

**Approved Minutes of the Additional Meeting of Heritage Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**

**Scheduled for 09:00 and held on Thursday, 17 September 2020 via
Microsoft Teams**



1. Opening and Welcome

The Chair, Mr Graham Jacobs, officially opened the meeting at 09:00 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members:

Mr Graham Jacobs (GJ) (Chair)
Mr Shawn Johnston (SJ)
Mr Guillaume Narainne (GN) left at 12:00
Ms Mishkah Collier (MC) left at 13:00
Prof Walter Peters (WP)
Mr Dennis Belter (DB)
Mr Stuart Hermansen (SH)
Mr Mike Scurr (MS) co-opted and left at 10:45

Members of Staff:

Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)
Ms Zikhona Sigonya-Ndongeni (ZSN)
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter (C-AP)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)
Ms Aneeqah Brown (AB)
Ms Nokubonga Dlamini (ND)
Ms Sandisiwe Matole (SM)
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Mr Olwethu Dlova (OD)
Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)

Visitors:

Mr Ingar Valentyn
Mr Barend Salamo
Mr Ulrich Zimri
Mr John Wilson-Harris
Mr Aldrey Africa
Reverend Godfrey Conningam
Ms Annelize Stroebel
Ms Elzette Henshilwood
Ms Cherin Balt
Mr Coby McGinty

Mr Cliff Zimri
Mr Waldo Hanekam
Mr Edgar Valentyn
Ms Laura Milandri
Mr Sidney Stadler
Dr Shaun Adendorff
Ms Claire Abrahamse
Mr James Wilkinson
Ms Bridget O'Donoghue
Mr Brian Alcock

3. Apologies

None

Absent

None

4. Approval of Agenda

4.1 Dated 17 September 2020.

The Committee approved the agenda dated 17 September 2020 with an additional item 8.5.

5. Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting

5.1 BELCom Minutes dated 26 August 2020.

The Committee reviewed the minutes dated 26 August 2020 and resolved to approve the minutes without amendments.

6. Disclosure of conflict of interest:

6.1 Recusals

- MC: Items 12.1 and 12.2
- GJ: item 13.1

7. Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Administrative Matters

8.1 Outcome of the Appeals and Tribunal Committees

PM gave a report back on the following appeals and tribunal matters:

- Proposed Total Demolition of a Structure older than 60 years on Erf 488, 13 Voor Street, Pniel, Stellenbosch Municipality

The Committee notes that there are affordability issues with regard to this applicant being able to obtain professional assistance. If necessary, members of this Committee are willing to assist given these special circumstances and the significance of this settlement.

- Proposed Residential Development on Watervliet Farm 1221, Paarl (S38.4 HOMs)

8.2 Report back on Stop Works Orders and Charges:

There were no cases to report.

8.3 Formal Protection of Buildings refused for Demolition

Nothing to report.

8.4 Draft HWC Wupperthal Application Requirements and Guidelines

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Mr Ingar Valentyn (Wupperthal Community Support Group i.e. WCSG), Mr Cliff Zimri (WCSG), Mr Barend Salamo (Chair WCSG), Mr Waldo Hanekam (WCSG), Mr Ulrich Zimri (WCSG), Mr Edgar Valentyn (WCSG), Mr John Wilson-Harris (CifA), Ms Laura Milandri (CifA), Mr Aldrey Africa (Eskom), Mr Sidney Stadler (Moravian Church in South Africa: Property Division) and Reverend Godfrey Conningam (President, Moravian Church in South Africa) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee heard representations from the WCSG. While the WCSG is supportive of the houses in Zone 2 of the Village being properly reconstructed, funding this is a fundamental problem as most members of the Community live on social grants. Affordability is therefore a major issue.

- There is a concern that most materials required in accordance with HWC's draft guidelines cannot be locally sourced.
- WCSG requests that it be kept informed of progress in this matter from both HWC and the Church headquarters. They feel that communication needs to be improved.
- The fire victims have been living in temporary accommodation for more than a year and are anxious to get back into their houses.
- The WCSG is to provide HWC with the date and authors of its letter of concern as well as their membership number and who they represent. This information has yet to be provided. The case officer to follow up.
- BELCom notes these concerns and will be taking these into consideration during further discussions at a date to be determined.

The Committee notes the importance of forming a special sub-committee for taking this matter forward and the Chair will make a recommendation to Council in this regard. Committee members who are prepared to make themselves available to serve in this sub-committee are GJ, DB, SJ and SH.

It is very apparent that a project manager is required to co-ordinate the various initiatives and offers of assistance that have been made in the aftermath of the fire. The Chair has previously approached the CEO to take this matter forward at Provincial department level so that Province can make good on its promise (made at Provincial Cabinet level) to provide assistance, which is yet to be forthcoming.

WD

8.5 Unauthorised Work

- The Committee has become increasingly concerned at the amount of unauthorised work being tabled for its response. This appears to have been increasing during COVID Lockdown.
- Means of addressing this problem other than threatening to press criminal charges need to be considered. These could include:
 - Requiring a heritage agreement to be entered into between HWC and the offending party. This could be negotiated in conjunction with the relevant local authority withholding certain certifications, e.g. an occupancy certificate, pending remediation.
 - Working with a local authority to penalise offenders by means of property rates surcharges and rewarding diligent conservation practices with property rates rebates.
 - Other means to be considered in conjunction with HWC's legal advisor.

9. Standing Items

9.1 Site Inspections Conducted:

DB reported back after an inspection of the V&A Waterfront Collier Jetty and will submit a written site inspection report in due course.

9.2 Potential Site Visits

- Alexandra Street, Stellenbosch
- Puntjie

Dates for these inspections have yet to be confirmed.

9.3 Report back on Closeout Reports

Nothing to report.

9.4 Report back on HWC Council Meetings

Nothing to report.

9.5 Discussion of agenda

Noted.

10. Appointments

10.1 None.

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Maintenance and Upgrades, Erf 4942, City Hall, Cape Town: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD/ ERF 4942

Case No: 20020303WD0205E

Third Floor Mezzanine Stair Proposal was tabled.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the case.

Ms Laura Milandri and Dr Shaun Adendorff (both from the project architects, Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects) were present and took part in the discussion.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requires revised proposals taking the following into account:

1. The Committee supports the principle of a suspended staircase instead of a staircase supported on posts inserted into the mosaic floor. However, concerns were expressed regarding the visible horizontal beams which should preferably be concealed above the ceiling.
2. The Committee expressed concerns regarding the width of the staircase. The architects have confirmed that this is necessary to meet fire regulations and that a rational design reducing the width further is not possible.
3. Given these limitations, and the quality and craftsmanship characterising this space, the design of the staircase and walkway becomes particularly critical and should not be a repeat of the new staircase insertions in other parts of the building.
4. The revised design needs to be of a quality that matches the craftsmanship, delicacy and artistic merit of its context. Given the narrowness of the space, the revised design needs to be as unintrusive as possible.

WD

11.2 Proposed Signage to Various Buildings, Erven 1667,1061, 2606, 1063+, Wellington: NM WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEINWELLINGTON/ERVEN 1667,1061+

Case No: 20013109TZ0824E

Application documents were tabled.

Mr Thando Zingange introduced the case.

Ms Annelize Stroebel (Drakenstein Local Tourism Association) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The sites are graded PHS and falls inside special character of Paarl and Wellington.
- It is noted that some of the plaques have already been installed and therefore constitute unauthorised work which the Committee cannot approve.
- The Committee strongly supports the municipality's initiative to provide interpretive signage on its significant buildings.
- However, the Committee does require more information regarding the actual appearance of the signs and manner in which there are to be installed.
- Various typos and inaccurate information was noted on some of these plaques.

FURTHERE REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requires accurate information regarding the materials, fixing details and appearance of those plaques already installed, as well as appropriate particulars for the signage yet to be affixed to buildings where relevant.

The Committee supports this initiative and is prepared to assist where possible.

TZ

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 46018, Corner Stanley Road and Lovers Walk, Rondebosch: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ RONDEBOSCH/ERF 46018

Case No: 19112803SB1129E

MC recused herself and logged off from MS Teams.

A heritage report and drawings prepared by Claire Abrahamse were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (Heritage Consultant), Mr James Wilkinson (Architect) and Mr Coby were present and took part in the discussion. Mr McGinty was present as an observer.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- CoCT and The Rustenburg Valley Residents Association (RVRA) supports the proposal.
- The building is graded IIIB and falls inside the declared HPO.
- The proposals are considered an improvement on the previous proposal but nonetheless a lost opportunity.
- Concerns were expressed about the interruption to the rhythm of the evenly spaced boundary wall columns due to an additional boundary wall pillar at the driveway gate.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to support the application as having met previous requirements on condition that revised proposals for the boundary wall that exclude the additional pillar are submitted to HWC for approval.

SB

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 19962, 4 Steenbras Street, Brooklyn: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BROOKYLN/ERF 19962**

Case No: 20072005ND0729E

MC recused herself and logged off from MS Teams.

Application documents was tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

Ms Claire Abrahamse (Heritage Consultant) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The CoCT graded the building "potential grade IIIC".
- The landmark palms along the street boundary are preferably to be retained.
- The flats in this building have storerooms and unusually large living rooms.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve this application as not negatively impacting heritage resources. It is strongly recommended that the palm trees be retained.

ND

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

**13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 569,16 Marine Drive, Wendy Cottage, Hermanus, Overstrand, Overberg: MA
HM/OVERBERG/OVERSTAND/HERMANUS ERF 569**

Case No: 20080313KB0805E

GJ recused himself and logged off MS Teams. The Committee elected DB as Chair for this item.

Permit application was tabled.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- There is missing documentation uploaded to the HWC Blog regarding current public participation.
- The Committee requested the case officer to upload the previous BELCom site visit report which had been presented to the previous BELCom Committee.
- There appears to be a missing pages in the uploaded report for the current application.
- The case officer is to ensure all documents are uploaded to HWC blog.

HELD OVER:

The matter will be held over to next BELCom meeting to be held on 30 September 2020.

KB

**13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1735, 19 Grimsby Road, Three Anchor Bay: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/THREE ANCHOR BAY/ERF 1735**

Case No: 20062510ND0813E

Application documents were tabled.

Ms Nokubonga Dlamini introduced the case.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The Committee cannot approve unauthorised work.
- The building is graded IIIC and falls within an HPO.
- The unauthorized work has compromised heritage significance both intrinsically and contextually.

RECORD OF DECISION:

Pending compliance with the following, the Committee will recommend that criminal charges not be laid:

1. Restoration of the front elevation and Grimsby Road street interface.
2. Removal of the vertical upper floor timber screen facing Grimsby Road.

The above to be implemented as part of a heritage agreement with HWC. This heritage agreement must include drawings that comprehensively and accurately indicate all unauthorised work and the spatial context of the subject site.

The above information to be submitted to HWC by no later than 14 October 2020.

ND

13.3 Completed Additions and Alterations, Erf 2675, 27 Rugley Road, Vredehoek: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / VREDEHOEK /ERF 2675

Case No: 19101702SB1029E

Section 34 application, plans and other relevant documents were tabled.

Ms Stephanie Barnardt introduced the case.

Mr Brian Alcock (Project Manager) and Ms Cherin Balt (Owner) were present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Greater Vredehoek Heritage Action Group (GVAG) commented that they do not provide comments to additions and alterations applications.
- The building is graded IIIC and falls outside a HPO.
- The Committee cannot approve unauthorised work.
- The Committee has insufficient visual information to determine to what extent heritage significance may have been negatively impacted.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Before the Committee can make a decision as to whether it would recommend that charges be laid, it requires the following:

1. Confirmation from the author of the drawings that all unauthorised work has been comprehensively and accurately indicated and to make appropriate amendmends to the drawings should this not be the case.
2. Photographs of the property from Vredehoek Avenue to provide the Committee with an accurate indication of the visibility (or not) of the unauthorised works, as the case may be.
3. Photographs of the property from Rugley Road to provide the Committee with a comprehensive indication of the site in this streetcape context.

The above information to be submitted to HWC by no later than 14 October 2020.

SB

**13.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions Erf 50924, 23 St Michaels Road, Claremont: NM
HM/CLAREMONT/ERF 50924**

Case No: 20071311SM0825E

Permit application was tabled.

Ms Sandisiwe Matole introduced the case.

Ms Bridget O'Donoghue (Heritage Consultant), was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- BELcom cannot comment on the application as the property is graded NCW and has no heritage significance.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not impacting heritage significance.

SM

**13.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 96664,13 Boundary Road, Josephine Mill,
Newlands: NM
HM/NEULANDS/ERF 96664**

Case No: 20072317KB0820E

Permit application was tabled.

Ms Khanyisile Bonile introduced the case.

Ms Elzette Henshilwood (representing the owners) was present and took part in the discussion.

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The CoCT supports the proposal.
- The building is a PHS and falls inside a HPO.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requires detailed drawings including fixing details of the proposed signage for the Valentre Institute between ground and first floor windows. Particular attention must be paid to the physical weight of the lettering to minimise fixing points into the historic brickwork. Consideration can be given to more light weight coated metals (e.g. aluminium).

DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the perspex signage and metal "Josephine Mill" sign, all in figure 3, and the perspex signage to the left of the arched doorway in figure 2 of the motivation permit application dated August 2020 prepared by Elzette Henshilwood.

KB

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at 17:30

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

30 September 2020

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____