

**Adopted Resolutions and Additions of the Meeting of Heritage Western
Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)**

**Commenced at 08:30 and held on Wednesday, 23 February 2022 via
Microsoft Teams**



MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Boschendal Cellar Building, off R310, Dwars River Valley
Farm 10, 167 Stellenbosch: MA
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH / BOSCHENDAL PORTION 10 OF FARM 167**

Case No: 21090305SB1020E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 200_H.1001 Rev C (02.10.22), 200_H.1002 Rev C (14.02.22), 200_H.1003 Rev C (14.02.22), 200_H.2001 Rev B (06.12.21), 200_H.2002 Rev D (14.02.22), 200_H.2003 Rev D (14.02.22), 200_H.2004 Rev D (14.02.22), 200_H.2005 Rev D (14.02.22), 200_H.2006 Rev C (14.02.22), 200_H.3002 Rev C (14.02.22), 200_H.3003 Rev C (14.02.22), 200_H.3004 Rev C (14.02.22), 200_H.4001 Rev C (14.02.22), 200_H.4002 Rev C (14.02.22), 200_H.6001 Rev D (14.02.22), 200_H.6002 Rev D (14.02.22), 200_H.6003 Rev D (14.02.22), 200_H.6004 Rev D (14.02.22), 200_H.6005 Rev D (14.02.22) and 200_H.6006 Rev D (14.02.22) dated 14 February 2022 prepared by ATC Architects as having met previous requirements.

SB

**11.2 Proposed Addition to Jonkershuis at Alphen Estate, 1 Peter Cloete Avenue, Constantia: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CONSTANTIA / ERF 377**

Case No: 22011709SJ0120E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection. The Committee resolved that IACom member and landscape architect, Mr David Gibbs be invited to attend the site inspection.

SJ

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 748, 78 Main Road, Sea Point: MA
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SEA POINT / ERF 748**

Case No: 21101818SJ1209E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on Annexure Ba: *Architectural Response to the Urban Design Indicators* (with reference to FIG.06: Proposed Demolition Layout - Ground Floor Plan; FIG.07: Proposed New Floor Layout - Ground Floor Plan; FIG.08: South East Elevation; FIG.09: Proposed Detail Section through Heritage Façade) dated December 2021 prepared by Paragon Architects & Chris Snelling. The Committee does not believe that significant heritage resources will be negatively impacted.

SJ

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Partial Demolition, Erf 746, 82 Main Road, Sea Point: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / SEA POINT / ERF 746**

Case No: 21101819SJ1209E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on Annexure Ba: *Architectural Response to the Urban Design Indicators* (with reference to FIG.06: Proposed Demolition Layout - Ground Floor Plan, FIG.07: Proposed New Floor Layout - Ground Floor Plan, FIG.08: South East Elevation, FIG.09: Proposed Detail Section through Heritage Façade) dated December 2021 prepared by Paragon Architects & Chris Snelling as it does not believe that significant heritage resources will be negatively impacted.

The Committee recommends that if the street façade is to be retained, that the design consider the structure and spaces immediately behind to ensure that the surviving façade does not become an architectural mockery.

It is further recommended that if the street façade is to be retained, that its sash windows be removed.

SJ

**13.2 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 7134, 80 Sir Lowry Road, District Six: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / DISTRICT SIX / ERF 7134**

Case No: 21121304SJ1214E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objections in principle to the development of the site with a multi-storey structure in terms of its overall massing and scale, i.e. as indicated on drawing numbered SK.1.001 and SK.1.002 Rev-01 dated 14/09/2021 prepared by Gordon Hart Architects However, given the architectural significance of the various existing buildings on the site, the integration (both spatially and physically) between old and new will be critical, as will be interventions to street interfaces along the various sides of the block.

Further information should therefore include, amongst others -

- The Local Authority approved original drawings OR measured drawings of the existing buildings,
- Information on the original architect(s) of these structures,
- Possible publications on these buildings especially those fronting onto Sir Lowry Road,
- A more detailed breakdown on the significance of the various buildings comprising the site.

SJ

**13.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 54891, 4 Eyton Road, Claremont: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT / ERF 54891**

Case No: 21112606SJ1126E

The matter has been withdrawn from the agenda.

SJ

**13.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1323 RE, 3 Hofmeyr Street, Gardens: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GARDENS/ ERF 1323**

Case No: 22011105XM0117E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee cannot condone unauthorised work.

The Committee has no objection in principle to the proposed new work but needs to be assured that it is considering the latest version of the design.

The Committee also requires a method statement by a suitably experienced metal worker/fabricator that addresses how the recycled cast iron elements will be attached to the steel or other new components in a safe and aesthetically appropriate manner.

Further detailed drawings to be submitted, also at larger scale.

XM

**13.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf95815, 118 Buitenkant Street, Gardens: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GARDENS/ERF95815**

Case No: 21111022AM0128E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has insufficient information to properly apply its mind to this submission. For example, it is not clear to what extent, if at all, the proposed roof deck balustrade and new horizontal fenestration will be visible from the surrounding area. These potential impacts need to be accurately illustrated, amongst others, with marked up and annotated photographs and at least one section that extends across Buitenkant Street to establish typical sight lines.

AM

**13.6 Proposed additions and alterations on Erf 74089, 14 Knutsford Road, Plumstead: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ PLUMSTEAD/ ERF 74089**

Case No: 22011209CH

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee cannot condone unauthorised work. However, it was noted that the building has no heritage significance and does not fall within an HPOZ. A NHRA S51 letter to be issued to the applicant.

MS

**13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1596, 8 Derry Street, Vredehoek: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/VREDEHOEK/ ERF 1596**

Case No: 21110801MS0127E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered AA214:01-10-2020 dated 01/10/2020 prepared by Atelier Architecture and Designs as not too negatively impacting heritage significance in this instance.

The Committee however, strongly recommends that the architects reconsider the design of the proposals, particularly with regards to the proposed roof shape as seen from Derry Street. Although the subject site does not fall within an HPOZ, it is noted that the street and wider area contain many buildings with typical hipped roof configurations which the Committee would encourage the architect to follow.

MS

**13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Farm 238 5, Bovlei Road, Wellington: NM
HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ WELLINGTON/ FARM 238**

Case No: 22012502MS0202E

COMMENT:

The Committee regards the building as being of sufficient significance to warrant an IIIA grading. This is due to its historical and scientific associations with agriculture during the phylloxera epidemic and the Pickston Nursery with its pioneering relating to the fruit industry in the Western Cape. The building also has historical architectural significance.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports the proposals in principle. The following aspects however require more detailed resolution:

1. The manner in which the roof of the new rear extension is supported to minimise contact with the historic fabric of the main building.
2. The construction of the loft space for conversion into a mezzanine.
3. The removal of the internal walls taking into account, amongst others, that structural engineering input is still required including lateral support for the outer walls. Detailing must acknowledge the locations of partition walls to be removed.
4. The detailing and placement of new fenestration and retention of historic wall features.

A principle of minimising physical interventions to what is an ancient structure is to be observed wherever possible.

MS

**13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 1489 & 1493, 1 Grant Avenue, Boulders, Simons
Town: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SIMONS TOWN/ ERVEN 1489 & 1493**

Case No: 21100105MS0131E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is of the opinion that it would be unfair to insist on the retention of a thatch roof given known fire risks. The Committee agrees that there are various acceptable alternatives available, including flexible asphalt shingles that can accommodate the complex geometries of most thatch roofs. The applicant is encouraged to investigate this material as a first alternative. Synthetic thatch would be another alternative.

MS

**13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 174341, 3 Colinton Road & 16 Kildare Road
Newlands: NM
HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / NEWLANDS / ERF 174341**

Case No: 21100105MS0131E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered A1100, A1101, A1102, A1103, A1104 dated 25/08/2021 prepared by CCW from NIBROC Architectural Technologists as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CN

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

**14.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Farm 168, 1 Uitsig Street, Wupperthal: NM
HM/ WEST COAST/ CEDERBERG/ WUPPERTHAL/ FARM 168**

Case No: 21060201KB0531E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 0001 Revision C dated 03/11/2020 prepared by Gabriël Fagan Architects as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

MS

**14.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 8138, 17 Middel Street, Wupperthal: NM
HM/ WEST COAST/ CEDERBERG/ WUPPERTHAL/ ERF 8138**

Case No: 21111023MS

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requires further information in order to apply its mind properly. That includes, amongst others, distinguishing between existing and new fabric and indicating in section the ground levels between the front and the back of the building. Also required is the height between the floor level and the roof eaves: the floor level and roof ridge: and indicating in broken lines the pre-existing roof and gable profiles.

The applicant is to note that horizontal picture windows are not in keeping with the historic character of Wupperthal and that the raising of existing walls should be minimised if not avoided all together.

MS

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 Wupperthal Site Inspection Report

A Draft Inspection document was prepared. This draft is to be circulated for HWC staff for comment before the matter is taken further.

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.