Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage Western

Cape

Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)



Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 28 July 2021 via Microsoft Teams

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

- 11.1 None
- 12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION
- 12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 25886, 21 Scott Road, Observatory: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ OBSERVATORY / ERF 25886

Case No: 21070511SB0708E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee cannot condone illegal work. Given that this involved the destruction of what appears to have been a significant heritage resource, the Committee strongly recommends that HWC lays charges.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that the drawings for the proposed replacement structure are inaccurate. This submission can only be further considered once that has been rectified.

The application is to be informed by heritage design indicators which are currently absent.

All revised documentation to be circulated to I&APs before resubmission to HWC.

SB

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 977, 11 Virginia Avenue, Vredehoek: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ VREDEHOEK/ERF 977

Case No: 21061711KB0701E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is of the view that the subject house has insufficient significance to warrant retention and would therefore support its demolition subject to the replacement structure being to HWC's approval.

Given the above and having reviewed the current proposals, the Committee feels that further design resolution of the replacement structure is required. The following issues should therefore be addressed amongst others:

Acknowledgement of the streetscape with particular attention to: rhythm; scale; pattern of buildings interspersed by greenery; stepping roofscape following the sloping topography; and roof forms as perceived at street level.

It is recommended that the revised proposal be informed by graphic indicators taking into account the built form along Virginia Avenue and the manner in which that development can inform the new proposal in terms of façade articulation and scale.

Revised proposals to be submitted to HWC by 20th August 2021 but must include two weeks for I&APs to comment prior to submission.

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 919, 13 Virginia Avenue, Vredehoek: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/VREDEHOEK/ERF919

Case No: 21061712KB0701E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is of the view that the subject house has insufficient significance to warrant retention and would therefore support its demolition subject to the replacement structure being to HWC's approval.

Given the above and having reviewed the current proposals, the Committee feels that further design resolution of the replacement structure is required. The following issues should therefore be addressed amongst others:

Acknowledgement of the streetscape with particular attention to: rhythm; scale; pattern of buildings interspersed by greenery; stepping roofscape following the sloping topography; and roof forms as perceived at street level.

It is recommended that the revised proposal be informed by graphic indicators taking into account the built form along Virginia Avenue and the manner in which that development can inform the new proposal in terms of façade articulation and scale.

Revised proposals to be submitted to HWC by 20th August 2021 but must include two weeks for I&APs to comment prior to submission.

KB

KB

12.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 5-RE 34 Kings Road, Sea Point: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SEA POINT/ERF 5-RE

Case No: 21062209KB0622E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition application as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 7159, 105 Westcliff Road, Hermanus: MA HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 7159

Case No: 21041201MS0511E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes and accepts the applicant's need for this roof to be changed from thatch to a less combustible material. However, the forms particular to thatching technology need to be translated sensitively. At this stage, the Committee does not have sufficient assurance that this can be done. Consequently, the Committee requires further details of the proposals. These could include a combination of thatch and metal, tiles or slate. Photographic examples of successful precedent would also assist.

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2486, George Road Wilderness: MA HM/EDEN/GEORGE/ERF 2486

Case No: 21052106XM0527E

The matter was removed from the agenda.

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erven 982, 974, 978, 108 St George's Street, Simons Town: MA

HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SIMONS TOWN / ERVEN 982, 974, 978

Case No: 21031106SB0609E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Given uncertainties arising from the current documentation, the Committee resolved to undertake an emergency site inspection on Thursday, 29 July 2021 at 15:00 (GJ, DB and WP).

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 31888, Main Road, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 31888

Case No: 21052006XM0527E

The matter was removed from the agenda.

XM

MS

Ś

3

SB

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erven 439, 440 & 442, 47 & 49 Napier Street & 13 Jarvis Street, The Village Lodge, De Waterkant: MA HM//CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ DE WATERKANT/ ERVEN 439, 440 & 442

Case No: 19080507LB0807E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the revised application as indicated on drawings numbered 2019/01 1 rev 01 dated 27 May 2021, 2019/01 2 rev 03, 2019/01 3 rev 03 dated 23 July 2021 as having met previous requirements on condition that:

- 1. The proposed setback and parapet height of no. 13 Jarvis Street matches the actual setback and parapet height of no. 5 Jarvis Street; and
- 2. That canopy posts of 49 Napier Street are spaced evenly from one end of the leading corner to the other, i.e. without side overhangs.

SB

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 56309,6 Paradise View Claremont: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 56309

Case No: 20112412KB1209E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 02-10-002 rev 3, 02-10-003 rev 3, 02-10-001 rev 6 dated 22 July 2021. as having met previous requirements.

SB

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 8731, 255 Main Road, Paarl: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ ERF 8731

Case No: 21032903KB0608E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 0000,002,003,004,005,006,007&)12 dated 29 April 2021 prepared by WP Bosch & Associates Architects as not negatively impacting heritage resources subject to the conditions set out on p64 item 10.3 of the Heritage Report dated 8 June 2021 prepared by RSA Architects.

KB

13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 1236, 60 Bain Street, Wellington: NM HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ WELLINGTON/ ERF1236

Case No: 21042302AM0503E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered MM 2020 0016 dated 15 July 2020 as not negatively impacting heritage resources on condition that all alterations to historic masonry fabric is conducted using lime mortars and renders.

13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 15394, Septimus Street, Paarl: NM HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 15394

Case No: 21021205KB0524E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 20113/C/001 and/002, both REV C dated 24 May 2021 as not negatively impacting heritage resources. However, the Committee notes that the proposed roof of the carport is architecturally unresolved. It is therefore recommended that an alternative solution involving separate horizontal roofs on different levels, be considered.

КΒ

AM

13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 979, 15 Virginia Avenue, Vredehoek: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / VREDEHOEK/ERF 979

Case No: 21062508KB0629E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered VA2101 and 2102 both REV A dated 24 May 2021 as not negatively impacting heritage resources.

КΒ

13.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 19858, 70 Berlyn Street, Paarl: NM HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF19858

Case No: 21062312KB0623E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Wednesday, 4 August 2021 at 14:30 (HvdM, DB and GJ).

KB

13.12 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 994, 19 Voortrek Street, Swellendam: NM HM/OVERBERG/ SWELLENDAM/ERF 994

Case No: 21060809KB0615E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has insufficient information to make an informed decision. The Committee therefore requires the submission to be informed by a heritage statement prepared by a heritage consultant, endorsed by HWC, with appropriate historical architectural and fabric experience.

13.13 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3032, 150 Buitengracht Street, Bo-Kaap: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ BO-KAAP/ERF 3032

Case No: 21050614KB0531E

INTERIM COMMENT:

The Committee notes that the current proposals fall well within the previously HWC approved development envelope for the site. It is further noted that the current proposals are a distinct improvement on what is currently permissible for the site. However, the proposals remain undoubtably excessive in relation to the scale of the surrounding Bo-Kaap neighbourhood. The Committee recognises this portion of the Bo-Kaap, amongst others, as a highly significant heritage resource.

Consequently, the Committee shares the concerns of CIFA in their response dated 5 July 2021 to the current proposals. This includes a shared concern that the Buitengracht Street façade is too high and that this be reduced with an additional front setback as recommended by CIFA. The Committee also supports proposals that enliven the street and ground floor experience on Buitengracht Street, shared courtyard space and closer spatial connections with the adjacent historic 148 Buitengracht Street.

The Committee would welcome any development setbacks on the northwest side to scale down impacts over the Bo-Kaap.

KB

13.14 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1182, 99 King Langalibalele Drive, Langa: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ LANGA/ERF 1182

Case No: 21051802KB0701E

FURTHER REQUIREMENT:

The Committee notes that there are a number of positive aspects to the proposals particularly as viewed from the exterior. That includes the manner in which the massing of the proposed development has been broken down and the retention of the Old Church as focus of the west elevation. The Committee nonetheless notes areas where the design could be improved:

КΒ

1. Exterior:

The unrelieved largely blank north façade which has opportunities to be articulated taking cues from the abutting elements of the floor plan and by using external elements that would reinforce its landmark status.

2. Interior:

To use the project as an opportunity to retain recognisable elements of the Old Church that define its spatial integrity within the interior (e.g. floor finish, wall and window elements and holding the corners of this old space).

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

- 14.1 None
- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- 15.1 None
- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- **16.1** None
- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- 17.1 None
- 18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- 18.1 None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- **19.1** None

20 OTHER MATTERS

- 20.1 None
- 21. NON-COMPLIANCE
- **21.1** None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

KB