Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape

Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)



Commenced at 08:30 and held on Thursday, 7 April 2022 via Microsoft Teams

MATTERS DISCUSSED

- 11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS
- 11.1 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 237, 75 Kerk Street, Elim: MA HM/OVERBERG / CAPE AGULHAS / ELIM/ERF 237

Case No: 2012809KB0112E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 02_01_594 dated November 2019 prepared by Tyrone Engel draughting services, as not negatively impacting heritage significance on condition that all drawings are amended to clearly differentiate between what is existing and what is proposed, and that these revisions are to the satisfaction of HOMs.

The Committee however, strongly recommends that the thatch on the rear be extended to the eaves line as this would simplify the construction, improve weather integrity and reduce opportunity for the thatch to rot.

KΒ

- 12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION
- 12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 172362, 6 Kenilworth Road, Kenilworth: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / KENILWORTH / ERF 172362

Case No: 22020906KB0309E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Wednesday, 13 April 2022 at 14:00 (HvdM, WP, SJ and DB).

ΚB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 50189, 21 Bucksburn Road, Newlands: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ERF 50189

Case No: 22020303TZ0204E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee cannot approve unauthorised work. However, on the basis of the explanation provided by the owner, the Committee does not recommend that charges be laid as heritage resources have not been negatively impacted. A letter in terms of NRHA S.51 to be sent to the owner.

ΤZ

13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 875, 11 Piet Retief Street, Stellenbosch: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ STELLENBOSCH/ ERF 875

Case No: 22012801CH0225E

The matter has been deferred to the next BELCom meeting to be held on 26 April 2022.

CH

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 117776, 1 Harrington Street, Cape Town: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD / ERF 117776

Case No: 21120607MS0211E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports the application as indicated on drawings numbered LAB_A1101-LAB_A3004 dated 08/03/2022 prepared by Jaco Botha Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance in terms of overall massing, scale and interface between old and new. However:

- 1. The Committee has concerns regarding the treatment of the staircase corner of the tower on its west end. This has yet to be resolved to the Committee's satisfaction and will require revised proposals to be submitted for this end of the building.
- The Committee will require a suitably experienced architect with appropriate heritage
 experience to be engaged to monitor the works for the duration of the contract with a
 closeout report submitted within 60 days of practical completion.

MS

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 14088 and 14089, 3 Salisbury Street, Woodstock:

MA

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WOODSTOCK/ ERF 14088 & 14089

Case No: 2122004MS0118E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objection in principle to raising of the house by an additional storey as the site occupies a focal position. Similarly, there is no objection in principle to an additional veranda level with bay windows. However, there are concerns with the manner in which the new meets the old, the juxtapositions between them and the extension representing two different stylistic periods.

MS

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 7642, 16 Ivy Road, Observatory: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY/ ERF 7642

Case No: 21091008MS0915E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee cannot approve unauthorised work which it notes includes a boundary wall and railings that have been completed contrary to the Committee's previous requirements. However, given new information provided, the Committee has concluded that heritage significance has not been compromised and therefore recommends that criminal charges not be laid in this instance.

MS

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1895, 31 Bellevue Street, Oranjezicht: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ ORANJEZICHT/ ERF 1895

Case No: 22012701MS0315E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to refuse the application as not meeting its' requirements as recorded on 24 November 2021.

MS

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations Erf 877, 19 Del Hermite Avenue, Fresnaye: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ FRESNAYE/ ERF 877

Case No: 21120217MS1223E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 19 De L'Hermite Ave Fresnaye 1.dwg, dated 16/02/2022 prepared by Fineline Plans, as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

The Committee nonetheless recommends that the applicant consider lowering the overall height of the replacement garage and reconfiguring the roof to fall to the east, i.e. towards the garden.

MS

13.8 Unauthorised Work, Farm RE-705, Spice Route Destination, Suid Agter Paarl Road, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / FARM RE-705

Case No: 21110902SJ1116E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee is of the opinion that heritage significance has not been negatively impacted. However, the unauthorised work as indicated on drawings numbered 985 Rev – dated 18 August 2021 prepared by Andre Carstens Architecture constitutes a breach of the heritage agreement dated 22 September 2017 concluded between the owner and HWC arising from previous unauthorised work.

Given that heritage significance has not been affected, the Committee will not recommend that criminal charges be laid. However, given the breach of agreement, the Committee recommends that the CEO applies penalties for this breach in terms of the heritage agreement. This agreement will require an addendum that accommodates the partly completed works and alterations now proposed by the owner.

SJ

13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 830, 17 Ravenscraig Road, Greenpoint: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GREENPOINT / ERF 830

Case No: 22020701SJ0208E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee cannot approve unauthorised work but given that this does not negatively impact heritage significance has resolved to recommend that criminal charges not be laid.

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed work as indicated on drawings numbered LG_100 REV A dated 12 December 2021 prepared by Architects Incorporated as not negatively impacting heritage significance on condition that the front boundary wall alterations are to the approval of CoCT HRM and in accordance with the CoCT's boundary wall policy, and that the roof over the rooftop store is lowered to align with the existing screen wall edge.

SJ

13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 54891, 4 Eyton Road, Claremont: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT / ERF 54891

Case No: 21112606SJ1126E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered CN1-100 Rev C, CN1-101 Rev C dated 07 March 2022 prepared by Architects Incorporated as meeting previous requirements.

SJ

13.11 Proposed Alteration and Addition on Farm 1796,1 Olyvenbosch Road, Wellington: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS / WELLINGTON/FARM 1796

Case No: 20081209KB0818E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The application is refused as it was submitted under the incorrect section of the NHRA. A S.38 application is to be submitted to HWC.

KB

13.12 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 15811, Ptn 947,35 Fountain Street, Wellington: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS / WELLINGTON/ERF 15811

Case No: 21120212KB0112E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes the additional photographs describing the context of the subject site. However, it remains unclear how the proposed new building will fit into that setting. It is furthermore noted that despite concerns regarding the historicist architectural expression of the proposed new building, no further design proposals have been submitted. Consequently, the Committee still has insufficient information to apply its mind to establish how the proposal will fit within the context.

KΒ

13.13 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 28173, 2 Dixton Observatory: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / ERF 28172

Case No: 21120209KB0322E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection Wednesday, 13 April 2022 at 15:15 (HvdM, WP, SJ and DB).

KΒ

- 14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS14.1 None
- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- **15.1** None
- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- **16.1** None
- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- **17.1** None
- 18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- **18.1** None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- **19.1** None
- 20 OTHER MATTERS
- **20.1** None
- 21. NON-COMPLIANCE
- **21.1** None
- 22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.