Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape

Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)



Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 25 August 2021 via Microsoft Teams

MATTERS DISCUSSED

- 11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS
- 11.1 Proposed Alterations on Rem of Ptn 12 Farm 653, Vergenoegd Farm, Macassar: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MACASSER/REM OF PTN 12 FARM 653

Case No: 21070609XM0706E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee supports the proposal to retain existing rooms F & I (restaurant) and N (kitchen) if so desired by the applicant as this clearly does not impact heritage significance. The Committee also supports the reinstatement of the interior of room J-K (Agterkamer) to its original proportions and as per the scope of works on page 23 items A, B, D, E and F of the proposal document dated 6 July 2021. This work is supported as not impacting heritage significance.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports in principle the proposed door on the south façade and bricking in of the existing toilet windows: all to be replaced with a new window as indicated on the 1910 Elliot photographs.

The Committee requires revised proposals that include details of the proposed new door and new window in the context of a new south elevation drawing which retains the buttresses.

XM

11.2 Proposed New Fence and Raising of current Boundary Wall including Minor Alterations on Erf 9768, Riebeek Square, 104 Bree Street, Cape Town: NM HM/CITY CENTRE CBD/ERF 9768

Case No: 18120603AS0129E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that there are security issues around this building and is therefore not opposed in principle to alterations that would assist in securing this very significant heritage resource. However, it is not convinced that the proposals in their current form address this issue adequately, both in terms of the building and its broader spatial context which also has high heritage significance. The Committee's concerns with the current proposals relate primarily to scale and visual permeability although questions were raised regarding the detailing of the proposed extension of the wrought iron gate and the proposed replacement railings of the entrance balcony.

Consequently, the Committee requires further information before it can apply its mind properly. This includes the following amongst others:

- 1. Further information regarding the historical development of the fenced enclosure of the Church frontage including historical illustrations and photographs.
- 2. The relationship of this enclosure to the parking fence on adjacent city land (this fence is currently not shown on the drawings).
- 3. Examples of precedent where railings have successfully secured other historic buildings without diminishing their architectural appreciation.

The Committee strongly recommends that the applicant engages a heritage professional with appropriate historical architectural experience to assist with this proposal.

MS

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 53936, 24 Claremont Avenue, Claremont: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CLAREMONT/ ERF 53936

Case No: 21071209MS0712E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee notes the site inspection report and agrees with the recommendation that this building be considered as grade IIIA (of highest local significance) and not grade IIIC as proposed by the CoCT, all for the reasons set out in the site inspection report.

The Committee therefore resolves not to approve the demolition application for this building.

MS

12.2 Proposed for Total Demolition, Erven 977 and 978, Vredehoek: MA HM/VREDEHOEK/ERVEN 977 AND 978

Case No: 21061711 KB0728E and 21061712KB0728E

INTERIM COMMENT:

Due to factors beyond its control (both on the part of the applicant and the Committee), the Committee has not had sight of the additional documentation it had requested as "further requirements" at the last meeting at which this item was tabled.

This item is therefore held over to the following meeting to enable Committee to examine this documentation.

KB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 178, 32 Church Street, Tulbagh: MA HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ WITZENBERG/TULBAGH/ERF 178

Case No: 21041906KB0506E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports the site inspection report and reiterates that HWC cannot condone unauthorised work. The site inspection has confirmed the Committee's concern particularly with regard to the bathroom insertion in the front bedroom and that in the Agterkamer which is particularly damaging. The Committee is of the view that the latter needs to be removed and the yellowwood floor and connection to the kitchen area reinstated.

The site inspection confirmed that there are various inconsistences between what has been completed and what is proposed. A lack of information in the documentation was also noted. Consequently, the Committee requires the following before it is prepared to consider the application further:

- Detailed drawings and specifications that include numbered windows and doors with a description clearly indicating where existing elements have or are to be relocated and where new elements are to be introduced.
- 2. The above specifications to include details of the appropriate preparation and use of traditional lime mortars and renders.
- 3. Details regarding finishes in the yard that retain as much of the Fagan era cobbled surfaces, proposed stoep surfaces, the manner in which rainwater from the roof will be channelled and drained away from external wall footings and nature of the proposed pergola columns and fixing details to the external wall.

The Committee strongly recommends that an architect with appropriate experience of buildings of this nature be engaged to assist with this submission.

KΒ

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 7159, 105 Westcliff Road, Hermanus: MA HM/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 7159

Case No: 21041201MS0511E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the conversion of the thatch roof to asphalt shingles in accordance with the proposal which includes images of precedent from Cape St Francis Marina as set out in an email to the case officer dated 12 August 2021.

MS

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1182, Baptist Church, Langa: MA HM/LANGA/ERF 1182

Case No: 21051802KB0701E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as having met previous requirements. The Committee does however recommend that the door on the north side of the old Church building be retained rather than bricked up.

KΒ

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 41855, 129 Main Street, Paarl: MA HM/PAARL/ERF 41855

Case No: 21071507KB0715E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee remains concerned regarding certain aspects of the proposal for the old building fronting onto Main Street. These include:

- 1. The nature of the street interface which remains largely in the public realm.
- 2. The detailed implications of the proposed work particularly with regards to joinery, finishes etc.

The Committee strongly recommends that the applicant engages a suitably qualified and experienced architectural heritage specialist to assist with resolving these issues which may include exercising a monitoring brief during the work.

KΒ

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 797, 6 Malherbe Street, Wellington: MA HM/DRAKENSTEIN/WELLINGTON/ ERF 797

Case No: 21040601XM0722E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee shares the concerns of Drakenstein Municipality that the proposed structure is massively over-scaled in relation to the house which is a grade IIIB heritage resource. The new structure must be visually subservient to the house.

The Committee further agrees that the proposed gateway closest to the street should have a visually permeable gate.

The Committee further requires that the front of the structure be set back at least 1m behind the leading corner of the hipped roof of the house and that its eaves line be lower than that of the adjacent house.

XM

13.6 Proposed Addition and Alteration, Proposed repairs to existing ceiling and proposed repointing of brickwork on Erf 16190, Dryden Primary School, Fenton Road, Salt River: NM HM/SALT RIVER/ERF 16190

Case No: 21073004KB0803E

RECORD OF DECISION:

Ceiling repair:

The Committee resolved to approve the proposed replacement marine plywood ceiling panels (3-4mm) with chamfered edges and scored to line up with the grid pattern of the existing pressed metal panels.

Pointing of brick work:

The Committee resolved to approve best practice (relating to tools, equipment, preparation, execution and materials) for repointing of brickwork and prioritising areas of significant weathering and deterioration as identified by the heritage practitioner (refer appendix c). It is understood that a consolidated method statement will be prepared by the heritage practitioner taking into account the method statements tabled and feedback provided by Committee.

ΚB

13.7 Proposed Addition and Alteration, Proposed reconstruction of demolished chimney, on Erf 16190, Dryden Primary School, Fenton Road, Salt River: NM HM/SALT RIVER/ERF 16190

Case No: 21073002KB0803E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the concept of a stub in memory of each dismantled chimney and the as-built detail to be documented by the heritage practitioner and included in the closeout report. Closeout report to be submitted within 30 days of completion.

The bricks from the dismantled chimneys are to be safely stored for reuse in buildings of this period, if not on the subject building itself, because they were imported from Bingley, UK, and are high quality. DPW, the owners, and the heritage practitioners are best placed for ensuring that the bricks are safely secured. The outcome is to be included in the closeout report.

KB

13.8 Proposed Addition and Alteration, Restoration and repair of existing cupola, on Erf 16190, Dryden Primary School, Fenton Road, Salt River: NM HM/SALT RIVER/ERF 16190

Case No: 21073003KB0803E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the heritage report relating to the restoration of the cupola. Documentation to be included in the heritage consultant's closeout report. Closeout report to be submitted within 30 days of completion.

ΚB

- 14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS
- **14.1** None
- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- **15.1** None
- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- **16.1** None
- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- **17.1** None
- 18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- **18.1** None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- **19.1** None
- 20 OTHER MATTERS
- **20.1** None
- 21. NON-COMPLIANCE
- **21.1** None
- 22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.