Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape

Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)



Commenced at 09:00 and held on Wednesday, 27 January 2021 via Microsoft Teams

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Refurbishment of the Auditorium, Allied Spaces and Services, Erf 4942, City Hall, Cape Town: MA

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN CBD/ERF 4942

Case No: 17103111WD1101M

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application (drawing numbered: 4605E), dated 22nd December 2020: Alternative D, on the understanding that the detailing will preclude the possibility of rising damp within the adjacent walls. This will include adequate measures for under floor ventilation and damp insulation of the new work from adjacent wall fabric.

WD

11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 192 RE 193 - 195, Swartberg Hotel, Church Street, Prince Albert: MA

HM/CENTRAL KAROO/ PRINCE ALBERT/ERF 192 RE 193 - 195

Case No: 20121701KB0717E

RECORD OF DECISION:

- 1. The Committee cannot legally approve unauthorised work.
- 2. Nonetheless, the Committee is of the view that the unauthorised work has not substantially impacted heritage significance and therefore does not recommend that legal action be taken against the applicant.

The proposed work:

The Committee approves the proposed work on the understanding that the proposed pergolas will be totally free standing, and on condition that all proposed alterations involving historic masonry are conducted using compatible mortars and renders under the supervision of an appropriately qualified and experienced architectural heritage practitioner.

ΚB

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 64402 & 64403, 29 and 31 Kenilworth Road, Kenilworth: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KENILWORTH/ERF 64402 & 64403

Case No: 20070701ND1006E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has insufficient information to apply its mind to properly adjudicate this application, particularly considering that the subject site falls within an HPOZ with a very distinctive character.

Additional information must include as a minimum:

- 1. Graphic heritage indicators elaborating further on the street elevations provided; and
- 2. 3D photo-montages of the proposal within its spatial context including from street level.

The purpose is for the Committee to be able to consider the impact of the proposals holistically within their spatial context and for the indicators to inform the architect as how best to adjust/re-consider the current proposals if/where necessary.

All proposed alterations to the current proposals, as well as all additional documentation clarifying this proposal, are to be circulated to the I&AP's prior to, or at the time of resubmission to HWC.

ND

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 1852, 2 Lion Street, Bo-Kaap: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BO-KAAP/ERF 1852

Case No: 20110209ND1125E

The matter was withdrawn from the agenda at the request of the applicant.

ND

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 49821, 2 Moss Street, Newlands: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ERF 49821

Case No: 20112002TZ1123E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition on the basis that it has no heritage significance.

The Committee does note the presence of at least one unregistered public body in the area which could result in an appeal should this body decide accordingly.

ΤZ

12.4 Proposed Total demolition on Erf 12459, Quay 3, Port of Mossel Bay: NM HM/MOSSEL BAY/ERF 12459

Case No: 20100502KB1027E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

It is not clear whether the site context requires special design considerations. Further information is therefore required for the Committee to determine whether the so-called Gees judgement needs to be applied.

KΒ

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 3480, 35 Bosman Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 3480

Case No: 20071408ND0716E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee remains concerned about the gutting of the existing house and therefore recommends that the additional accommodation in this building be taken up as loft accommodation that could include raising the eaves of the roof without substantially altering its overall massing and the general character of the area.

It is reminded that to come to an appropriate solution all alternatives need to be considered by the applicant. The above alternative will enable the ground floor room configuration and fittings to be retained substantially as currently existing with the possibility of further obscuring the rear extension from Bosman Street.

The Committee's previous requirements remain applicable.

ND

13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2243, 9 Rose Street, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN /PAARL/ERF 2243

Case No: 20071304ND0713E

RECOMMENDATION AND FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

- 1. Based on the additional information submitted, the Committee recommends that no further actions be required with regard to the unauthorised external toilet alternations.
- 2. The Committee has no objections to the proposed rear dormer balcony and proposed internal staircase.
- 3. The Committee has no objections in principle to the proposed alterations to the saddle store.
- 4. Points 2 and 3 are conditional on the following:
 - a. That a full drawing of the new staircase be submitted to HOMs for discretionary approval, and

b. The roof of the saddle store be reconfigured to fall as a lean-to from the rear façade to a horizontal gutter line running parallel with the rear façade.

ND

13.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 21518, 32 Links Road, Bellville: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BELLVILLE/ERF 21518

Case No: 20110507TZ1127E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee has no objections to the proposed alterations on the basis that the building remains have insufficient significance to warrant retention and the building is not in a declared or proposed heritage area.

RECOMMENDATION:

While heritage significance is not negatively impacted, the Committee urges the applicant to explore alternatives that would be more in keeping with the residential character of the surrounds.

ΤZ

13.4 Proposed Alterations and additions, Erf 746,10 Milner Road, Sea Point: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SEA POINT/ERF 746

Case No: 20102309KB1207E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting either significant built fabric or the streetscape in this specific instance. The additional storey and the manner in which that has been treated will improve visual links between the site and street surroundings.

ΚB

13.5 Proposed Restoration, Erf 55307, 43 Vineyard Road, Claremont: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 55307

Case No: 20101305SM1013E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage significance in as far as the NHRA affords this Committee jurisdiction.

Given the historical significance of the property, the Committee strongly recommends that the well on the site be thematically if not spatially linked and its presence acknowledged in a manner that contributes and reinforces the significance and interpretation of the property as a whole.

SM

13.6 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 56309,6 Paradise View Claremont: NM HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 56309

Case No: 20112412KB1209E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

While the Committee is in general support of the proposal and the heritage report, reservations are expressed regarding:

- 1. The close proximity between the manor house and the new south wing extention; and
- 2. The over-elaboration of the proposed parapets.

The applicant is encouraged to explore alternatives that provide more "breathing space" between the manor house and this extension and consider simpler treatments for the above parapets.

KΒ

13.7 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 50441, 38 Malcolm Road, Rondebosch: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 50441

Case No: 20121702TZ1217E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

ΤZ

13.8 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 17958, 14A De Beers Avenue, Paardevlei, Somerset West: NM

HM/SOMERSET WEST/PAARDEVLEI/ERF 17958

Case No: 20090905ND1104E

The matter was withdrawn from the agenda.

ND

13.9 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 9785, 13 Upper Wheelan Street, Newlands: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ERF 9785

Case No: 20102908ND1201E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved in this instance to approve the application given that this specific streetscape is already predominately characterised by garages and carports on the street boundary. Consequently, heritage significance will not be negatively impacted.

ND

13.10 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 2911,38 Huguenot Road, Franschhoek: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/FRANSCHHOEK/ERF 2911

Case No: 20112501KB1126E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has insufficient information to make a decision on this proposal at this stage although it has no objection in principle to the use of the roof space, the inclusion of roof dormers/doors nor the glazed enclosure of ground floor colonnade. This issue, however, is how this is executed and detailed.

The Committee has concerns regarding the following amongst others:

- 1. The location and treatment of the proposed roof dormers;
- 2. The treatment of the proposed canopy balustrade if this area is to be occupied;
- 3. The enclosure of the ground floor colonnade which currently does not allow for existing columns to be sufficiently expressed.

The Committee recommends that the amended proposals include 3D presentations that help to clarify and motivate the positions of the proposed new dormers in relation to the manner in which the building turns the corner from its street elevation to the adjacent pedestrian alley and bank building.

The Committee requires that the revised proposals be circulated for comment to all I&AP's who previously commented and that this be done at the time of re-submission to HWC at the latest.

ΚB

13.11 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 11139-11140, 3 3A Sussex Street, Woodstock: NM HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 11139-1114

Case No: 20009807KB1019E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve Option 4 as indicated in drawing number H027 dated 15th January 2021 in the document dated as having met previous heritage related concerns and requirements.

KB

13.12 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 54726, Kwnilworth: NM HM/CAPE TOWNMETROPOLITAN/KENILWORTH/ERF 54726

Case No: 20112411SM1136E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application substantially in accordance with drawings numbered 3.100,3.101,3.102,3.103,3.104,3.105,3.106 &3.107. dated July 2020 as not impacting heritage significance on condition that appropriate mortars, renders and other materials to the satisfaction of the heritage consultant are used on historic parts of the fabric.

SM

- 14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS
- **14.1** None
- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- **15.1** None
- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- **16.1** None
- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- **17.1** None
- 18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- **18.1** None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- **19.1** None
- 20 OTHER MATTERS
- **20.1** None
- 21. NON-COMPLIANCE
- **21.1** None
- 22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.