Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape

Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)



Commenced at 08:35 and held on Tuesday, 26 April 2022 via Microsoft Teams

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Addition to Jonkershuis at Alphen Estate, 1 Peter Cloete Avenue, Constantia: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CONSTANTIA / ERF 377

Case No: 22011709SJ0120E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application for alterations to the Jonkershuis as indicated on drawings numbered SK.01 Revision 2, SK.02 Revision 2 dated 30 March 2022 prepared by MLH Architects, as having met previous further requirements and not impacting negatively upon heritage significance.

The Committee accepts the proposal to plant two deciduous trees in the location recommended in the landscape report prepared by David Gibbs dated 2017. It is recommended to plant the trees in this winter season and to submit interim photographic evidence thereof.

A closeout report to be submitted for the building work and including a progress report on the establishment of the trees within 30 days of completion of works.

SJh

11.2 Proposed New Agricultural Werf and associated Buildings on Kleinbosch Farm 1576, Dal Josaphat: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/FARM 1576

Case No: 22032911SB0405E

INTERIM COMMENT:

The Committee supports the proposals for reconstruction of the S.27 buildings in principle as described in the HIA phase II dated March 2022 prepared by Anne-Marie Fick and drawings numbered:3101, 3201, 3202, 3301, 3302, 3501, 3601, 3602 (Malherbe House), 4101, 4201, 4202, 4301, 4302, 4501, 4601 (Du Toit House), 5101, 5201, 5301, 5501, 5601 (Hugenote Gedenkskool) dated 4 March 2022 and prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects. All proposals for reconstruction and new work will be jointly addressed by BELCom and IACom.

SB

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erven 1422 & 1424, 5 Hargraves Road, Llandudno: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ LLANDUDNO/ ERVEN 1422 & 1424

Case No: 22011908NK0315E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

NK

12.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 148975, 1 Buiten Street, Cape Town CBD: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD / ERF 148975

Case No: 22031706MS0322E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

MS

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 172362, 6 Kenilworth Road, Kenilworth: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / KENILWORTH / ERF 172362

Case No: 22020906KB0309E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

ΚB

12.4 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 45515, 3 Linray Road, Rosebank: NM HM/ROSEBANK/ERF 45515

Case No: 22030914KB0310E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition as there is insufficient heritage significance to warrant retention.

ΚB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 875, 11 Piet Retief Street, Stellenbosch: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ STELLENBOSCH/ ERF 875

Case No: 22012801CH0225E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee expressed similar concerns raised by the Stellenbosch Interest Group and the Docomomo, in that the proposed addition does not make for a sympathetic continuation with an authentic building by a significant modernist architect.

There is no objection to addition of a second storey, however a more appropriate resolution is required in terms of form and detail.

The Committee strongly recommends that a suitably qualified professional architect with heritage experience be involved to assist with design resolution.

CH

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 146109, 27 Lower Rochester Road, Observatory: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / ERF 146109

Case No: 22021823CN0228E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered A(HWC)1000, A(HWC)1001, A(HWC)1002, A(HWC)1003, A(HWC)1004, Revision 1, dated 14 December 2021, prepared by ME from Bruce Wilson Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CN

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 146110, 29 Lower Rochester Road, Observatory: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / ERF 146110

Case No: 22021824CN0228E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered A(HWC)1000, A(HWC)1001, A(HWC)1002, A(HWC)1003, A(HWC)1004, Revision 1, dated 14 December 2021, prepared by ME from Bruce Wilson Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CH

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 146111, 31 Lower Rochester Road, Observatory: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / ERF 146111

Case No: 22021825CN0228E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered A(HWC)1000, A(HWC)1001, A(HWC)1002, A(HWC)1003, A(HWC)1004, Revision 1, dated 14 December 2021, prepared by ME from Bruce Wilson Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CH

Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 167760, 2 Burke Street, Observatory: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / ERF 167760

Case No: 22021819CN0228E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered A(HWC)1000, A(HWC)1001, A(HWC)1002, A(HWC)1003, A(HWC)1004, Revision 1, dated 14 December 2021, prepared by ME from Bruce Wilson Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CN

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 167761, 2A Burke Street, Observatory: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / ERF 167761

Case No: 22021820CN0228E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered (HWC)1000, A(HWC)1001, A(HWC)1002, A(HWC)1003, A(HWC)1004, Revision 1, dated 14 December 2021, prepared by ME from Bruce Wilson Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CN

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 167762, 4 Burke Street, Observatory: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / ERF 167762

Case No: 22021821CN0228E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered A(HWC)1000, A(HWC)1001, A(HWC)1002, A(HWC)1003, A(HWC)1004, Revision 1, dated 14 December 2021, prepared by ME from Bruce Wilson Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CN

13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 167763, 4A Burke Street, Observatory: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / ERF 167763

Case No: 22021822CN0228E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered A(HWC)1000, A(HWC)1001, A(HWC)1002, A(HWC)1003, A(HWC)1004, Revision 1, dated 14 December 2021, prepared by ME from Bruce Wilson Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CN

13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1518, 4 Highbury, 42 Davenport Road, Vredehoek: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / VREDEHOEK / ERF 1518

Case No: 22020306MS0224E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to endorse the application with the following amendments:

- 1. That the proposed new balcony door be symmetrical with the next door flat.
- 2. That the new door be made up with similar detailing to the original door composite.

Amended drawings to be submitted to HWC for permitting.

MS

13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 28173, 10 Dixton Observatory: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / OBSERVATORY / ERF 28172

Case No: 21120209KB0322E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee has no objection to the demolition of the existing structures on the site proposed for the new auditorium.

The Committee resolved to approve the application for the new auditorium as indicated on the drawing titled '05 Final Masterplan 14 with changes', numbered 31902-02-001 and dated 17.03.2022 as prepared by SLT Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

ΚB

13.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Farm 485, Le Chant Wine Estate, Eikenhof, Polkadraai Road: NM

HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ EIKENHOF/ LE CHANT WINE ESTATE/ FARM 485

Case No: 22032912AM0405E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Friday, 6 May 2022 at 11:00 (GJ, DB, SJ, WP and HvdM). The Committee requests that additional documentation be supplied prior to the site inspection, including:

- 1. Ground floor plan with all interventions;
- 2. Longitudinal and cross sections through wine testing area; and
- 3. Cross section through cellar and extending across the restaurant sitting area.

AM

13.12 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 14088 & 14089, 3 Salisbury Road, Woodstock: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WOODSTOCK/ ERF 14088 & 14089

Case No: 2122004MS0118E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as having met previous requirements and indicated on drawings numbered CDSALS_01 Rev1, dated 12 April 2022 prepared by Jurgen Kieslich, as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

MS

13.13 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 10685, 55 Main Road, Fish Hoek: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/FISH HOEK/ERF 10685

Case No: 19090206TZ1119E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee cannot condone unauthorised work but recommends that HWC not press charges.

The Committee resolved to endorse the application with the following conditions:

- 1. That all plans and elevations are updated to show existing antennae and the existing access ladder;
- 2. That the proposed new wall as shown on the east elevation be articulated to improve the street interface; and
- 3. Updated drawings to be submitted to HWC for permitting.

ΤZ

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 8138, 17 Middel Street, Wupperthal: MA HM/ WEST COAST/ CEDERBERG/ WUPPERTHAL/ ERF 8138

Case No: N/A

HELD OVER:

The matter was held over to the next BELCom meeting to be held on 12 May 2022.

MS

- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- **15.1** None
- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- **16.1** None

- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- **17.1** None
- 18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- **18.1** None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- **19.1** None
- 20 OTHER MATTERS
- **20.1** None
- 21. NON-COMPLIANCE
- **21.1** None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted