Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape

Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)



Commenced at 08:30 and held on Friday, 16 April 2021 via Microsoft Teams

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 43 Kerk Street, Elim: NM HM/OVERBERG/ELIM/ERF 43

Case No: 20120809KB0112E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Before the Committee can apply its mind properly, the following information is required:

- 1. The location of the site on the development plan of Elim in relation to the various zones 1-5 as indicated in the 'Elim Riglyne vir Bewaring' of October 1995 p5.
- 2. Contextual information including elevations of the buildings on either side of the subject site to illustrate the relationship of the proposal to its neighbours, particularly in terms of eaves lines, roof ridge lines and overall scale and massing.
- 3. A written response to the Friends of Elim's concerns given that these have not been addressed in the design proposals.

ΚB

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 3053, 23 Anderson Street, Goodwood: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GOODWOOD/ERF 3053

Case No: 20070605SM0210E

COMMITTEE SUGGESTIONS:

The Committee strongly suggests that the existing building be recycled if at all possible or, alternatively, that the design of the replacement building be reconsidered to be more sympathetic to the neighbourhood, particularly with regard to street interface, façade articulation, roof configuration and general massing.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the demolition application as not significantly impacting heritage value. The Committee further notes that the property does not fall within a heritage area and does not find it appropriate to apply the so called Gees Judgement.

SB

- 13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS
- 13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erven 439, 440 & 442, 47 & 49 Napier Street & 13 Jarvis Street, The Village Lodge, De Waterkant: MA
 HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ DE WATERKANT/ ERVEN 439, 440 & 442

Case No: 19080507LB0807E

HELD OVER:

This item is held over to 28 April 2021 due to its complexities.

SB

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 714, 3 Milner Road, Sea Point: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SEA POINT/ERF 714

Case No: 20102304ND1028E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee requires revised proposals to achieve the following:

- Boundary alterations that are more appropriately scaled in relation to the streetscape to enable the house to be more visible as a contributory element within this streetscape. That would include the substantial setting back or removal of the currently proposed pergola.
- 2. A boundary wall with elements that have a vertical rather than horizontal emphasis.

The Committee recommends that the applicant consider a balustrade treatment that is consistent with the existing stoep balustrade of the house.

XM

13.3 Proposed Redevelopment of Erf 13355, 230 Victoria Street, Woodstock: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 13355

Case No: 21012606TZ0128E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application on condition that the existing ground floor fenestration openings are retained. Apart from the latter, the Committee regards the application as having met previous requirements.

ΚB

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 1187, 371 & 373 Main Street, Paarl: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ERF 1187

Case No: 20081708ND1119E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

While the applicant has provided certain additional information, this is still insufficient for the Committee to make a properly informed decision. The applicant is to revisit the "Further Requirements" as previously recorded, as well as the Drakenstein Municipality's comments.

XM

13.5 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 386, 273 Longmarket Street, Bo-Kaap: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BO-KAAP/ERF 386

Case No: 21010404ND0119E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that the unauthorised work is a deviation on approved plans for a total new build. Given that the property falls within an HPO, the nature of its context is a factor that must also be carefully considered. Consequently before this Committee can recommend whether charges be laid for the unauthorised deviation, further information regarding the spatial context is required.

KB

13.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 2041, 23 Buitenkant Street, Bredasdorp: MA HM/OVERBERG/BREDASDORP/ERF 2041

Case No: 21011903SM0219E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings 001 Rev N dated 22 February 2021 as not impacting heritage significance, but on condition that lean-to roofs as typically indicated in Section CC be adjusted to attach to the external wall face.

SB

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 56039, 6 Paradise View, Claremont: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 56039

Case No: 20121003KB0324E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the revised simplified parapet at the building marked 'Block B' as meeting previous requirements.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

While the redesigned junction between the manor house and south-east wing is considered an improvement, the applicant is urged to investigate further alternatives that would impact

less on the south east gable end of this house given its fine architectural detailing, even though the main views of the gable can be seen only from the internal courtyard and not the street.

KB

13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 884,6 Exner Avenue, Vredehoek: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/VREDEHOEK/ERF 884

Case No: 21031006KB0318E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee notes the disparate architectural character of the area which does not fall within a declared HPO. (The Committee however notes the intention for this area to be included in an HPO). The building has insufficient architectural significance to warrant rentention and/or incorporation into a new structure. Consequently the proposals are approved as not impacting negatively on heritage significance.

KΒ

13.9 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 28905, 9 Strubens Road, Mowbray: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MOWBRAY/ERF 48642

Case No: 14050201KB0508E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not impacting negatively on heritage significance.

ΚB

13.10 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 46723,5 Kingsbury Way, Rondebosch: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 46723

Case No: 20101308KB1103E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the amended proposals as indicated on drawings (ROBE01/19d), dated 11 February 2021 as having met previous requirements.

KΒ

13.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 48642, 42 Kildare Road, Newlands: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/NEWLANDS/ERF 48642

Case No: 21021008KB0216E

COMMITTEE SUGGESTIONS:

The Committee suggests, on architectural and urban design (i.e. non-heritage) grounds, that the architect consider addressing, with regards to the proposed extention, the scale and monolithic nature of its boundary walls on its south-west and south-east sides.

The Committee suggests on similar (non-heritage grounds) that the fenestration on the northeast side be reconsidered with reference to the glazed veranda street frontage of the historic house, and that the bagged façade finish be changed to plaster and paint.

RECORD OF DECISION:

After considering the new information provided by the applicant, the Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings (2007-MD100,2007-MD102,2007-MD103& 2007-MD104,), dated 15 July 2020 as not negatively impacting heritage significances.

KB

- 14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS
- **14.1** None
- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- **15.1** None
- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- **16.1** None
- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- **17.1** None
- 18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- **18.1** None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- **19.1** None
- 20 OTHER MATTERS
- **20.1** None
- 21. NON-COMPLIANCE
- **21.1** None
- 22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.