare a draft report for internal distribution by next meeting.

SJ

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

**20.1 Proposed New Agricultural Werf and Associated Buildings Kleinbosch Farm, Dal Josaphat,
Paarl: NM
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/FARM 1576 PORRTION 9**

Case No: 21091320SB1004E

HIA and associated documentation prepared by Anne-Marie Fick were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee decided to undertake a joint site inspection on Friday, 28 January 2022 at 11:00 (HvdM and SJ).

SB

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 15:25

24. DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

10 February 2022

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

Annexure S11

BELCOM Site Inspection Report

Proposed Additions and Alterations on Boschendal Cellar building, off R310, Dwars River Valley Farm 10, 167 Stellenbosch

HWC Case Number: 21090305

Nature of Application: S.34 NHRA – alterations & additions.

Date of Site Visit: Wed, 12 January 2022, 11:00-12:30.

HWC Belcom Reps: Graham Jacobs, Walter Peters, Shawn Johnston & Hélène van der Merwe.

Met on site by: Heritage practitioners Sarah Winter & Mike Scurr; Architect Jacques; Landscape architect Werner; Boschendal representative ALSO, Stellenbosch Interest Group (SIG) Bertha Hayes & Patricia Botha; and Stellenbosch Municipality: Kate Robinson & Kaiser Makati.

Grading: NHS; PHS (confirmation required as to whether any part of the proposals fall within the NHS area).

Reasons for the Site Inspection: The purpose of the site inspection was to view the proposed interventions in situ for information purposes only, especially after SIG had expressed grave reservations with a determination to appeal. No discussions regarding the merits of the proposals were conducted.

OBSERVATIONS

This was a proposal for remodeling the additions by Gabriel Fagan of c1974 and certain subsequent kitchen and restaurant alterations by Philip Briel Architects of 2014: all at the back of the historic cellar building.

In particular, the flat roof of the restaurant is proposed to be replaced with a roof of double pitch and open ceiling, separated from the historic building by a glazed strip. The glazed side wall of the restaurant is to become a solid gable end, which visibility from the werf is questioned, as is the metal roof covering and the timber siding to the gable.

It was pointed out by the architect that certain details of the plans had been superseded e.g. the authentic window at the restaurant entrance would stay and not become a throughway & that the new gable ends could be faced with open timber boarding in either SA Pine or Ash.

The landscape architect explained the pathway to the inner perimeter to the werf, which would be of stabilized decomposed granite with no steps, to facilitate wheeled access.

CONCLUSIONS

While the form and spatial intentions of the design proposal are acceptable, questions remain regarding finishes and detail of exterior treatment - the longevity and sustainability of the proposed timber cladding to the new gables (south west elevation), as is the proposed treatment of the façade including the proposed pergola and colonnade facing onto the garden (south east elevation). Landscaping: Similarly, the need for the continuous pathway is acceptable/questioned, especially on the garden end of the werf.