

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape  
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**



**Commenced at 08:30 and held on Thursday, 11 November 2021 via  
Microsoft Teams**

**1. Opening and Welcome**

**Note:** Due to the Chairperson, Mr. Graham Jacobs, being unable to attend the meeting and tendering apologies, Ms Waseefa Dhansay presided over the election of an Acting Chairperson in terms of the rule 12(5) of the Rules of Order and Conduct at Meetings of HWC. The Committee elected Mr Dennis Belter to chair the meeting.

The Acting Chair, Mr Dennis Belter, officially opened the meeting at 08:45 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Committee Members:**

Mr Dennis Belter (DB) - Acting chairperson  
Prof Walter Peters (WP)  
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)  
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM)  
Mr Mike Scurr (MS) co-opted at 09:30 till 10:00

**Members of Staff:**

Ms Waseefa Dhansay  
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)  
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)  
Ms Natalie Kendrick (ND)  
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)  
Mr Reagon Fortune (RF)  
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)  
Ms Muneerah Solomon (MS)  
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)  
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)  
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM)  
Ms Chane Herman (CH)  
Ms Corne Nortje (CN)  
Mr Robin George (RG)  
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)

**Visitors:**

Ms Annemie Vermeulen  
Mr Bruce Wilson  
Ms Elbe Cooper  
Mr Brina Snyders  
Mr Giancarlo Bruno  
Mr Craig Thomson  
Mr Johan Cornelius  
Mr Tinus Olivier  
Mr Dieter Bossow  
Mr Jan Douglas  
Mr Philip Smith  
Ms Clotilda Garatsa  
Mr Henry Aikman

Mr Temba Jauch  
Ms Melani Erasmus  
Mr Giancarlo Bruno  
Dr Stephen Townsend  
Ms Kim Whitaker  
Prof Berni Searle  
Mr Sean May  
Ms Bridget O'Donoghue  
Mr Niel Jonker  
Ms Wendy Wilson  
Ms Traci Viljoen  
Mr Mike Scurr

**3. Apologies**

Ms Mishkah Collier (MC)  
Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)

**Absent**

None

**4. Approval of Agenda**

**4.1 Dated 11 November 2021.**

The Committee approved the agenda dated 11 November 2021.

**5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings**

**5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 14 October 2021**

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 14 October 2021 and resolved to approve them with amendments.

**6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:**

**6.1 Recusals**

None.

**7. Confidential Matters**

None.

**8. Administrative Matters**

**8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

PM reported back on the following appeals matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition Erf 2291, 21 Dal Road, Camps Bay
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 53936, 24 Claremont Avenue, Claremont
- Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 12255, 230 Victoria Street, Woodstock
- Proposed Total Demolition on Erven 1299 & 1300, 77 & 79 Shortmarket Street, Cape Town
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 12563, 26 Coronation Road, Walmer Estate
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1726, 1 Rowan Street, Stellenbosch
- Proposed demolition of Erf 3585, 18 Queen Victoria Street, Corner Keerom Street Cape Town
- Notification of Intent to Develop: Proposed Development of New Dwellings of Erf 2090, 50 Olievenhout Avenue (S.38(1) of the NHRA)

**8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:**

Nothing to report.

**8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition**

None.

**8.4 Feedback on Erf 8731, Droomers Garage, Main Street, Paarl**

Heritage officer followed up with the heritage consultant but has not received a response. The committee requires the information in writing by the next BELCom meeting.

**8.5 Illegal Work, Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 5372, 179 Voortrek Street, Swellendam**

- No formal application has been submitted to HWC.
- Work has commenced on site, approval granted by the local authority.
- The owner has undertaken to replace the roof with “like-for-like” thatch.
- Given the nature of the work (reconstruction after fire damage), the committee is of the view that charges will not be considered.
- HWC will await the formal application submission to HWC, including photographic evidence of the completed work.

**9. Standing Items**

**9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports**

Nothing to report.

**9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings**

Nothing to report.

**9.3 Discussion of agenda**

Noted.

**9.4 Proposed Site Inspections**

- Conservation Management Plan for Rhodes Cottage, on Erven 87087 and 87082, 246 Main Road, Muizenberg
- Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf151025, 53 Fisherman’s Flats, Kalk Bay

**9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken**

None.

**10. Appointments**

None.

## **MATTERS DISCUSSED**

### **11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

#### **11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 699, Somerset College, Bredell Road, Somerset West: MA**

##### **HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SOMERSET WEST/ ERF 699**

**Case No:** 21071407SB0817E

Application form and relevant documentation prepared by Annemie Vermeulen were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnard introduced the case.

Ms. Annemie Vermeulen (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The new fabric abuts the existing; this approach agreed.

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as detailed in drawing numbers 20-06-ST4-01 Rev 0, 20-06-ST4-02 Rev 1, 20-06-ST4-03 Rev 1, 20-06-ST4-04 Rev 0 dated 19 October 2021 and prepared by 2AD Space Architects Inc.

**SB**

### **12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

#### **12.1 Proposed Total Demolition Erf 1487, 15 Davenport Road, Vredehoek: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ VREDEHOEK/ERF 1487**

**Case No:** 21092002KB0927E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Temba Jauch (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIIC and located outside an HPOZ.
- City of Cape Town does not support the proposal.
- CIBRA and Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group did not comment within the 30-day commenting period.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

1. The Committee requires a detailed photomontage of the streetscape with illustrations of how the proposed building fits into the neighbourhood.
2. The Committee requires engagement with I&APs.

KB

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1491, 11 Davenport Road, Vredehoek: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/VREDEHOEK/ERF 1491**

**Case No:** 16101306HB1102E

Motivation and amended drawings were tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Mr Bruce Wilson (architect), Ms Melani Erasmus (architect), Ms Elbe Cooper (representing owner) and Mr Brina Snyders (representing owner) and were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The application is for changes to a previously approved proposal for a replacement building following demolition of an existing house.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee requires that the verticality of the staircase tower at the top is further articulated. The revised proposal to be submitted to HOMs for approval.

WD

**12.3 Proposed Total Demolition Erf 12011 Re, Woodstock: NM  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 12011**

**Case No:** 21081212KB0923E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue (heritage consultant) and Mr Dieter Bossow (project manager) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee commended the team for a thorough application.
- The site is graded Not Conservation Worthy.
- City of Cape Town and Woodstock Residents Association supported the proposal.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition application and proposed replacement structure as detailed on drawings numbered 2000/02/03, 2000/02/04 2000/02/05 2000/02/07 2000/02/07,2000/03/01,2000/03/02,2000/03/03,2000/03/04,2000/00/01, 2000/00/02,2000/00/03dated and prepared by CCNIA Architects.

KB

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 977, 11 & 13 Virginia Avenue, Vredehoek: MA HM/APE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ VREDEHOEK/ERF 997**

**Case No:** 21061711 KB0728E

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Dr Stephen Townsend (heritage consultant), Mr Giancarlo Bruno (developer), Ms Kim Whitaker (Virginia Avenue Home Residents Association), Mr Craig Thomson (Virginia Avenue Home Residents Association), Prof Berni Searle (Virginia Avenue Home Residents Association) and Mr Mike Scurr (observer) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The overall height of the building remains contentious however this is a town planning issue.
- The site is located within the proposed HPOZ.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as having met the previous recommendation with one-member dissenting.

KB

**13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 97982, 10 King Street, Newlands: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ NEWLANDS/ ERF 97982**

**Case No:** 19120902LB1212E

Application documentation was tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIC resource, in a proposed HPOZ and part of a semi-detached cottage.

- Alterations were made without a permit.
- The Newlands Residents Association objected to the unauthorised enclosure of the stoep.
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee recommends to the CEO of HWC that charges must be laid in terms of unauthorised work.

**MS**

**13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 178, 32 Church Street, Tulbagh: MA  
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ WITZENBERG/ TULBAGH/ERF 178**

**Case No:** 21041906KB0506E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Jayson Clark (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIA resource, in a HPOZ, and was restored post-earthquake.
- The current owner made some alterations without authorisation.
- The Committee supports the return of the Agterkamer to its former state but expressed concerns about how damaged yellowwood flooring would be dealt with.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the alteration as per drawings dated 20 September 2021 and prepared by PDM Architects. The reinstatement of the yellowwood floor to be done as per best heritage practice. The use of lime mortars and renders is required. A close-out report is to be submitted within 30 days of completion.

**KB**

**13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 44736, 18 Firth Road, Rondebosch: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ ERF 44736**

**Case No:** 21060805KB0830E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIC resource and not in a HPOZ.

- The loft addition shown in the application has already been completed.
- This constitutes unauthorised work.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee cannot condone unauthorised work. The Committee recommends that no charges to be laid.

KB

**13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on RE 4486, Erf 7669, Somerset Lodge, Somerset West: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SOMERSET WEST/RE 4486 ERF 7669**

**Case No:** 21071508KB0716E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant) and Mr Sean May (architect) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee discussed alteration's details to the historic building. While not opposed to the 'opening up' of this structure, the pattern of the proposed new folding doors is too inconsistent with each other.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as having met previous requirements. The proportions of the fenestration on the east elevation are to match those elsewhere in the intervention.

KB

**13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 994, 19 Voortrek Street, Swellendam: MA  
HM/OVERBRG/ SWELLENDAM/ERF 994**

**Case No:** 21060809KB0615E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Tinus Olivier (applicant) was present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building in question is located in the heritage protected Swellendam historic core.



- An application was made to replace the thatch roof with corrugated iron.
- Swellendam Heritage Association and Swellendam Municipality supported the proposal.
- Swellendam Residents objected to the proposal.
- The committee requested further information at the meeting on 28 July. However, the owner has completed the roof alteration in the meantime, constituting unauthorised work.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

A heritage agreement with HWC for reinstatement of the thatch is to be concluded within 30 days from date of notification, failing which criminal charges will be recommended.

KB

**13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 47721, 4 Lea Road, Rondebosch: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ ERF 47721**

**Case No:** 21071501XM0813E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is Grade IIIB resource outside a HPOZ.
- Details for the proposed addition was presented in the context of the main building.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as having met the previous requirements. The Committee recommends that the new lean-to roof eaves should project on the north and east elevation to match the west elevation.

XM

**13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 31888, Main Road, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 31888**

**Case No:** 21052006XM0527E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Mr Henry Aikman (heritage consultant) was present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Building 03 is a Grade IIIB resource and in a HPOZ.
- The applicant has decided to abandon the proposed alterations to building 03.

- Confirmation is required that As Built drawings accurately reflect the structure.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee requires a written statement from the heritage practitioner that the existing structure and works undertaken are accurately recorded on the drawings submitted. This statement can be submitted to HOMs.

**XM**

**13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 740, 25 Caledon Street, Camphersdrift, George: NM HM/ EDEN/ GEORGE/ ERF 740**

**Case No:** 21092717AM0928E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Ayanda Mdludlu introduced the case.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The George Municipality supported the application, made after building work had taken place.
- The George Heritage Trust and Simon van der Stel Foundation objected to the unauthorised work as having further negative impacts on the heritage significance of the streetscape and the integrity of the subject building, and recommended S.51 (NHRA) action.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee cannot condone illegal works and thus refuses the application. No S.51 (NHRA) letter can be issued.

**AM**

**13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 701-Re, 30 Montrose Avenue, Oranjezicht: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / ORANJEZICHT/ 701ERF RE**

**Case No:** 21092211MS0923E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Jan Douglas (architect) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The subject building is rated Not Conservation Worthy and inside a HPOZ.
- The applicant's first submission was supported by CIBRA but not by the City.

- The second revised submission was supported by the City but not by CIBRA.
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee deliberated between option 1 and 2 and resolved to approve option 1 (with band of clerestory windows) as detailed on drawing numbered 2007/100 and 2007/101 Revision A dated 01/03/2021 and prepared by KLG Architects.

**MS**

**13.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 151025, 53 Fisherman's Flats, Kalk Bay: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ KALK BAY/ERF 151025**

**Case No:** 21092306KB0927E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Mike Scurr (heritage consultant), Ms Wendy Wilson (heritage consultant), Mr Niel Jonker (owner), Mr Philip Smith (CoCT) and Ms Traci Viljoen (interested and affected party) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The flats are a Grade IIIA resource and located within an HPOZ.
- Unauthorised work has taken place at one of the flats.
- The subsequent building plan application was not supported by the City.
- Objections to the unauthorised work was raised by residents, Docomomo and the Kalk Bay & St. James Residents and Ratepayers.
- The Committee acknowledged the complexities of the situation and the context.

**HELD OVER:**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Thursday, 25 November 2021 (DB, GJ, WP, HvdM, SJ).

**KB**

**13.12 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 26527, 1 Milner Road, Observatory: NM  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ OBSERVATORY/ERF 26527**

**Case No:** 21092306KB0927E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Johan Cornelius (heritage consultant) and Ms Clotilda Garatsa (town planning) were present and took part in the presentation and discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIB resource and located within a HPOZ.
- Proposed work to the main house is internal and will not impact street-facing exterior facades.
- The Committee did not object to the proposed work in the area behind the house (removal of a shed, part of the garage and construction of a small room not attached to the main house).

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application for internal modification of the main dwelling, demolition of the outhouse and its replacement structure as detailed on drawing numbered LUM -102 dated 03 February 2021 prepared by Fusion architects.

**KB**

**13.13 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 25245, Bulties Way, Somerset West: NM  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SOMERSET WEST/ERF 25245**

**Case No:** 21053107KB0623E

Application documents were tabled.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIC resource and located outside a HPOZ.
- The drawings show Servants Quarters which were on the property when the current owner bought it. This part of the application is seen as unauthorised work.
- The application also includes two proposed additions to the main house (not yet constructed).

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee cannot condone illegal work thus will not comment on the outbuilding (servants' quarters). Whilst the Committee has reservations about the aesthetics, the positions of the proposed additions will not affect the street façade. The Committee approves the application as per drawing no 2021-03-Fei1001-02 REV4 dated 16 July 2012 and prepared by Jacques Du Toit as not affecting the heritage resources as detailed.

**KB**

**13.14 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 3047, 21 Saviour Street, Oudtshoorn: NM HM/CENTRAL KAROO/ OUDTSHOORN/ERF 3047**

**Case No:** 21063108KB0623E

Application documents were tabled.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The application documents are incomplete. The matter is referred to the case officer and HOMs to determine if the matter is to return to BELCom.

**KB**

**13.15 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 20553, 3 Queen Street, Durbanville: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / DURBANVILLE/ ERF 20553**

**Case No:** 21051301MS0916E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade IIIB resource and located outside a HPOZ.
- The Durbanville Heritage Society and Simon van der Stel Foundation support the restoration work and had provided comment and suggestions.
- The Committee recommends that the modern horizontal window in the north elevation be replaced with a window of vertical proportions if possible.
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal.
- Durbanville Community Forum missed the 30-day commenting period.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as having met the previous requirements.

**MS**

**14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**14.1** None

**15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**15.1** None

**16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**16.1** None

**17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**17.1** None

**18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

18.1 None

**19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

19.1 None

**20 OTHER MATTERS**

**20.1 Conservation Management Plan for Rhodes Cottage, on Erven 87087 and 87082, 246 Main Road, Muizenberg: NM  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ MUIZENBERG/ERVEN 87087 AND 87082**

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Given the nature of the documentation the committee requires a site inspection.

**HELD OVER:**

The committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Thursday, 25 November 2021 at 14:00 (DB, GJ, WP, HvdM, SJ) and the consultant team to be included in the walk-through.

**WD**

**21. NON-COMPLIANCE**

21.1 None

**22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

**23. CLOSURE**

The meeting closed at 16:35.

**24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**

24 November 2021

**MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_