

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
SUPPLEMENTARY HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING (SUPP HOMS)
Held on Monday, 17 February 2020, in the 8th Floor Boardroom at
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town scheduled for
09:00**

1. OPENING AND WELCOME

The Chairperson, Mr Jonathan Windvogel, officially opened the meeting at 9:09 and welcomed everyone present.

2. ATTENDANCE

Committee Members

Mr Laura Milandri(LM)
Mr Peter Büttgens(PB)
Mr Raymond Smith(RS)
Mr. Rashaad Carlsen (RC)

Members of Staff

Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)
Mr Andrew September (AS)
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Ms Cathy-Ann Potgieter(CP)
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)
Mr Jonathan Windvogel (JW)

Visitors

Mr James Hallinan
Mr Christian Scriba
Ms Maryna Pretorius

Mr Baker Ederies
Mr Micheal Du Toit

Observers

None

2. APOLOGIES

Ms Colette Scheermeyer
Mr Lwazi Bhengu
Ms Khanyisile Bonile
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)
Ms Penelope Meyer (PM)

Absent

None

4. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

4.1 Dated 17 February 2020.

The Committee resolved to approve the agenda with minor additions.

5 APPROVAL OF MINUTES AND MATTERS ARISING FROM PREVIOUS MEETING

5.1 Dated 14 October 2019.

The HOMs Committee resolved to approve the minutes dated 14 October 2019 with amendments.

6. DISCLOSURE OF INTEREST

6.1 12.1 P.B

7. CONFIDENTIAL MATTERS

7.1 None

8. Standing Items

8.1 Proposed Site Inspection

8.1.1 None

8.2 Site Inspection Reports

8.2.1 Erf: 55, 85 Church Street, Elim. S27. Site inspection conducted by Mr L Bhengu and Ms L Milandri

A verbal report by Ms L Milandri.

9 Administrative Matters

9.1 HWC staff to look at an executive summary template and guidelines for S31,S 34 and S27 applications.

10. Other Committee Referrals

11. Appointments

11.1 None

12. Matters Arising

12.1 Proposed Additions & Alteration on Erf: 2743, 3 Camps Bay Drive, Camps Bay. S34

HM/ Cape Town Metropolitan/ Camps Bay/ Erf: 2743

Case No: 19110613KB1107E

PB recused himself and left the room.

Mr James Hallinan and Mr Baker Ederies were present and took part in the discussion.

Mr TZ presented the item.

Discussion:

Amongs other things, the following was discussed:

- CoCT does not support the proposal.
- CBCRA does not support the proposal.
- HOMS supports the CoCT's proposed grading of IIIC.
- Extensive social history supports the contextual significance. The proposal does not impact negatively on the site's contextual significance.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The committee resolved to support the proposal in principal subject to final detailing of features such as the linking walk way and balustrade to be submitted to HWC for final approval.

TZ

12.2. Proposed Additions & Alteration on Erf: 55, 85 Church Street, Elim. S27 HM/ Overberg/ Cape Agulhas/ Elim/ Erf 55

Case No:19102941LB1126E

Mr Andrew September introduced the item.

Discussion:

Amongs other things, the following was discussed:

- Friends of Elim and Opsiensersraad did not support the proposal.
- The building falls in a Provincial Heritage Site and in the main Church Street gateway entrance.
- A site inspection was conducted by LB and LM who reported that work has proceeded on site.
- The east wing extension and the second floor additions is an inappropriate intervention, and would impact negatively on the significance of the Church Street context.
- It is recommended that the height be reduced and the usage of loft spaces be proposed as an alternative to a full second storey.
- It is recommended that thatch is used as a roof material on the Church Street elevation. Corrugated iron sheeting can be used as a roof material for additions that are not visible from Church Street.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved not to approve the proposal in its current form as it is detrimental to the heritage significance of the Church Street context.

Case officer to issue the Stopworks Order immediately.

AS

12.3. Proposed Additions & Alteration on Erf:338, 98 Loader Street, De Waterkant, CT. S34

HM/Cape Town Metropolitan/ De Waterkant/ Erf 338

Case No:19050609SB0618E

Mr Christian Scriba was present and took part in the discussion.

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item.

Discussion:

Amongs other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is graded IIC.
- The revised proposal has reduced impact and does not negatively impact the heritage resource of the structure or its context.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The committee resolved that the revised proposals is substantially in accordance with the previously approved submission, therefore the revised proposal can be stamped off in accordance with the previous approval.

WD

13 **New Matter**

13.1 Proposed Additions & Alteration on Erf:8607, 311 Main Road, Paarl, Drakenstein, Cape Winelands. S34-A&A

HM/ Cape Winelands/ Drakenstein/ Paarl/ Erf: 8607

Case No: 19093012SB1015E

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item.

Discussion:

Amongs other things, the following was discussed:

- DHF does not support the proposal.
- Drakenstien Municipality supports the proposal

- Paarl 300 did not comment within the 30 day commenting period
- The site falls outside of the Paarl Special Area of significance

RECORD OF DECISION:

The committee resolved to approve the application as not impacting heritage resources.

WD

13.2. Proposed Additions & Alteration on Erf:15118, 10 Patriot Street, Paarl, Drakenstein, Cape Winelands.S34

HM/ Cape Winelands/ Drakenstein/ Paarl/ Erf 15118

Case No: 19112511AS1204E

Ms Maryna Pretorius was present and took part in the discussion.

Mr Andrew September introduced the item.

Discussion:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The site is located in the Paarl Area of Exceptional Heritage Significance.
- The site is a Grade IIIB.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Revised plans to be submitted addressing the following concerns:

- Height and Bulk: The way to reduce the height and bulk would be to turn the guest room into a loft space with wall heights of 1.2m. Alternatively the addition could be built on the ground level.
- Roof Form: A hipped roof, possibly with dormers, would be preferable over the proposed roof form. The roof pitch must match the existing building.
- Cladding Material: The use of brick and mortar or corrugated cladding is preferred over Nutec cladding
- Fenestrations: The fenestrations must be rectangular and vertical in nature.

AS

13.3. Proposed Total demolition on Erf:1360, 10 St John Street, George, Eden.S34-

HM/ Eden/ George/ Erf 1360

Case No:17102301ZK0515E

Mr Andrew September introduced the item.

Discussion:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Building is graded Not Conservation Worthy.
- St. John Street does not have a heritage context and is not a declared heritage area.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The demolition of the building is supported as the building does not warrant retention.

AS

13.4. Proposed Additions & Alteration on Erf:325, 55 Loader Street, De Waterkant, CT S34

HM/Cape Town Metropolitan/ De Waterkant/ Erf 325

Case No:19120301LB1206E

Mr Andrew September introduced the item.

Mr Micheal Du Toit was present and took part in the discussion

Discussion:

Amongs other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is a Grade III C

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee concluded to conduct a site inspection (PB, RS & LM)

The matter will be retabled on 16th March 2020.

AS

13.5. Proposed Additions & Alteration on Erf:41 64,6, Mancadan Street Stellenbosch, Cape Winelands, S34

HM/ Cape Winelands/ Stellenbosch/ Erf 4164

Case No 20011509LB0122E

Mr Andrew September introduced the item.

Discussion:

Amongs other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is Not Conservation Worthy.
- The building falls outside of a significant heritage area and the context is not significant.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal.

**13.6. Proposed Additions & Alteration on Erf:154, Hoekwill Road, George, Eden. S34
HM/Eden/ George/ Erf: 154**

Case No: 20010802SB0113E

Ms Waseefa Dhansay introduced the item.

Discussion:

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

1. Simon van der Stel Foundation supports the proposal
2. George Heritage Trust does not support the proposal
3. The committee graded the site to be of IIIC significance

RECORD OF DECISION:

The committee resolved to approve the application in its current form, as the proposal does not negatively impact on the heritage significance of the cottage.

WD

14. OTHER MATTERS

14.1 None

15. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions.

16 CLOSURE

The Chair closed the meeting at 12:10

17 DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 16 March 2020