

**DECISION MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF  
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,  
SUPPLEMENTARY HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING (HOMS)  
Held on Monday, 20 May 2019, in the 8th Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the  
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,  
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town scheduled for  
09:00**

---

**1. Opening and Welcoming**

The Chairperson, Ms Colette Scheermeyer, officially opened the meeting at 9:03 and welcomed everyone present.

**2. Attendance**

**Committee Members**

Mr Chris Snelling (CSn)  
Mr Peter Buttgens (PB)  
Mr Ivan V Smidt (IvS)

**HWC Members of Staff**

Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)	Administrative Clerk
Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)	Assistant Director
Mr Andrew September (AS)	Heritage Officer
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)	Heritage Officer
Mr Lwazi Bhengu (LB)	Heritage Officer
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)	Graduate Intern
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)	Graduate Intern

**Visitors**

Mr Guy Thomas (GT)	Mr Alex Stewart (AS)
Mr Justin Ruyowa (JR)	Mr Hessel Berga (HBg)
Ms Beth Richardson (BR)	

**Observers**

None

**3. Apologies**

Stephanie Barnardt

**4. Approval of agenda**

The HOMS Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 20 May 2019 with additional items

**5. Approval of minutes of the previous meeting**

The HOMS Committee resolved to approve the minutes dated 15 April 2019 with amendments.

**6. Disclosure of interest**

- 6.1 CSn -13.13 noted his concerns in the use of his report of 2005 as indicating support of the current proposal.

**7 Confidential Matters**

- 7.1 None

**8. Site inspections**

**8.1 Proposed Site Inspection**

1. Proposed thatch replacement and alterations on Erf 11033, 21 & 23 Marine Drive, Hermanus. Item 13.4
2. Proposed additions and alterations, Erf 55018, Corner of Bowwood & Main Road, Claremont. Item 13.10

**8.2 Site Inspection Reports**

1. Item 12.3 report by LB

**9 Administrative Matters**

- 9.1 None

**10. Other Committee Referrals**

**11. Appointments**

- 11.1 Item 13.1, 13.5, 13.10, 13.12 and 13.13

**12. Matters Arising**

- 12.1 **Proposed additions & alterations at Farm 501/20, Mooi Kelber, Main Road, Northern-Paarl. S34**

**Case. No: 17091407HB1004E**

**HWC file No. HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/NORTHERN-PAARL/ FARM 501/20**

HB introduced the item

**Amongst other things, the following were discussed:**

- Site Report 3- dated February 2019 and Site Report 4 dated March 2019 prepared by Malherbe Rust Architects

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to endorse the above reports submitted with a note that the next report must illustrate how heritage significance is retained.

**HB**

**12.2 Proposed Addition & Alteration at Erven 252 & 253, 11 Leeuvenvoet Road, Tamboerskloof, S 34**

**HWC file No: HM/ CAPE METROPOLITAN/ TAMBOERSKLOOF/ ERVEN 252 & 253**

**Case. No:** 17030906HB0721E

HB introduced the item.

**Amongst other things, the following were discussed:**

- The report dated April 2019 prepared by Barak Mizarchi Architects.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to endorse the report.

**HB**

**12.3 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 781, 11 Hastings Road, Tamboerskloof. S 34**

**HWC file No.: HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ TAMBOERSKLOOF/ ERF 781**

**Case. No** 19011605LB0131E

LB introduced the item.

**Amongst other things, the following were discussed:**

- The site is graded III C
- Inside in a HPO
- The Committee endorses the heritage indicators as per page 12, 13, 14 & 15 of report the report: Attwell, M. 2019. Erf 781, 11 Hastings Street Tamboerskloof: Application for a permit to undertake alterations and additions in terms of S 34 of the national heritage Resources Act
- The current drawings have not responded to the heritage indicators.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The committee requires a submission of a revised proposal in line with the heritage indicators.

**LB**

**12.4 Proposed addition and alteration at Erf 340, 51 Main Street, Wellington. S34**

**HWC file No.: HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ WELLINGTON/ ERF 340**

**Case. No.:** 19021903HB0219E

HB introduced the item.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

The committee recommends the matter to be referred to BELCom to be held on 29 May 2019.

**HB**

**13 New Matters**

**13.1 Proposed total demolition, Erf 198, 2 Avenue Des Huguenots, Fresnaye. S34**

**HWC file No.: HM/ FRESNAYE/ ERF 198**

**Case. No:** 19043003LB0430E

LB introduced the item.

Mr Guy Thomas was present and took part in the discussion.

**Amongst other things, the following were discussed:**

- The building is not conservation worthy and is therefore not a heritage resource.
- Outside a proposed HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal and SFA objected to the proposal.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition application as the building lacks heritage significance which might warrant retention.

**LB**

**13.2 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 914, 15 Van Der Byl Avenue, Durbanville S 34**

**HWC file No.: HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ DURBANVILLE/ ERF 914**

**Case Number:** 19012901KB0208E

KB introduced the item.

**Amongst other things, the following were discussed:**

- The building is graded Not Conservation Worthy (NCW)
- The site is not located in a Heritage Protection Overlay (HPO)
- CoCT support the proposal
- DHS objects to the proposal

## **DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the total demolition application as the building lacks heritage significance which might warrant retention.

**KB**

### **13.3 Proposed additions & alterations at Erf 1388, Cnr Alfred and Stanley Streets, Cape Town S 34**

**HWC file No.: HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/CAPE TOWN/ERF 1388**

**Case Number:** 17070501HB0705E

HB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- Close out report dated 11.4.2019 prepared by Steven Townsend

#### **RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to endorse the close out report dated 11 April 2019 prepared by Stephen Townsend.

**HB**

### **13.4 Proposed thatch replacement and alterations on Erf 11033, 21 & 23 Marine Drive, Hermanus. S34**

**HWC file No.: HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 11033**

**Case Number:** 19020604AS0404E

AS introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

#### **RECOMMENDATION:**

The Committee recommends a site inspection to be conducted and the matter to be referred to BELCom to be held on 29 May 2019.

**AS**

### **13.5 Proposed additions and alterations, Erf 1668, 16 Kelvin Street, Gardens. S34**

**HWC file No.: HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ GARDENS/ ERF 1668**

**Case. No.:** 18111923LB0507E

LB introduced the item.

Mr Alex Stewart was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is graded IIIB
- Inside HPO
- CoCT support the proposal
- CIBRA does not support the proposal in its current form, however in principle a contemporary insertion is acceptable at the rear of the property.

**RECORD OF DECISION:**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal as it does not negatively impact on the heritage resource.

**LB**

**13.6 Proposed addition and alteration at Erf 3241, Ptn 3240, 5 Milner Street, Wellington. S34**

**HWC file No.: HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ WELLINGTON/ ERF 3241, PTN 3240**

**Case No:** 19040908HB0417E

HB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- Drakenstein Municipality
- Drakenstein Heritage Foundation (DHF) raised the following concerns:
  - The new Bedroom wall de set back from the edge of the existing wall/edge.
  - No angle iron railing/fencing to be used.
  - No detail supplied on enclosure of front stoep– reference to Drakenstein Heritage Guidelines for Built Environment.
- The owner has agreed to address the above concerns raised by DHF.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee awaits the revised drawings which addresses DHF's concerns. These drawings must be submitted to HOMS for approval.

**HB**

**13.7 Proposed addition & alteration at Erf 19828, 16 Zion Street, Paarl. S27**

**HWC file No.: HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ WELLINGTON/ ERF 19828**

**Case No:** 19050607HB0507E;

HB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The site is a Provincial Heritage Site (PHS)

- DHF and Paarl 300 support the proposal

**RECOMMENDATION:**

The Committee recommends the matter to be referred to BELCom to be held on 29 May 2019.

**HB**

**13.8 Proposed additions and alterations, Erf 14423, 2 Moolman Street, Paarl. S34**

**HWC file No.: HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ ERF 14423**

**Case No:** 19050711LB0507E

LB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building has not been graded and is not listed in the Drakenstein Heritage Survey.
- The site is located outside the Special Character Protected Area Overlay Zone (SPOZ) of Paarl.
- The Committee has considered the building to be Not Conservation Worthy (NCW).
- Drakenstein Municipality support the proposal
- DHF and Paarl 300 do not support the proposal

**DECISION**

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal as the structure has no heritage significance.

**LB**

**13.9 Proposed additions and alterations, Erf 2463, 12 Treurnicht Street, Paarl. S34**

**HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/ ERF 2463**

**Case No:** 19050710LB0507E

LB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building has not been graded and not listed in the Drakenstein Heritage Survey.
- The Committee has considered the building to be Not Conservation Worthy (NCW).
- Drakenstein municipality and Paarl 300 support the proposal.
- DHF does not support the proposal.

- Work has been completed without a permit.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

The Committee resolved to issue a S51 letter as HWC cannot condone illegal work.

**LB**

**13.10 Proposed additions and alterations, Erf 55018, Corner of Bowood & Main Road, Claremont. S27**

**HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN /CLAREMONT/ ERF 55018**

**Case No:** 19022205LB0304E

LB introduced the item.

Mr Justin Runyowa was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The site is a PHS
- Outside HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- UCRRRA supports with recommendations

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee resolved to undertake a site inspection with the recommendation to the applicant to provide HWC with a spatialized vision of the congregation for the whole site in the form of the diagrammatic analysis of the design intent.

**LB**

**13.11 Proposed additions and alterations to existing structure on Erf 112610, 22 Ayres Street, Rosebank. S34**

**HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ROSEBANK/ERF 112610**

**Case No:** 19042306TZ0425E

TZ introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building a potential III C
- The site is located inside on HPO
- CoCT supports the proposal
- RAMPAC does not support the proposal
- The Committee notes RAMPAC's concern regarding the size of the dormer windows.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**



The Committee supports the proposed work in principle but requires the dormer windows be reduced in size. The revised plans must be submitted to HOMs for approval.

**LB**

**13.12 Proposed additions and Alterations on Erf 46364, 24 Avenue Road, Rondebosch. S34**

**HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 46364**

**Case No:** 19030808TZ0405E

TZ introduced the item.

Hessel Berga was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The site is graded III C.
- Inside an HPO.
- COCT supports the proposal.
- NRA does not support the proposal.
- HWC does not condone illegal work.
- Heritage assessment is required to understand the historical chronology of the impacts to the existing heritage resource.

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS**

The Committee resolved to require the applicant to engage the services of a suitably qualified heritage practitioner to:

1. To undertake an assessment of the illegal work
2. To further investigate the impact to the heritage resource and
3. How this can be mitigated through the formulation of heritage indicators.

**TZ**

**13.13 Proposed additions and alterations, Farm 1546, Old Farm House Restaurant, Plateau Road, Red Hill. S34**

**HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/RED HILL/ FARM 1546**

**Case No:** 19032209LB0326E

LB introduced the item.

Beth Richardson was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- LB provided feedback on the site inspection undertaken on 25 April 2019.
- The site is graded III A
- CoCT does not support the proposal

- STHS does not support the proposal

**FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:**

The Committee resolved to require the applicant to engage the services of a suitably qualified heritage practitioner to undertake an assessment which must include multi-disciplinary inputs namely: architecture, social history and archaeology as well as heritage design indicators.

**LB**

**14 Other Matters**

**14.1** None.

**15. Adoption of decisions and additions**

The Committee resolved to adopt the decisions with some minor changes.

**16. Closure of the meeting**

The Chairperson closed the meeting at 12:46

**17. Date of next meeting:** 15 July 2019

Chairperson's Signature.....

Date:

Secretariat's Signature.....

Date: