

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**

**Commenced at 08:30 and held on Thursday, 13 May 2021 via
Microsoft Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 08:30 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)
Mr Dennis Belter (DB)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Prof Walter Peters (WP)
Ms Mishkah Collier (MC)
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)

Members of Staff:

Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CAP)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM)
Ms Mureerah Solomon (MS)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)

Visitors:

Mr Peter Buttgens
Mr Kevin Stein
Mr Clive Theunissen
Ms Melanie Attwell
Mr Pierre Swanepoel
Ms Claire Abrahamse
Mr Alexis van der Merwe
Mr Conrad Janse van Rensburg

3. Apologies

None

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 13 May 2021.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 13 May 2021.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 28 April 2021

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 28 April 2021 and resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

6.1 Recusals

MC: item 13.1

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

CAP reported back on the outcomes of the following appeals and tribunals matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1430, 30 Bradwell Road, Vredehoek, CT. S34
- Tribunal: Proposed Demolition, Erven 55165 and 55166,8 & 10 Feldhausen Road, Claremont
- The Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 405, 11 Oldfield Road, Sea Point
- Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 768. Clydebank Road, Green Point, CT. S.34-A&A

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

- Erf 25886, 21 Scott Street, Observatory
- Bellair Mansions, Cnr of Wexford and Bellair Road, Vredehoek

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

Nothing further to report.

8.4 Recording dates of previous items on the agenda

The Committee notes the severe strain that staff are currently under due to recent resignations. This matter will be pursued further once staff capacity has improved.

8.5 Upcoming Council meeting

The chair requested members to contact him regarding any specific BELCom items that need to be raised at the upcoming Council meeting.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports

The remedial work to the gantry cranes on the Collier Jetty in the V&A Waterfront has been completed, DLB will submit the close-out report for the next BELCom meeting.

9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.3 Discussion of agenda

Noted.

10. Appointments

10.1 None.

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 None

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 27629, 22 Collingwood Road, Observatory: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/OBSERVATORY/ERF 27629

Case No: 21011108KB0407E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Peter Buttgens (heritage consultant), Mr Pierre Swanepoel (architect) and Mr Kevin Stein (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site falls immediately outside an HPOZ.
- The property falls at a strategic juncture between residential and commercial/industrial areas.

RECORD OF DECISION:

1. The Committee concurs with the applicant's heritage consultant that the existing factory building on the site has insufficient significance to warrant retention.
2. The Committee supports the heritage indicators and the manner in which the proposals have responded to them taking into account surrounding development densities and the site's strategic position at the interface between residential and industrial realms.

The Committee consequently approves the application as not substantially impacting heritage significance.

KB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 56039, 6 Paradise View, Claremont: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 56039

Case No: 20121003KB0324E

MC recused herself and logged off from MS Teams.

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Claire Abrahamse and Mr Alexis van der Merwe (Upper Claremont Ratepayers and Residents Association) were present and took part in the discussions.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that there are inconsistencies between the heights of the new extension as indicated in the elevation and rendered 3D photomontage. This needs to be clarified to provide an accurate representation of the impact of this extension on the Manor House.

The Committee therefore requires revised elevations and/or photomontages (as the case may be) to clarify the matter. The Committee would also like to see at least one more photomontage that is consistent with the view provided in p2 of the heritage consultant's April 2021 supplementary report. Further ground level montages from within the forecourt and from Paradise View would be encouraged.

KB

13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 27957, 5 Franklin Street, Observatory: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/OBERVATORY/ERF 27957

Case No: 20102209ND1029E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Melanie Attwell (heritage consultant) and Mr Conrad Janse van Rensburg (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the revised application as indicated on drawings numbered 2005 04.1-A-1 , 2005 04.1-A-2 , 20005 04. 1-A-3 dated 5 November 2020 prepared by TwoFiveFive Architects as not impacting negatively on heritage resources.

SB

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

**20.1 Unauthorized work on Erf 2342, 155 Main Street, Paarl: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ ERF 2342**

Case No: N/A

Request to issue a Compulsory Repair Order to be tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonisile introduced the case.

Mr Clive Theunissen (Drakenstein Municipality) was present and took part in the discussions.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The whole property is a declared PHS.
- An oak tree fell down in a storm approximately a year ago, causing damage to a 10-15m length of the historic boundary wall. The fallen tree was removed by the municipality. However it was determined that the tree had been on private land, i.e. the responsibility of the property owner. The owner has not responded to requests from the Drakenstein Municipality to do remedial work to the historic wall.
- The wall is built of soft clay bricks and in danger of further deterioration due to weather exposure.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved that the owner of the property situated at Erf 2342, 155 Main Street, Paarl be issued with a compulsory repair order in terms of S 45(1)(b) of the NHRA requiring the damaged wall to be repaired within 30 days of the date of notification. These repairs are to be conducted using only compatible materials that must include traditional lime mortars and renders. This work is to be monitored by an architect with appropriate heritage

experience who must submit a close-out report on the work within 30 days of practical completion.

The owner's attention is also drawn to S 45(2) of the NHRA:

" Subject to sub-section 3, upon failure of the owner to comply with the terms of an order under subsection (1) within the specified time, the authority which served the order may itself take such steps as may be necessary for the repair or maintenance thereof and recover the costs from the owner."

KB

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 11:45

24. DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

26 May 2021

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____