Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape

Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)



Commenced at 08:30 and held on Thursday, 17 March 2022 via Microsoft Teams

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Addition to Jonkershuis at Alphen Estate, 1 Peter Cloete Avenue, Constantia: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CONSTANTIA / ERF 377

Case No: 22011709SJ0120E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objections in principle to the proposed addition to the south of the Jonkershuis. However, the Committee believes that this can be better integrated. The following is strongly recommended:

- 1. Articulating the west facing side,
- 2. The return of the front glazing on both east and west corners;
- 3. The introduction of horizontal glazing below the front cantilever; and
- 4. Minimizing the height of the overhead parapet.

There is concern regarding the increasingly exposed nature of the landscape immediately to the south of the manor house (homestead) and therefore that additional tree planting is required to compensate for the loss the two Oak trees on the upper terrace. Cypress trees as proposed by the owner are not considered appropriate alternatives to oak trees, as their form and growth habit is columnar and constricted, whereas oak trees and similar species have spreading canopies. New replacement trees should have spreading canopies and be of deciduous species, not necessarily oaks, but of similar form and growth habit. The overall purpose of this landscaping intervention is for the manor house (homestead) to remain the focus at this end of the property, and for the later additions to recede into the landscape context.

The above are to be included in an integrated, phased, development plan for the property which would also incorporate any other proposals the owner may have over the next 10 years.

SJ

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 2486, George Road, Wilderness, George: MA HM/ GARDEN ROUTE/ EDEN/ GEORGE/ ERF 2846

Case No: 1052106XM0527E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered S03 dated 3 March 2022 prepared by Scott Architects in conjunction with the heritage report by Scott Architects dated February 2022 - all as not impacting heritage significance on the understanding that:

- 1. The boundary treatment remains as visually permeable as possible to allow the forest on the property to remain strongly connected with the surroundings and to enable the development to nest into its green surroundings as much as possible.
- 2. The surface treatment of the proposed driveway and paving be permeable to allow rain to infiltrate into the tree roots system. It is recommended to work closely with the botanical consultant in this regard.

XM

12.2 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 883,66 Bath Street, Montagu: MA HM/MONTAGU/ERF 883

Case No: 21071507KB0715E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered CB22/B/OMA/01 dated 03 February 2022 prepared by Mr Carl Breytenbach Architects, as not negatively impacting heritage significance. The Committee however strongly recommends that the south elevation is articulated to be consistent in scale with the other elevations.

ΚB

12.3 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 8113, 1 Andries Pretorius Street, Somerset West: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SOMERSET WEST/ ERF 8113

Case No: 21112303MS1209E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered SK001, SK002, SK 003, SK 004 Rev 0 dated 9 March 2022 prepared by HB Architects as not negatively impacting heritage significance. The Committee agrees with the CoCT that the building warrants a grade IIIA grading. This approval includes the proposed doorways and removal of the terrazzo fire place.

MS

12.4 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 97938, 56 Kildare Road, Newlands: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / NEWLANDS / ERF 97938

Case No: 22021604SJ0221E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objections in principle to the proposed demolition of the current building. However, in order to assess the impact of the proposals properly in context, the Committee requires elevational studies of the three abutting streets with the proposal and possible alternatives superimposed, based on a critical analysis of these three streetscapes before it can consider the matter further.

SJ

12.5 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 556, 33 Nico van der Merwe Street, Sandbaai, Hermanus: MA HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 556

Case No: 21102503CH1206

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objection to the demolition of the existing building on the site as it has insufficient significance to warrant being placed on HWC's heritage register.

However, given that the property falls within a HPOZ, this application is referred back to the Overstrand Heritage and Aesthetics Committee (OHAC) for consideration of the design of the replacement building in terms of the Overstrand guidelines for development within a HPOZ. This design to be submitted to HWC with OHAC support as a condition of issuing the demolition permit.

CH

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 95815, 118 Buitenkant Street, Gardens: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GARDENS/ERF 95815

Case No: 21111022AM0128E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings unnumbered dated 13 August 2021 and 8 March 2022 and prepared by Pure Object as not in this instance negatively impacting the heritage significance of the subject building and the surrounding area.

AM

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 12530, 58 Chester Road, Walmer Estate: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WALMER ESTATE/ ERF 12530

Case No: 21101201CH1109E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve, with one-member dissenting, the application as indicated on drawing numbered JJ01 Rev3 option 2 dated 21 February 2022, prepared by Cape Architecture as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

CH

13.3 Proposed alteration and addition on Farm 1796,1 Olyvenbosch Road, Wellington: MA HM/WELLINGTON/FARM 1796

Case No: 20081209KB0818E

The matter was withdrawn from the agenda.

KΒ

13.4 Proposed Alt and Addition on Erf 258, 31 Eight Avenue, Melkbosstrand: MA HM/MELKBOSSTRAND/ERF 258

Case No: 21110303KB1216E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 258/01/01 and 258/01/02 both dated February 2022 prepared by Red Brick Architecture as not negatively impacting heritage significance, but on condition that the horizontal garage window on the north elevation is amended to 1 or 2 vertically proportioned windows. Revised drawing to be submitted to HOMs for approval.

ΚB

13.5 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 54891, 4 Eyton Road, Claremont: MA HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / CLAREMONT / ERF 54891

Case No: 21112606SJ1126E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objection in principle to the revised application. However, given that the revised proposal has not yet been seen by the UCRRA, the applicant is to forward these proposals to them for comment. Any comments to be received by Monday, 28th March 2022 for this matter to be finalised at the following BELCom meeting.

SJ

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations, 17 Ravenscraig Road, Greenpoint: NM HM / CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN / GREENPOINT / ERF 830

Case No: 22020701SJ0208E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee cannot approve unauthorised work.

The applicant is to amend the application to clearly distinguish between the unauthorised work and work yet to be undertaken or completed.

Revised drawings to be submitted to HWC for consideration at the BELCom meeting of 7 April 2022.

SJ

13.7 Unauthorised Work, Farm RE-705, Spice Route Destination, Suid Agter Road, Paarl: NM CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN / PAARL / FARM RE-705

Case No: 21110902SJ1116E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee refers this matter to the legal advisor to determine what legal mechanism could be implemented if this Committee was to agree that heritage resources have not been negatively impacted.

In the interim, the Committee will conduct a site inspection on Thursday, 24 March 2022 (DB, HvdM, and SJ) at 14:00 to determine whether heritage resources have been impacted.

The applicant is to provide the Committee with a heritage statement of the subject building's background including the ages of its various parts where known. The applicant to provide Committee members with historical material already in their possession to inform Committee members before the site inspection.

SJ

13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 50189, 21 Bucksburn Road, Newlands: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ERF 50189

Case No: 22020303TZ0204E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The applicant is to provide reasons why the Committee should recommend that charges not be laid for the unauthorised work. This will include information substantiating why the unauthorised work has not negatively impacted the heritage significance, including architectural merits, or otherwise, of the building.

ΤZ

13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4, 21 Andrew Street, Gansbaai: NM HM/GANSBAAI/ERF 4

Case No: 22012611TZ0209E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has concerns regarding this proposal and agrees with the OHAC that the proposed double storey extension be set back from the south end of the stone building on the 1st floor level of the extension, at least. The Committee has no objection to a single storey interleading element that does not extend above the line of the stone gable end.

It is furthermore strongly recommended that:

- 1. The uninterrupted chimney flue on the east side requires reconfiguration; and
- 2. All glazing be consistent in proportion and shape to the existing casement windows of the front façade of the stone house.

ΤZ

13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 117776, 1 Harrington Street Cape Town: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD / ERF 117776

Case No: 21120607MS0211E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee has no objection in principle to the overall massing, shape and size of the proposal within the broader context and agrees that the reduction in height by one floor and inclusion of a flat roof to the proposals circulated prior to this meeting are distinct improvements.

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 22 March 2022 at 10:00 (GJ and WP).

MS

13.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 14088 and 14089, 3 Salisbury Street, Woodstock: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WOODSTOCK/ ERF 14088 & 14089

Case No: 2122004MS0118E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection on Tuesday, 22 March 2022 (GJ and WP).

MS

13.12 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 14213, 22 Balfour Street Woodstock: NM HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WOODSTOCK/ ERF14213

Case No: 21082009AM1104E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered MYR SC 100 and 200 dated February and March 2022. prepared by EA-PAT 34897891 as having met previous requirements.

AM

- 14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS
- **14.1** None
- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- **15.1** None
- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- **16.1** None
- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- **17.1** None
- 18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- **18.1** None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- **19.1** None
- 20 OTHER MATTERS
- **20.1** None
- 21. NON-COMPLIANCE
- **21.1** None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.