

**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF
HERITAGE WESTERN CAPE,
SUPPLEMENTARY HERITAGE OFFICERS MEETING (Supp HOMS)
Held on Monday, 15 July 2019, in the 8th Floor Boardroom at the Offices of the
Department of Cultural Affairs and Sport,
Protea Assurance Building, Greenmarket Square, Cape Town scheduled for
09:00**

1. Opening and Welcoming

The Chairperson, Ms Colette Scheermeyer, officially opened the meeting at 9:08 and welcomed everyone present.

2. Attendance

Committee Members

Mr Chris Snelling (CSn) recused himself at 10:59 and returned at 11:40
Ms Helene Van der Merwe (HvdM)

HWC Members of Staff

Ms Nosiphiwo Tafeni (NT)	Administrative Clerk
Mr Andrew September (AS)	Heritage Officer
Ms Heidi Boise (HB)	Heritage Officer
Mr Lwazi Bhengu (LB)	Heritage Officer
Ms Stephanie Barnardt (SB)	Heritage Officer
Ms Khanyisile Bonile (KB)	Graduate Intern

Visitors

Mr K.H Berga (KhB)	Mr S. Hermansen (SH)
Mr R Magdee (RM)	Mr Z. Adams (ZA)
Mrs Fawzia Adams (FA)	Mr Ron Martin (RM)
Ms W Whittaker (WW)	Mr G.J Stander (GjS)
Ms L Hyde (LH)	Mr C Scriba (CSc)
Mr Stephen Dugmore (SD)	Ms Mpambani Viwe (MV)
Mr Johan Cornelius (JC)	

Observers

None

3. Apologies

Ms Waseefa Dhansay (WD)
Mr Thando Zingange (TZ)
Mr Peter Buttgens (PB)

4. Approval of agenda

The HOMS Committee resolved to approve the agenda dated 15 July 2019 with some minor changes.

5. Approval of minutes of the previous meeting

The HOMs Committee resolved to approve the minutes dated 20 May 2019 with amendments.

6. Disclosure of interest

- CSn: item 13.3 and 13.4

7 Confidential Matters

7.1 None

8. Site inspections

8.1 Proposed Site Inspection

8.1.1 None

8.2 Site Inspection Reports

8.2.1 None

9 Administrative Matters

9.1 None

10. Other Committee Referrals

11. Appointments

11.1 The Committee noted appointments of item 13.4 set for 10:30

12. Matters Arising

12.1 **Farm 904, Farm Bien Donne, Simondium, Paarl. Section 27 HWC file No. HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/SIMONDIUM/ FARM 904**

Case. No: 1709050903HB0509M

HB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- It was noted that the works is suffering from actions of a contractor that is seemingly inexperienced in heritage restoration work (wasted effort due to having to remove and redo various parts of walls as noted in Interim Report No 1)
- The relevant department must obtain heritage expert input when formulating the scope of works for heritage significant buildings.
- Detailed specifications specifically related to the restoration work to be provided.

- Heritage restoration skills set to be part of requirements at tender stage.
- A supervisory or mentoring role by a suitably qualified heritage professional to be put in place for building contractors inexperienced in restoration work.
- A set of guidelines regarding maintenance and restoration processes for heritage buildings could be helpful to the PWD.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The HOMs Committee endorses the Interim Report No1 dated the 1 May 2019 prepared by John Wilson Harris. The committee further proposed that the report be tabled at the next BELCom meeting scheduled for 24 July 2019 for their input.

HB

12.2 Erf 4141, Corner of Victoria - Van Ryneveld & Crozier Streets, University of Stellenbosch. Section 27

HWC file No: HM/CAPE WINELANDS/STELLENBOSCH/ERF 4141

Case No: 18041012HB0412M

HB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The revised proposal for the insertion of a platform lift

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee approves the revised proposal drawing no. J1864-ML 01R01 dated 30 May 2019 prepared by MBB Consulting Engineers detailing the insertion of a platform lift.

HB

12.3 Unauthorised Work at Erf 88548, 1 Ley Road, St James, CT. Section 34

HWC file No.: HM / CAPE METROPOLITAN/ ST JAMES/ERF 88548

Ref. No.: 17082302HB0911E

HB introduced the item.

RECOMMENDATION:

Refer to BELCom 24.7.2019 for advice.

HB

12.4 Proposed Additions and Alterations at Farm 501/20, Mooikelder, Main Road, Northern-Paarl. Section 34

HWC file No.: HM/ CAPE WINELANDS/ DRAKENSTEIN/ PAARL/NORTHERN-PAARL/ FARM 501/20

Case No.: 17091407HB1004E

HB introduced the item.

RECOMMENDATION:

Refer Site Visit Report No 5 dated April and May 2019 prepared Malherbe Rust Architects to be tabled on the next BELCom meeting on 24.7.2019.

HB

12.5 Proposed Addition and Alteration at Erven 252 & 253, 11 Leeuwenhoek Road, Tamboerskloof. Section 34

HM/CAPE METROPOLITAN/TAMBOERSKLOOF/ERVEN 252 & 253

Case No: 17030906HB0721E

HB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- Progress Report No2 June 2019 prepared by B Architects.

RECORD OF DECISION

The Committee resolved to endorse the Progress Report No2 June 2019 prepared by B Architects.

HB

12.6 Proposed Additions and Alterations on Erf 46364, 24 Avenue Road, S34 Rondebosch

HWC file No: HM/RONDEBOSCH/ERF 46364

Case No: 19030808TZ0405E

KB introduced the item.

Mr K.H Berga and Mr S. Hermansen were present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following was discussed:

- The building is graded IIIIC.
- The building is situated inside an HPO.
- CoCT supports the mitigations.
- NRA objects to the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION

The Committee resolved to endorse the report prepared by Stuart Hermansen dated 10.7.2019, noting that the unauthorised work does not impact negatively on the heritage resource.

The proposed mitigations to the structure are approved.

TZ

13 New Matters

13.1 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 302, 18 du Toit Street, Stanford: Section 31

HWC file No: HM/ OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ STANFORD / ERF 302

Case. No: 19061910WD0626E

AS introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The property is within the Stanford Conservation Area
- The property is graded III C
- OHAC supports the proposal
- Stanford Heritage Committee does not support the proposal in respect of height and the articulation of the new addition.
- The aesthetics of the new proposal will not detract from the significance of the heritage area

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolve to approve the proposal as it does not impact negatively on the heritage resources.

WD

13.2 Proposed Total Demolition at Erf 173310 & Re- Erf 69017, 23 & 25 Park Road, Wynberg. Section 34

HWC file No: HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/Erf 173310 & Re Erf 69017

Case Number: 19061101HB0611E

HB introduced the item.

Mr Chris Snelling (CSn) recused himself.

Mr Ron Martin was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is graded III C.
- The building is situated inside the proposed HPO
- The CoCT supports the proposal.
- The state of neglect of the structure is regrettable as the features of the existing building contribute to the street context.

Further requirements

The Committee supports the proposed demolition in principle, however, requires that heritage indicators to inform the design of a replacement structure be provided.

HB

13.3 Proposed Total Demolition, Erf 67739, 22 Castletown Road, Wynberg. Section 34

HWC file No: HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WYNBERG/ ERF 67739

Case Number: 19061209LB0614E

LB introduced the item.

Mr Chris Snelling (CSn) recused himself.

Mr Ron Martin was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The structure is graded III C.
- The structure is outside an HPO.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- The structure sits at the end of a narrow block located between the railway and a part of Castletown road that does not have enough heritage context.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as the structure and its immediate context lacks sufficient heritage significance.

LB

13.4 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 55361, 27 Bishoplea Road, Claremont. Section 34

HWC file No: HM/CLAREMONT/ERF55361

Case No: 19020101SB0627E

CnS accused himself and left the room.

SB introduced the item.

Ms W Whittaker, Ms L Hyde and Mr GJ Stander were present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is graded III C.
 - The building is outside HPO
 - City of Cape Town supports the proposal
- Upper Claremont and Residents and Ratepayers Association (UCRRA) does not support the proposal.

RECOMMENDATION:

The matter is referred to BELCom meeting to be held on 27 August 2019.

SB

13.5 Proposed Addition and Alteration at Erf 22, Parel Vallei, 32 Bulties Way, Somerset West. Section 34

HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/SOMERSET WEST/PARELVALLIE/ERF 22

Case No: 19052003HB0528E

HB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is graded IIIB
- The house is in the Arts & Crafts Revival style and has been retained as the centre point of a proposed residential estate development.
- This building is situated outside HPO (no heritage context in the area).
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- Helderberg Renaissance Foundation supports the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolve to approve the proposal as it does not impact negatively on heritage resources.

HB

**13.6 Proposed Alteration and Addition at Portion 3 of Farm 13, Farm Nootgedagt, Oudtshoorn. Section 34
HM/EDEN/OUTDSHOORN/SHAMMAH VALLEY/PTN 13 OF FARM 30**

Case No: 19021907HB0603E

HB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is graded IIIB.
- Oudtshoorn Heritage supports the proposal.
- Supplementary HOMs strongly suggests that a suitably qualified heritage practitioner should be involved in the project to assist with the necessary heritage analysis.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The matter is referred to BELCom meeting to be held on 24 July 2019.

HB

**13.7 Proposed Additions and Alterations, Erf 9684, Corner St Georges Mall and Hout Street. Cape Town. Section 34
HM/ CAPE TOWN/ CITY CENTRE CBD/ ERF 9684**

Case No: 19042411LB0426E

LB introduced the item.

Mr R Magdee was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is a series of 3 co-joined structures, two with a grading of IIIB and one graded IIIC.
- The City of Cape Town supports the proposal.

- The City Bowl Ratepayers and Residents Association (CIBRA) supports.
- The Cape Institute for Architecture (CIFA) supports the proposal with the following comments:
 - The existing signage carved into stone must remain visible as it speaks to the past life of the building.
 - The new signage is to be designed and mounted as a floating element in front of the circular window recess to circumvent the obscuring of existing details.
 - There should be consideration of a replacement entrance canopy structure which should be well designed and detailed as a lightweight element which could enhance both the building and the public domain. This would require heritage indicators to inform a suitable design.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The HOMS Committee generally supports the proposal; however, it requires the submission of

1. A built fabric analysis
2. A methodology statement which must include further detailed information in respect of construction methods and specifications appropriate to the specific historic fabric. .

This report must be compiled by a suitably qualified heritage practitioner with the relevant architectural experience.

LB

**13.8 Proposed Additions, Alterations and Partial Demolition on Erf 338, 98 Loader Street, De Waterkant. Section 34
HWC FILE NO: HM/ DE WATERKANT / ERF 338**

Case No: 19050609SB0618E

SB introduced the item.

Mr C Scriba was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- Structure is graded IIIC.
- The structure is situated inside an HPO.
- City of Cape Town supports the proposal.
- De Waterkant Civic Association (DWCA) supports the proposal on condition the jacaranda tree is retained
- It was noted by the committee that replacing the jacaranda with an indigenous tree would be acceptable.

RECORD OF DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal with the exception of the addition of the roof pergola.

SB

13.9 Proposed Additions to existing structure Erf 183, 5 Crown Crescent, Camps Bay. Section 34
HWC FILE NO: HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/CAMPS BAY/ERF 183

Case No: 19060608TZ0702E

KB introduced the item.

Mr Stephen Dugmore and Ms Mpambani Viwe were present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is graded IIIB.
- The building is situated outside HPO.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CBCRRA objects to the proposal.
- The neighbours objected to the proposal.

DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the proposal as it does not impact negatively on the heritage resource.

TZ

13.10 Proposed Alteration and Additions, 16 Protea Street, Paarl: Section 34 -
HWC file No: HM / PAARL /ERF 4046

Case No: 19051505SB0624E

SB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The structure is identified as being Not Conservation Worthy.
- The building is situated outside an HPO, heritage area, or heritage context.
- Paarl 300 does not support the proposal.
- Drakenstein heritage foundation does not support the proposal.
- Drakenstein municipality supports the proposal.

The structure and context are not regarded as having sufficient heritage significance to formally protect.

Decision:

The Committee resolve to approve the proposal as it does not impact negatively on heritage resources.

SB

13.11 Proposed Additions and Alterations to existing structure Erf 1838, 38 Bellevue Road, Gardens. Section 34
HWC file No.: HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/GARDENS/ERF 1838

Case No.:19013105TZ0611E

SB introduced the item.

Mr Johan Cornelius was present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is graded III B.
- The building is situated inside HPO.
- CoCT supports the proposal.
- CIBRA does not support the proposal (the height of the boundary wall).
- Height of the boundary wall complies with the boundary wall policy, and is located in a street which is typified by boundary walls of a similar height
- The Committee suggests the hardwood slats be painted to fit in with colour scheme of the historic house.

DECISION:

The Committee resolve to approve the proposal as it does not impact negatively on heritage resources.

TZ

13.12 Proposed Alteration and Additions on Erf 70626, 17 Wembley Road, Plumstead. Section 34
HWC file No: HM/Plumstead/Erf 70626

Case No: 19053114KB0531

KB introduced the item.

Mr Z Adams and Mrs Fawzia Adams were present and took part in the discussion.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is Not Conservation Worthy.
- The building falls outside any HPO.
- CoCT does not support the proposal.

RECORD OF DECISION

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it does not impact negatively on heritage resources.

KB

**13.13 Proposed Additions and Alterations - Erf 290, Akademie Street,
Franschhoek: Section 34
HWC file No.: HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ FRANSCHHOEK/ ERF 290**

Case No.: 19062109WD0702E

WD introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building is graded IIIC.
- The Committee questions the grading as it of the opinion it may be grade IIIB due to the building's intact historic built fabric, internally and externally, as well as its relationship to the street and townscape of Franschhoek.
- Franschhoek Heritage Trust objects to the proposal as they have concerns relating to the change of use.
- The Committee suggested that the required additional information be submitted to HWC prior to the case being tabled at BELCOM.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

A detailed site development plan is required and a contextual analysis with detailed heritage indicators to inform the proposed design.

WD

**13.14 Proposed Parking and Landscaping on the front garden of Erf 65133, 18
Goldbourne Road, Kenilworth, S 34
HWC File No: MH/ Cape Town Metro /Kenilworth/ Erf: 65133**

Case No: 19050905LB0510E

LB introduced the item.

Amongst other things, the following were discussed:

- The building has IIIA grading.
- It is in a proposed Heritage Protection Overlay.
- The City of Cape Town does not support the proposal.
- The demolition of the stairs triggers Section 34 of the Act.

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS

The matter is referred to BELCom meeting to be held on 24 July 2019.

LB

14 Other Matters

14.1 None.

15. Adoption of decisions and additions

The Committee resolved to adopt the decisions.

16. Closure of the meeting

The Chairperson closed the meeting at 14:00

17. Date of next meeting: 14 October 2019

Chairperson's Signature.....

Date

Secretariat's Signature.....

Date

APPROVED