

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape  
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**

**Commenced at 08:30 and held on Thursday, 14 October 2021 via  
Microsoft Teams**



**1. Opening and Welcome**

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Committee Members:**

Mr Dennis Belter (DB)  
Prof Walter Peters (WP)  
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)  
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)  
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)

**Members of Staff:**

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)  
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)  
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)  
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)  
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)  
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)  
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)  
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS)  
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)  
Mr Michael Janse van Rensburg (MJvR)

**Visitors:**

Mr Tyron Bloch  
Mr Chris Snelling  
Mr Philip Smith  
Mr Carlos De Mendonca  
Mr Joshua Jacobs  
Mr Ashley Lillie  
Ms Lize Malan  
Mr Timothy Maclean  
Mr Ebrahim Ryklief  
Ms Wendy Wilson  
Ms Michelle Silva  
Mr Nic Vester  
Ms Sylvie Vantillard

Mr Bruce Burmeister  
Ms Teresa Thomson  
Ms Alex Edmayr  
Mr Steven Boers  
Ms Renee Worthington-Smith  
Mr Gordon Metz  
Ms Oliver Vantillard Hurt  
Mr Johan Cornelius  
Mr Mike Scurr  
Mr Alexis van der Merwe  
Mr Christof Albertyn  
Ms Elize Mendelsohn

**3. Apologies**

Ms Mishkah Collier (MC)

**Absent**

None

**4. Approval of Agenda**

**4.1 Dated 14 October 2021.**

The Committee approved the agenda dated 14 October 2021.

## **5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings**

### **5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 29 September 2021**

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 29 September 2021 and resolved to approve them with minor amendments.

### **5.2 BELCom Confidential Minutes dated 29 September 2021**

The Committee reviewed the confidential minutes dated 29 September 2021 and resolved to approve them without amendments.

## **6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:**

### **6.1 Recusals**

- GJ: item 13.2

## **7. Confidential Matters**

None

## **8. Administrative Matters**

### **8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

PM reported back on the outcomes of the following appeals matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 334, 21 Victoria Road, Bantry Bay
- Proposed Total Demolition Erf 1713, 55 Cearn Drive, Knysna
- Proposed Total Demolition Erf 2291, 21 Dal Road, Camps Bay
- Proposed Total Demolition Erf 53936, 24 Claremont Avenue, Claremont

### **8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:**

- Erf 2139, 213 Main Road, Paarl

### **8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition**

None.

### **8.4 Feedback on Erf 8731, Droomers Garage, Main Street, Paarl**

The Committee is still waiting for a response from the case officer so that the matter can be resolved. It was noted that the heritage consultant has yet to clarify the matter.

### **8.5 Report back on meeting with HWC and Chair of BELCom**

The Chair reported back on a meeting he had had with the CEO and members of staff to discuss possible assistance staff could provide Committee in exploring means to reduce the lengths of meetings. This was in light of certain previous meetings that had lasted for up to 12 hours.

### **8.6 Time taken for Committee meetings**

The Committee and staff discussed various means for expediting the processing of the cases tabled.

**8.7 The application of the Gees judgement**

The committee is concerned by the number of NHRA S.34 applications in which the CoCT looks to HWC to impose conditions on new developments in areas that are neither proposed nor declared heritage protection overlays (HPOs). It is therefore requested that staff address the matter with the CoCT as the current situation has potential to create uncertainty within the development sector. It is reminded that the application of the Gees judgment requires sound reasons substantiated, for example, by location of a site under consideration within such proposed or declared HPOs.

**9. Standing Items**

**9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports**

Nothing to report.

**9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings**

Nothing to report.

**9.3 Discussion of agenda**

Noted

**9.4 Proposed Site Inspections**

None

**9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken**

- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 50290, 15 Colinton Road, Newlands.

**10. Appointments**

The Committee noted the appointment for item 13.5 set for 09:00.

**MATTERS DISCUSSED**

**11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

**11.1 None**

## **12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

### **12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 50290, 15 Colinton Road, Newlands: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ NEWLANDS/ ERF 50290**

**Case No:** 21083101MS0903E

The Committee members reported back on the site inspection undertaken on the 11 October 2021. See attached site inspection report in annexure SI1.

Mr Bruce Burmeister (architect), Ms Thomson (owner) and Mr Philip Smith (CoCT) were present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded not conservation worthy and is located outside an HPOZ.
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal.
- Newlands Residents' Association not supported.
- HOMs referred the matter to BELCom given the comments from Newlands Residents' Association.

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition application as the subject building has insufficient significance to warrant retention.

**MS**

### **12.2 Proposed Removal of Crane on Erf 10256, Tanker Basin, Monument Road, Table Bay Harbour: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ NEWLANDS/ ERF 50290**

**Case No:** 21052709SB0528E

Application form and relevant documentation prepared by Carlos De Mendonca was tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Carlos De Mendonca (applicant) and Mr Steven Boers (heritage consultant) were present and took part in the discussions.

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

Taking into account further information provided by the applicant regarding the significance of this structure the Committee resolved to approve its demolition as this will not negatively impact heritage significance.

**SB**

**12.3 Proposed Total Demolition Erf 10617, Corner Tabak and Station Street, Paarl: MA HM/PAARL/ERF 10617**

**Case No:** 21050609KB069E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Lize Malan (heritage consultant), Mr Christof Albertyn (architect) and Mr Nic Vester (developer) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC and borders the special character area.
- Drakenstein Municipality and Drakenstein Heritage Foundation supported the proposal.
- Paarl 300 did not support the proposal.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition on condition that the replacement development is substantially in accordance with the conceptual proposals indicated on drawings numbered 0133 – ERF31899 PAARL STATION – SK08 – HERITAGE – Sheet – A101 – SITE PLAN and 0133 – ERF31899 PAARL STATION – SK08 – HERITAGE, both dated 7 October 2021 and as underpinned by the heritage indicators.

The final proposals to be subject to the approval of Drakenstein Municipality (heritage section). The Committee expects the submission to include a detailed soft and hard landscaping plan that clearly indicates ground level linkages with the adjacent public realm and that mitigates potential negative impacts from parking both within and surrounding the development.

Should the site not be developed in accordance with the approved plans within 3 years of the granting of the demolition permit, any proposed development thereafter must be resubmitted to HWC for approval.

**KB**

**12.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 353, Sea Point West: NM  
HM/SEA POINT/ERF 353**

**Case No:** 21030811KB0920E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Ashley Lillie (heritage consultant), Ms Elize Mendelsohn (CoCT) and Mr Gordon Metz (Sea Point Fresnaye Bantry Bay Ratepayers and Residents Association) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC and is located outside an HPO.
- City of Cape Town and SFB does not support the proposal.
- Sea Point for All did not comment within 30 days commenting period.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition of the subject building as it has insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

The Committee resolved with two members dissenting not to invoke the so-called Gees Judgement as the surrounding area was not considered to constitute a heritage resource, while recognising the significance of the adjacent Sea Point Fire Station and old municipal show rooms.

**KB**

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 47721, 4 Lea Road, Rondebosch: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ ERF 47721**

**Case No:** 21071501XM0813E

Application documentation were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Renée Worthington-Smith (project manager) and Joshua Jacobs (architectural technologist) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and falls outside an HPOZ.
- HRS supports the proposal in principle.
- HOMs referred the matter to BELCom for their expertise.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee reiterates its support in principle for the covered veranda. Concerns regarding the refinement of detailing remain. The following is therefore still required:

1. Details of the form and junction with the existing structure. Oversailing eaves should be considered.
2. All elevations to include the entire building to enable a better understanding of the architectural context of the proposal.
3. Reconsideration of the 1:50 scale sections that are currently inconsistent in terms of roof slope.

The applicant to investigate lowering the roof to below the adjoining eaves line and plaster string moulding (head height permitting).

**XM**

**13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 20553, 3 Queens Street, Durbanville: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / DURBANVILLE/ ERF 20553**

**Case No:** 21051301MS0916E

GJ recused himself and logged off from MS Teams. The Committee nominated HvdM to chair this item.

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee supports the initiative to return this significant building back to original detail as described in the motivation document.
- The Committee strongly recommends that the north facing modern window of the proposed open plan office to be replaced with a window matching proportions of historic windows.
- The site is graded IIIB and is located outside an HPOZ.
- Durbanville Heritage Society supports the proposal.
- Simon van der Stel Foundation supports the proposal.
- Durbanville Community Forum did not comment within commenting period time.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

1. The Committee requires that the lean-to extension visible on north elevation (proposed open plan office) be amended in terms of roof detail to match historic detail in other words to fit underneath the main house eaves.
2. The Committee requires that the south facing proposed dormer window be more consistent in terms of the fenestration being sympathetic to the character of the house.

**MS**

**13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 12235, 312 Main Road, Eastcliff, Hermanus: NM HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 12235**

**Case No:** 21060304MS0906E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Ms Alex Edmayr (candidate architect representing Mr Andrew Finlayson, architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC and inside an HPO and is located adjacent to the Hermanus cliff path.
- It is a significant building with fine interiors which may warrant a Gr IIIB grading.
- The approved building plans are dated 19 Feb 2019 and an HWC permit was issued on 24 January 2020.
- Building work has commenced, however, the documentation supplied did not clarify which parts of the building work has been completed and which not. The issues at hand appeared to be the number of columns and their shape (whether square or round) at the south balcony addition – refer Minutes of the Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee dated 29 July 2021, item 6.5.
- Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee supports proposal.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The applicant is to provide the Committee with a set of drawings clearly distinguishing between what is currently proposed and what has previously been approved in terms of a valid permit from HWC. The documentation must include all elevations. A revised 3D model reflecting the current proposals in relation to the previous 3D model for the southern extension is strongly recommended.

The applicant also to provide photographs of the buildings in their current state including previously approved alterations already completed. This must include views from the cliff path.

**MS**



**13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 97982, 10 King Street, Newlands: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ NEWLANDS/ ERF 97982**

**Case No:** 19120902LB1212E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Timothy Maclean (on behalf of the owner), Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant) and Mr Ebrahim Rykief (author of the plans) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIC and is located outside an HPOZ.
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal.
- Newlands Residents' Association does not support the proposal.
- HOMs referred the matter to BELCom given the objection from the Newlands Residents' Association.

**HELD OVER:**

This matter is held over to enable the heritage consultant to be properly briefed so that he can advise the owner accordingly. This will include the provision of whatever additional information is required to enable BELCom to apply its mind appropriately.

**MS**

**13.5 Proposed Minor Works, Erf 54613, Herschel High, Herschel Road, Claremont: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 54613**

**Case No:** 21091321XM0913E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Mr Tyron Bloch (architect) was present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIIB and falls outside an HPOZ.
- HOMS referred the matter to BELCom for their expertise.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee supports the proposed reconstruction in principle but requires the following information before it can approve the work:

1. A detailed method statement of how the work will be conducted.
2. Specifications of the materials and elements to be used in the reconstruction.

3. Particulars regarding the skills of the contractor for this kind of work including examples of similar work done in the past, if possible.
4. The exercising of a monitoring brief by a suitably skilled and experienced heritage professional with a detailed closeout report submitted to HWC within 30 days of practical completion.

The Committee strongly recommends that an architect with appropriate heritage experience involving structures of this nature be engaged to assist.

**XM**

**13.6 Proposed Alteration and Additions on ERF 32001, 21 Nieuwe Street, Prince Albert: NM HM/PRINCE ALBERT/ERF 32001**

**Case No:** 21083107KB0913E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Michelle Silva (owner) and Ms Sylvie Vantillard (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC.
- Prince Albert Cultural Foundation supported the proposal.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee does not have concerns with the proposals in principle: It is mainly a case of how it is done while ensuring that removal of old fabric is minimized. It is therefore strongly recommended that the applicant engage the services of a suitably experienced heritage architect to assist. This should include specifications regarding compatible mortars plasters and renders. Revised proposals to be submitted to HWC for final approval.

**KB**

**14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**14.1** None

**15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**15.1** None

**16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**16.1** None

**17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**17.1** None

**18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

18.1 None

**19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

19.1 None

**20 OTHER MATTERS**

**20.1 Tribunal Directive on the Proposed Restoration, Erf 55307, 43 Vineyard Road, Claremont: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 55307**

**Case No:** 20101305SM1013E

Tribunal Directive - RSA conceptual design and heritage indicators were tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Mr Mike Scurr (architect), Ms Wendy Wilson (architect), Mr Alexis van der Merwe (Upper Claremont Ratepayers Residence Association) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

**COMMENT:**

The Committee generally prefers the direction that concept design alternative 2 (the 'commercial alternative') provides in terms of enabling stronger spatial links with the historic building and the well (amongst others).

The Committee has no objection in principle to the new structure having a clearly contemporary architectural expression provided that it presents a neutral backdrop to the historic building, which must remain the focus of the new development.

There are no concerns in principle regarding the scale of the new building as conceptually presented. Some concerns were expressed regarding the rectilinear massing of the roofline although some members did not regard this as a concern.

The physical integrity of the well needs to be respected and is one of the reasons for the in-principle support of the 'commercial alternative'.

**WD**

21.1 None

**22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

**23. CLOSURE**

The meeting closed at: 16:30

**24. DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**

28 October 2021

**MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

APPROVED

## Annexure S11

### **BELCOM Site Inspection Report - Erf No 50290, 15 Colinton Road, Newlands**

Submitted by Hélène van der Merwe

**HWC Case Number:** 21083101MS0903E

**Nature of Application:** S.34 NHRA – application for total demolition.

**Date of Site Visit:** Monday, 11<sup>th</sup> October 2021 at 14h30

**HWC Belcom Representatives:** Walter Peters, Shawn Johnston, Hélène van der Merwe

**Met on site by:** Applicant / Owner – Mr Thomson (?), Architect – Mr Bruce Burmeister

**Grading:** Not in a HPOZ. Area not yet graded (tbc).

**Zoning:** SR1

#### **Reasons for the Site Inspection:**

The Newlands Residents Association submitted a letter of objection to the proposed total demolition and motivated for recognition and protection of the heritage character of the surrounding area. It seems that this enclave has not yet been graded by the City's Heritage authority.

The City of CT had no objection to the proposed total demolition.

The purpose of the site inspection is to assess the property itself and the character of the context to determine potential heritage significance.

#### **Findings of the Site Inspection**

##### **No 15 Colinton Road – the house and property**

This early 20thC house has been somewhat altered and functions as two independent units with office space facing Colinton Road and a residential unit located in the back of the house being accessed from Oakdale Road. The veranda facing Colinton Road has been enclosed and windows are modern, but the original form of roof and projecting window bays are intact. As a corner house the gable near the corner and facing Oakdale Rd is an important part of the street facing façade and remains intact with its porthole ventilator and projecting window bay with original timber window. The character of the original street facing facades could be recovered.

The interior, despite some alteration, retains legibility of the original plan and many intact period elements such as original timber flooring, period doors and architraves, including the front door with side and top lights and patterned glass. The living room contains a fireplace with a marble surround.

The division between the front (used as offices) and the back (residential) consist of a few doors paneled off within the framing provided by the architraves and is therefore a reversible intervention.

#### **Context**

The area surrounding No 15 Colinton Road has a distinct character in terms of consistency of street presentation, form and roofscape, with mostly modest rectangular single-storey hipped and tiled roof buildings

set fairly close together and at similar setback from the street. In particular No 15, despite alterations, still forms a legible ensemble with the neighbouring buildings at No 13 & 11.

The immediate area could be seen as defined by Colinton, Oakdale and Kildare Roads. However, when looking at an aerial view the scale, pattern and grain of this local area is typical of the street and built form pattern of a much wider area especially when considering residential blocks. Insertions that are by turn similar to the historic early 20thC architectural expression or at times clearly contemporary can be observed with the latter examples more common on the main routes and towards the commercial area to form transitional areas.

It is highly evident that the overall scale, pattern and roofscape of the area has been respected by recent insertions. In the heart of the Colinton / Oakdale / Kildare enclave the residential development along Elgin Terrace consists of double storey apartments arranged as a series of rectangular buildings with hipped roofs and some plaster detailing and serve to reinforce the character of the area. Along Oakdale Road the Newlands Cricket ground buildings offer a three-storey edge, while a contemporary recent building of similar height sets up a transition towards the Claremont commercial area.

Residential properties that are being used for business tend to open up directly to the street (mostly to allow parking) allowing the original houses to form a strong presentation to the street. Properties still being used as private residences display a range of fences, walls and hedges. Though this reduces legibility of some of the street facing facades, the consistency of larger forms including roofs, chimneys and window bays is clearly discernible.

#### CONCLUSIONS:

- The house at No 15, though altered, can be seen as contributing positively to a dominant built form pattern of the street and the area.
- Its location as a corner site should be taken into account. The existing building, while presenting its front towards Colinton Road to link up with the rest of the street does not neglect its aspect towards Oakdale Road and the corner.
- The alterations that have been made to No 15 are not irreversible. The street and the wider area have a consistent character, with transitions in terms of height and architectural expression towards the commercial area.
- The committee members support the views expressed by the Newlands Residents Association in terms of the heritage significance and character of the area.

#### ILLUSTRATIONS:

##### No 15 Colinton Road

**Interior** – showing intact floors, doors & architraves, windows.



Back of house – gabled & lean-to extension.



**No 15 Colinton Road**

**Exterior –**

No 15 & houses beyond showing repeated setback, roof & window bay pattern.



No.11 and No.13





No.15



No 15 - Side gable facing Oakdale Road, near the corner

**Colinton Road streetscapes**





**Oakdale Road Adjacent to No 15 Colinton**



**Context Aerial View**



**Some recent buildings**



**Complex of double storey apartment buildings along Elgin Terrace**



**seen from Kildare Rd**



**Corner Elgin Terrace & Oakdale, near Protea Rd, very recent new building directly opposite the three storey buildings edging the cricket ground.**