#### Adopted Resolution and Decision of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom) Commenced at 08:30 and held on Monday, 26 June 2023 via MS Teams



#### **MATTERS DISCUSSED**

- 11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS
- 11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 543, 23 Lower Kloof Road, Clifton: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLIFTON / ERF 543

Case No: HWC23021411SJ0228

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numberedS2.001, S2.002, S2.003, S2.004, S2.005, S2.006, S2.007, S2.008 dated 15 December 2022 prepared by Studio HS Architects as not negatively impacting heritage significance including the character of the surrounding area.

SJ

- 12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION
- 12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 16324, 9 Hopkins Street, Salt River: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SALT RIVER / ERF 16324

Case No: HWC23052313CN0525

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition of the 3 buildings on the site and endorsed the proposals for the replacement structure as indicated on drawing numbered HPST-GSS-XX-ZZ-PP-AR-01PL0001, -01PL0002, -01PL0003, -01PL0004, -01PL0701, -01PL0702, -02SE0401, -03EL0001, -10VS0001, -10VS0002, -10VS0003, -10VS0004, -10VS0005, -10VS0006, dated 10 March 2023 and prepared by Gass Architecture Studios as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

The Committee suggests that the applicant consider a spatial connection between the park and the internal courtyard without compromising the secure space that the latter provides.

Should the site not be developed in accordance with the approved plans within 3 years of the granting of the demolition permit, any proposed development thereafter must be resubmitted to HWC for approval.

CN

#### 12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 917, Church Street, Worcester: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ NEWLANDS/ ERF 49969

Case No: HWC23050505CH0509

#### RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application for full demolition as there is no compelling evidence to support the claim that the building has historical significance. The Committee is furthermore of the view that the building has no architectural or architectural/historical

significance.

CH

#### 12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 49969, 38 Almond Street, Fernwood, Newlands: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ NEWLANDS/ ERF 49969

Case No: HWC23050505CH0509

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved, with one member dissenting to approve the full demolition of the building as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CH

#### 12.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 574, 9 Trotter Street, Knysna: NM HM/ EDEN/ KNYSNA/ ERF 574

Case No: HWC23041913CH0523

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition of the buildings on Erf 574 as not negatively impacting heritage significance. The Committee has no objection to the revised proposals for the replacement building as indicated on drawings numbered 3003-A2-04-01, 3003-A3-04-02, and 3003-A2-04-03, compiled by Olivier Architects and dated 31 May 2023. Note that the latter proposals were submitted voluntarily by the applicant and requested by the Committee.

CH

#### Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 68301, 1 Country Club Road, Kenilworth: MA MM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ KENILWORTH/ ERF 68301

Case No: 20073002TZ0831E

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition of the building on the property as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

The Committee supports the revised proposals for the replacement building on the site as indicated on drawings numbered 2023.06 dated June 2023 prepared by Creative Style Architects as not negatively impacting on heritage significance including the character of the surrounding context.

KΒ

## 12.6 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 15098, 8 Ceotzee Street, Paarl: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ PAARL/ ERF 15098

Case No: HWC2212105SJ1123

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition as not negatively impacting the heritage significance.

SJ

- 13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS
- 13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 19426, KWV Wine Emporium, Dr Andre du Toit Building, Kohler Street, Paarl: NM
  HWC/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ ERF 19426

Case No: HWC23052309RG0524

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee has no objections to the revised proposals as indicated on drawings numbered 2248-MUN-01; 2248-MUN-02; 2248-MUN-03 and 2248-MUN-04 dated 28/04/2023 prepared by JG Kemp Architects with the exception of the existing timber front doors which the Committee feels must be retained. Amended drawings reflecting this retention to be submitted to HOMs for processing.

The Committee agrees with the architect that removing the existing security gate in front of the existing front doors to be replaced by an appropriate internal security alternative would be a distinct improvement.

RG

13.2 Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 234, 22 Huguenot Road,

Franschhoek: MA

HM / CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH / FRANSCHHOEK / ERF 234

Case No: HWC23032316CN0324

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee is in overall support of the proposals but feels that there are still certain aspects that need to be clarified. These are:

- 1. The nature of what is being retained and what will be new work with regard to the roof of the old building and its connection with the proposed lean-to extension. An enlarged detailed 06 section BB would assist with photographs of existing features.
- 2. A south west elevation of the retail annex.
- 3. Clarity regarding the exact nature of the kitchen extractor as it will be installed on site. Manufactures information would assist.
- 4. All views to be consistent and all new work to be indicated with the appropriate colour coding.

CN

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erven 66034-RE, 66040-RE, 66038-RE & 176321, Springfield Convent, St John's Road, Wynberg: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / WYNBERG / ERVEN 66034-RE, 66040-RE, 66038-RE & 176321

Case No: HWC23042009SJ0426

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered2203/01/01 , 2203/02/01, 2203/02/02, 2203/02/03, 2203/02/05, 2203/03/01, 2203/03/02, 2203/03/04, 2203/03/05, 2203/03/07, 2203/03/08, 2203/03/09, 2203/03/10, 2203/03/11, 2203/02/05, 2203/03/07, 2203/03/08, 2203/20/01 dated 25 July 2022 prepared by CCNIA Architects as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

SJ

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1075, 18 Munnik Street, Strand: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ STRAND/ ERF 1075

Case No: HWC23051503CH0522

#### COMMENT:

The Committee notes that the site does not fall within either a proposed or declared heritage area and the degree to which this submission can be regarded as a heritage issue can therefore be questioned. However, the Committee believes that the proposals are intrusive within their context and therefore strongly recommends that the City use its approved boundary wall policy and the development parameters contained within the Development Management Scheme to ensure that a more sympathetic proposal be achieved.

The Committee notes that the boundary wall may be older than 60 years and therefore may be subject to NHRA section 34.

CH

### 13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 19, 10 The Bend Road, Pinelands: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ PINELANDS/ ERF 19

Case No: HWC23040304RG0425

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee has fundamental problems with the proposals in their current form. This includes the impact on the roof configuration and front gable of the existing building. The proposals require significant amendments. The Committee therefore strongly recommends that the applicant engage an architect with appropriate heritage experience to assist in remediating the current proposals.

RG

## 13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 56251, 27 Eyton Road, Claremont: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CLAREMONT/ ERF 56251

Case No: HWC23052307RG0524

#### **FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

There appear to be fundamental problems with the proposals in their current form. The proposals require further information including a heritage statement and design indicators for guiding the nature, configuration and extent of the new proposal. The Committee therefore strongly recommends that the applicant engage an architect with appropriate heritage experience to assist in preparing the outstanding information required and to use that to prepare proposals that would not significantly detract from the building's significance.

RG

# 13.7 Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 270, 28 Jarvis Street, De Waterkant, Green Point: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GREEN POINT / DE WATERKANT / ERF 270

Case No: HWC23060209CN0608

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection Tuesday, 11 July 2023 at 12:30.

CN

## 13.8 Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 16379 (Erf 1812), 22 Van Riebeeck Street, Stellenbosch: MA

HM / CAPE WINELANDS / STELLENBOSCH / ERF 16379

Case No: HWC23030710CN0314

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the revised application as indicated on drawings numbered A101 and A102 dated 21 June 2023 and on drawings for the proposed new building numbered A000, A001, A002, A002.2, A003, A004, A005 and A006 dated 21 June 2023 prepared by WP Bosch & Associates Architects prepared by as not significantly impacting heritage importance but with the following conditions:

#### The historic building:

- 1. That a suitably qualified architect with heritage experience endorsed by HWC be engaged to monitor the work with particular attention to the retention and/or relocation of its significant elements (as the case may be, and the appropriate use of physically compatible materials e.g. lime mortars and renders. This monitoring professional to submit a closeout report to HWC within 30 days of practical completion of the work to the historic building.
- 2. That a structural method statement be prepared by a suitably qualified structural engineer with heritage experience to be endorsed by HWC. This method statement to be submitted for endorsement to HWC within 14 days.
- 3. The treatment of the new retaining wall underpinning the historic house adjacent to the new underground parking ramp in terms of appearance and finish as guided by heritage practitioner
- 4. To reinstate a matching window in the north façade of room E (heritage statement figure 13).

#### The new building:

- 1. The roof parapet line be horizontal without any projecting features.
- 2. Articulation of the glazed stair well enclosure as guided by the heritage practitioner

CN

## 13.9 Proposed Alteration and Addition on Erf 975, 397 Main Road, Sea Point: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SEA POINT/ ERF 975

Case No: HWC2304011

The item has been removed from the agenda as it is incomplete.

ΚB

- 14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS
- **14.1** None
- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- **15.1** None

- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- **16.1** None
- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- **17.1** None
- 18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- **18.1** None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- **19.1** None
- 20 CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN
- **20.1** None
- 21. NON-COMPLIANCE
- **21.1** None
- 22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.