Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage Western Cape

Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)



Commenced at 07:30 and held on Thursday, 15 July 2021 via Microsoft Teams

MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

11.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 2108, 2109, 6176, 18-24 Crozier Street, Stellenbosch: MA

HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 2108,2109,6176

Case No: 21040628MS0520E

FURTHER REQUIREMETS:

While the Committee remains supportive in principle in securing the verandas, the proposals need to reflect the existing condition accurately and distinguish clearly between what is existing and what is proposed. That includes reflecting accurately the relationship between veranda colonnades and stoep edges. Updated drawings to be submitted to the Committee for further consideration.

MS

11.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 4140, CL Marais Library, Crozier Street, Stellenbosch: MA

HM/BOLAND/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 4140

Case No: 21040627MS052E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

While the Committee remains supportive in principle of securing the loggia, it is not yet convinced that all alternatives have been explored to provide an optimum solution for what is a highly significant building. While glazing may present one alternative, the Committee feels that metal bars /wrought iron components could produce a better solution which should be further explored.

The Committee remains concerned that a single rather than double entrance doors/gates is proposed.

The Committee requires the alternatives to be clearly and accurately documented in both section and plan. Updated drawings to be submitted to the Committee for further consideration.

MS

11.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 87011- Re 192, Main Road, Muizenberg: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/MUIZENBERG/ ERF 87011

Case No: 21042303XM0603E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the proposals as indicated on drawings numbered 105 and dated 21/04/2021 as not negatively impacting heritage significance.

XM

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

12.1 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 334, 21 Victoria Road, Bantry Bay: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/BANTRY BAY/ERF 334

Case No: 21030408XM0422E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee accepts the findings of the attached site inspection report with which it is in agreement, namely that the subject building has insufficient significance to warrant retention and that the broader context has insufficient significance to warrant the application of the so-called Gees Judgement with regard to the replacement development.

XM

12.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 2291,21 Dal Road, Camps Bay: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAMPS BAY/ERF 2291

Case No: 20071608KB0303E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved not to approve the demolition application on the basis that insufficient alternatives have been explored for its retention which is particularly relevant considering that the subject building is architecturally and historically highly significant and a pioneering example of its period.

KΒ

12.3 Proposed Total Demolition on Erf 10617, Cnr Tabak & Station Street Paarl: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 10617

Case No: 21050609KB609E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee resolved to support the demolition application given that the building has insufficient significance to warrant retention. However, given the high strategic value of the site within an area of considerable heritage significance, demolition will be conditional on the

replacement development, informed by Drakenstein Municipality's precinct plan and appropriate heritage indicators, being to the approval of HWC.

KB

13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS

13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions on Erf 670,3 Alice's Ride, Pinelands: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/PINELANDS/ERF 670

Case No: 20102201KB11203E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as having met previous requirements.

WD

13.2 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 41855, 129 Main Road, Paarl: NM HM/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 41855

Case No: KB0513E

FURTHER REQUIREMENT:

While the Committee considers the revised proposals to be an improvement on what was previously submitted, further work is still required. This includes the following:

The historic building:

- 1. Accurate plans are required differentiating between old and new. Where historic elements such as doors and windows are to be relocated, their new positions are to be shown.
- 2. All interventions involving old fabric are to be appropriately specified in the interest of physical compatibility (e.g. traditional lime mortars and renders).
- 3. Details of connections between old and new require detailing.

The new building:

- 1. Drawings including a longitudinal section reflecting accurate levels.
- 2. Proposals that provide a unified roof design based on attic massing and / or dormers for the third level in lieu of the current horizontal parapet and projecting gable roof forms informed by surrounding precedent but executed as a contemporary interpretation.

ΚB

13.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 3774, 12 Pontac Street, Paarl: NM HM/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 3774

Case No: 21050307KB0514E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee regards the proposals in the current form to be inappropriate and negatively impact heritage resources on various levels. This is elaborated on in the attached site inspection report dated 18 June 2021.

The proposals do not accurately reflect their scale in relation to the surrounding area and will involve the removal of trees that are not currently shown.

Revised proposals addressing these concerns to be submitted together with a heritage report addressing the points raised by the Drakenstein Municipality to be submitted.

KB

13.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erven 439, 440 & 442, 47 & 49 Napier Street & 13 Jarvis Street, The Village Lodge, De Waterkant: MA HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ DE WATERKANT/ ERVEN 439, 440 & 442

Case No: 19080507LB0807E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that the applicant has met some of the requirements as previously resolved. However, the Committee remains of the view that the following negatively impact heritage significance:

- 1. The pergola on top of 49 Napier Street. This should be removed together with the service cubicle and extractor ducts.
- 2. The post spacings are to relate to the canopy ends and not windows and doors. Canopies are to relate to the buildings to which they are attached as individual entities.
- 3. The parapet and cornice lines of the new bedrooms above 13 Jarvis Street are to align with number 5 Jarvis Street.

Revised proposals to be submitted to HWC for approval.

SB

13.5 Proposed Partial Demolition, Addition and Alteration at Erf 155675, 232 Sir Lowry Road, Woodstock: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/WOODSTOCK/ERF 155675

Case No: 19030505HB0603E

COMMENT:

The Committee resolved that the revised scheme as prepared by Revel Fox and Partners numbered SDP_0001, SDP_1001, SDP 1002, SDP_1003, SDP_1004, SDP_1005, SDP_2001,

SDP_2002, SDP_3001, SDP_3002, SDP_3003, SDP_3004, SDP_5001 and dated 17 June 2021 is substantially in accordance with the permit as issued by HWC dated 20 August 2019.

WD

13.6 Proposed Additions and alterations on Erf 56309, 6 Paradise View, Claremont: MA HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CLAREMONT/ERF 56309

Case No: 20112412KB1209E

FURTHERE REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes the various improvements made to the proposals on both north and south sides. Further improvements to the articulation including introduction of street facing windows and scale of the extension can be made, e.g. further lowering the ceiling, reducing the heights of the front and sides parapets and introducing more planting between the rear of the altered building and the south boundary wall. Revised proposal to be submitted to BELCom addressing these points.

SB

13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 2486, George Road, Wilderness, George: NM HM/EDEN/GEORGE/ERF 2486

Case No: 21052006XM0527E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee supports the demolition of the subject building but has concerns regarding the current redevelopment proposals. These impose on surrounds strongly characterised by biophysical heritage and next door to a building of architectural/ historical significance. Revised proposals are required taking into account the aforementioned factors, surrounding planting patterns, roofscapes, topography (natural and cultural) and archaeological potential, amongst others.

 \mathbf{XM}

13.8 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 111, 35 Dennehof Street, Riebeek West: MA HM/CENTRAL KAROO/ RIEBEEK WEST/ERF 111

Case No: 21050313KB0504E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee notes that its previous requirements have not yet been met. The matter will be considered once the alternatives have been clearly indicated and articulated. This includes:

- 1. Scale and articulation of the proposed new side entrance in relation to the details of the historical villa.
- 2. Historical evidence of a pre-existing chimney breast at the proposed porch.
- 3. Structural consequences of the proposed porch opening in relation to historic fabric.

KB

13.9 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 1468, 13 Florida Road, Vredehoek: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/VREDEHOEK/ ERF 1468

Case No: 21030410XM0430E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawings numbered 1001/C1 and dated 10/12/2020read in conjunction with the 3D views as having met previous requirements. Note that any proposal to enclose this structure will require a new submission to HWC.

XM

13.10 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 90017, 173A Main Road, Kalk Bay: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/KALK BAY/ERF 90017

Case No: 21051709XM0518E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the revised application as indicated on drawings numbered 90017 | 105 dated 24/06/2021as having met previous requirements.

XM

13.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 178, 32 Church Street, Tulbagh: MA HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ WITZENBERG/ TULBAGH/ERF 178

Case No: 21041906KB0506E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee cannot condone unauthorised work.

The Committee notes that there appear to be discrepancies between the pre-reconstruction plan, Fagan reconstruction plan and the present plan up to the applicant's voluntary cessation of works. The current proposals need to be accurately differentiated between the previous plans so that the Committee can apply its mind properly in determining whether charges need to be laid for the unauthorised work and whether the outstanding proposed work will negatively impact heritage significance.

ΚB

13.12 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 7159, 105 Westcliff Road, Hermanus: MA HM/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 7159

Case No: 21041201MS0511E

The matter was removed from the agenda.

MS

13.13 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 31888, Main Road, Paarl: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS / DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ERF 31888

Case No: 21052006XM0527E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee cannot condone unauthorised work.

The Committee requires drawings accurately differentiating between the unauthorised work and proposed work yet to be undertaken before it can consider this matter further.

XM

13.14 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 5553, 30 Wallers Way, Betty's Bay, Overstrand: NM HM/OVERSTRAND/ OVERBERG / BETTY BAY / ERF 5553

Case No: 21060701SB0621E

RECORD DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawing numbered 15004_rev01, dated 24 August 2020 prepared by M De Jager Architect as not impacting heritage significance. The Committee is pleased that a sustainable new use as been found for the property.

The Committee cautions that being prefabricated structures, internal elements are likely contributing to the structural stability, and therefore caution is to be taken with alterations to the latter. It is also advised that the timber codes be consulted before work commences to ensure structural stability of the heritage resources.

SB

13.15 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 19240, 1 Squirrels Road, Land and Zeezicht Estate, Somerset West: NM HM/SOMERSET WEST/ERF 192040

Case No: 21051913KB0524E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as indicated on drawing numbered VH-001-04 dated 25 March 2021 drawn by Design establishment architects as not impacting heritage significance.

ΚB

13.16 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Estate Mobile Bottling Farm, Farm 1796, 1

Olyvenbosch Road, Wellington: NM

HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ WELLINGTON/FARM 1796

Case No: 20081209KB0818E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee regards the current proposals to be inappropriate and lacking contextualisation and details that would need to be clarified by the applicant. The proposal does not reflect the sense of place, nor heritage context of the surrounding area.

The Committee requires the circulation of the visual impact assessment to be circulated to all the heritage conservation bodies, Drakenstein Municipality and HWC.

KB

13.17 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 149639, 18 Kloof Street, Garden: NM HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN/ERF 149639

Case No: 21061001KB0510E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve application as indicated on drawings numbered LAD_101, LAD_102, LAD_103, LAD_202, dated March 2021 by van der Vyver Architects as not impacting heritage significance on condition that the expression of the flanking steps of the front façade parapet is retained when the parapet is extended full width to accommodate the new roof deck. Revised details to be submitted to HWC for approval.

ΚB

13.18 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 8731, 255 Main Road, Paarl: NM HM/CAPE WINELANDS/DRAKENSTEIN/PAARL/ ERF 8731

Case No: 21032903KB0608E

HELD OVER:

This item is postponed to the meeting of 28th of July 2021.

ΚB

- 14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS
- **14.1** None
- 15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT
- **15.1** None

- 16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL
- **16.1** None
- 17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS
- **17.1** None
- 18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS
- **18.1** None
- 19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE
- 19.1 Erf 16190, 84 Fenton Road, Dryden Street Primary, Salt River: MA HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SALT RIVER/ERF16190

Case No: 20110907WD1109E

DISCUSSION:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Priorities for repair & restoration work to the historic school building.
- Restoration of the Cupola.
- Repair and replacement of pressed metal ceilings.
- Brickwork pointing and repairs.
- The (unauthorised) removal of the building's historic brick chimneys.

WD

- 20 OTHER MATTERS
- **20.1** None
- 21. NON-COMPLIANCE
- **21.1** None
- 22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee resolved to adopt the resolutions and decisions as minuted.