Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom) Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 30 November 2022 via Microsoft Teams



11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2081, 108 Shortmarket Street, Cape Town: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN/ ERF 2081

Case No: HWC22110905

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

HWC cannot condone illegal work.

The Committee has no objections in principle to the proposed light weight roof addition but has reservations regarding its uneven setbacks from the building's roof parapet and in particular the projection forward towards Buitengracht Street. Revised proposals to be submitted to address the concerns.

AM

- 12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION
- 12.1 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 68301, 1 Country Club Road, Kenilworth: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KENILWORTH/ERF 68301

Case No: 20073002TZ0831E

HELD OVER:

This matter is held over until the next meeting to provide the Lower Kenilworth Improvement District an opportunity to comment.

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 355, 5 Bickley Road, Sea Point: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SEA POINT/ERF 355

Case No: HWC22101701TZ1017

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objections to the demolition of the building. However, before a permit can be issued, the Committee will need to consider the impact of the replacement building in relation to its context informed, amongst others, by diagrammatic heritage indicators including street elevations.



ΤZ

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 2397, 110 11th Street, Voelklip, Hermanus: NM HM / OVERSTRAND / OVERBERG / HERMANUS / ERF 2397

Case No: HWC22042103SJ1028

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has insufficient information especially with regards to significance and spatial context to be able to make an informed decision. That would include pictorial coverage of the area in which the building sits. The Committee also needs to understand whether the Overstrand Municipality regards the significance of the site to be a heritage protection area issue or whether it relates to the building itself. Additional information to be supplied by the applicant.

12.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 55193, 24 Bishoplea Road, Claremont: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT / ERF 55193

Case No: 22070704KB0704E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee has no objection to the demolition of the building on the property as it has insufficient significance to warrant retention.

The Committee notes the updated 3D renderings (Revision F dated October 2022) with which there are still certain reservations. Revised proposals are therefore required that will provide a softer interface between the street and built edge and informed by well-performing precedents within the local context. Furthermore, the top floor of the proposals are to be treated in a more visually recessive manner than is currently the case.

KB

SJ

12.5 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 452, 30 Main Road, Hermanus: MA HM/OVERBERG/OVERSTRAND/HERMANUS/ERF 452

Case No: 22040410SJ0405E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee reiterates its support for the demolition of the building on the property.

The revised proposals contained in updated Heritage Statement in support of Proposed Total Demolition Revision 4, received November 2022, prepared by Design Ateljee are a considerable improvement on the previous proposals and are supported in general. There are however reservations regarding the treatment of the continuous unbroken boundary wall around the property which requires considerable refinement. It is encouraged that the boundary edge be made visually permeable where this is possible e.g. the intersection of Main Road and Flower Street where there is opportunity for greening for the public benefit. Revised proposals to be submitted.

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 7477, 13 Schilpadvlei Road, Constantia: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CONSTANTIA/ ERF 7477

Case No: 22092303RG0923E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 6 December 2022 at 14:00 (GJ, DB, HvdM and WP).

RG

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 107, 11 Poyser Road, Tamboerskloof: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ TAMBOERSKLOOF/ ERF 107

Case No: HWC22101307RG1014

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The Committee has concerns regarding the configuration and transition between old and new fabric and requires further information before it can make a decision. The transition between old and new is unresolved and appears not to be accurately indicated on the drawings. This applies amongst others to the roof.

RG

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 28910, 23 Koning Street, Paarl: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 28910

Case No: HWC22102503TZ1101

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee suspects that the building of attic typology is considerably older than indicated in the application. Before the Committee can apply its mind properly, it therefore requires a heritage statement to better understand the nature of the building fabric and the manner in which the building has evolved over time.

ΤZ

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 63656, 42 Oak Avenue, Kenilworth: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KENILWORTH/ERF 63656

Case No: 22090604TZ0907E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as indicated on drawings numbered C-0001 Rev A;C-0002 Rev A; C0003 and C-0004 prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff dated 06 September 2022 as not negatively impacting heritage significance subject to the following conditions:

- 1. That the north elevation arch is retained;
- 2. That the treatment of reveals and soffits of each of the new openings in the dividing walls in ground floor living areas are appropriately detailed and;
- 3. That exposed thresholds where walls are being removed be subtly differentiated as per the second option on page 2 of the 'Response to Further Requirements' document prepared by RSA, dated 8 November 2022.

Revised drawings including details to be submitted to HWC for approval.

ΤZ

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 86417, 10 Camp Road, Muizenberg: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ MUIZENBERG/ ERF 86417

Case No: 22103101CH1031

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as indicated on drawings numbered 2010-02-200, 2010-02-201, 2010-02-204; Revision J, dated 24 November 2022 prepared by STARC as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

СН

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 149294-Re, Old Power Station & Pump House Building, Dock Road, V&A Waterfront: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / V&A WATERFRONT / ERF 149294-RE

Case No: HWC221021075J1024

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that these proposals require considerable additional information especially regarding interventions with old fabric and the manner in which the work is to be carried out. It is essential that a suitably qualified and experienced heritage architect be engaged to assist with the execution of this project. The work would include:

- 1. An overarching method statement outlining the heritage philosophy to be applied to the interventions;
- 2. Details that include marked up photographs indicating interventions involving old fabric and;
- 3. Detailed method statement for various material interventions acknowledging conservation technology with an emphasis on physical compatibility.

Adopted BELCom Resolutions and Decisions_30 November 2022

The above is to be read in conjunction with the BELCom site inspection report dated November 2022.

SJh

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on 3 Royal Road, Muizenberg: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / MUIZENBERG / ERF 179757

Case No: HWC22100311SJ1107

FURTHER REQUIREMENT:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 6 December 2022 (SJ, GJ, DB, WP and HvdM).

SJh

13.8 Proposed Partial Demolition on Erf 7182, 39 Marine Drive, Hermanus: NM HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 7182

Case No: HWC22110807CH1108

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated in the heritage report, dated 8 November 2022 prepared by Rennie Scurr Adendorff Architects as not impacting negatively on heritage significance.

This approval is subject to the engagement of an appropriately experienced and qualified heritage architect with specialist knowledge in stone construction. This heritage architect is to provide guidance and monitoring of all heritage related processes including the dismantling, underpinning, reconstruction and other works as the case may be.

СН

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

- 14.1 None
- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- 15.1 None
- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- 17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 **REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE**

19.1 None

20 **OTHER MATTERS**

- 20.1 None
- 21. **NON-COMPLIANCE**

muted more than the second sec