

**Adopted Resolutions and Decisions of the Meeting of Heritage
Western Cape
Built Environment and Landscape Permit Committee (BELCom)
Scheduled for 09:00 and held on Wednesday, 29 April 2020 via
Microsoft Teams**



MATTERS DISCUSSED

11 PROVINCIAL HERITAGE SITES: SECTION 27 PERMIT APPLICATIONS

**11.1 IZIKO CMP South African National Gallery, Erven 95204, 96132, St. Johns Road, Cape Town: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN/ERVEN 95204 AND 26132**

Case No: N/A

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee will prepare commentary on the submitted documents to be put to the applicants at the next BELCom committee meeting.

WD

**11.2 CMP: Puntjie Portions 5, 8 and 9, Farm Kleinfontein, Hessequa: MA
HM/PUNTJIE/PTN 5, 8 AND 9**

Case No: N/A

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Commentary has been prepared by the Committee for distribution to the applicant. (See Annexure A).

JW

12. STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR TOTAL DEMOLITION

**12.1 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 46018, Corner Stanley Road and Lovers Walk Rondebosch
NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ RONDEBOSCH/ ERF 46018**

Case No: 19112803SB1129E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

The Committee is happy for the process to proceed to the next stage i.e. the development of sketch plans and structural documentation, provided that it addresses the following concerns:

1. The building's current fulcrum position and massing on this corner site. These factors are to be taken forward in the new design.
2. It is important to conserve what is conservable but ensure that the new work is contemporary in its architectural expression.

3. Significant elements that Committee expects to be incorporated include the encaustic floor tiles, cast iron columns, pressed metal ceiling elements and bay window with built-in seating.
4. An architectural solution that results in historicist pastiche should be avoided. e.g. such as currently indicated on conceptual sketches submitted.

SB

**12.2 Proposed Total Demolition of Erf 2588 - 129 9th Street, Hermanus: MA
HM / OVERBERG/ OVERSTRAND/ HERMANUS/ ERF 2588**

Case No: 20022006WD0304E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as not having sufficient significance to warrant retention.

WD

**13 STRUCTURES OLDER THAN 60 YEARS: SECTION 34 PERMIT FOR PARTIAL
DEMOLITION/ALTERATIONS**

**13.1 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erven 4509 and 4508, 82 Adderley Street, Cape Town
CBD: MA
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ CAPE TOWN CBD/ ERVEN 4509 AND 4508**

Case No: 19192932WD0304E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Given the lockdown status that will continue for some time, this provides the ideal opportunity for consulting stakeholders formally before resubmission to HWC. This will ensure that all parties are addressing the same information.

The Committee is thereafter prepared to assist wherever possible to evaluate the proposals using information provided remotely by the applicant.

WD

**13.2 Proposed Partial Demolition, Additions and Alterations, Erven 15588 and 15589, 428 and
432 Albert Road, Salt River: NM
HM/ CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ WOODSTOCK/ ERF 15588 AND 15589**

Case No: 20021924JW0413E

FURTHER REQUIREMENTS:

Given that the site falls within an area of heritage significance, the Committee requests the following further information:

1. An elevation analysis that includes at least one block to either side of the subject site on Albert Road and another elevation analysis at right angles to Albert Road that includes at least the building on the opposite side of Albert Road, extending uphill to the end of the block and including the residential development on the South side of the subject site.

JW

**13.3 Proposed Alterations to Erf 1291, 33 Church Street, Stellenbosch: NM
HM/CAPE WINELANDS/ STELLENBOSCH/ ERF 1291**

Case No: 20030910SB0311E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application which will not negatively impact the streetscape and townscape and does not physically impact the historic Coopmanhuijs Hotel.

The Committee recommends that the rooftop balcony on the eastern wing be better integrated into the scale of the development.

SB

**13.4 Proposed Alterations and Additions, Erf 923, 53 Arthurs Road, Sea Point: NM
HM/CAPE TOWN METROPOLITAN/ SEA POINT/ ERVEN 4509 AND 4508**

Case No: 19112512LB1204E

RECORD OF DECISION:

The Committee resolved to approve the application as it will not impact heritage significance.

The Committee recommends that the new French doors facing the street are reduced in width to uphold the pattern of articulation particular to the street scape of the terrace houses. .

The Committee strongly recommends that lime mortars and renders are used for the proposed work as this would be more compatible with the historic fabric than Portland cement.

WD

14 HERITAGE AREAS: SECTION 31 CONSENT APPLICATIONS

14.1 None

15 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 29 PERMIT

15.1 None

16 PROVINCIAL PROTECTION: SECTION 28 REFUSAL

16.1 None

17 HERITAGE REGISTER: SECTION 30 PROCESS

17.1 None

18 PUBLIC MONUMENTS & MEMORIALS: SECTION 37 PROCESS

18.1 None

19 REQUESTS FOR OPINION/ADVICE

19.1 None

20 OTHER MATTERS

20.1 None

21. NON-COMPLIANCE

21.1 None

22. ADOPTION OF RESOLUTIONS AND DECISIONS

The Committee adopted the resolutions and decisions as minuted.

23. CLOSURE

The meeting closed at: 13:55

24 DATE OF NEXT MEETING:

27 May 2020

MINUTES APPROVED AND SIGNED BY:

CHAIRPERSON _____

DATE _____

SECRETARY _____

DATE _____

Annexure A

HWC BELCom meeting of 9th April 2020

Comments on: Puntjie, Conservation Management Plan, April 2019

Compiled by: Prof W. Peters & Mr S. Johnston

Preface: Conserving the vernacular heritage is always a challenge, even if the whole of the settlement is in single ownership as Puntjie. Alongside the very thorough CMP, which includes the promotion of artisanal building traditions, the following comments are offered as aids towards achieving the objective, namely that the *kapstyl* cultural artefacts survive.

1. Historical background (CMP Ch 5) & Site description (CMP Ch 6).

As confirmed in 7.2, a fundamental characteristic of vernacular architecture generally, is its evolution as a pragmatic response to local conditions over time (p22). Similarly, the *kapstyl* vernacular of Puntjie is an empirically developed architecture, well demonstrated when comparing the existing dwellings with a sketch of 1887 (attributed to H Clayton, held by the Africana Museum, Johannesburg) included in the coverage in Oberholster, J. *The Historical Monuments of SA*, 1972. Unlike the current buildings, this sketch shows an A-frame with thick covering layer to the ridge, and stepped thatch, and unlike the rounded and battered return with recessed stable door of today, the example shown has a simple infilling to the triangulated portions aside the full height boarded door hung on strap hinges.

For interest, Oberholster mentions the name *kapstyl* as being descriptive of the building technique, literally 'truss style' (and no neologism of any kind, CMP 6.2, p15). He also mentions that the interior is divided by 'a simple partition' into a living room and bedroom (which appears not to be addressed in the CMP), and that cooking was "done outside on an open-fire protected by a reed screen", although Clayton's sketch shows a free-standing outdoor oven, or *bakoond*, misaligned with the A-frame and without any wind-shield surround.

The author who most covered the *kapstyl* is the late Dr h.c. James Walton, who besides the 1981 publication referred to in the CMP, covered same in his *Homesteads and Villages of SA*. Pretoria: Van Schaik, 1952; *Homes of the Trekboers*. Lantern, Sept 1961, pp 8-21; and 'Architecture, Vernacular' in *Standard Encyclopaedia of Southern Africa*, 1974/5. For the best understanding of the typology, all these sources including Oberholster should be scoured.

2. Applied construction and maintenance principles (CMP 9.4.1.)

Item (iv) Advises that “newly reconstructed dwellings be built with concrete floor slabs... and thatch eaves ... raised above the surrounding natural ground level by 50-70mm (p37). Comment: Without the external longitudinal walls, this proposal makes for unliveable conditions.

According to Walton (1952: 95) the floor was of “ant-heap (sic), smeared and made to shine by continued applications of linseed oil or ox blood”. While the demands of modern living might render a continuation hereof unacceptable, the resort to concrete slabs cannot be accepted without first investigating alternatives.

A concrete slab requires subfloor preparation and the inclusion of a damp proofing membrane, which renders it impermeable. This might have long term effects on the constituent natural materials to the kapstyl, which could be subjected to increased moisture.

However, if concrete slabs can be argued, not as a substitute, but as an empirically derived approach to evolving the vernacular kapstyl, then internal (not external) low longitudinal walls as per Walton’s sketches of other examples could be designed integral with the proposal. In that case, prevention from the erosive action by rainwater or groundwater, could be facilitated with external drainage / trenches with, preferably, a little more than the suggested 50-70 gap between thatch eaves and ground level as a safeguard against deterioration from moisture.

(v) In agreement with the assertion that certain “architectural detailing ... has proved problematic over time” (Incremental Changes in Built Character, CMP 8.3, p27), and in acknowledgment that repair must have highest priority, the traditional sliding pane fenestration is surely an item for reconsideration, especially when fitted on the inclined roof plane. It is submitted that a top-hung awning / sash would best promote ventilation, keep the rain out and have minimal impact on any visual consideration.

3. Applied Construction and Maintenance Principles (CMP 9.5.2., p40).

This item advises that “vent pipes are to be located internally with top ends exhausting to the exterior behind roof eaves”. The reasoning is understood and accepted. However, stub vent pipes appear not to have been considered, which could, perhaps, perform better if wholly outside where they might also be easier to conceal e.g. by reed screen, shrubs, or plantings.

4. Interested and affected parties (CMP 11.2., p46).

The committee would like to highlight the lack of public engagement on this application. This is a unique site of provincial and national interest and therefore your stakeholder engagement process should not just be limited to the local input. The local stakeholder engagement is skewed by the fact that not all interested and affected parties participated in the process; there is doubt that organisations with a focus on vernacular architecture would not be interested in the CMP of Puntjie. No stakeholder profile, nor details of attempts made to engage interested and affected parties were provided in the report.

The only two groups highlighted as stakeholders are the Hessequa Municipality and the Puntjie Tennant Forum. Other interested and affected parties with interest in the area were not consulted and the committee feels that comment should have been requested more widely and from groups such as the Vernacular Architecture Society of SA and the Hessequa Khoi-San heritage group.

The applicant and its consultants failed to consult with the Hessequa Khoi-San heritage group who has a keen interest in the Agulhas Plain area and the areas surrounding Puntjie, the Duiwenshok River and other key sites of significance.

The committee is concerned that the stakeholder engagement was conducted with no effort to obtain broader input from stakeholders with interest and expertise.

5. Lighting

The document appears silent on general external electric lighting, which could be hugely intrusive if not included in the CMP.

6. General comments

It is the Committee's understanding that the application was tabled for comment, there is a consensus among members that a site visit is needed, due to the current Lockdown this is not possible at this stage, thus commentary has been provided for the applicant on areas of concern. Puntjie is a unique site and there is a need for a Conservation Manual for promoting appropriate maintenance and conservative repair in Puntjie. The document appears silent on general external electric lighting, which could be hugely intrusive if not included in the CMP.