

**Approved Minutes of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape  
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**

**Commenced at 07:30 and held on Thursday, 10 June 2021 via  
Microsoft Teams**



**1. Opening and Welcome**

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 07:30 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Committee Members:**

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)  
Mr Dennis Belter (DB)  
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)  
Prof Walter Peters (WP)  
Ms Mishkah Collier (MC) (left at 13:00)  
Ms Helene van der Merwe (HvdM) (logon at 07:45)

**Members of Staff:**

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)  
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (CAP)  
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)  
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)  
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)  
Ms Ayanda Mdludlu (AM)  
Ms Mureerah Solomon (MS)  
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)  
Ms Xola Mlwandle (XM)  
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)

**Visitors:**

Mr Raymond Bouma  
Ms Sonja Warnich-Stemmet  
Mr C Taljaard  
Mr Aurie Jordaan  
Mr Kristof Basson  
Ms C Groenewoud  
Mr Uthmaan Japtha  
Ms Alta Steenkamp  
Mr Renier Steenkamp  
Mr Philip Smith

Ms Katherine Robertson  
Mr Rossouw Theron  
Mr Antony Leonsins  
Ms Adelaide Combrink  
Mr Joe Olivier  
Mr Jannie Engelbrecht  
Ms Elize Mendelsohn  
Ms Marilie Pretorius  
Ms Nemone Bieldt

**3. Apologies**

None

**Absent**

None

**4. Approval of Agenda**

**4.1 Dated 10 June 2021.**

The Committee approved the agenda dated 10 June 2021.

## **5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meetings**

### **5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 26 May 2021**

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 26 May 2021 and resolved to approve the minutes with minor amendments.

### **5.2 BELCom Wupperthal Sub Committee Minutes dated 9 June 2021**

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 9 June 2021 and resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

## **6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:**

### **6.1 Recusals**

None

## **7. Confidential Matters**

None

## **8. Administrative Matters**

### **8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees**

CAP reported back on the following outcomes of the appeals and tribunal matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1430, 30 Bradwell Road, Vredehoek, CT. S34
- Tribunal: Proposed Demolition, Erven 55165 and 55166, 8 &10 Feldhausen Road, Claremont

### **8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:**

- 108 St George Street, Simons Town

### **8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition**

Nothing further to report.

### **8.4 Wupperthal building control issues**

A meeting to be convened shortly by the Acting CEO involving all major parties.

## **9. Standing Items**

### **9.1 Report back on Close-Out Reports**

Nothing to report.

### **9.2 Report back on HWC Council Meetings**

Nothing to report.

### **9.3 Discussion of agenda**

Noted.

#### **9.4 Proposed Site Inspections**

- Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 334, 21 Victoria Road, Bantry Bay
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 41855, 129 Main Road Street, Paarl
- Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3774, 12 Pontac Street, Paarl

#### **9.5 Site Inspections Undertaken**

- Erf 16190, 84 Fenton Road, Dryden Street Primary, Salt River undertaken on the 28 May 2021.

#### **10. Appointments**

None.

### **MATTERS DISCUSSED**

#### **11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS**

##### **11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2108, 2109, & 6176, 18-24 Crozier Street, Stellenbosch: NM**

**HM/BOLAND/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 2108, 2109, & 6176**

**Case No:** 21040628MS0520E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Raymond Bouma (architect) and Ms Katherine Robertson (Stellenbosch Municipality) were present and took part in the discussions.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Precedent for such enclosures already exists in Stellenbosch with the exception of Dorp Street. It is therefore a matter of how such work is executed, rather than whether such enclosures in principle.
- The proposed glass enclosure must conserve the verandas of the row of cottages as exterior space under cover, and not transform them into internal rooms.
- The site is graded as a PHS.
- The site is located inside an HPOZ.
- Stellenbosch Municipality supported the proposal with conditions.
- Stellenbosch Interest Group supported the proposal.
- Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation supported the proposal.
- HOMs is of the opinion that a different approach would be more appropriate.
- Enclosure should not be a common internal room.

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee supports the proposals in principle. However, details are to be provided regarding the exact locations, fixing, structural support and junctions, especially where changes in level are involved. This would include sections and elevations at minimum 1:5 scale.

**MS**

**11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 41440, 18-24 Crozier Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/BOLAND/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 41440**

**Case No:** 21040627MS052E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Raymond Bouma (architect) and Ms Katherine Robertson (Stellenbosch Municipality) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This is a porch to the library, which must be fitted with security glass or e.g. steel bars could be considered.
- Whatever is proposed, the openness of the space must be conserved, and if glazed, must not be installed like a window.
- The building is graded as a PHS.
- The building is located inside an HPOZ.
- Stellenbosch Municipality supported the proposal with conditions.
- Stellenbosch Interest Group supported the proposal.
- Stellenbosch Heritage Foundation supported the proposal.
- HOMs is of the opinion that a different approach would be more appropriate. HOMs can support the glass intervention at the library façade as this is a singular occurrence.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee supports the proposals in principle. However, details regarding the exact positioning within the reveals and fixing details that enable the glazing to “float” are to be provided. This would include sections and elevations at minimum 1:5 scale.

The Committee recommends that the glass doors open inwards and that their asymmetrical configuration be reconsidered.

**MS**

**12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION**

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 334, 21 Victoria Road, Bantry Bay: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BANTRY BAY/ERF 334**

**Case No:** 21030408XM0422E

Application documents were tabled.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 22 June 2021 (WP and SW).

**XM**

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 223, 4 Weir Road, Milnerton: NM  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MILNERTON/ERF 223**

**Case No:** 21040706MS0428E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Ms Sonja Warnich-Stemmet (CoCT) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The location on the lagoon's edge along with scale of buildings and the roofscape are the primary factors that form local character and visual unity.
- There is no unified stylistic architectural character.
- The subject building is not regarded as having sufficient architectural significance to warrant inclusion in the Provincial Heritage Register.
- The site is graded IIIC.
- The site is situated outside an HPOZ.
- CoCT does not support the proposal.
- FoBCA objected to the application.
- HOMs is of the opinion that the site is not within a proposed HPOZ and therefore does not warrant retention, however given the objection, the application was referred to BELCOM.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as the building has insufficient significance to warrant retention. The Committee notes that the surrounding area does not fall within a proposed or declared HPOZ. Furthermore, the area lacks the architectural cohesion for the so-called Gees Judgement to be invoked for the proposed replacement development.

**MS**

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1468, 13 Florida Road, Vredehoek: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/VREDEHOEK/ERF 1468**

**Case No:** 21030410XM0430E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Adelaide Combrink (CoCT), Mr Aurie Jordaan (owner,) and Mr Kristof Basson (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The proposed structure should minimize visual intrusion into views of the mountain backdrop.
- The building is graded as IIIC.
- The site is situated outside an HPOZ.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee has no objections to the proposed extension in principle. However, it remains to be convinced that the visual impact along the side of the building towards the mountain backdrop will be as low-key as claimed. It may well be, but this needs to be demonstrated. The Committee therefore requires a photomontage that clearly demonstrates this impact before it can consider this submission further.

**XM**

**13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Rem of Erf 8676, Main Road Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 8676**

**Case No:** 2011805XM0420E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms C Groenewoud (Friends of Blaauwberg; also interested in built heritage within the larger Cape Town Metro) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The proposed alterations are internal, which affects the 'utilitarian' office areas of the original 1958 concrete framed building.
- Its stylistically distinctive period interiors will not be affected, i.e. the main foyer, boardroom and board member's lounge.
- Rotten windows are being replaced in the 1970s addition with like windows.
- The building is grading as a PHS.
- The building is situated within a Special Character Protected Area Overlay Zone of Paarl.

## **RECORD OF DECISION:**

### Unauthorised work:

The Committee cannot condone unauthorised work. However, given the additional information provided and the fact that the significant interiors of the building are to be retained, the Committee recommends that no charges be laid for the unauthorised work.

### Proposed work:

The proposed work is approved as not impacting negatively on heritage significance provided that plans are submitted clearly distinguishing the unauthorised work from the proposed work.

**XM**

## **13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2284, 38 Long Street, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ERF 2284**

**Case No:** 21041907MS0504E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Jannie Engelbrecht (architect), Ms Elize Mendelsohn (CoCT), Ms C Groenewoud (Friends of Blaauwberg; also interested in built heritage within the larger Cape Town Metro) were present and took part in the discussions.

### **DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The drawings did not reflect the considerable number of insertions on the roof as shown in the photograph of the comment sheet by the City.
- The building is graded IIIA.
- The building is located inside an HPOZ.
- CIBRA supports the proposal.
- CoCT supports the proposals with recommendations.

### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as a temporary structure on condition that this approval be limited to a period of 5 years after which an application for renewal to HWC will need to be submitted should the applicant wish to retain the structure for longer.

The Committee strongly recommends that an alternative design that is purpose-made for this significant building be considered which more appropriately reflects its architectural qualities. This will be a consideration when the application is submitted for renewal in the future.

**MS**

**13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 293799, Kew Road, Mowbray: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MOWBRAY/ERF 293799**

**Case No:** KB0513E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Mr Uthmaan Japtha (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The previously approved plan by BELCom had not been fully executed and permission was sought for this reduced proposal.
- It was noted that the drawings and photographs were not consistent. The chimney for example has not been correctly shown on all views.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage significance on the understanding that this applies to the proposed balcony, staircase and roof dormer weather lap siding. This is conditional on plans being submitted to HWC clearly indicating this proposed work.

**KB**

**13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 41855, 129 Main Road Street, Paarl: NM HM/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 41855**

**Case No:** KB0513E

Application documents were tabled.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Friday, 18 June 2021 at 10:00 (DB, GJ, HvdM and SJ).

**KB**



**13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3774, 12 Pontac Street, Paarl: NM HM/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 3774**

**Case No:** 21050307KB0514E

Application documents were tabled.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Friday, 18 June 2021 at 10:30 (DB, GJ and HvdM).

**KB**

**13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 90017, 173A Main Road, Kalk Bay: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KALK BAY/ERF 90017**

**Case No:** 21051709XM0518E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Ms Alta Steenkamp (heritage consultant) and Mr Renier Steenkamp (architect) were present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The applicant was commended for a comprehensive report.
- The application is for remodelling a building of the 1950s, with additional accommodation.
- The building is graded IIIB.
- The building is situated inside an HPOZ.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

While the Committee supports much of what is being proposed it nonetheless has certain reservations, which it encourages the applicant to reconsider:

1. The circular corner bay window is an unusual landmark feature. There is an opportunity for this feature to be reinvented, if not retained.
2. The use of stone walling and/or cladding which grounds buildings in Kalk Bay and has the added potential of relieving the uninterrupted expanses of plastered wall should be considered. This applies particularly where facing the railway line and forming the terrace facing the sea.

Revised drawings addressing these points are to be submitted to this Committee for final approval.

**XM**

**13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 7159, 105 Westcliff Road, Hermanus: NM HM/OVERSTRAND/HERMANUS/ERF 7159**

**Case No:** 21041201MS0511E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Muneerah Solomon introduced the case.

Mr Rossouw Theron (architect) was present and took part in the discussions.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Replacing thatch has by necessity become a common occurrence in Hermanus. However, few materials have the malleability of thatch, which means that the transmutation of architectural forms to metal requires careful design consideration.
- The building is graded IIIB.
- The building is situated inside an HPOZ.
- Overstrand heritage and aesthetics committee suggests employing a simplified gable expression and straight mono-pitch roof, i.e. new and old building should be distinguishable from one another.
- HOMs mentioned that changing the thatch roof materiality will detract it from its grading.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

While the Committee has no objection in principle to the replacement of the thatch roof with roof sheets, the manner in which this is done will be critical in retaining the significance of this building i.e. the architectural transformation must not compromise architectural significance. Consequently, the Committee will require the external envelope of the building to be accurately modelled by an architect with appropriate heritage experience to ensure that junctions, eave lines and other characteristic roof features are properly detailed.

Appropriate architectural drawings addressing these concerns are to be submitted to this Committee for approval.

**MS**

**13.9 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2015, 65 Rose Street, Bo-Kaap: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BO-KAAP/ERF 2015**

**Case No:** 20111810SM1123E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Xola Mlwandle introduced the case.

Ms Nemone Bieldt (architect) was present and took part in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION:**

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- This is a substantial 1970s reconstruction now to be repurposed.
- The building is graded IIIC.
- The building is situated within an HPOZ.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not impacting negatively on heritage significance.

**XM**

**14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS**

**14.1** None

**15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT**

**15.1** None

**16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL**

**16.1** None

**17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS**

**17.1** None

**18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS**

**18.1** None

**19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

**19.1 Erf 16190, 84 Fenton Road, Dryden Street Primary, Salt River: MA  
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SALT RIVER/ERF16190**

**Case No:** 20110907WD1109E

The matter was removed from the agenda.

**WD**

**20 OTHER MATTERS**

**20.1** None

**21. NON-COMPLIANCE**

**21.1** None

**22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS**

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

**23. CLOSURE**

The meeting closed at 13:10

**24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:**

30 June 2021

**MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:**

**CHAIRPERSON** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_

**SECRETARY** \_\_\_\_\_

**DATE** \_\_\_\_\_