Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape

Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom) Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 31 August 2022 via Microsoft Teams



MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 641, 8 Herte Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH / ERF 641

Case No: 22040716SJ0419E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 120-21 Demolition Plan, 120-20B Plans and Elevations, 120-20A Detail of Family Room dated August 2022, prepared by Naude & Bouma Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance. This is subject to the new masonry fabric being indicated on the floor plan adjacent to door numbered D11.3 and window numbered W11.1. Final drawings to be submitted to HOMs for permitting and stamping.

SJH

11.2 Painting and Maintenance on Erf 13162, 92 Main Road, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 13162

Case No: 22052416SJ0530E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated in the documentation listed below as having met previous requirements:

- 1. Breathecoat Letter (Wupperthal), dated 20 September 2021, prepared by Graham Jacobs,
- 2. Breathecoat Smooth Technical Data Sheet, undated, prepared by Breathecoat South Africa,
- 3. Breathecoat Textured Specification Sheet, undated, prepared by Breathecoat South Africa,
- 4. Method Statement and Mix Specification for Using Lime in Heritage/Old-Buildings Restoration Work in South Africa, undated, prepared by CLC,
- 5. Method Statement for Crack Repair Using Lime in Heritage/Old-Buildings Restoration Work in South Africa, undated, prepared by CLC,
- 5. Lime, White Hydrated Material Safety Data Sheet dated January 2020 prepared by Cape Lime,
- 7. Maintenance Method for Heritage Part of Building Going Forward, undated, prepared by Cally Kumbier

SJH

11.3 Proposed Telecommunication Mast on Erf 969, Church Street, Pacaltsdorp: NM HM/EDEN/PACALTSDORP/ERF 969

Case No: 22050904TZ

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee lacks sufficient information to be able to make an informed decision at this stage. For example, given that the property is within the historically significant part of the town and given that the site itself is a PHS, it is surprising that there is no record of other alternative locations having been considered before arriving at the current proposal. A preferred alternative that would have the least impact on the site and its surroundings is to be pursued. Furthermore, no heritage statement or heritage indicators have been provided to arrive at the most appropriate location. Additional information to be submitted.

ΤZ

11.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 138 & 3110, 19 Mead Way, Pinelands: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/PINELANDS/ERF 138 & 3110

Case No: 220230303TZ0304E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to refuse the application as it appears to detract from the character of the area which is a PHS and lacks sufficient information including detailing to indicate how it would not negatively impact this area.

ΤZ

11.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3507, 51A Upper Kloof Street, Oranjezicht: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ORANJEZICHT/ERF 3507

Case No: 22072907720803E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered SDD3.101/SDD1.200/SDD.1.100/ SDD3.100/ SDD5.100/ SDC1.300/ SDD5.100 Rev B/ SDD2.100 & SDD1.001, prepared by Jenny Mills Architect and dated 24 June 2022, 23 August 2022 & 15 March 2022, as not negatively impacting heritage significance but subject to the drawings being coloured to distinguish between new and old fabric. Final drawings to be submitted to HOMs for permitting and stamping.

ΤZ

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 1607, 10 Gladiolus Avenue, Devil's Peak Estate: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ DEVILS PEAK ESTATE/ ERF 1607

Case No: 22061319RG0705E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as the building has insufficient significance to warrant retention. The surrounding area has insufficient heritage significance to warrant the application of the so-called Gees Judgement relating to a replacement building.

RG

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on ERF 452, 30 Main Road, Hermanus: MA HM / OVERBERG / OVERSTRAND / HERMANUS / ERF 452

Case No: 22040410SJ0405E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is of the opinion that it still has insufficient information to make an informed decision on the proposed replacement building. Unless the replacement building can be articulated and scaled in a manner that will be sympathetic to the finer grain character of the surrounding area, the Committee is unlikely to approve the proposal.

SJH

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 20746, 166-170 Main Street, Paarl: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ ERF 20746

Case No: 22062704CH0630E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as the existing building as having insufficient significance to warrant retention. The Committee resolved to approve the replacement building as indicated on drawing numbered A120, A121, A122 and A116, A117, A118, A119, dated 21 August 2022 and prepared by CAA Architect as having met previous requirements.

The replacement development must be completed within five years of the permit for demolitions date of issue, failing which, a new application to approve the replacement structure will be required in terms of the NHRA, regardless of whether the demolition of the existing structure has taken place or not. The period may be extended by HWC on good cause shown, provided that the application for the extension is made prior to the lapsing of the approval referred to above.

СН

12.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 710-RE, 3 Leicester Grove, Greenpoint: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ GREENPOINT/ ERF 710-RE

Case No: 22062307RG0628E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports the demolition of the existing building as having insufficient significance to warrant retention. This is informed amongst others by a site inspection conducted by Committee members. The support of demolition is subject to HWC's approval of the replacement building which falls with an HPOZ.

RG

- 13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS
- 13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 24306, Cnr Mcfarlane & Main Street, Paarl: MA HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / ERF 24306

Case No: 22062917SJ0711E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawing numbered ARCC001/00/ dated 23 August 2022 and prepared L&H and Urban Designers but subject to revised drawings consistent with the aforementioned drawings being submitted to HOMs for permitting and stamping.

SJH

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf RE-735, 36 Hastings Street, Tamboerskloof: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ TAMBOERSKLOOF/ ERF RE-735

Case No: 22052702MS0531E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee cannot authorise illegal work. It is prepared to recommend to CoCT that legal action not be taken in this instance on condition that remedial work as indicated on drawing numbered S-ERF-735-RE-21.01 Revision 05 dated 4 August 2022 and prepared by Kirsten Burgess Architects is implemented. The Minor Works application for the remedial work is to be submitted to HWC for permitting.

MS

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 156275, 56 Chad Road, Retreat: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ RETREAT/ ERF 156275

Case No: 22052017MS0727E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Friday, 2 September 2022 at 10:00 (SJ and HvdM).

MS

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 914, 106 St Georges Street, Simons Town: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SIMONS TOWN/ ERF 914

Case No: 22031001CH0810E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Before the Committee can make an informed decision, it requires the following additional information:

- 1. Marked up 3D views indicating the impact of the proposal on the pedestrian experience from Smith Lane.
- 2. A structural engineer's design proposal for the excavation and stabilisation of the slope.
- 3. The inclusion of details on section AA of the historic stone channel, pedestrian pathway of Smith Lane and proposed boundary wall.
- 4. Protection methodologies for adjacent historic elements including stone channel, pathway and structures.
- 5. Comment from CoCT Roads Engineer regarding the proposed methodology for the construction phase of the project.

CH

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Farm 15251/1, Dunstone Country Estate, Wellington: NM

HM / CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / WELLINGTON / FARM 15251/1

Case No: 22012701MS0315E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

It is not clear to the Committee whether some of the work has already been completed, without first obtaining authorisation. This requires confirmation from the applicant. Should unauthorised work have been completed, this needs to be clearly distinguished on the drawings from the work still to be completed. It is reminded that HWC cannot approve illegal work. The applicant to ensure that the submission addresses the latest comments from I&AP's.

The architect is requested to be present when the item is tabled again.

ΚB

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 13681, 21 The Avenue, Salt River: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SALT RIVER/ ERF 13681

Case No: 22072709KB0811E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is of the view that the proposed roof configuration is unsympathetic to its context and that therefore alternatives be explored that are more appropriate in terms of massing, form and scale in relation to its context e.g. a double pitched roof. Revised proposal to be submitted to HWC.

ΚB

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1633, 8 Silverdale Road, Pinelands: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ PINELANDS/ ERF 1633

Case No: 22062915MS0707E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered BARR/21/09/01 dated 1 September 2021 and prepared by M.R.P Architectural Solutions, as this is not considered to be a heritage issue.

MS

13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1000, 29 Marmion Road, Oranjezicht: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ORANJEZICHT/ERF 1000

Case No: N/A

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee recognises the thoughtfulness of the proposal and the manner in which it distinguishes between old and new while respecting the old. The Committee does however suggest that the design development explores greater expression of horizontality.

It will assist the Committee if particulars regarding the manner in which the glass gasket meets the flanking wing containing the existing main bedroom is illustrated with a 3D rendering. 3D renderings of other parts of the building would be helpful.

Revised proposals to be submitted.

ΤZ

13.9 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 28478, 22 Rose Street, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 28748

Case No: 22021802TZ0222E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application (preferred Option B, with pitched roof) as having met previous requirements, on condition that final drawings include specifications for the use of lime mortars and renders in lieu of Portland cement on the building's superstructure where interfacing historic material, are submitted. These final drawings to be submitted to HWC for permitting and stamping.

ΤZ

- 14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS
- **14.1** None
- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- **15.1** None
- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- **16.1** None
- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- **17.1** None
- 18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- **18.1** None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- **19.1** None
- 20 OTHER MATTERS
- 20.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 149294, 3 Dock Road, Waterfront: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/V&A WATERFRONT/ERF 149294

Case No: 22082301

DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the emergency application on the understanding that this will be a temporary measure to secure the building against the weather and does not preclude the possibility of a more robust temporary installation to allow further protection to be implemented. This approval is subject to the following:

- 1. A monitoring proposal to be submitted for approval before work may start.
- 2. The monitoring must be conducted by an independent architect with appropriate heritage experience and similarly, an independent engineer with appropriate heritage experience.

Both parties are to submit interim reports to HWC at two weekly intervals or lesser interval as they may deem fit from time to time.

- 3. The appointment of the independent architect and engineer is to be approved by HWC.
- 4. A detailed scope of work to be submitted for approval by HWC prior to any work being undertaken.
- 5. Once the above requirements have been met and an HWC permit issued, the applicant may commence the emergency work.

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.